

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 11

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 11 December 2002 and
Thursday 12 December 2002 at 2:30 pm respectively

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP (absent on 12.12.2002)

The Hon LAU Kong-wah

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok
The Hon WONG Sing-chi
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

On 11.12.2002 and 12.12.2002

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

On 11.12.2002

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Clerks in attendance:

On 11.12.2002 and 12.12.2002

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

On 11.12.2002

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 12.12.2002

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Nurses (Registration and Disciplinary Procedure) (Amendment) Regulation 2002 (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	196/2002
2. Enrolled Nurses (Enrolment and Disciplinary Procedure) (Amendment) Regulation 2002 (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	197/2002
3. Airport Authority Ordinance (Map of Airport Area) Order (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	198/2002
4. Airport Authority Ordinance (Map of Restricted Area) Order (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	199/2002
5. Appeal Board on Closure Orders (Immediate Health Hazard) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	200/2002
6. Securities and Futures (Client Securities) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	201/2002
7. Securities and Futures (Client Money) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	202/2002
8. Securities and Futures (Associated Entities — Notice) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	203/2002
9. Companies Ordinance (Exemption of Companies and Prospectuses from Compliance with Provisions) (Amendment) Notice 2002 (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	204/2002
10. Securities and Futures (Registration of Appeals Tribunal Orders) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	205/2002
11. Securities and Futures (Registration of Market Misconduct Tribunal Orders) Rules (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	206/2002
12. Securities and Futures (Collective Investment Schemes) Notice (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	207/2002
13. Chiropractors Registration Ordinance (Cap. 428) (Commencement) Notice 2002 (gazetted on 6.12.2002)	208/2002

Other Papers

- No.35 - Annual Report on The Police Children's Education Trust and The Police Education and Welfare Trust for the period from 1 April 2001 to 31 March 2002 (published on 3.12.2002)
- No.36 - Emergency Relief Fund Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending on 31 March 2002 (published on 4.12.2002)
- No.37 - Queen Elizabeth Foundation for the Mentally Handicapped Report and Accounts 2001-2002 (published on 4.12.2002)
- No.38 - Hong Kong Sports Development Board Annual Report 2001-2002 (published on 6.12.2002)

Questions

1. Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon Cyd HO asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

3. Hon WONG Sing-chi asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

4. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

6. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Stamp Duty (Amendment) Bill 2002

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Stamp Duty (Amendment) Bill 2002

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

The 70% ceiling for residential mortgage loans

Hon James TIEN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government has introduced measures to stabilize the property market, secondary residential property prices have fallen by about 62% from their peak in 1997 and the public's ability in making property loan repayments has increased by about 73% in the same period, thereby considerably reducing the risk of defaults on mortgage loan, this Council asks the Government to adopt measures to assist needy mortgage applicants in securing more conveniently and speedily loans in excess of 70% of the value of their properties, including improving the conditions and procedures for vetting and approving applications under the mortgage insurance scheme or relaxing the guideline for banks on the 70% ceiling for residential mortgage loans, with a view to boosting property transactions, stabilizing the property market, easing deflation and reviving the economy.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Albert HO would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "thereby considerably reducing the risk of defaults on mortgage loan," after "the public's ability in making property loan repayments has increased by about 73% in the same period,"; to delete "assist needy mortgage applicants in securing more conveniently and speedily loans in excess of 70% of the value of their properties, including improving" and substitute with "improve"; and to delete "or relaxing the guideline for banks on the 70% ceiling for residential mortgage loans" and substitute with "and examine the possibility of lowering the mortgage insurance premium, in order to assist needy mortgage applicants in securing more conveniently and speedily loans in excess of 70% of the value of their properties".

While Hon Albert HO was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 4:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

After declaring his interest as the chief executive of a local bank, Dr Hon David LI spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Three more Members and Hon Fred LI spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 5:05 pm, while Hon Fred LI was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 10 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon James TIEN spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TIEN replied.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 were in favour of the motion and three against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Enacting laws to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law

Hon James TO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council considers that enacting laws according to the proposals in the "Consultation Document on Proposals to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law" will reduce the rights and freedoms enjoyed by the people of Hong Kong and damage the rule of law and "One Country, Two Systems".

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of

Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon James TO's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "this Council considers that enacting" after "That" and substitute with ", as the Government will proceed with the work for enacting"; to delete "the proposals in the 'Consultation Document on Proposals to implement" after "laws according to"; to delete "' will reduce" after "Article 23 of the Basic Law" and substitute with ", this Council urges the Government, in drafting the relevant bill, to fully ensure that"; to add "will not be undermined" after "the rights and freedoms enjoyed by the people of Hong Kong"; to delete "damage" before "the rule of law and 'One Country, Two Systems'"; and to add "will not be damaged" after "the rule of law and 'One Country, Two Systems'".

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment to Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion and the amendment.

16 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:00 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 2:30 pm on 12 December 2002 and continued to debate the motion on Enacting laws to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law moved by Hon James TO and the amendment to the motion moved by Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG.

Another 19 Members and Hon NG Leung-sing spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon NG Leung-sing was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:05 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW took the chair.

Five further Members and Hon Howard YOUNG spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:00 pm, while Hon Howard YOUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine more Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Justice and the Secretary for Security spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment to Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO replied.

Question on Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, five were in favour of the motion, 22 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 18 December 2002 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:55 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 11/12/2002
 時間 TIME: 06:31:46 下午

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對田北俊議員就「住宅樓宇七成按揭上限」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON JAMES TIEN'S MOTION ON "THE 70%
 CEILING FOR RESIDENTIAL MORTGAGE LOANS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	5	8	
反對 No	20	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		徐謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江善 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒善 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆榮 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	劉漢詮 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 11/12/2002
 時間 TIME: 06:39:25 下午

動議 MOTION: 「住宅樓宇七成按揭上限」議案
 MOTION "THE 70% CEILING FOR RESIDENTIAL MORTGAGE LOANS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 田北俊 James TIEN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	29	
投票 Vote	26	28	
贊成 Yes	23	19	
反對 No	3	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Eric LI	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	陳鑑林	CHAN Kar-lam	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	黃宏發	Andrew WONG		
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	黃成管	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES	朱幼麒	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-tok	贊成	YES	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES	劉漢達	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
				馬逢夏	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 12/12/2002
時間 TIME: 10:36:03 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁劉柔芬議員對涂謹申議員就「立法實施《基本法》第二十三條」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SOPHIE LEUNG TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON
"ENACTING LAWS TO IMPLEMENT ARTICLE 23 OF THE BASIC LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	28	
投票 Vote	28	27	
贊成 Yes	23	12	
反對 No	5	14	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES		
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

Appendix IV

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 12/12/2002
 時間 TIME: 10:55:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 「立法實施《基本法》第二十三條」議案
 MOTION "ENACTING LAWS TO IMPLEMENT ARTICLE 23 OF THE BASIC LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	28	
投票 Vote	28	27	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	22	12	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK