

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 21

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 12 March 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP

The Hon WONG Yung-kan

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon SZETO Wah

Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP

Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

Members absent:

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP

The Hon SIN Chung-kai

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP

The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP

The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon YEOH Eng-kiong, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Public Revenue Protection (Revenue) Order 2003 (gazetted on 5.3.2003)	59/2003
2. Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	60/2003
3. Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) (North Lantau and Chek Lap Kok Airport) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	61/2003
4. Schedule of Routes (Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	62/2003
5. Schedule of Routes (Long Win Bus Company Limited) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	63/2003
6. Schedule of Routes (New Lantau Bus Company (1973) Limited) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	64/2003
7. Schedule of Routes (New World First Bus Services Limited) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	65/2003
8. Immigration (Anchorages and Landing Places) (Amendment) Order 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	66/2003
9. Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 7.3.2003)	67/2003

Other Papers

- No.69 - Hong Kong Tourism Board
2001/2002 Annual Report (published on 6.3.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Juvenile Offenders (Amendment) Bill 2001 (published on 4.3.2003)
- Report of the Bills Committee on Fire Services (Amendment) Bill 2001 (published on 10.3.2003)

Questions

1. Hon TSANG Yok-sing asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

3. Hon LAU Ping-cheung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Security, the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

4. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries. The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food and the Financial Secretary replied.

5. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

6. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Second Reading

Juvenile Offenders (Amendment) Bill 2001

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 14 November 2001 resumed.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Juvenile Offenders (Amendment) Bill 2001, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another seven Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Juvenile Offenders (Amendment) Bill 2001**.

Question that clause 1 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Five Members and the Secretary of Security spoke on the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, six were in favour of the amendments, 10 against them and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 22 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendments and seven against them. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clauses 2, 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

New clauses 2A and 3A read the first time.

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 2A and 3A read the second time.

The Secretary for Security moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Security reported that

the Juvenile Offenders (Amendment) Bill 2001

had passed through the Committee with amendments. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Fire Services (Amendment) Bill 2001

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 4 July 2001 resumed.

Hon IP Kwok-him, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Fire Services (Amendment) Bill 2001, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Another Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Fire Services (Amendment) Bill 2001**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 6 to 9, 11 to 19 and 23 to 27 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 4, 5, 10, 20, 21 and 22 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 4, 5, 10, 20, 21 and 22, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 3A, the new heading before new clause 22A and new clause 22A read the first time.

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid heading and clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid heading and clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 3A, the new heading before new clause 22A and new clause 22A read the second time.

The Secretary for Security moved the addition of the aforesaid heading and clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Security reported that

the **Fire Services (Amendment) Bill 2001**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Bills

First Reading

The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President stated that as The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill presented by Hon NG Leung-sing related to Government policies, in accordance with Rule 54(1) of the Rules of Procedure, the signification of the written consent of the Chief Executive by the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was required before the Council entered upon consideration of the second reading of the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury confirmed that the Chief Executive had given his written consent for The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill to be introduced into this Council.

Second Reading

The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill

Hon NG Leung-sing moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the -

- (a) Trade Marks Rules, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 30 of 2003; and
- (b) Trade Marks Ordinance (Cap. 559) (Commencement) Notice 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 31 of 2003,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 February 2003, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 2 April 2003.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Kenneth TING moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the -

- (a) Import and Export (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 32 of 2003;
- (b) Import and Export (Registration) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 33 of 2003;
- (c) Import and Export (Removal of Articles) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 34 of 2003;
- (d) Reserved Commodities (Control of Imports, Exports and Reserve Stocks) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 35 of 2003;
- (e) Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Ordinance 2001 (19 of 2001) (Commencement) Notice 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 39 of 2003; and

(f) Import and Export (Electronic Transactions) Ordinance 2002 (24 of 2002) (Commencement) Notice 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 40 of 2003,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 19 February 2003, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 9 April 2003.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Medical fee waiver mechanism

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government will introduce very shortly a new charging scheme for public health care services and, in parallel, enhance the existing medical fee waiver mechanism, this Council urges the Government to relax the eligibility criteria under the mechanism so as to benefit more people from the socially disadvantaged groups, such as elderly persons, low-income earners and chronic patients.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung would move an amendment to the motion and that Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung would each move an amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment and the amendments to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", including relaxing the asset-assessment criteria for unsupported elderly persons, and to extend the maximum fee-waiver period for chronic patients from six months to one year," after "this Council urges the Government to relax the eligibility criteria under the mechanism".

Question on Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

9 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Sing-chi declared an interest that his wife was a chronic patient and spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ng Leung-sing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:35 pm, while Hon NG Leung-sing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another two Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment:

To add "providing half-fee concessions for all elderly persons, and" after "this Council urges the Government to relax the eligibility criteria under the mechanism, including"; to add "to apply for a higher fee waiver" after "relaxing the asset-assessment criteria for unsupported elderly persons"; to add "exempt patients on disability allowance from payment of medical fees and charges and" after ", and to"; and to add "other" after "extend the maximum fee-waiver period for".

Question on Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong's amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment proposed and put.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 20 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and three against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong's amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved to the motion on Medical fee waiver mechanism at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the President may order that the Council do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment:

To delete "relaxing the asset-assessment criteria for unsupported elderly persons and to extend the maximum fee-waiver period for chronic patients from six months to one year" after "this Council urges the Government to relax the eligibility criteria under the mechanism, including" and substitute with "fully waiving the new and increased fees and charges in respect of elderly persons and chronic patients".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 20 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and four against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 14 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the

two groups of Members present, she declared that Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment was negatived.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and eight against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 21 were present and 20 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Legislating against racial discrimination

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to adopt the recommendations of the relevant United Nations committees and expeditiously legislate against racial discrimination to ensure that new arrivals from the Mainland and ethnic minorities in Hong Kong can enjoy equal opportunities in such areas as education, employment and access to social services.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung said that he had decided to withdraw his amendment to the motion. He explained his decision and then spoke on the motion.

Another 21 Members and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion.

Hon Audrey EU replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 19 March 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 12:17 am on 13 March 2003.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 12/03/2003
時間 TIME: 06:19:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2001年少年犯(修訂)條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第2、3及4條
JUVENILE OFFENDERS (AMENDMENT) BILL 2001 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 2, 3 AND 4

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	22	
投票 Vote	21	21	
贊成 Yes	6	14	
反對 No	10	7	
棄權 Abstain	5	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	反對 NO
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 12/03/2003
時間 TIME: 09:34:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 羅致光議員就楊耀忠議員對馮檢基議員的「醫療收費減免機制」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
DR HON LAW CHI-KWONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON YEUNG YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON "MEDICAL FEE WAIVER MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 羅致光 LAW Chi-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	20	
投票 Vote	19	19	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	11	3	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Eric LI			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	反對	NO	黃宏發	Andrew WONG		
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
胡經昌	Henry WU			余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah			朱幼麟	Dr David CHU		
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing		
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU		
				馬達國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 12/03/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:38:15 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員就楊耀忠議員對馮檢基議員的「醫療收費減免機制」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON YEUNG YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON "MEDICAL FEE WAIVER MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	20	
投票 Vote	19	19	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	14	4	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
李家祥	Eric LI			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	反對	NO	黃宏發	Andrew WONG		
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			司徒華	SZETO Wah	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對	NO
羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
胡經昌	Henry WU			余若薇	Audrey EU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	選舉委員會 Election Committee			
麥國風	Michael MAK	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah			朱幼麟	Dr David CHU		
勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	反對	NO	吳亮星	NG Leung-sing		
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO
劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU		
				馬逢國	MA Fung kwok		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 12/03/2003
 時間 TIME: 09:40:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊耀忠議員對馮檢基議員就「醫療收費減免機制」所提議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON YEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON
 "MEDICAL FEE WAIVER MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	21	
投票 Vote	19	20	
贊成 Yes	15	4	
反對 No	1	2	
棄權 Abstain	3	14	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES		
麥國風 Michael MAK	棄權 ABSTAIN	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 12/03/2003
時間 TIME: 09:46:05 下午

動議 MOTION: 「醫療收費減免機制」議案
MOTION "MEDICAL FEE WAIVER MECHANISM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	21	
投票 Vote	19	20	
贊成 Yes	11	20	
反對 No	8	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成 YES	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	

秘書 CLERK