

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 18

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 19 February 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung
The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP
The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai
The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong
The Hon WONG Yung-kan
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon SZETO Wah
Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Import and Export (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	32/2003
2. Import and Export (Registration) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	33/2003
3. Import and Export (Removal of Articles) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	34/2003
4. Reserved Commodities (Control of Imports, Exports and Reserve Stocks) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	35/2003
5. Electronic Transactions (Exclusion) (Amendment) Order 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	36/2003
6. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (No. 2) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	37/2003
7. Dutiable Commodities Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1B) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	38/2003
8. Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Ordinance 2001 (19 of 2001) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	39/2003
9. Import and Export (Electronic Transactions) Ordinance 2002 (24 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	40/2003
10. Pilotage (Dues) (Amendment) Order 2002 (L.N. 234 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 14.2.2003)	41/2003
11. Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration of Electors) (Village Representative Election) Regulation (gazetted on 15.2.2003)	47/2003

Other Papers

No.60 - Hong Kong Arts Development Council
Annual Report 2001-2002 (published on 17.2.2003)

- No.61 - The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts Annual Report 2001-2002 and the Financial Statements and Auditor's Report for the year ended 30 June 2002 (published on 17.2.2003)
- No.62 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2002 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 39) and Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 38 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits (February 2003 - P.A.C. Report No. 39) (published on 19.2.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Education Reorganization (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2002 (published on 12.2.2003)

Address

Hon Eric LI, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2002 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 39) and the Committee's Supplemental Reports on Report No. 38 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits.

Questions

1. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 1.
i
The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.
2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Justice replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon Albert HO asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Justice replied.

5. Hon SIN Chung-kai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

10 Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs and the Secretary for Security replied.

6. Hon Michael MAK asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Foreshore, Sea-bed and Roads (Amendment) Bill 2003
Bills of Exchange (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Foreshore, Sea-bed and Roads (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Bills of Exchange (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Education Reorganization (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2002

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 20 November 2002 resumed.

Hon Cyd HO, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Education Reorganization (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2002, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Education Reorganization (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2002**.

Question that clauses 2 to 42 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 43 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 43, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Education and Manpower reported that

the Education Reorganization (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2002

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Security and Guarding Services Ordinance

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That the notice, as annexed to this Motion, which specifies the revised criteria that a person must satisfy before the Commissioner of Police may, under the Security and Guarding Services Ordinance, issue to him a permit to do security work, be approved. (Contents of the notice as annexed to the Motion in Appendix I.)

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU declared interest as the chairman of Security and Guarding Services Industry Authority and spoke on the motion.

Another three Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

The 2003-04 Budget

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council demands the Government, when formulating the 2003-04 Budget, not to raise tuition fees, not to increase the government fees and charges that affect people's livelihood, not to cut spending across the board on government services, and not to introduce tax increases targeted at the middle class.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Miriam LAU would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:01 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

10 Members and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:15 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 17 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion:

To add "to take account not only of the need to tackle the huge deficits, but also of the hardships faced by the public, and" after "That this Council demands the Government, when formulating the 2003-04 Budget,"; to add "not to reduce the rates of the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance across the board," after "not to cut spending across the board on government services,"; and to add "the grass roots and" after "and not to introduce tax increases targeted at".

Question on Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment had been passed, she granted leave for Hon Miriam LAU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following revised amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung and explained the revised wording of her amendment to the Council:

To add “, as well as not to increase the government fees and charges that affect the business environment, not to abolish the concessionary duty rate for ultra low sulphur diesel and not to increase the duty on petrol” after “not to introduce tax increases targeted at the grass roots and the middle class”.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion, as amended by Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Miriam LAU, put and agreed to.

Public consultation on constitutional reforms

Hon Emily LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Executive Authorities have undertaken in the Policy Agenda to begin to make suitable preparations for the review of constitutional developments after 2007, this Council urges the Administration to conduct as soon as possible a public consultation on constitutional reforms.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon Philip WONG would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon LAU Ping-cheung would also move an amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following amendment to Hon Emily LAU's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete “a” after “this Council urges the Administration to conduct as soon as possible” and substitute with “research concerning constitutional developments and thereafter to commence”; and to delete “on constitutional reforms” after “public consultation” and substitute with “at an appropriate time”.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment to Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

Hon LAU Ping-cheung moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "commerce" after "this Council urges the Administration to conduct as soon as possible research concerning constitutional developments and thereafter to" and substitute with "conduct"; and to delete "at an appropriate time" after "public consultation" and substitute with "after the 2004 Legislative Council elections".

Question on Hon LAU Ping-cheung's amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment proposed.

18 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Question on Hon LAU Ping-cheung's amendment to Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon LAU Ping-cheung's amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Public consultation on constitutional reforms at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment put.

Hon LAU Chin-shek claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Dr Hon Philip WONG's amendment was negatived.

Hon Emily LAU replied.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the motion, seven against it and 12 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion, one against it and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 26 February 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 12:10 am on 20 February 2003.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

SECURITY AND GUARDING SERVICES ORDINANCE (Chapter 460)
(Notice under section 6(1)(b)(i))

CRITERIA FOR ISSUING A SECURITY PERSONNEL PERMIT

Take notice that, pursuant to section 6(1)(b)(i) of the Security and Guarding Services Ordinance, the Security and Guarding Services Industry Authority (hereafter referred to as “the Authority”) hereby specifies the following revised criteria (hereafter referred to as "the revised criteria"), which replace the ones published in G.N. 2994 on 4 August 1995 with effect from 1 April 2003 , for issuing a permit under the said Ordinance. The criteria specified below in relation to a particular type of security work must be satisfied by a person before the Commissioner of Police may issue to him a permit under the said Ordinance to do that type of security work.

(A) Guarding work restricted to a “single private residential building”, the performance of which does not require the carrying of arms and ammunition (See Note 1)

- (a) *Age*
- (i) The applicant must be 18 years of age and above on the date of application.
 - (ii) If the applicant or permit holder is 65 years of age or above, he/she must produce a medical certificate (see Note 2) issued by a registered medical practitioner to certify that he/she is fit to undertake the duties required every two years.
- (b) *Fitness*
- The applicant must be physically fit to perform the job. A medical certificate (see Note 2) issued by a registered medical practitioner may be required if the Commissioner of Police reasonably considers necessary.
- (c) *Good Character*
- The applicant must be of good character having regard to his employment history, criminal records (see Note 3) and other relevant factors.

(d) *Proficiency in Security Work* The applicant must satisfy one of the followings:

- (i) He/She must have sat and passed a trade test recognized by the Authority and announced in a manner that it thinks fit, within 1 year before submitting his/her application. (A person who has already passed a recognized trade test before the commencement of the revised criteria is eligible to apply for a permit within 1 year from the effective date of the revised criteria.); or
- (ii) He/She must have not less than 3 years of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 5 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
- (iii) He/She must have not less than 1 year of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 2 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
- (iv) He/She must produce a letter of employment from the prospective employer (see Note 5).

(B) Guarding work in respect of any persons, premises or properties, the performance of which does not require the carrying of arms and ammunition and which does not fall within Category A

(a) *Age* The applicant must be 18 years of age or above. The upper age limit for engaging in this type of security work is 65 years.

(b) *Fitness* The applicant must be physically fit to perform the job. A medical certificate (see Note 2) issued by a registered medical practitioner may be required if the Commissioner of Police

reasonably considers necessary.

- (c) *Good Character* The applicant must be of good character having regard to his employment history, criminal records (see Note 3) and other relevant factors.
- (d) *Proficiency in Security Work* The applicant must satisfy one of the followings:
- (i) He/She must have sat and passed a trade test recognized by the Authority and announced in a manner that it thinks fit, within 1 year before submitting his/her application. (A person who has already passed a recognized trade test before the commencement of the revised criteria is eligible to apply for a permit within 1 year from the effective date of the revised criteria.); or
 - (ii) He/She must have not less than 3 years of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 5 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
 - (iii) He/She must have not less than 1 year of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 2 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
 - (iv) He/She must produce a letter of employment from the prospective employer (see Note 5).

(C) Guarding work, the performance of which requires the carrying of arms and ammunition

- (a) *Age* The applicant must be 18 years of age or above. The upper age limit for engaging in this type of security work is 55 years.

- (b) *Fitness* The applicant must be physically fit to perform the job. A medical certificate (see Note 2) issued by a registered medical practitioner may be required if the Commissioner of Police reasonably considers necessary.
- (c) *Good Character* The applicant must be of good character having regard to his employment history, criminal records (see Note 3) and other relevant factors.
- (d) *Proficiency in Security Work* The applicant must satisfy one of the followings:
- (i) He/She must have sat and passed a trade test recognized by the Authority and announced in a manner that it thinks fit, within 1 year before submitting his/her application. (A person who has already passed a recognised trade test before the commencement of the revised criteria is eligible to apply for a permit within 1 year from the effective date of the revised criteria.); or
 - (ii) He/She must have not less than 3 years of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 5 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
 - (iii) He/She must have not less than 1 year of cumulative working experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past 2 years immediately before submitting his/her application (Note 4); or
 - (iv) He/She must produce a letter of employment from the prospective employer (see Note 5).
- (e) *Arms Licence* The applicant must possess a valid arms licence for the arms used on duty issued by the Commissioner of Police.

application. Offences involving fixed penalty tickets, traffic summons, illegal hawking, article obstruction, littering, jaywalking and failing to answer Police or Court bail are considered minor and will be excluded.

- (4) Working experience may be substantiated by relevant documentary evidence provided by employers or a statutory declaration of experience by the applicant.
- (5) Item (iv) will cease to have effect 12 months after the effective date of the revised criteria as published in the Gazette.
- (6) The applicant shall attach copies of certificate of relevant technical training, *or* record of employment showing his/her experience in this type of security work.

*Miriam LAU Kin-ye Chairman, for and on behalf of the
Security and Guarding Services Industry Authority*

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 20/02/2003
時間 TIME: 12:00:59 上午

動議 MOTION: 劉炳章議員就黃宜弘議員對劉慧卿議員的「政制改革的公眾諮詢」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON LAU PING-CHEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO DR HON PHILIP WONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON EMILY LAU'S MOTION ON "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON CONSTITUTIONAL REFORMS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	13	11	
反對 No	11	17	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

Appendix III

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 20/02/2003
時間 TIME: 12:04:59 上午

動議 MOTION: 黃宜弘議員對劉慧卿議員就「政制改革的公眾諮詢」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY DR HON PHILIP WONG TO HON EMILY LAU'S MOTION ON "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON CONSTITUTIONAL REFORMS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	13	11	
反對 No	4	17	
棄權 Abstain	7	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Surn	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN		
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK _____

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 20/02/2003
時間 TIME: 12:10:27 上午

動議 MOTION: 「政制改革的公眾諮詢」議案
MOTION "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON CONSTITUTIONAL REFORMS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	28	
投票 Vote	23	27	
贊成 Yes	4	17	
反對 No	7	1	
棄權 Abstain	12	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	棄權	ABSTAIN	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	棄權	ABSTAIN	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Eric LI			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃宏發	Andrew WONG	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	棄權	ABSTAIN	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權	ABSTAIN
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
李國英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
胡經昌	Henry WU	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN				
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	反對	NO	朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	棄權	ABSTAIN
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	反對	NO
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	反對	NO	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
				劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN
				馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK