

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 29

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 21 May 2003 at 2:30 pm

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP

The Hon NG Leung-sing, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP
The Hon CHAN Kwok-keung
The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP
The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai
The Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong
The Hon WONG Yung-kan
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
The Hon LAU Kong-wah
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
The Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon SZETO Wah
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Dr the Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

The Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP

The Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon LEUNG Fu-wah, MH, JP

Dr the Hon LO Wing-lok

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

The Hon IP Kwok-him, JP

The Hon LAU Ping-cheung

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon MA Fung-kwok, JP

Members absent:

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Antony LEUNG Kam-chung, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon Elsie LEUNG Oi-sie, GBM, JP

The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP

Secretary for the Civil Service

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP, Deputy Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Legislative Council (Subscribers and Election Deposit for Nomination) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	119/2003
2. District Councils (Subscribers and Election Deposit for Nomination) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	120/2003
3. Declaration of Constituencies (District Councils) Order 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	121/2003
4. Aerial Ropeways (Operation and Maintenance) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	122/2003
5. Air Pollution Control (Emission Reduction Devices for Vehicles) Regulation (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	123/2003
6. Air Pollution Control (Vehicle Design Standards) (Emission) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	124/2003
7. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	125/2003
8. Registration of Persons (Application for New Identity Cards) Order (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	126/2003
9. Registration of Persons (Application for New Identity Cards) (Repeal) Order 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	127/2003
10. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (No. 5) Notice 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	128/2003
11. Statutes of the University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Statute 2003 (gazetted on 16.5.2003)	129/2003

Other Papers

- No.83 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Language Fund, together with the Director of Audit's Report, for the year ended 31 August 2002 (published on 13.5.2003)

No.84 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Director of Social Welfare Incorporated together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 March 2002 (published on 13.5.2003)

No.85 - Report on the Recommended Constituency Boundaries for the 2003 District Councils Election (published on 16.5.2003)

Report of the Bills Committee on Interest on Arrears of Maintenance Bill 2001 (published on 12.5.2003)

Questions

1. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

2. Hon Michael MAK asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

The Member asked a supplementary and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

4. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Town Planning (Amendment) Bill 2003

Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill

United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Town Planning (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Public Officers Pay Adjustments (2004/2005) Bill

The Secretary for the Civil Service moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Bill 2003

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Interest on Arrears of Maintenance Bill 2001

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 9 January 2002 resumed.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Interest on Arrears of Maintenance Bill 2001, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another five Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Interest on Arrears of Maintenance Bill 2001**.

Question that clauses 2, 3, 5, 6, 9, and 10 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 12 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved amendments to clause 12 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 12, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 4, 7, 8 and 11 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Home Affairs and Hon Margaret NG had separately given notice to move the addition of section 20B to clause 4, section 9C to clause 7, section 53B to clause 8 and section 28AB to clause 11 of the bill. She ordered that the proposed amendments be debated together in a joint debate.

The Chairman invited the Secretary for Home Affairs to move his amendments first as he was the Public Officer in charge of the Bill.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved amendments to add section 20B to clause 4, section 9C to clause 7, section 53B to clause 8 and section 28AB to clause 11 of the Bill and addressed the Committee.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on the Secretary for Home Affairs' amendments as well as her own proposed amendments.

A Member spoke on the amendments and the proposed amendments.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Home Affairs put and negatived.

Hon Margaret NG moved the addition of section 20B to clause 4, section 9C to clause 7, section 53B to clause 8 and section 28AB to clause 11 of the Bill.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon Margaret NG put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved further amendments to clauses 4, 7, 8 and 11 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 4, 7, 8 and 11, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 1 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved an amendment to clause 1 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 1, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New headings before new clauses 11A, 15 and 18, new clauses 11A, 11B, 11C, 11D and 13 to 23 read the first time.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid headings and clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid headings and clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

The aforesaid headings and clauses read the second time.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the addition of the aforesaid headings and clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Home Affairs reported that

the **Interest on Arrears of Maintenance Bill 2001**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Merchant Shipping (Liability and Compensation for Oil Pollution) (Amendment) Bill 2003

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 7 May 2003 resumed.

With the leave of the President, the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour, spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Merchant Shipping (Liability and Compensation for Oil Pollution) (Amendment) Bill 2003**.

Question that clauses 1 to 6 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour reported that

the **Merchant Shipping (Liability and Compensation for Oil Pollution) (Amendment) Bill 2003**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Andrew WONG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Maximum Amount of Election Expenses (Village Representative Election) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 81 of 2003 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 2 April 2003, be amended in section 2 –

- (a) in paragraph (a), by repealing "\$14,000" and substituting "\$18,000";
- (b) in paragraph (b), by repealing "\$20,000" and substituting "\$28,000".

Question on the motion proposed.

A Member and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion.

Hon Andrew WONG replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Expediently implementing the election of the Chief Executive and all Members of the Legislative Council by universal suffrage

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council demands that the Basic Law be amended so as to expedite the full implementation of the election of the Chief Executive and all Members of the Legislative Council by universal suffrage.

Question on the motion proposed.

Four Members and Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion.

While Hon Abraham SHEK was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, took the chair.

Another eight Members and Hon LEUNG Fu-wah spoke on the motion.

At 7:23 pm, while Hon LEUNG Fu-wah was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five more Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert HO replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, five were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 27 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Independence of statutory organizations handling public complaints

Hon Cyd HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to ensure the independence of the Independent Commission Against Corruption, the Office of The Ombudsman, the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHOY So-yuk would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon Cyd HO's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "ensure" after "That this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with "continue to maintain".

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Cyd HO's motion proposed.

Eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Cyd HO spoke on the amendment.

The Chief Secretary for Administration and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Cyd HO's motion put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 26 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Cyd HO replied.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's motion put.

Hon CHOY So-yuk claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the motion and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections and by the Election Committee, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 28 May 2003 at 2:30 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:13 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 21/05/2003
時間 TIME: 08:27:08 下午

動議 MOTION: 「盡快落實普選行政長官和全體立法會議員」議案
MOTION "EXPEDITIOUSLY IMPLEMENTING THE ELECTION OF THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE AND ALL MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL BY UNIVERSAL SUFFRAGE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	27	
投票 Vote	23	26	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	17	11	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	反對 NO	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	反對 NO
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
胡經昌 Henry WU	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey BU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah	反對 NO	朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	反對 NO
勞永榮 Dr LO Wing-lok		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung	反對 NO	劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	反對 NO
		馬達國 MA Fung kwok	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 21/05/2003
時間 TIME: 10:05:57 下午

動議 MOTION: 蔡素玉議員對何秀蘭議員就「處理市民申訴的法定組織的獨立性」所提議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CHOY SO-YUK TO HON CYD HO'S MOTION ON "INDEPENDENCE OF STATUTORY ORGANIZATIONS HANDLING PUBLIC COMPLAINTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	26	
投票 Vote	19	25	
贊成 Yes	13	12	
反對 No	5	13	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
李家祥 Eric LI	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	贊成 YES	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	贊成 YES
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	贊成 YES
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	贊成 YES
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 21/05/2003
時間 TIME: 10:11:15 下午

動議 MOTION: 「處理市民申訴的法定組織的獨立性」議案
MOTION "INDEPENDENCE OF STATUTORY ORGANIZATIONS HANDLING PUBLIC COMPLAINTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區及選舉委員會 Geographical Constituencies & Election Committee	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	25	
投票 Vote	19	24	
贊成 Yes	9	15	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
丁午壽 Kenneth TING	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
田北俊 James TIEN		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
李家祥 Eric LI	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
李國寶 Dr David LI		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUT Ming-wah	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
許長青 HUI Cheung-ching	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃宏發 Andrew WONG	
陳國強 CHAN Kwok-keung	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		司徒華 SZETO Wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄧兆棠 Dr TANG Siu-tong	棄權 ABSTAIN
羅致光 Dr LAW Chi-kwong	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
胡經昌 Henry WU	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		選舉委員會 Election Committee	
麥國風 Michael MAK	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
梁富華 LEUNG Fu-wah		朱幼麟 Dr David CHU	棄權 ABSTAIN
勞永樂 Dr LO Wing-lok		吳亮星 NG Leung-sing	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊耀忠 YEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉炳章 LAU Ping-cheung		劉漢銓 Ambrose LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
		馬逢國 MA Fung kwok	贊成 YES