Subcommittee on the Proposed Accountability System for Principal Officials and Related Issues

Summary of views expressed by organisations/individuals

Organi Individ LC Paper No. of Written submission	Consistency with the The function, compo Executive Council (I	Basic Law (BL); sition and operation of the ExCo); Independent of the ExCo is	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 1. The Law Society of Ho (no written su provided)	a thorough un following production of principal of stipulate the free ExCo; BL 59 be the head of Administrativ 61 and 101 principal of different ranks 103 provides to existing systems.	the accountability system, derstanding of the visions of BL is required - vides for the appointment ficials; BL 54 and 55 anction and composition of and 60 provide for CE to the Hong Kong Special e Region (HKSAR); BL ovide for the citizenship or principal officials and sof civil servants; and BL for the maintenance of the m of recruitment and of civil servants;	

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		(b) The appointment of principal officials on terms different from those for civil servants represents a departure from the existing recruitment and employment system for public servants. However, from a rational perspective, BL 103 is not intended to "fossilise" the appointment system for government officials but to suit the needs of Hong Kong. Therefore, the Government can appoint principal officials under the accountability system in accordance with BL 48(5) without having to follow the terms of employment for civil servants; and	
		(c) Judging from the above analysis of BL, the accountability system does not contravene BL. Nonetheless, the Government should enact legislation for the implementation of the system in order to dispel possible misgivings among the public.	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
	Hong Kong Political, Economical and Cultural Society CB(2)1854/01-02(11)	 (a) In support of implementing the proposed system by 1 July 2002; (b) The proposed system complies with BL; and (c) The accountability system should be reviewed constantly in accordance with BL; (d) LegCo should expedite funding approval for the early implementation of the proposed system. 	(e) More senior officials should be included in the accountability system in due course.
	Pro-Vision CB(2)1974/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the accountability system which is a first step to reform.	(b) In support of appointment of elites of the community from outside the civil service as principal officials since the success of the accountability system relies on whether experts and competent people will play the leading roles in governance;

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
			(c) CE should account for the criteria for the nomination of principal officials to the public;(d) Principal officials should explain to the public their policy thinking, work	
			objectives as well as measurable projected result. They should also self-evaluate their performance and progress annually; and (e) If the contract of a principal official is	
			terminated prematurely, CE should explain the reasons to the public.	
* 4.	The Democratic Party CB(2)1974/01-02(04) CB(2)2013/01-02(04)	(a) Does not object to a system under which principal officials can be truly held accountable for their policies, but questions whether the proposed accountability system can really achieve the purpose;	(e) Principal officials are only accountable to CE who is not elected by universal suffrage, therefore the accountability system is incapable of achieving its intended purpose of principal officials being accountable to the people;	

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		 (b) A fair, open and just election for CE by universal suffrage is necessary before the implementation of the accountability system. The proposed system should come with a set of clear and strict rules and regulations. The Administration should also widely consult the public to win their support and agreement; (c) Objects to the hasty implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002 because the Government has failed to consult the public and complete the study on the transfer of statutory powers or amendment of the legislation; (d) Expresses extreme resentment and regret about the Government's failure to consult District Councils (DCs) and its refusal to attend DC meetings to discuss the accountability system. 	 (f) The appointment of principal officials should be subject to approval by LegCo. If LegCo passes a motion of noconfidence, the relevant principal official should bear the political responsibility and resign or be removed; and (g) It is necessary to establish procedures for integrity checks, code of practice and declaration of interests for principal officials to avoid the seeking of advantages through the use of power and to preserve the neutrality of the civil service.

	Organisation/ Individual oer No. of a submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 5.	New Century Forum CB(2)1974/01-02(05)	 (a) In support of accountability system; (b) The implementation of the accountability system is a huge step forward in Hong Kong's political development. 	 (c) Principal officials must grasp public opinions and strengthen the study of policies and cooperate wholeheartedly with civil servants for the implementation of policies; (d) The Government should establish a comprehensive system of declaration of interests, integrity checks and termination of service for principal officials; and (e) The accountability system will preserve the political neutrality of civil servants and will allow them to focus on policy execution. Also, it will not affect their promotion prospects and the stability of the civil service.
* 6.	Hong Kong Chinese Reform Association Ltd CB(2)1857/01-02(09)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) More senior officials can be appointed by CE and included in the accountability system.

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
	Zhongshan University Law Faculty Hong Kong Students Association CB(2)1854/01-02(01)	(a) The appointment of principal officials to ExCo will maintain the stability and increase the efficiency of the Government.	 (b) In support of separating political accountability from execution of policies so that principal officials will be held accountable for serious policy blunders and be removed from office without affecting the stability of the civil service; and (c) Principal officials should maintain close contact with LegCo, the media and the public.
	Heung Yee Kuk, New Territories CB(2)1917/01-02(02)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; and (b) The remuneration for the Chief Executive (CE) should not be less favourable than that of the principal officials. 	

LC Pape	Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
	Hong Kong Federation of Civil Service Unions (No written submission provided)	accountability system by 1 July 2002 is	(b) Not in support of the political appointment of the Secretary for the Civil Service (SCS) for fear that the interests and political neutrality of civil servants will not be adequately protected.
	Senior Non-Expatriate Officers Association CB(2)1917/01-02(01)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) There is concern about the impact on the operation and coordination of the various bureaux, with the proposed reduction of the number of bureaux from 16 to 11; (c) There is also concern that the reduction of the number of bureaux under the proposed system will pave the way for further amalgamation of bureaux with departments and merging of departments. 	 (d) In support of separating political accountability from execution of policies in order to maintain the political neutrality of the civil service; (e) SCS should not be politically appointed; (f) SCS should be a civil servant appointed on civil service terms and be appointed to the ExCo and enjoy equal status as the other politically appointed principal officials;

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			 (g) Principal officials should have a full understanding of the core values of the civil service. They should have regard to the need to uphold such values in formulating policies and taking policy decisions; (h) Principal officials should have good knowledge of matters within their respective policy portfolios to avoid a situation of "non-professionals leading the professionals"; (i) The duties and responsibilities of principal officials and Permanent Secretaries and their relationship should be clearly defined; and (j) Civil servants should be further consulted when more details of the accountability system are available.

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 11.	Disciplined Services Consultative Council (Staff Side) CB(2)1895/01-02(01)		 (a) The political neutrality of the civil service may not be maintained under a politically appointed SCS with political inclinations; and (b) As civil servants strive to safeguard their interests, the civil service may be forced to become politicised. In the end, the interests of civil servants may be sacrificed as a result of the political "tussle".
* 12.	Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association (CB(2)1931/01-02(01))	(a) There is concern about the impact of the re-structuring of bureaux, and the re-distribution of responsibilities among bureaux, on the services provided to the public, as well as the work, rights and benefits of civil servants.	(b) Civil servants need not be too concerned about the office of SCS being filled by a political appointee. The Government should enhance communication and establish a partnership relationship with civil servants at all levels. This partnership relationship will enable principal officials to win the cooperation and support of civil servants, which is crucial to the success of the proposed system.

LC Paper I		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			 (c) Whether principal officials can bring in practical and innovative ideas and formulate long term policies within their term of office; and (d) Policy decision making under the proposed system should be free from abuse of power, and responsive to the views of the community and the civil servants.
E	Clerical and Professional Employees Association (B(2)2013/01-02(10)	(a) In support of the accountability system; and(b) The Government should step up the publicity of the accountability system to enlist the support of the general public.	
Tı C	The Hong Kong Federation of Frade Unions Social Policy Committee (B(2)1947/01-02(02)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 15.	Motor Transport Workers General Union CB(2)1857/01-02(10)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
16.	Food and Beverage Industry Employees General Union CB(2)1854/01-02(13)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
17.	Hong Kong Federation of Employees' Unions in Public Utilities CB(2)1854/01-02(08)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
18.	Hong Kong Printing Industry Workers Union CB(2)1947/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
*		Hong Kong Executive, Administrative & Clerical Staff Association CB(2)1857/01-02(02)	 (a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; (b) The proposed system complies with BL; (c) In support of the proposed reorganisation of bureaux and reduction of the number of bureaux; and (d) The proposed system will enhance the operation of ExCo. 	
*	21.	Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers CB(2)1857/01-02(01) The Association of Hong Kong Health Care Professionals CB(2)1857/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.(a) In support of the prposed system.	

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
22.	Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union CB(2)1947/01-02(04)	(a) In support of the proposed system.		
23.	Hong Kong Manufacturing Industry Employees General Union CB(2)1985/01-02(02)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	(c) The proposed system will improve the civil service system.	
24.	Harbour Transportation Workers General Union CB(2)1985/01-02(01)	(a) In support of the proposed system.		
25.	Hong Kong & Kowloon Spinning Weaving and Dyeing Trade Workers General Union CB(2)1947/01-02(05)	(a) In support of implementing the proposed system by 1 July 2002.	(b) The proposed system will improve the operation of the civil service which needs to be restructured.	

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
26.	The Education Advancement Society for Workers in Hong Kong and Kowloon CB(2)1854/01-02(15)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	 (c) The structure and ideology of the civil service system passed on from the British rule no longer meet the needs of Hong Kong after the reunification. The accountability system will enable CE to recruit a core group of principal officials who share his political visions to support him in his governance; and (d) The proposed system will not affect the appointment, promotion, welfare and career prospect of civil servants in general. 	
27.	Business and Professionals Federation of Hong Kong CB(2)1854/01-02(06)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo Members will ensure harmonisation in policy formulation; (c) The communication between ExCo and the public, the media and legCo will be enhanced; 	(e) The proposed role for CS and the Financial Secretary under the new system will enhance better coordination among bureaux;	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		(d) In support of the proposed reduction of the number of bureaux.	 (f) The political neutrality of the civil service will not be affected by the proposed system. Also, with the Directors of Bureaux and the Permanent Secretaries to look to for guidance, civil servants will become more confident with their work; and (g) In support of a review of advisory bodies and committees.
Indus	astries (2)1974/01-02(01)	 (a) In support of implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members will facilitate internal coordination within the Government. 	 (c) The principal officials, who are appointed from the elites of the society, and the civil servants will complement each other through cooperation; (d) The separation of political accountability from execution of policies will ensure the political neutrality of the civil service; and

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(e) The restrictions on post-office employment on principal officials should not deter competent people from joining the Government.
* 29.	The Hong Kong Chinese Enterprises Association CB(2)1895/01-02(02)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	
30.	Hong Kong Chinese Importers' and Exporters' Association CB(2)1985/01-02(03)	 (a) Before implementing the accountability system, the Government should seek and accept the views from across the community. It should also review the system in due course and constantly improve the operation of the accountability system; (b) The accountability system is consistent with BL; 	(d) Hopes that CE will appoint more talents from outside the government as principal officials.

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		(c) The accountability system will not change the functions of ExCo provided by BL. The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members will strengthen ExCo's role as a decision-making body and will enhance communication and cooperation with LegCo.	
	The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong (No written submission provided)	(a) The proposed system will improve the operation of the Government and pave the way for democratic development.	 (b) In support of the proposed relationship between the principal officials and Permanent Secretaries; (c) Restrictions on principal officials taking up post-office employment should not have the effect of deterring able persons from joining the Government; and (d) Civil servants should support the accountability system and fully cooperate with the principal officials.

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
32.	The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1854/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The Government should regularly review and improve the accountability system after its implementation.	
* 33.	The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce - Central and Western District Liaison Group CB(2)1857/01-02(13)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	
* 34.	The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce-YMT-TST-MKK District Liaison Group CB(2)1974/01-02(08)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002.	
* 35.	Hong Kong Swatow Merchants Association Limited CB(2)1974/01-02(09)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002.	
* 36.	Hong Kong Foshan Trader Association CB(2)1857/01-02(05)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	

Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
Technology Federation CB(2)1974/01-02(10)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) Objects to the amalgamation of the Information Technology portfolio with that of Economic Services, which will compromise the development of information technology; (c) The existing Information Technology and Broadcasting Bureau should be preserved to form a new Science and Technology Development Bureau with the addition of the functions of the Innovation and Technology Commission under the purview of the existing Commerce and Industry Bureau; 	(f) The Government should strengthen the role of the Information Infrastructure Advisory Committee in assisting in the formulation and execution of policies.	

	Organisation/ Individual oer No. of a submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		 (d) In the event the Government should decide in the end to place Information Technology under Economic Development Bureau, then a post of Permanent Secretary should be created to be responsible for the area of information technology, and should incorporate the wording of "information" and "technology" into the name of the new policy bureau; (e) The Government should consult the information technology industry regarding the re-organisation of bureaux with Information Technology related portfolios. 	
* 38.	Hong Kong General Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1857/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) The proposed system will complement and benefit the civil service;(c) Principal officials should improve communication with civil servants; and

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(d) Restrictions on post-office employment should not deter able persons from accepting appointment as principal officials.
* 39.	Fukien Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1895/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL; and(c) Principal officials should be appointed to ExCo.	
* 40.	The Chiu Chau Plastic Manufacturers Association Company Limited CB(2)2013/01-02(05)	(a) In support of the accountability system which should be implemented five years later so that the Government can first improve the economy before reforming the government structure.	
* 41.	Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawker Associations CB(2)1857/01-02(04)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	

Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civi Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
Friends of the Earth (Hong Kong), Green China Foundation, Hong Kong Bird Watching	 (a) Not in support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002 as there will not be sufficient time for public consultation; and (b) The proposed merging of the Environment and Food Bureau with Health and Welfare Bureau into a new Environment, Health & Welfare Bureau is against the global trend and will undermine the importance of environmental and conservation issues in Government policies. Sufficient public consultation should be conducted before finalising the restructuring of the Environment and Food Bureau. 	

	Organisation/ Individual oer No. of a submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 43	The Conservancy Association CB(2)1974/01-02(12)	 (a) Opposes the amalgamation of the portfolios of Environment & Food and Health & Welfare, which will result in the duties of the new bureau being too wide and undermine its ability to concentrate on the management of environmental and conservation affairs; and (b) Should establish an independent environment and resources bureau to coordinate works related to pollution, environmental protection, the ecosystem, heritage and culture, and conservation. 	
* 44	Friends of the Earth (Hong Kong) CB(2)1974/01-02(11)	(a) Opposes the amalgamation of the portfolios of Environment & Food and Health & Welfare, which will result in too wide an area of work for the new bureau, thereby undermining its ability to concentrate on the handling of environmental and conservation matters;	(c) Government structure and advisory bodies should be reviewed in an objective and fair manner and with sufficient public consultation.

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
		(b) Should establish an independent bureau for environment and conservation.		
* 45.	New Century Society Limited CB(2)1974/01-02(13)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) Should establish a monitoring mechanism for the accountability system; (c) Should establish an ad hoc department under CE to solve problems arising from the implementation of the accountability system; (d) Should establish an inter-departmental management body to coordinate the works related to environmental protection. 	(e) Each principal official should be free to recruit four administrative support staff to assist his work.	
* 46.	Kowloon Women's Organisation Federation CB(2)2013/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the accountability system;(b) The accountability system is consistent with BL.	(c) The accountability system does not have significant impact on the recruitment, terms of employment, promotion, welfare and prospects of civil servants as a whole.	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
47. Hong Kong S Women's Ass CB(2)1854/03	ociation	(a) In support of the proposed system.		
Women's Ass Hong Kong T Women Association, Women's Ass Shatin Women Tuen Mun Din Association, Cheung Chau Association,	Association, her Women Outlying Islands sociation, in Shui Wai ciation, outhern District sociation, n's Association, strict Women's Women's	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) The accountability system will facilitate communication between the Government and the public, the Government will give due consideration to the needs of the public when implementing policies, which will help consolidate popular mandate and speed up democratic development; (c) The consolidation of portfolios from 16 to 11 will allow a more reasonable distribution of resources. 	 (d) Principal officials under the accountability system should be required to declare their interests to ensure their integrity and honesty; and (c) The accountability system will ensure the stability and neutrality of the civil service. 	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Service under the proposed system; Relationship
	Sai Kung Women's Association, Tseun Wan Kwai Tsing District Women's Association, The Women's Association of Tseung Kwan O Community, Women Service Association, Tseung Kwan O Women's Centre, New Territories Association of Societies Women's Centre, Wisenice Club CB(2)2072/01-02(01)		
49.	Wah Fu Estate Woman's Association CB(2)1854/01-02(16)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	(c) The merits of the civil service will be preserved under the proposed system.

LC Pape	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 50.	Tuen Mun Youths Association CB(2)1974/01-02(21)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) In support of the election of CE by universal suffrage but BL stipulates that the political system will not be reviewed until 2007. It is necessary to implement the accountability system as soon as possible to improve governance and solve the economic problems. 	(c) CE should consider appointing likeminded core figures of political parties and professionals as principal officials and make use of the media to facilitate the implementation of policies.
* 51.	Alliance of Hong Kong Youth Groups CB(2)1974/01-02(16)	 (a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members will enable ExCo to develop its professionalism and arrive at more timely and rational decisions; (c) The scope of certain portfolios need to be followed-up by inter-bureaux and inter-departmental working groups; 	 (e) The delegation of powers by CE to principal officials, the separation of the latter from the civil service and the introduction of the accountability system is a milestone in the development of democracy in Hong Kong; (f) There is concern that the accountability system may not be put to effective practice if the majority of the Directors' posts are taken up by incumbent Secretaries;

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux Principal officials under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions		
		(d) The accountability system is incapable of improving the relationship between the executive and legislature.	 (g) The accountability system will change the function of civil servants. Moreover, principal officials will review the staffing and structure of the policy bureaux and departments. As a result, the civil service system will suffer from a long unstable state; (h) The Directors of Bureau under the accountability system should establish a sound mechanism of communication and coordination with the civil servants who work under them; and (i) Should build up networks and think-tank bodies outside the Government to receive public views so as to raise the quality of the policies.

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 52. Hong Kong Youths Unifed Association CB(2)1974/01-02(17)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) In support of the proposed legislative arrangement under which the accountability system will be implemented without incurring substantial public expenditure; (c) It is doubtful whether the accountability system can improve the relationship between the executive and legislature; (d) The Manpower and Welfare portfolios should merge to become an Employment and Welfare Bureau. 	 (e) Opposes to the creation of the posts of Permanent Secretary; (f) Should create two posts of Deputy Secretary to assist CS and Financial Secretary in the management of the relevant departments; (g) The number of principal officials should be changed so that there will be three Secretaries of Department, two Deputy Secretaries of Department and seven Directors of Bureau; (h) SCS should not be a political appointee and should be placed under the purview of the Deputy Chief Secretary; and (i) The post of Director of CE's Office should not be taken up by a civil servant.

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
*		Hong Kong Youth Association CB(2)1974/01-02(18)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	(b) The accountability system enables CE to have flexibility in selecting talents from the society to become principal officials to complement the existing civil service system and is conducive to the good governance of Hong Kong.
*		Hong Kong United Youth Association CB(2)2013/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002.	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 55. Tsuen Wan Youths Association CB(2)1974/01-02(19)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) Hong Kong's economy is changing rapidly. However, BL stipulates that the development of the political system will not be reviewed until 2007. Therefore, it is necessary to implement the accountability system as soon as possible to improve governance and to solve the economic problems. The implementation of the system should not be postponed until after the election of CE by universal suffrage; (c) With the monitoring of LegCo and the media, there will not be abuse of power by principal officials and CE. 	(d) The existing civil service structure no longer meets the needs of society. The accountability system can enhance the efficiency of administration.
* 56. Tseung Kwan O Youth Association CB(2)1974/01-02(20)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 57.	New Youth Forum CB(2)1895/01-02(08)	(a) The public should be consulted on the details of the accountability system and any future changes to the system to ensure there is transparency;	(e) Political accountability of principal officials should be separated from policy implementation by civil servants;
		(b) In support of transferring the ExCo Secretariat to the CE's Office;	(f) Some principal officials may be overloaded with responsibilities that they may not be able to maintain close contact with LegCo;
		(c) The duties and responsibilities of the bureaux after re-organisation have to be appropriately defined;	(g) There may be difficulty in finding suitable candidates to fill the offices of politically appointed principal officials;
		(d) The merge of the Manpower portfolio with Commerce and Industry may cause continuing education to become too business-oriented.	and(h) The relationship between principal officials and advisory/statutory bodies should be reviewed.
* 58.	Union Fencing Club CB(2)1857/01-02(11)	(a) Election of CE by universal suffrage and party politics, though conducive to enhancing accountability, need time to develop. The proposed accountability system is a desirable step forward.	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 59.	Kowloon Federation of Associations CB(2)1974/01-02(28)	 (a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; (b) If LegCo has the power to select and remove principal officials, the Hong Kong's political system will become legislature-led instead of executive-led and will contravene BL. 	(c) There is concern that the politicalisation will bring along instability, compounded by the restriction of a 5-year term, it will be difficult to attract talents to join the Government. If nearly all posts of principal officials are taken up by incumbent civil servants, the accountability system will not be put into effective practice.
* 60.	Kowloon City District Residents Association (no written submission provided)	(a) The accountability system is consistent with BL.	 (b) The accountability system will not affect the civil servants. The Government will preserve the good tradition of the civil service; and (c) Principal officials and Permanent Secretaries will cooperate with each other wholeheartedly to improve the efficiency of administration.
* 61.	Tai Hang Concern Association CB(2)1974/01-02(22)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002.	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 62.	Lei Cheng Uk Residents Association CB(2)1974/01-02(25)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	
63.	East Kowloon District Residents' Committee CB(2)1974/01-02(26)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	
64.	The Society for the Coordination & Promotion of Eastern District CB(2)1854/01-02(04)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) Formulation of policies and decision making under the proposed system will become more democratic and scientific; (c) By increasing the transparency of decision making within the Government, the proposed system will enhance the monitoring of the Government by the public, the media and LegCo; 	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Service under the proposed system; Relationship
		(d) Amalgamation of bureaux will enable more rational distribution of responsibilities and resources among bureaux; and	
		(e) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo Members will facilitate better coordination within the Government.	
	Yau Tsim Mong Federation of Association CB(2)1854/01-02(05)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	 (c) Principal officials appointed from outside the civil service will bring in innovative ideas and vision to the Government; and (d) Principal officials should improve
			communication with the public.

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
	The Association of the Hong Kong Central and Western District Limited CB(2)2013/01-02(09)	 (a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; and (b) Questions the amalgamation of Commerce and Industry with Manpower to become a policy bureau instead of merging Commerce and Industry with Economic Development as well as that of Manpower with Education. 	
67.	Aberdeen Inhabitants Union Association Ltd. CB(2)1854/01-02(09)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) In support of the proposed reorganisation and reduction of the number of bureaux; (c) There is concern about effective coordination and rational distribution of responsibilities among bureaux. 	(d) There should be a code of practice setting out the procedures for the removal of principal officials.

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
*		The Hong Kong Southern District Alliance CB(2)1917/01-02(03)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002.	
*		The Hong Kong Island Federation CB(2)1895/01-02(04)	 (a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and (b) The Legislative Council (LegCo) should expedite funding approval for the early implementation of the accountability system. 	
*		The Hong Kong Wan Chai District Association CB(2)1857/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) Principal officials should be appointed to ExCo.	(c) SCS should be appointed from within the civil service.

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
*	71.	Sham Shui Po Residents Association CB(2)1974/01-02(24)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; and(b) In support of the reorganisation of 16 policy bureaux into 11.	
*	72.	Kwun Tong Residents Association CB(2)2013/01-02(08)	(a) The accountability system is consistent with BL.	(b) The accountability system will not undermine the morale and stability of the civil service, nor will it have significant impact on civil servants' employment, promotion and welfare.
	73.	Quarry Bay Resident's Association CB(2)1854/01-02(18)	(a) The proposed system complies with BL.	
*	74.	Wah Fu Service Centre Limited CB(2)1895/01-02(05)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	

	_	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
*	75.	New Territories Association of Societies CB(2)1974/01-02(29)	(a) In support of the implementation of accountability system on 1 July 2002.	
*	76.	Kwai Chung Residents Association CB(2)1974/01-02(23)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	
	77.	Shaukiwan and Chaiwan Residents Fraternal Association CB(2)1854/01-02(17)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
*		Causeway Bay Association Limited CB(2)1974/01-02(27)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002. The Government should enhance publicity to dispel the misgivings among the public and it is not necessary to postpone the implementation date.	
	79.	Shan Wei City Hai Lu Feng Clansmen Association Ltd. CB(2)1854/01-02(02)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) The proposed system complies with BL; and	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		(c) LegCo should expedite its deliberation on the proposed system so that it can be implemented as soon as possible.	
80.	Hong Kong Federation of Shan Wei City Association CB(2)1854/01-02(10)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) LegCo should expedite its deliberation on the proposed system so that it can be implemented as soon as possible; and (c) The proposed system complies with BL. 	
* 81.	Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations CB(2)1895/01-02(07)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
* 82.	Fukien Athletic Club Ltd (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
* 83.	The Foochow Association (no written submission provided)	(a) In support of the accountability system; and	

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		(b) The Government should assess the difficulties and problems that will arise in the implementation of the accountability system and tackle them in order to lessen the impact of the reform on the society and to ensure the successful implementation of the system.	
	Cultural and Recreational Services Centre CB(2)1974/01-02(15)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members will facilitate the implementation of policies; and (c) In support of the proposed reorganisation of policy bureaux. 	
* 85.	Community Activities Centre CB(2)1857/01-02(08)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
86.	Po Kin Athletic Society CB(2)1854/01-02(14)	 (a) In support of the proposed system; (b) The proposed system complies with BL; and (c) LegCo should expedite its examination on the proposed system so that it can be implemented as soon as possible. 	
* 87.	The King Chung Association CB(2)1974/01-02(14)	(a) In support of the implementation of the accountability system on 1 July 2002; and(b) The majority of public opinions are in favour of the accountability system.	
* 88.	Hong Kong Fishermen's Association CB(2)1974/01-02(31)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) After the implementation of the accountability system, LegCo's role in monitoring and checking and balancing the power of CE and the Government of HKSAR will remain 	(c) The traditional system and culture of the civil service will be preserved under the accountability system. Except for the 14 principal officials, the roles of other civil servants will remain unchanged and the stability of the civil service will be maintained.

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			unchanged, nor will its power be weakened.	
*	89.	Joint Committee of Hong Kong Fisherman's Organizations CB(2)1974/01-02(30)	(a) Principal officials should not be removed on the passage of a noconfidence motion by LegCo since this will interfere with CE's power to appoint and remove senior officials and is not consistent with BL.	(b) The accountability system enables CE to select talents who share his political vision to become principal officials so as to improve the efficiency of administration.
*		New Territories Fishermen Fraternity Association CB(2)1895/01-02(03)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
		Professor John BURNS University of Hong Kong CB(2)1854/01-02(21)	 (a) The accountability system will centralise powers in the hands of CE; (b) There is no new institutional mechanism to ensure that policies will meet the expectations of the community more effectively under the proposed system; 	(e) The power of CS will be weakened;(f) The distinction between the roles of principal officials and Permanent Secretaries is not clear;

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
		 (c) With the principal officials appointed as ExCo Members, ExCo will play a more active role in policy making; (d) The proposed system will not enable the Government to gain greater support form LegCo as LegCo will have no role to play in the appointment of principal officials. 	 (g) Since it is likely that most of the principal officials will be appointed from within the civil service, there will not be much change in the Government after the implementation of the proposed system; and (h) The Government should ensure that restrictions on principal officials taking up post-office employment should not have the effect of deterring able persons from joining the Government. 	
	Tong versity of Hong Kong 013/01-02(11)	(a) The existing Women's Commission should be put directly under CS.		
	Shiu-hing versity of Hong Kong 013/01-02(02)		(a) LegCo can strengthen its role in monitoring the performance of principal officials through the following measures -	

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 94.	Mr CHEUNG Yat-fung The University of Hong Kong CB(2)2013/01-02(02)		 (i) to invite candidates nominated for principal officials to attend Council meetings to enhance mutual understanding and communication and to move a motion debate to decide whether to endorse the nominations of principal officials and to require the principal officials to pay attention to particular policies; (ii) in the event of serious policy blunders, to move a motion of noconfidence in the principal official concerned to hold him accountable; (iii) to request principal officials to explain to LegCo their policy objectives in the following year and to evaluate the progress made; and

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			 (iv) to request principal officials to submit work reports at the end of their term for reference of their successors. (b) LegCo may consider reorganising its panels to enhance their communication with the principal officials and to strengthen the latter's accountability; (c) LegCo may urge government departments to tie their performance pledges with the policy objectives of the principal officials; and (d) LegCo may establish a panel on public and subvented organisations to enhance monitoring of public organisations.

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 95.	Mr KWONG Kam-kwan The University of Hong Kong CB(2)2013/01-02(03)		(a) SCS, being a political appointee, would find himself in a difficult position when exercising his duties, as he has to protect the rights of the civil servants and be held politically accountable for his decisions at the same time. This would deepen internal conflicts within the Government and undermine the effectiveness of the accountability system;
			(b) The Permanent Secretaries, who are not political appointees, will still be responsible for promoting and executing policies, making the effectiveness of the accountability system doubtful; and
			(c) As LegCo is not in a position to influence the appointment or removal of principal officials, nor does it have the means to monitor their performance, its relationship with the Government will not improve. It is suggested that LegCo may invite principal official designates to

Organis Individu LC Paper No. of Written submission		Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and
		introduce themselves to LegCo to enhance mutual understanding, so as to improve the relationship between LegCo and the Government.
96. Dr Eliza LEE The Chinese University Hong Kong CB(2)1854/01-02(20)	of	 (a) It is in the best interest of Hong Kong to maintain political neutrality of the civil service. The following measures can help achieve political neutrality of the civil service - (i) CE and Principal officials should accept the advice of the Public Service Commission. They should not be vested with the power to decide on the promotion of civil servants, including officials at the rank of D8;

	Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
97. Dr Wilson Wong The Chinese Un Hong Kong CB(2)1947/01-0	iversity of 02(06)	 (a) The problem of Government making bad policy decisions still remains even with improved policy implementation under the proposed system; (b) Institutional checks on the powers of CE and principal officials should be provided; 	 (ii) There should be a code of conduct for principal officials and the civil service respectively. The latter should embrace the value of political neutrality of the civil service; and (iii) Permanent Secretaries should be appointed from within the civil service. (e) As there may be competition among principal officials for resources, performance and results, CE will need to exercise a very strong leadership to maintain policy consensus and coordination; and

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		 (c) Constitutional conventions should be developed to enable LegCo to have a role to play in the appointment and removal of principal officials; (d) The proposed system will lead to expansion of the top echelon of Government at the expense of civil servants at lower levels. 	(f) The proposed system may undermine the strength of the existing civil service system. Hence, there should be institutional safeguard to ensure the integrity and political neutrality of the civil service.
* 98. Dr MA Ngok The Universit Technology CB(2)1974/0	ty of Science and	 (a) The accountability system as proposed by the Administration has not set out the details which should be taken into consideration in implementation. The Government should, as far as possible, set out the details of the accountability system through legislation and in other written forms. The Government should not implement the new system hastily on 1 July 2002; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members is a rational 	 (j) May consider the delegation of the power of the Secretary for Justice (SJ) to make decisions on criminal prosecutions to prevent interference on the principle of criminal prosecutions by political appointees; (k) It is not necessary for the Secretary for the Civil Service (SCS) to be selected from within the civil service. The appointment and performance assessment functions should be separated from those related to the review of the civil service

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		arrangement; (c) ExCo would become a collective decision-making body. It is necessary to introduce a mechanism for collective accountability for decisions made by ExCo and to define the rights and obligations of the Directors of Bureau relative to ExCo and CE; (d) CE should appoint new ExCo members based on their representativeness of different classes and political opinions; (e) The reorganisation of bureaux should be based on the principle of enhancement of efficiency or sound integration of policies. The Government should consider a more thorough reorganisation of the framework to achieve a more rational redistribution of the portfolios of the various bureaux;	system and other policy areas. The head of the civil service should be a civil servant directly responsible to the Chief Secretary for Administration (CS) for the former functions, while a principal official under the accountability system will be responsible for the latter functions; (1) There is little difference between the duties of Permanent Secretaries and deputy secretaries and those of principal officials under the accountability system. It is therefore necessary to ascertain whether holders of the former two posts are required to be accountable to a certain extent for policy mishaps they have made. The principal officials should be responsible for policy areas which require direct accountability to the public and the Legislative Council (LegCo). In the long run, the deputy Secretaries should also be politically appointed; and

LC Paper No. of Written submission	Organisation/ Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
		 (f) The original grouping of economyrelated portfolios should be maintained as far as possible; (g) The Education and Manpower portfolios should be split to become separate bureaux; (h) Environment should be separated from Food and Hygiene. The latter can be merged with Health and Welfare while the former with part of the urban planning functions of the Planning and Lands Bureau to become a new Environment and Planning Bureau; (i) Not in support of placing the Manpower portfolio under Industry and Commerce Bureau. Labour protection should merge with the Welfare portfolio to become an independent bureau for labour matters. 	(m) In order to uphold the political neutrality of the civil service, the Government should institutionalise the mechanism for the protection of civil servants. It should be in the form of legislation or a code of practice providing them the right to refuse to carry out instructions and channel to complain if civil servants are forced to act against their conscience or public interests.

LC Pape Written	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
99.	Professor Frank FU Hong Kong Baptist University CB(2)1854/01-02(19)	(a) ExCo should be recognised as the Cabinet of CE and act as his executive arm. It should be held accountable for the drafting, approval and implementation of policies and indirect supervision of the principal officials.	 (b) The appointment of principal officials should be transparent; (c) The working relationship between the bureaux and departments should be clearly defined. Feedback from peers/staff should be considered in the assessment of the performance of the principal officials; and (d) The role of advisory and statutory bodies and their relationship with ExCo should be clearly defined.
* 100.	Mr Daniel R. Fung, QC, SC (no written submission provided)		(a) In support of the separation of political accountability from the responsibilities of the departments in executing and administering policies. This will be conducive to preserving the political neutrality as well as boosting morale of the civil service;

LC Pape	Individual	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(b) Political appointees should not be responsible for matters relating to criminal prosecution. BL does not stipulate that such duty must be executed by SJ only. The duties can be taken up by the Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) and the post of DPP should be held by a civil servant; and
			(c) To strike a balance between enlisting talents from outside the civil service and preserving the political neutrality of the civil service, the Government should also study in detail whether other Law Officers should be politically appointed.
* 101.	Mr WONG Siu-yee Member, Kowloon City District Council CB(2)2013/01-02(01)	(a) In support of the concept of the accountability system but has reservations on the framework and details of implementation proposed by the Government;	(c) In support of the enhancement of the accountability of principal officials. Eventually all civil servants should be included in the accountability system;

Organ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission	Overall comments on the ac Consistency with the Basic I The function, composition a Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and reten	Law (BL); Ser nd operation of the Rev ation of bureaux imp	incipal officials under the proposed system; Civil rvice under the proposed system; Relationship tween bureaux and departments; view of advisory and statutory/public bodies and plications of the proposed system on their roles d functions
	(b) As the posts of Perm are not provided for a Government may be for possible contrave Moreover, it should whether the posts of Secretaries should be residents of Hong Ko abode in any foreign	in BL, the challenged in future ention of BL. be stated clearly Permanent e held by permanent ong with no right of	The accountability system will become meaningless if the majority of the posts of principal officials are taken up by incumbent Policy Secretaries; Whether principal officials have the power to deploy or dismiss staff of the executive departments under their respective portfolios, and what impact the accountability system will have on the deployment of serving Administrative Officers; Some of the provisions in the draft code for principal officials will tie the hands of the officials. Besides, the standards are ambiguous and may create conflicts between them and the Permanent Secretaries, thereby discouraging elites from outside the civil service from joining the Government; and

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(g) How the Government can guarantee that after the implementation of the accountability system, civil servants will be loyal to the Chief Executive (CE) and the principal officials and support and execute their decisions wholeheartedly, and that the principle of political neutrality of the civil service will not be abused.
* 102.	Ms LEE Ming-pui Member, Wong Tai Sin District Council (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) Principal officials should enhance communication with the District Councils, and the latter should have a greater role to play in assisting with the formulation and implementation of government policies.
* 103.	Dr LI Sze-bay, Albert, JP Member, Wong Tai Sin District Council (no written submission provided)	(a) Since all principal officials will be appointed as ExCo members, the Government should appoint an adequate number of non-official Exco members to strike a balance.	(b) The Government should draw up clear criteria for the appointment of principal officials, placing emphasis on the candidate's work attitude and past performance, and require candidates to pass the integrity checks.

	Organisation/ Individual er No. of a submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 104	Mr CHEUNG Yan-hong Member, Wong Tai Sin District Council CB(2)1974/01-02(06)	(a) In support of the implementation of accountability system on 1 July 2002.	(b) The accountability system enables CE to exercise flexibility in selecting talents from outside the civil service to become principal officials, who will assist him in the administration of the HKSAR affairs.
105	Mr LAM Wing-yin Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1854/01-02(03)	(a) District Councils should be consulted on details of the proposed system as soon as possible.	
* 106	Mr HIEW Chin Member, Sai Kung Distict Council CB(2)1895/01-02(09)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	
107	. Mr FAN Kwok-wai Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1854/01-02(03)	(a) Not in support of the proposed system since the principal officials will only be accountable to CE who was not directly elected by the people of Hong Kong.	

LC Paper : Written su		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
M C	Mr WAN Yut-kau Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1854/01-02(03)		(a) A mechanism under which principal officials shall resign from office for serious blunders should be established; and(b) More than half of the principal officials should be appointed from outside the civil service.
M C	Mr LAU Hing-kee Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1854/01-02(03)	(a) The proposed system is a big step forward towards democracy.	 (b) The duties and responsibilities of principal officials and Permanent Secretaries must be clearly defined; (c) How will principal officials maintain effective communication with LegCo and District Councils; (d) Whether there will be consultation on the appointment of principal officials; and (e) Whether principal officials can be appointed to other public offices after leaving service.

Individual (Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
110. Mr LOUR Tsang-tsay Member, Sai Kung District Council CB(2)1854/01-02(03)	(a) The Constitutional Affairs Bureau should be overseen by the Chief Secretary for Administration (CS) while the portfolios of Environment, Health & Welfare and Education should be reorganised to form the Environment & Health Bureau and Education & Welfare Bureau.	 (b) There is concern whether the newly appointed principal officials can effectively manage the re-structured policy bureaux and the working relationship between the bureaux and the executive departments; and (c) The remuneration for the Permanent Secretaries should be less than that for the principal officials.
* 111. Mr CHAN Choi-hi Member, Central and Western District Council (no written submission provided)	(a) Opposes the merge of the portfolio of Environment with Health and Welfare. The scope of duties of the proposed Environment, Health and Welfare Bureau is too wide, which will deprive environmental affairs of the attention and resources they deserve.	 (b) LegCo should establish a select committee and "shadow minister" to monitor the work of the Secretaries of Department and Directors of Bureau; (c) It is necessary to establish a comprehensive mechanism for the declaration of interests by principal officials; and

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
		(d) To prevent conflict of interests, it is necessary to impose restrictions on the employment of principal officials within the first year after leaving office.	
* 112. Mr CHAN Chit-kwai Member, Central and Western District Council CB(2)1974/01-02(07)	 (a) In support of the speedy implementation of the accountability system with sound mechanisms of public monitoring and declaration of interests; (b) The appointment of principal officials as ExCo members will facilitate the coordination between ExCo and bureaux; (c) Moreover, LegCo Members or representatives of political parties may also be appointed as ExCo members. This will facilitate the cooperation and communication between Exco and LegCo. 	(d) Under the accountability system, civil servants will only concern themselves with the formulation and execution of policies. This will ensure the neutrality and productivity of the civil servants.	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 113.	Mr YEUNG Pak-sing Member, Kwun Tong District Council (no written submission provided)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	 (b) Should define clearly the duties of principal officials as well as the Government's demands and expectations on them; and (c) Should increase transparency in the appointment of principal officials.
* 114.	Mr TSE Ping-kin Member, Kwun Tong District Council (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) The Government should consider appointing advisers from a wider spectrum of the community, and review the functions and the number of existing advisory bodies.

	ividual Consistency w The function, Executive Cou	ith the Basic Law (BL); composition and operation of the incil (ExCo); ging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
* 115. Ms LAW Lai-kuen Member, Kwun To Council (no written submiss provided)	ng District the acco	untability system.	(c) While appointing talents from outside the civil service as principal officials, the Government should also preserve the merits and traditional culture of the civil service and avoid too great an impact on the civil service. Principal officials appointed from outside the civil service and civil servants should work together wholeheartedly to complement each other.
* 116. Mr CHAN Yan-cho Member, Sham Shu Council (No written submis provided)	ni Po District	rt of the proposed system. ((b) Each principal official should be assisted by a Deputy Director of Bureau whose duties may include that of a press secretary.
* 117. Mr HONG Tsang-y CB(2)1857/01-02(1		rt of implementing the bility system by 1 July 2002;	

	Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
			(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	
*		Mr CHU Chun-lok CB(2)1974/01-02(34)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	
*	119.	Ms YU Kwei-chun Member, The Chinese General Chamber of Commerce CB(2)1857/01-02(14)	 (a) The majority of the people of Hong Kong support the proposed system; (b) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; (c) The proposed system will enhance coordination between bureaux and cooperation with ExCo in policy implementation. 	(d) Principal officials should share the same policy visions as the CE.
*		Mr NG Yat-cheung (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of implementing the accountability system by 1 July 2002; and(b) The proposed system complies with BL.	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Individual or No. of	Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions	
*		Mr NG Man-kwong CB(2)1857/01-02(15)	(a) In support of the proposed system; and(b) The system complies with BL.		
*		Mr CHOW Hing CB(2)1974/01-02(32)	 (a) In support of the implementation of accountability system on 1 July 2002; (b) To consolidate 16 policy bureaux into 11 will help improve the efficiency of administration but the Government should define clearly the functions of the various bureaux and their departments. 	(c) The proposed remuneration of principal officials under the accountability system is acceptable but it should be reviewed regularly and adjusted in line with market pay trend.	
*		Mr CHAN Chung-bun (no written submission provided)	(a) In support of the accountability system.	 (b) Should define clearly the relationship between principal officials and Permanent Secretaries and their duties; and (c) The mass media and LegCo can continue to monitor the work of principal officials effectively. 	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
124	. Mr CHAN Kin CB(2)1854/01-02(22)	(a) In support of the proposed system;(b) In support of the appointment of the principal officials as ExCo Members.	(c) Principal officials will be accountable to the general public through CE.
* 125	. Mr CHAN Sun CB(2)1974/01-02(33)	 (a) In support of the accountability system; (b) The Government should make reference to the successful experience of other countries and consult various sectors of the community seriously with a view to establishing a rational administrative structure; and (c) To streamline the structure by consolidating the 16 existing policy bureaux into 11 will make the policy portfolios of various Directors more clear-cut, thus enhancing the efficiency of the Government. 	

Organisation/ Individual LC Paper No. of Written submission		Overall comments on the accountability system; Consistency with the Basic Law (BL); The function, composition and operation of the Executive Council (ExCo); Splitting, merging and retention of bureaux	Principal officials under the proposed system; Civil Service under the proposed system; Relationship between bureaux and departments; Review of advisory and statutory/public bodies and implications of the proposed system on their roles and functions
	Mr YIP Fong-keung, Christ (No written submission provided)	(a) In support of the proposed system.	(b) All civil servants should eventually be included in the accountability system.
	Anonymous person CB(2)1854/01-02(23) CB(2)1947/01-02(07)	(a) The proposed system contravenes BL which requires principal officials to be civil servants and therefore to be employed on civil service terms.	

^{*}Organisations/ individuals who have made oral representations to the Subcommittee

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
27 May 2002