

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 24

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 April 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP
The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung
The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP
The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai
The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong
The Hon WONG Yung-kan
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon SZETO Wah
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP
The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP
Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok
The Hon WONG Sing-chi
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP
The Hon LAU Ping-cheung
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

The Hon James TO Kun-sun
The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration
The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary
The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP
The Secretary for Justice
The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology
The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Import and Export (General) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 4.4.2003)	93/2003
2. Immigration (Anchorage and Landing Places) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2003 (gazetted on 4.4.2003)	94/2003

Other Papers

- No.73 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Hong Kong Rotary Club Students' Loan Fund together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2002 (published on 1.4.2003)
- No.74 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Sing Tao Foundation Students' Loan Fund together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2002 (published on 1.4.2003)
- No.75 - Summary and Revenue Analysis by Head, General Revenue Account, Estimates for the year ending 31 March 2004 (published on 1.4.2003)
- No.76 - Approved Estimates of Income and Expenditure for financial year 2003/2004, Securities and Futures Commission (published on 9.4.2003)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Construction Industry Levy (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003
Education (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003
Betting Duty (Amendment) Bill 2003
Revenue Bill 2003
Revenue (No. 2) Bill 2003

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

**Construction Industry Levy (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003
Education (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2003**

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council on each of the above two Bills.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

Betting Duty (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Revenue Bill 2003
Revenue (No. 2) Bill 2003**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council on each of the above two Bills.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

Appropriation Bill 2003

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 5 March 2003 resumed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for the Civil Service, the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for Education and Manpower spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 53 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the motion and 19 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Appropriation Bill 2003**.

In accordance with Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure, the Committee first considered the schedule to the Bill.

Question that the sums for heads 21 to 31, 35, 37, 39, 42 to 51, 53, 55, 58, 60, 62, 63, 70, 72, 74, 76, 78, 79, 80, 82, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 100, 106, 110, 112, 114, 115, 116, 118, 120, 121, 130, 136, 138, 142, 143, 145, 147, 148, 149, 151, 152, 155 to 160, 162, 163, 166, 168, 170, 173, 174, 176, 177, 180, 181, 184, 186, 188, 190 and 194 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO was ill and could not attend the meeting, she had acceded to Hon Albert HO's request to move without notice two resolutions which were identical to those that Hon James TO had intended to propose.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$58,500,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Eric LI declared that he was the vice-chairman of Independent Police Complaints Council, and spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of the remaining motions to be moved at the Committee Stage of the Appropriation Bill 2003 at this meeting, Rule 47(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended so that the Chairman may order that the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$85,000,000 in respect of subhead 103 and addressed the Committee.

Three Members and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

One Member who had spoken spoke again.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Emily LAU moved that head 144 be reduced by \$11,220,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

Five Members spoke on the amendment.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the Chairman to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Another two Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the amendment.

While the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was speaking, Hon Martin LEE raised a point of order regarding whether a remark just made by the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was insulting or offensive to a Member of the Council. The Chairman suspended the meeting at 7:15 pm.

The Committee resumed at 7:22 pm.

The Chairman said that she had reviewed the speech of the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs. She ruled that the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs' statement was neither insulting nor offensive to a Member of the Council, and asked the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs to continue.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs continued to speak on the amendment.

Hon Emily LAU spoke again.

One Member who had spoken spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Financial Secretary reported that

the Appropriation Bill 2003

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 55 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the motion and 21 against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that -

- (a) the Import and Export (Removal of Articles) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 34 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 19 February 2003, be amended, in section 6, in the new Schedule 2, in item 7, by repealing "該船隻、飛機或車輛的收貨人或" and substituting "所涉物品的收貨人或該船隻、飛機或車輛的";

- (b) the Reserved Commodities (Control of Imports, Exports and Reserve Stocks) (Amendment) Regulation 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 35 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 19 February 2003, be amended -
- (i) in section 3(2), in the new regulation 5(3), by repealing "11(2)(b)" and substituting "11(1)(d)";
 - (ii) in section 4(4), in the new regulation 6(2A), by repealing "11(2)(b)" and substituting "11(1)(d)";
 - (iii) in section 5(2), in the new regulation 8(3), by repealing "12(2)(b)" and substituting "12(1)(d)".

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Bills

First Reading

Daughters of Mary Help of Christians Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2002

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Daughters of Mary Help of Christians Incorporation (Amendment) Bill 2002

Hon Andrew WONG moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 12 March 2003 resumed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the Bill.

Hon NG Leung-sing replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered **The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 to 17 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on the preamble to the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

Hon NG Leung-sing reported that

The Bank of East Asia, Limited (Merger of Subsidiaries) Bill

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that in relation to the Public Revenue Protection (Revenue) Order 2003, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 59 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 March 2003, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 30 April 2003.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolves that this Council appoints a select committee to investigate:

- (a) whether the purchase of a personal vehicle by the Financial Secretary before the adjustments to the motor vehicle first registration tax constitutes a breach of clauses 1.2(6) and 1.2(7) of the Code for Principal Officials under the Accountability System, namely, "Principal officials shall observe the highest standards of personal conduct and integrity at all times" and "Principal officials shall ensure that no actual or potential conflict arises between their public duties and their private interests";
- (b) whether any person suggested amending those parts of the minutes of the Executive Council meeting held on 5 March 2003 relating to the declaration of interests regarding the purchase of personal vehicles by those who had attended the meeting; and
- (c) whether the Government has provided this Council with complete and truthful information on the discussions at the Executive Council meeting(s) relating to the declaration of interests in the purchase of personal vehicles;

and that in the performance of its duties the committee be authorized under section 9(2) of the Legislative Council (Power and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) to exercise the powers conferred by section 9(1) of that Ordinance.

Question on the motion proposed.

A Member and Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 8:24 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Another Member and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the motion.

At 8:50 pm, while Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four further Members and Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the Chief Secretary for Administration raised a point of order regarding whether

remarks made by Hon Albert CHAN in his speech was insulting or offensive to the Financial Secretary. The President suspended the meeting at 9:48 pm.

The Council resumed at 10:02 pm.

The President said that she had reviewed the speech of Hon Albert CHAN. She ruled that Hon Albert CHAN's remarks were made in the form of a question and did not breach the Council's Rules of Procedure. However, she reminded Members that words such as "hypocrisy" and "hypocritical" should be avoided in Council debates. She then asked Hon Albert CHAN to continue.

Hon Albert CHAN continued to speak on the motion.

Five more Members and the Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion.

Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

Question on the motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, five were in favour of the motion and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 30 April 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 11:12 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

Appendix I

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
時間 TIME: 04:12:52 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2003年撥款條例草案》- 二讀
APPROPRIATION BILL 2003 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :53
投票 Vote :52
贊成 Yes :33
反對 No :19
棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
李家祥	Eric LI	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
李國寶	Dr David LI			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI			司徒華	SZETO Wah	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES	羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
黃宏發	Andrew WONG	反對	NO	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	馬逢國	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

Appendix II

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
時間 TIME: 05:02:16 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2003年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122削減58,500,000元
APPROPRIATION BILL 2003 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$58,500,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Hon Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	23	21	
贊成 Yes	4	10	
反對 No	19	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching		黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳克星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Appendix III

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
 時間 TIME: 05:49:16 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2003年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目103而將總目122削減85,000,000元
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2003 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$85,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 103

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Hon Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	5	14	
反對 No	21	12	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謙申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Appendix IV

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
時間 TIME: 07:46:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2003年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目144削減11,220,000元
APPROPRIATION BILL 2003 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 144 BE REDUCED BY \$11,220,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	26	
投票 Vote	27	25	
贊成 Yes	5	14	
反對 No	22	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG			
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK _____

Appendix V

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
 時間 TIME: 07:52:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2003年撥款條例草案》- 三讀
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2003 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :55
 投票 Vote :54
 贊成 Yes :33
 反對 No :21
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES
丁午壽	Kenneth TING	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	楊耀忠	YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
朱幼麟	Dr David CHU	贊成	YES	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO
何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	劉漢銓	Ambrose LAU	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
李家祥	Eric LI	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	司徒華	SZETO Wah	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
吳亮星	NG Leung-sing	贊成	YES	羅致光	Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	鄧兆棠	Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
許長青	HUI Cheung-ching	贊成	YES	胡經昌	Henry WU	贊成	YES
陳國強	CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			麥國風	Michael MAK	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	梁富華	LEUNG Fu-wah	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			勞永樂	Dr LO Wing-lok	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
黃宏發	Andrew WONG	反對	NO	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	劉炳章	LAU Ping-cheung	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	馬達國	MA Fung kwok	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

Appendix VI

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 09/04/2003
時間 TIME: 11:12:23 下午

動議 MOTION: 根據《立法會（權力及特權）條例》動議決議案
PROPOSED RESOLUTION UNDER THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (POWERS AND PRIVILEGES) ORDINANCE

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	22	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr Lui Ming-wah	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	贊成 YES
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO		
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	選舉委員會 Election Committee	
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK