

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 7

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 13 November 2002 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok
The Hon WONG Sing-chi
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP
The Hon James TO Kun-sun

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Shipping and Port Control (Closure of Waters) (No. 2) Notice 2002 (gazetted on 8.11.2002)	164/2002
2. Waste Disposal (Designated Waste Disposal Facility) (Amendment) Regulation 2002 (L.N. 118 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2002 (gazetted on 8.11.2002)	165/2002
3. Waste Disposal (Refuse Transfer Station) (Amendment) Regulation 2002 (L.N. 119 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2002 (gazetted on 8.11.2002)	166/2002

Other Papers

- No.20 - Report by the Trustee of the Customs and Excise Service Children's Education Trust Fund for the year ending 31 March 2002, together with the Director of Audit's Report and the Audited Statement of Accounts (published on 8.11.2002)
- No.21 - Summary of the Statement of Accounts of the Customs and Excise Service Welfare Fund together with the Director of Audit's Report and the Audited Statement of Accounts (published on 8.11.2002)
- No.22 - The Government Minute in response to the Fourteenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2002 (published on 13.11.2002)

Address

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Fourteenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2002.

Questions

1. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon SZETO Wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

3. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon SZETO Wah asked Question 3 on behalf of Hon James TO, who was absent.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Justice replied.

4. Hon James TIEN asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Statements

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands made a statement on Government's policy on housing.

14 Members put questions to the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands on this statement and the Secretary replied.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that -

(a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment)(No. 4) Regulation 2002; and

(b) the Poisons List (Amendment)(No. 4) Regulation 2002,

made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 22 October 2002, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Reducing electricity and gas tariffs

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to expeditiously discuss with the two power companies and Town Gas and encourage them to take account of their respective operating conditions and reduce their tariffs or offer concessions to users, thereby alleviating the burden on the public and the commercial and industrial sectors.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon NG Leung-sing would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon NG Leung-sing moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion and addressed the Council:

To add “, under the premise of safeguarding the rights of investors to operate in compliance with the law and to determine prices,” after “That this Council urges the Government”.

Question on Hon NG Leung-sing's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

Three Members and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

At 5:53 pm, while Hon Andrew CHENG was still speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 17 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon NG Leung-sing's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion put.

Hon NG Leung-sing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 22 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion and seven against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 23 were present, 21 were in favour of the motion and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Ageing of the population

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the ageing of the population in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government to respond to the changes in the population profile and actively take the lead in promoting a proper perspective on ageing; encourage the public and private sectors to make the best use of the knowledge and experience of senior citizens; promote "lifelong learning" among the elderly; improve town planning and the design of public facilities and housing to create a "barrier-free" environment; provide sound primary health care services; promote a positive and healthy lifestyle; as well as encourage the commercial sector to establish an "elderly-friendly" service culture, thereby creating a favourable social environment for present and future senior citizens to keep on giving full play to their abilities.

While Hon TAM Yiu-chung was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 8:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:30 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

15 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "actively consider the implementation of an old age pension scheme to safeguard the livelihood of the retired elderly;" after "this Council urges the Government to".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 22 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and five against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Ageing of the population at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "consider the financial needs of the elderly and ensure that any adjustments to the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance payment to the elderly will not result in payments that are lower than at the current level;" after "this Council urges the Government to respond to the changes in the population profile and actively take the lead in promoting a proper perspective on ageing;"; and to add "and exempt the elderly from paying the various new and increased fees and

charges proposed for medical services” after “provide sound primary health care services”.

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 20 November 2002 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:41 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 13/11/2002
時間 TIME: 07:50:54 下午

動議 MOTION: 吳亮星議員對李華明議員就「調低電力及煤氣收費」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON NG LEUNG-SING TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "REDUCING ELECTRICITY AND GAS TARIFFS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	22	
投票 Vote	24	21	
贊成 Yes	19	9	
反對 No	4	12	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 13/11/2002
時間 TIME: 07:58:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 「調低電力及煤氣收費」議案
MOTION "REDUCING ELECTRICITY AND GAS TARIFFS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	23	
投票 Vote	25	22	
贊成 Yes	18	21	
反對 No	7	1	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG			
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 13/11/2002
時間 TIME: 10:35:29 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對譚耀宗議員就「人口老齡化」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON
"AGEING OF THE POPULATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	9	16	
反對 No	13	5	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永榮 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 13/11/2002
 時間 TIME: 10:39:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對譚耀宗議員就「人口老齡化」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON
 "AGEING OF THE POPULATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	6	10	
反對 No	14	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK