

Corporate Governance Review
By
The Standing Committee on
Company Law Reform

A Consultation Paper
on proposals made
in Phase I of the Review

July 2001

CONTENTS

	Page
Membership of the Standing Committee on Company Law Reform	i
Terms of Reference of the Directors Sub-Committee	iii
Terms of Reference of the Shareholders Sub-Committee	v
Terms of Reference of the Corporate Reporting Sub-Committee	vii
Summary of Proposals	ix
Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION	
1. Background	1
<i>Inception of Review</i>	1
<i>Structure of Review</i>	1
<i>Scope of Review</i>	1
<i>Direction of Review</i>	2
<i>Policy Considerations</i>	3
• <i>Oversea companies</i>	3
• <i>Dominant shareholders</i>	4
• <i>Lack of shareholder activism</i>	5
<i>Programme of Review</i>	6

	2. Future work	7
	<i>The Directors Sub-Committee</i>	7
	<i>The Shareholders Sub-Committee</i>	8
	<i>The Corporate Reporting Sub-Committee</i>	8
	<i>Corporate Regulation</i>	9
	3. Other measures which seek to enhance our corporate governance regime	9
	4. Consultation	10
Chapter 2	DIRECTORS	11
	5. Overview	11
	6. Directors' duties	11
	<i>Background</i>	11
	<i>Position in Hong Kong</i>	12
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	14
	<i>Proposals</i>	15
	7. Voting by directors in relation to directors' self-dealing	16
	<i>Background</i>	16
	<i>Proposals</i>	18
	<i>Rationale</i>	20
	8. Shareholder approval for connected transactions of significance involving directors	21
	<i>Background</i>	21
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	21

	<i>Proposals</i>	26
	● <i>Persons connected with the director</i>	27
	● <i>Controlling shareholder and persons connected with controlling shareholder</i>	27
	● <i>Exception in relation to transactions with wholly owned subsidiaries</i>	27
	● <i>Consequences of breach</i>	28
	<i>Rationale</i>	28
9.	Transactions between directors or connected parties with an associated company	29
	<i>Background</i>	29
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	30
	<i>Proposals</i>	31
	<i>Rationale</i>	31
10.	Nomination and election of directors	32
	<i>Background</i>	32
	<i>Shareholder's right to nominate</i>	34
	<i>Cumulative voting</i>	35
	<i>The SCCLR's views</i>	37
	<i>Proposals</i>	38
11.	Role of the independent director	40
	<i>Background</i>	40
	<i>Proposals</i>	42

Chapter 3	SHAREHOLDERS	44
12.	Overview	44
13.	Self-dealing by controlling shareholders	45
	<i>Background</i>	45
	<i>Listing rules</i>	46
	<i>Whether the requirement to abstain from voting should be incorporated into the law</i>	47
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	48
	<i>Proposals</i>	50
14.	Overview of shareholder remedies	52
	<i>Background</i>	52
	<i>Types of action</i>	52
	<i>Derivative rights</i>	52
	<i>Personal rights</i>	52
	<i>Intervention by regulator</i>	53
15.	Derivative action	53
	<i>Background</i>	53
	<i>The proper plaintiff rule</i>	54
	<i>The majority rule</i>	54
	<i>Exceptions under the rule of Foss v. Harbottle</i>	54
	<i>Wrongdoings that can be ratified and those that cannot</i>	55
	<i>Wrongdoer control</i>	56
	<i>Determining standing as a preliminary issue</i>	56
	<i>Practical difficulties</i>	56

	<i>When should the remedy be available?</i>	57
	<i>Directors' duties and conflict of laws</i>	58
	<i>Proposals</i>	59
	<i>Rationale</i>	60
	<i>Views of the public</i>	60
16.	Unfair prejudice	61
	<i>Background</i>	61
	<i>Scope of section 168A</i>	62
	<i>"Personal wrongs"</i>	63
	<i>Corporate wrongs as a foundation for section 168A actions</i>	64
	<i>Breaches of directors' duties</i>	65
	<i>Oversea companies</i>	65
	<i>Width of available remedies</i>	66
	<i>Difficulties in relation to unfair prejudice remedy</i>	66
	<i>Proposals</i>	68
17.	Personal rights	68
	<i>Background</i>	68
	<i>Memorandum and articles of association</i>	69
	<i>Internal corporate procedure</i>	69
	<i>Inconsistent case law</i>	69
	<i>Proposals</i>	70

18.	Orders for inspection	70
	<i>Background</i>	70
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	71
	<i>Proposals</i>	71
19.	Other powers of the court	72
	<i>Background</i>	72
	<i>General power to injunct</i>	72
	<i>Orders as to costs</i>	73
	<i>Oversea companies</i>	73
20.	The role of regulators	74
	<i>Background</i>	74
	<i>Policy considerations</i>	74
	<i>Proposals</i>	75
Chapter 4	CORPORATE REPORTING	76
21.	Overview	76
22.	Filing of financial statements	77
	<i>Background</i>	77
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	78
	<i>Proposals</i>	80
	<i>Rationale</i>	80
23.	Management discussion and analysis	81
	<i>Background</i>	81
	<i>United Kingdom Approach</i>	82
	<i>The HKSA's Recommendations</i>	82

	<i>Proposals</i>	82
	<i>Rationale</i>	83
24.	Inconsistencies between the audited financial statements and other financial information contained in the directors' report and other sections of the annual report	83
	<i>Background</i>	83
	<i>United Kingdom Approach</i>	83
	<i>Proposals</i>	84
25.	Accounting reference date	84
	<i>Background</i>	84
	<i>United Kingdom Approach</i>	85
	<i>Proposals</i>	85
	<i>Rationale</i>	85
26.	Standards-setting process	86
	<i>Background</i>	86
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	86
	<i>Proposals</i>	88
	<i>Rationale</i>	89
27.	Body to investigate financial statements	90
	<i>Background</i>	90
	<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	91
	<i>Proposals</i>	92
	<i>Rationale</i>	93

28. Quality of audit practice and monitoring of audit practice	93
<i>Background</i>	93
<i>Other jurisdictions</i>	95
<i>Proposals</i>	96
<i>Rationale</i>	96
29. Revision of audited financial statements and related matters	97
<i>Background</i>	97
<i>Proposals</i>	99
<i>Rationale</i>	99

CB(1)2282/02-03

A copy of this document is kept at the Legislative Council Library.
Please contact the Legislative Council Library if you wish to refer to this document.