

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 19

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 26 February 2003 at 2:30 pm

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP  
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok  
The Hon WONG Sing-chi  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee  
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP  
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration  
The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP  
The Financial Secretary  
The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP  
The Secretary for Justice  
Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food  
The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Security and Guarding Services Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 21.2.2003)	48/2003
2. Village Representative Election (Registration of Electors) (Appeals) Regulation (gazetted on 21.2.2003)	49/2003
3. Telecommunications (Telecommunications Apparatus) (Exemption from Licensing) Order (L.N. 4 of 2003) (Commencement) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 21.2.2003)	50/2003

### Other Papers

- No.63 - Audited Statement of Accounts together with the Director of Audit's Report and Trustee's Report on the Administration of the Education Scholarships Fund for the year ending 31 August 2002 (published on 20.2.2003)
- No.64 - Hong Kong Council for Academic Accreditation Annual Report 2001-2002 (published on 20.2.2003)
- No.65 - Li Po Chun Charitable Trust Fund Annual Report for the period from 1 September 2001 to 31 August 2002 (published on 24.2.2003)
- No.66 - Audited Financial Statements and Programme of Activities of the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority for the year ending 31 August 2002 (published on 24.2.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2002 (published on 10.2.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill 2001 (published on 24.2.2003)

### Questions

1. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Eight Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. Hon Fred LI asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Seven Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Statements**

The Chief Secretary for Administration made a statement on the Report of the Task Force on Population Policy.

23 Members asked questions to seek elucidation on the statement and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **National Security (Legislative Provisions) Bill Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2003**

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Second Reading**

#### **National Security (Legislative Provisions) Bill**

At 5:02 pm, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum stood up to inform the President that pro-democracy Members would walk out in protest against the First Reading of the Bill. More than 12 odd other Members then rose from their seats, some displaying protest signs. While these Members were leaving the Chamber, there was an uproar in the Public Gallery caused by several men yelling and throwing shreds of paper. The President ordered that these men be removed. After several orders by the President, the security staff managed to remove these men from the Public Gallery.

Following the brief interruption of the meeting, the Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### **Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2003**

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### **Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2002**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 30 January 2002 resumed.

Hon HUI Cheung-ching, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2002, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Another two Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2002**.

Question that clauses 2, 4, 5, 7 to 19 and 21 to 26 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 6 and 20 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 6 and 20, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2002**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

**Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No.2) Bill 2001**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**



The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 21 November 2001 resumed.

Hon Eric LI, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No.2) Bill 2001, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Another four Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 48 Members were present, 46 were in favour of the motion and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No.2) Bill 2001**.

Question that clauses 3 to 7 and 9 to 14 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 8 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 8, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No.2) Bill 2001**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## **Members' Bills**

### **First Reading**

#### **Dao Heng Bank Limited (Merger) Bill**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President stated that as the Dao Heng Bank Limited (Merger) Bill presented by Dr Hon David LI related to Government policies, in accordance with Rule 54(1) of the Rules of Procedure, the signification of the written consent of the Chief Executive by the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was required before the Council entered upon consideration of the second reading of the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury confirmed that the Chief Executive had given his written consent for the Dao Heng Bank Limited (Merger) Bill to be introduced into this Council.

### **Second Reading**

#### **Dao Heng Bank Limited (Merger) Bill**

Dr Hon David LI moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Members' Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

Hon James TO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Ocean Park Bylaw, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 1 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 15 January 2003, be repealed.

Question on the motion proposed.

After declaring that he was a director of the Board of the Ocean Park Corporation, Hon Henry WU spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Opposing cutbacks in welfare benefits**

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council opposes cutbacks in welfare benefits for the elderly, the vulnerable and the disabled.

While Hon WONG Sing-chi was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:19 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

11 Members and Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion.

At 8:26 pm, while Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion.

Hon WONG Sing-chi replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Compendium of Submissions on the Consultation Document on Proposals to Implement Article 23 of the Basic Law**

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council condemns the authorities for compiling the Compendium of Submissions in respect of the enactment of laws to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law in a slipshod, incomplete and inequitable manner, distorting the views expressed by the public and organizations, and urges the authorities to commission an independent organization to analyze and summarize the views expressed by the public on the various proposals in the Consultation Document and to ensure

that public opinions are fully and properly reflected and addressed.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Howard YOUNG and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Howard YOUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion and the amendments.

18 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion:

To delete "condemns" after "That this Council" and substitute with "expresses disappointment with"; to delete "," after "in a slipshod" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and inequitable" after "incomplete"; to delete ", distorting" after "manner" and substitute with "and for categorizing wrongly"; to delete "the public" after "the views expressed by" and substitute with "some members of the public"; and to delete "commission an independent organization to analyze and summarize the views expressed by the public on the various proposals in the Consultation Document and to ensure that public opinions are fully and properly reflected and addressed" after "and urges the authorities to" and substitute with "rectify the inaccuracies and omissions as soon as possible".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed and put.

Hon Howard YOUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 25 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members

present, she declared that Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Compendium of Submissions on the Consultation Document on Proposals to Implement Article 23 of the Basic Law at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion:

To add “; hence, this Council urges the authorities to shelf the continuation of the legislative procedures for the National Security (Legislative Provisions) Bill” after “to ensure that public opinions are fully and properly reflected and addressed”.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 24 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment was negatived.

Hon SIN Chung-kai replied.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, five were in

favour of the motion and 24 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 29 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 March 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:52 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 26/02/2003  
時間 TIME: 06:57:20 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2001年稅務（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》- 二讀  
INLAND REVENUE (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2001 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :48  
投票 Vote :47  
贊成 Yes :46  
反對 No :1  
棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung		
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
李家祥	Eric LI	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing			羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周潔淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
徐謙中	James TO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching			胡經晶	Henry WU	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
陳善林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-tek	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
黃宏發	Andrew WONG			葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳華	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 26/02/2003  
時間 TIME: 11:45:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊孝華議員對單仲偕議員就「實施《基本法》第二十三條諮詢文件的意見書匯編」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON HOWARD YOUNG TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON "COMPENDIUM OF SUBMISSIONS ON THE CONSULTATION DOCUMENT ON PROPOSALS TO IMPLEMENT ARTICLE 23 OF THE BASIC LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	29	
投票 Vote	29	28	
贊成 Yes	11	3	
反對 No	18	25	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午焜 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹中 James TO	反對 NO
吳嘉儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容棋 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES		
麥國凱 Michael MAK	反對 NO	<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO





投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 26/02/2003  
時間 TIME: 11:48:43 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊森議員對單仲偕議員就「實施《基本法》第二十三條諮詢文件的意見書匯編」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY DR HON YEUNG SUM TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON "COMPENDIUM OF SUBMISSIONS ON THE CONSULTATION DOCUMENT ON PROPOSALS TO IMPLEMENT ARTICLE 23 OF THE BASIC LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能界別 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	29	
投票 Vote	29	28	
贊成 Yes	5	16	
反對 No	24	12	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能界別 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳納綱 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kyong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳冠強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡業王 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-teng	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kyong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡煜昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余百薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗潔 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

## Appendix IV

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 26/02/2003  
時間 TIME: 11:53:09 下午

動議 MOTION: 「實施《基本法》第二十三條諮詢文件的意見書匯編」議案  
MOTION "COMPENDIUM OF SUBMISSIONS ON THE CONSULTATION DOCUMENT ON PROPOSALS TO IMPLEMENT ARTICLE 23 OF THE BASIC LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	29	
投票 Vote	29	28	
贊成 Yes	5	17	
反對 No	24	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	徐謙申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳藝林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sam	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	<b>選舉委員會 Election Committee</b>	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-jok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬建國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

