CB(1)1369/03-04 (02)

Bills Committee on Companies (Amendment) Bill 2003 Schedule 4 – Amendments to the Companies Ordinance relating to Shareholder Remedies Clause-by-clause examination

At **Annex** is a preliminary draft mark-up version of those provisions relating to derivative action in Schedule 4 of the Companies (Amendment) Bill 2003 to which the Administration would like to propose amendments, having taken into account views expressed at previous meetings of the Bills Committee. The reasons for the amendments are set out in the footnotes.

Financial Services Branch Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau March 2004

AMENDMENTS TO THE COMPANIES ORDINANCE RELATING TO SHAREHOLDERS' REMEDIES

5. Part IVAA added

The following is added immediately after section 168B - "PART IVAA

BRINGING OR INTERVENING IN PROCEEDINGS ON BEHALF OF SPECIFIED CORPORATION

168BA. Definition

In this Part, unless the context otherwise requires, "proceedings" (法律程序) means any proceedings (other than criminal proceedings) within the jurisdiction of the court.

168BB. Members may bring or intervene in proceedings

- (1) A member of a specified corporation may -
 - (a) without leave of the court, bring proceedings

 before the court on behalf of the specified

 corporation; or
 - (b) with the leave of the court granted under subsection (3), intervene in any proceedings before the court to which the specified corporation is a party for the purposes of continuing, discontinuing or defending those proceedings on behalf of the specified corporation.

- (1) A member of a specified corporation may, with leave of the court granted under subsection (3)
 - of the specified corporation; or
 - (b) intervene in any proceedings before the court to which the specified corporation is a party for the purposes of continuing, discontinuing or defending those proceedings on behalf of the specified corporation."¹
- (2) Any proceedings brought under subsection (1) on behalf of a specified corporation shall be brought in the name of the specified corporation.
- (3) The court may, on the application of a member of a specified corporation, grant leave for the purpose of subsection (1)(b) if it is satisfied that
 - (a) the intended intervention is in the best
 interests of the relevant specified
 corporation;
 - (b) the member is acting in good faith in the application for leave to intervene in the proceedings; and
 - (c) except where leave is granted by the court under section 168BC(4), the member has served a

In response to Members' suggestion, these amendments aim to impose a leave requierement for commencing a statutory derivative action.

written notice on the specified corporation in accordance with section 168BC.

- (3) The court may, on the application of a member of a specified corporation, grant leave for the purpose of subsection (1) if it is satisfied that -

 - (b) the applicant is acting in good faith;
 - bring proceedings under subsection (1)(a),
 there is a serious question to be tried and
 it is probable that the specified

 corporation will not itself bring the
 proceedings;
 - (d) if the applicant is applying for leave to intervene in proceedings under subsection (1)(b), it is probable that the specified corporation will not itself properly take responsibility for those proceedings; and
 - (e) except where leave is granted by the court
 under section 168BC(4), the member has
 served a written notice on the specified
 corporation in accordance with section

168BC.²

- (4) This Part shall not affect any common law right of a member of a specified corporation to bring proceedings on behalf of the specified corporation, or intervene in any proceedings to which the specified corporation is a party.
- (5) For the avoidance of doubt, this section does not prevent a member of a specified corporation from bringing proceedings in respect of the specified corporation, or intervening in any proceedings to which the specified corporation is a party, on his own behalf in respect of his personal right.

168BC. Service of written notice

- (1) Subject to subsection (4), a member of a specified corporation shall serve a written notice on the specified corporation at least 14 days before he brings or applies for leave to intervene in proceedings under section 168BB in respect of the specified corporation.
- (2) Service of a written notice under this section shall be effected by leaving it at -
 - (a) in the case of a company, its registered office;
 - (b) in the case of a non-Hong Kong company, the address of its authorized representative that is

In response to Members' suggetsion, these amendments aim to add two new requirements, along the lines in section 237(2) of the Australian Corporations Act 2001, for the court to grant leave to a member to commence a statutory derivative action i.e. (a) it is probable that the specified corporation concerned will not bring the proceedings, or take responsibility for them; and (b) there is a serious question to be tried.

See Footnote (1).

registered under section 333.

- (3) A written notice under this section shall state -
 - (a) the intention of the member to bring or apply for leave to intervene in proceedings 4under section 168BB in respect of the specified corporation; and
 - (b) the reasons for his intention.
- (4) The court may grant leave to dispense with the service of a written notice required by this section.

168BD. Court's power to strike out proceedings brought by members

(1) On application by any party to any proceedings brought by a member of a specified corporation under section 168BB(1), the court may, on any of the grounds mentioned in subsection (2), at any time after the proceedings were brought—

- (a) order to be struck out or amended any pleading or the indorsement of any writ in the proceedings brought by the member, or anything in such pleading or indorsement; and
- (b) order the proceedings brought by the member to

 be stayed or dismissed or judgment to be entered

 accordingly.
- (2) The grounds referred to in subsection (1) are -
 - (a) the bringing of proceedings under section

_

⁴ See Footnote (1).

- 168BB(1) is not in the best interests of the relevant specified corporation;
- (b) the proceedings have not been brought by the relevant member of the specified corporation in good faith;
- (c) except where leave is granted by the court under section 168BC(4), the written notice required to be served on the relevant specified corporation under section 168BC has not been served on it or has not been served in accordance with section 168BC; or
- (d) leave granted under section 168BC(4) has been set aside by the court.
- (3) This section is in addition to and does not derogate from any power of the court conferred by any enactment or rule of law.⁵

168BE. Effect of approval or ratification

- (1) The approval or ratification by the members of a specified corporation of any conduct shall not have the effect of -
 - (a) preventing a member of the specified corporation from bringing or intervening in any proceedings under section 168BB(1), or from applying for leave under section 168BB(3);
 - (b) requiring the court to strike out the

- proceedings brought by the member, or 6refuse to
 grant leave under section 168BB(3); or
- (c) requiring the court to determine the proceedings brought or intervened in by the member in favour of the defendant.
- (2) Notwithstanding subsection (1), the court may, after having regard to the following matters in respect of the members of a specified corporation who approved or ratified the relevant conduct, take into account the approval or ratification in deciding what judgment or order (including any order as to damages) to make in respect of any proceedings brought or intervened in by a member of the specified corporation under section 168BB(1), or in respect of an application for leave made under section 168BB(3)
 - (a) the extent of the members' independence of the conduct when they approved or ratified it;
 - (b) how well-informed about the conduct they were when deciding whether or not to approve or ratify it; and
 - (c) whether or not they were acting for proper purposes having regard to the interests of the specified corporation when they approved or ratified it.

See Footnote (1). After the introduction of the leave requirement, the striking out mechanism can be deleted.

⁶ See Footnote (5).

168BF. General powers of court

- (1) The court may, at any time, make any order and give any direction it considers appropriate in respect of any proceedings brought or intervened in by a member of a specified corporation under section 168BB(1), or in respect of an application for leave made under section 168BB(3), including -
 - (a) interim orders pending the determination of the proceedings or application;
 - (b) directions concerning the conduct of the proceedings or application, including requiring mediation;⁸
 - (c) an order directing the specified corporation, or an officer of the specified corporation, to do, or not to do, any act; and
 - (d) an order appointing an independent person to investigate and report to the court on -
 - (i) the financial position of the specified corporation;
 - (ii) the facts or circumstances that gave rise to the proceedings; or
 - (iii) the costs incurred by the parties to the proceedings, and by the member who brought or intervened in the proceedings, or made the application.

These amendments aim to improve the clarity of the proposed section 168BF(1).

- (2) Where the court makes an order under subsection (1)(d), it may make any other orders it considers appropriate for the purposes of that subsection.
- (3) Where the court orders the appointment of an independent person under subsection (1)(d), the court may, at any time -
 - (a) order any or all of the following persons to be liable for any expenses arising out of the investigation -
 - (i) the specified corporation;
 - (ii) the parties to the proceedings;
 - (iii) the member who brought or intervened
 in the proceedings, or made the
 application; and
 - (b) review, vary or revoke an order made pursuant to paragraph (a).
- (4) If an order made pursuant to subsection (3)(a), or the order as varied pursuant to subsection(3)(b), makes 2 or more persons liable for the relevant expenses, the court may also determine the nature and extent of the liability of each of those persons.

168BG. Power of court to make orders as to costs

(1) The court may, at any time, make any order it considers appropriate as to the liabilities of the following persons in relation to the costs of any proceedings brought or intervened

In response to the suggestion made by Mr Winston Poon, SC, these amendments aim to delete the phrase

in by a member of a specified corporation under section 168BB(1), or any proceedings on an application for leave made under section 168BB(3)—

- (a) the specified corporation;
- (b) the parties to the proceedings; and
- (c) the member who brought or intervened in the proceedings, or made the application.

(1) The court may, at any time (including on granting leave under section 168BB(3)), make any order it considers appropriate as to the liabilities of the following persons in relation to the costs of the application for leave or any proceedings brought or intervened in, or to be brought or intervened in, by a member of a specified corporation —

- (a) the specified corporation;
- (b) the parties to the proceedings; and
- (c) the member.9
- (2) An order made under subsection (1) may require indemnification of costs, which may require indemnification, out of the assets of the relevant specified corporation, against the costs incurred or to be incurred by the member referred to in subsection (1)(c) in bringing or intervening in the proceedings, or making the application.

[&]quot;including requiring mediation".

In response to Members' suggestion, these amendments aim to make it clear that the court may grant an order as to costs for proceedings brought or intervened in by a member of the specified corporation once the leave to commence the proceedings is obtained.

(3) The court may only make an order as to costs under this section in favour of the member referred to in subsection (1)(c) if it is satisfied that the member was acting in good faith in, and had reasonable grounds for, bringing or intervening in the proceedings, or making the application.

168BH. Discontinuance or settlement

Proceedings brought or intervened in by a member of a specified corporation under section 168BB(1) shall not be discontinued or settled without the leave of the court.

168BI. Rules of court

The Rules Committee constituted under section 55 of the High Court Ordinance (Cap. 4) may make rules of court for giving effect to this Part as appears to the Committee to be necessary or expedient.".