立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1384/02-03 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/PL/WS

Panel on Welfare Services

Minutes of meeting held on Monday, 10 February 2003 at 10:45 am in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

Members : Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP (Chairman) **Present**

Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Dr Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Dr Hon YEUNG Sum Hon CHOY So-yuk Hon LI Fung-ying, JP

Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP Hon Michael MAK Kwok-fung

Hon WONG Sing-chi

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee

Public Officers: All items

Attending

Mrs Carrie LAM, JP

Director of Social Welfare

- 2 -

Item III

Mr FUNG Pak-yan

Assistant Director (Family and Child Welfare)

Mr Kenneth CHAN

Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Welfare)1

Dr Regina CHING

Assistant Director (Personal Health Services), Department of Health

Mr Ian Robert Mackness

Chief Superintendent (Crime)(Support)

Miss CHU Ming-po, Shirley

Superintendent (Crime)(Support)

Mrs Gigi Mansukhani

Principal Inspector (Student Guidance)

Mr LAI Ip-cheung

Assistant Director (Estate Management) 1

Mr SUM Chak-loong

Senior Housing Manager (Tenancy Management Policy)

Item IV

Miss Ophelia CHAN

Assistant Director of Social Welfare

(Rehabilitation and Medical Social Services)

Mr Stephen PANG

Commissioner for Rehabilitation

Item V

Mr Patrick NIP

Deputy Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Elderly Services)

Clerk in : Ms Doris CHAN

Attendance Chief Assistant Secretary (2) 4

Staff in : Miss Mary SO

Attendance Senior Assistant Secretary (2) 8

I. Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1103/02-03)

The minutes of the special meeting held on 13 January 2003 were confirmed.

II. Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1104/02-03(01) and (02))

- 2. <u>Members</u> agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for 10 March 2003 -
 - (a) Residential care services for frail elders; and
 - (b) Progress on implementation of the information technology strategy for social welfare sector.

III. An update on strategy and measures to prevent and tackle family violence

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1104/02-03(03))

- 3. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>Director of Social Welfare</u> (DSW) gave a power point presentation on the Administration's strategy and measures to prevent family violence as detailed in its paper.
- 4. <u>Mr Michael MAK</u> asked the following questions -
 - (a) Whether the recent economic downturn had a significant bearing on the 25% increase in the number of reported battered spouse cases in 2002 as compared with 2001;
 - (b) How did Hong Kong statistics on family violence compare with those in other major cities; and

- (c) What measures had been taken by the Administration to prevent child abuse victims from imitating the violent behaviour and become aggressive adults.
- 5. <u>DSW</u> responded that it was difficult to say whether the increase in reported battered spouse cases was due to the worsening economic situation or heightened publicity and improvement in supporting services. Initial assessment was that money problem was one of the major causes of spousal abuse. To ascertain such and to find out how serious the problem of family violence in Hong Kong was compared with other major cities, the Social Welfare Department (SWD) would shortly commission a tertiary institution to carry out a study on child abuse and spousal battering in Hong Kong. Separately, a Lotteries Fund-supported study by the University of Hong Kong to study homicide-suicide in Hong Kong was underway.
- 6. On the measures to protect and assist victims of child abuse, <u>Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Family and Child Welfare)</u> (ADSW) said that out-of-home care would be arranged for those who were in immediate danger or subject to a high risk of family violence. Abuse victims with psychological and behavioural problems would be referred to SWD's Clinical Psychology Units for treatment. Multi-disciplinary case conferences on child abuse, participated by social workers, doctors, clinical psychologists, teachers, etc. would also be held to discuss nature of the cases and welfare plans for the abused children and their families.
- 7. <u>DSW</u> supplemented that the number of child abuse victims who needed welfare support to overcome the trauma of abuse far exceeded several hundreds a year, as statistics on child abuse cases mentioned in the Administration's paper only referred to newly reported cases in a year. This was because follow-up service to help child abuse victims to resume normal living often took several years to complete. <u>DSW</u> further said that assistance to children witnessing domestic violence was equally important, as many studies had revealed that the pain inflicted on them could be great and prolonged and the impact could be as adverse as children being abused.
- 8. Mr MAK further asked the following questions -
 - (a) Whether spousal battering was getting more violent, and if so, why; and
 - (b) Whether any study had been conducted to find out the extent of child abuse victims being afflicted with mental illness.

Action

- 9. <u>Superintendent (Crime)(Support)</u> surmised that spousal battering was getting more violent, having regard to the fact that there had been a 28% increase in the number of crimes, including rape, homicide, assault and indecent assault, in 2002 over 2001. As to the reasons for the increasing violence in spousal battering, <u>Superintendent (Crime)(Support)</u> said that the findings of the two studies mentioned by DSW in paragraph 5 above should help to better understand the problem. As regards Mr MAK's second question, <u>ADSW</u> said that the study on child abuse and spousal battering, as detailed in paragraphs 34 and 35 of the Administration's paper, should shed light on the question raised.
- 10. <u>Mr WONG Sing-chi</u> said that placing too much emphasis on remedial work in tackling family violence had posed a heavy burden on frontline social workers. This situation was aggravated by the rise in the number of family violence cases and in the increasing complexity of these cases. In the light of this, <u>Mr WONG</u> said that SWD should engage victims of domestic violence in providing support and guidance to families in crisis, as in the case of engaging young people as peer counsellors to youth-at-risk, so as to better prevent the occurrence of family violence.
- DSW agreed that no matter how much resources were put into remedial 11. services, the problem of domestic violence could not be satisfactorily tackled without more timely intervention and assistance provided to families in crisis. To this end, some of the resources previously put into remedial services had been diverted to providing preventive measures such as stepping up public education on domestic violence, installing more hotlines and strengthening outreaching work. To promote the service users' accessibility to services, the 15 pilot Integrated Family Services Centres (IFSCs) and some of the family services centres had also extended their service hours to make services available in weekday evenings, Saturday afternoons/evenings or Sundays. No additional resources, however, had been allocated for such improved accessibility to services. DSW pointed out that as a result of strengthening preventive measures and targetting services to those in need, workload of frontline staff had been reduced to a more manageable level. Nevertheless, she hoped that the public could show more understanding of the difficult task for outsiders to intervene in family disputes by not laying the blame on frontline staff whenever family tragedies due to family violence occurred.
- 12. As to engaging victims of family violence to provide support and guidance to families in crisis, <u>DSW</u> said that this was one strategy which SWD had been encouraging all family service units to pursue and some of them had adopted it. Cases in point were the Family Service Ambassador Scheme run by the Family Crisis Support Centre of the Caritas Hong Kong and similar ones by the five Single Parent Centres in varying degrees. In respect of the Family Service Ambassador Scheme, <u>DSW</u> said that Caritas Hong Kong had obtained funding

from the Community Investment and Inclusion Fund (CIIF) to extend the Scheme throughout the territory, i.e. each of the 18 Districts would have its own district group of Family Service Ambassadors rendering peer counselling and social support to individuals or families in crisis. DSW further said that the territory-wide search for family service ambassadors under the "In Search of Resilient Family Members" Campaign of SWD was another initiative to provide peer counselling and social support to individuals or families in crisis. DSW, however, pointed out that due to fiscal constraint, it would not be possible for SWD to create paid posts for family service ambassadors, as in the case of creating paid peer counsellor posts to service other youngsters who were muddling at the crossroad. Nevertheless, SWD would give its support for agencies engaged in such initiatives to apply funding from other sources, such as the CIIF and the Lotteries Fund.

- 13. <u>Mr WONG Sing-chi</u> remarked that the existing provision of peer counselling to families in crises, including the Family Service Ambassador Scheme, was too centre-based, and should be expanded to become community-based to facilitate better identification and early detection of family violence problems.
- 14. <u>Ms LI Fung-ying</u> asked about the number of repeated batterers, how frequently they had repeated the act and the contributing factors of spouse battering incidents. Noting the Government's goal to cut spending by 10% in 2006-07, <u>Ms LI</u> asked whether services on preventing and tackling domestic violence would be curtailed, and if so, to what extent. <u>Ms LI</u> hoped that this would not be the case, as the adverse effect of spousal battering and child abuse could extend to the offspring of the victims.
- 15. <u>DSW</u> responded that SWD would strive to see that resources for its support services for families would not be reduced if not increased, as such services were one of the core services of the Department. As resources were finite, every effort would continue to be made to optimise the use of resources. For instance, based on the review of family services, 15 pilot IFSCs had been set up to provide a continuum of preventive, supportive and specialised services at primary, secondary and tertiary levels to prevent family problems and to deal with them when they arose. <u>DSW</u> hoped that with the publicity and education programmes carried out by the public sector, and increasingly by the corporate sector, need for the more expensive remedial services could be reduced. As to which services provided by SWD would be curtailed or cut in order to achieve a saving of 10% in 2006-07, <u>DSW</u> said that she could not divulge information on such until after the Financial Secretary had delivered his 2003-04 Budget Speech on 5 March 2003. She however pointed out that re-prioritising of services was certainly one way in achieving savings. For instance, the traditional family aide service to parents, care persons in families or individuals to develop basic skills in self-care, general

household management, etc. could be re-engineered with the development of other home-based support services in recent years.

16. Regarding information about battered spouse cases, ADSW said that the Central Information System on Battered Spouse Cases (CISBS) presently only captured basic statistics on battered spouse cases. Action was under way to enhance CISBS by expanding its database to include information on sexual violence cases and more data on battered spouse cases, e.g. occupation of the victims and batterers, years of residence of the batterers, etc. As to why people resorted to battering their spouse, ADSW said that SWD would need to await for the findings of the study on child abuse and spousal battering. ADSW further said that action was also underway to enhance the Child Protection Registry (CPR) which captured statistics on child abuse cases. The enhancement of CPR included the improvement of the computerised programme and the revision of the data input form for collecting more specific information on child abuse cases, e.g. contributing factors of the child abuse incidents. The enhanced systems were scheduled to be implemented around mid-2003. At the request of Ms LI, ADSW undertook to provide further analysis of statistics captured by CISBS and CPR after the meeting.

Admin

17. Ms Cyd HO asked the following questions -

- (a) Whether any study would be carried out to assess the impact of reduced welfare services on the community;
- (b) Whether consideration would be given to widening the scope of protection under the Domestic Violence Ordinance (DVO) to include other family members, such as siblings, and ex-spouses;
- (c) Whether consideration would be given to assigning legal representation to child abuse victims; and
- (d) What were the measures taken by the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB) in preventing and tackling domestic violence. For instance, whether arrangements would be made for young parents who had not completed their secondary education to continue schooling, and whether programmes aiming at strengthening family relationships and educating youngsters on how to be good parents could be given before the expiry of the nine years' free education.
- 18. <u>DSW</u> responded that all major policies and strategic initiatives were presently required to go through full assessment of their environmental and economic implications. <u>DSW</u> further said that to enable the Government to apply

the principles of sustainable development through the formulation to implementation of policies, plans and programmes, SWD had recently been requested by the Sustainable Development Unit to comment on a range of sustainability indicators recommended in the report on the Study on Sustainable Development in Hong Kong for the 21st Century (SUSDEV 21) for assessing the implications of major new policy proposals on the social conditions of Hong Kong.

- 19. Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (ASHWF) said that Ms HO's proposal to widen the coverage and scope of protection under DVO had previously also been raised by certain parties in the community. **ASHWF** pointed out that the study on child abuse and spousal battering would, inter alia, identify possible areas for improvement including those that might be related to legislation. Relevant statistics from the Judiciary were also being collected to assess the effectiveness of the existing legal remedies under DVO. This would shed light on the way forward, before consideration would be given to the need or otherwise of embarking on an evidence-based review of the operation of DVO. As to assigning legal representation to child abuse victims, ASHWF said that under the Official Solicitor Ordinance, the court could, depending on the circumstances of a case, appoint the Official Solicitor to act as guardian ad litem or next friend to any person under a disability of age or mental capacity in proceedings before any court.
- 20. As regards measures taken by EMB for preventing and tackling domestic violence, <u>Principal Inspector (Student Guidance)</u> said that all primary and secondary school students were taught skills on building a positive child-parent relationship and coping with family problems through the use of real-life situation under moral and civic education. On the parents front, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) were commissioned to run parenting programmes, recruit people to serve as peer parents, and provide training to teachers on parenting skills so that they could pass these skills on to parents when they met.
- 21. Ms Cyd HO said that the Administration should first consult the public on the sustainability indicators before implementation. The Chairman advised that public consultation had been conducted on the Study on SUSDEV 21, including a range of sustainability indicators that had been proposed to use in assessment and monitoring, between October 1999 and January 2000. Members were consulted on the preliminary findings of the Study at the joint meetings of the Panel on Environmental Affairs (EA Panel) and the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works (PLW Panel) on 9 December 1999 and 27 January 2000. The final report on the Study, which recommended, amongst others, a series of guiding principles and indicators of the key sustainable issues in Hong Kong at the current time (see Appendix), was issued to all Members and submitted to a joint meeting of EA

Panel and PLW Panel on 9 February 2001.

- 22. <u>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan</u> said that the problem of domestic violence could not be reduced when the society was oriented to economic development. For instance, long working hours had left workers with very little time to foster a healthy family life. Noting that five out of the 128 domestic violence cases referred by the Police to SWD for welfare services during the month of January 2003 were without the consent of the victims, <u>Mr LEE</u> asked about the criteria adopted by the Police for referring cases to SWD without the consent of the victims.
- 23. <u>Dr YEUNG Sum</u> welcomed SWD's intention not to cutback its family support services in achieving the Government's goal of reducing spending by 10% in 2006-07. <u>Dr YEUNG</u> further said that given the increasing complexity of domestic violence cases, inter-departmental working group chaired by DSW and comprising representatives from SWD, the Police and the Housing Department (HD), etc. should be set up to provide guidance and support to frontline social workers. <u>Dr YEUNG</u> also hoped that working hours of frontline social workers would not be confined to normal working hours, HD would not provide housing assistance to battered spouses only after tragedies occurred, and the media would refrain from reporting the domestic violence cases in an explicit manner.
- 24. <u>Mr Henry WU</u> asked about the percentage of new arrivals involved in crimes in recent years. <u>Mr WU</u> pointed out that measures should be formulated to target this group of people if there was a rising trend of them involving in crimes, particularly in light of the impending implementation of 24-hour boundary crossings.
- 25. Referring to the suggestion of setting up inter-departmental working group to provide guidance and support to frontline social workers, <u>DSW</u> said that this had been done. The Committee on Child Abuse and the Working Group on Combating Violence chaired by herself and attended by representatives from other Government departments, NGOs and concerned professionals met regularly to devise strategies and measures to tackle the problem of child abuse and spousal battering through multi-disciplinary collaboration. As to the working hours of frontline social workers, <u>DSW</u> said that apart from extending the service hours of some family service centres, those with 24-hour hotline service were backed up by social workers who could provide timely intervention and assistance where necessary.
- 26. Regarding the criteria for referring domestic violence cases to SWD without the consent of victims, <u>Superintendent (Crime)(Support)</u> referred members to paragraph 7 of the Administration's paper. As to the percentage of new arrivals involved in crimes in recent year, <u>Superintendent (Crime)(Support)</u> said

that the Police did not have such information.

- 27. The Chairman said that new arrivals should not be singled out in combating domestic violence, as they faced similar problems to those of other Hong Kong citizens, albeit with an additional hurdle to adapt to the new environment. He then asked a question on behalf of Miss CHAN Yuen-han as to whether housing assistance would be provided to elders who were abused by their children and to debtors who were pursued relentlessly by debt collection companies.
- 28. <u>Assistant Director (Estate Management) 1</u> responded that HD would consider providing housing assistance to elders who were abused by their children and to debtors who were pursued relentlessly by debt collection companies on a case by case basis.

IV. Services and support for people with disabilities (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1104/02-03(04) and (05))

- 29. <u>DSW</u> gave a power point presentation on the major rehabilitation services for adults with mental/physical handicaps (MH/PH), particularly on the recent development of vocational rehabilitation services, residential services and community support services under SWD as detailed in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1104/02-03(04)).
- 30. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan said that SWD should not compare the success of sheltered workshop (SW) and Supported Employment (SE) services in terms of discharge rate, having regard to the fact that users of SW service had lower functioning level than users of SE service. Mr LEE then asked the following questions -
 - (a) What actions would be taken to increase more income-generating work for service users of SW, having regard to the fact the average daily income of SE users only ranged from \$5 to \$82 in 2001-02; and
 - (b) Whether consideration could be given to offering concessionary transport fares to people with disabilities, having regard to the fact the average monthly income of service users of SE was merely \$2,562 in 2001-02.
- 31. <u>Mr Michael MAK</u> said that discrimination against people with disabilities was detrimental to their moving towards self-reliance, and hoped that more efforts would be put in to reduce such. <u>Mr MAK</u> further asked whether there was any sign of service users of SE being exploited by their employers.

- 32. <u>The Chairman</u> asked whether SWD would encourage NGOs providing welfare services to incorporate rehabilitation services for adults with MH/PH in their mainstream services.
- DSW clarified that the Administration had no intention to undermine the 33. value of SW service or close down all SWs. The reason for conducting valuefor-money audits on SW and SE services was to find out how these two services could be operated in a more cost-effective manner. <u>DSW</u> further said that owing to recent economic downtown and the fading out of small production industries in Hong Kong, it had become more difficult for SWs to secure income-generating Nevertheless, about one-third of SWs had taken the work for their users. initiative to set up mobile work teams in providing outdoor contractual services such as car-washing, office cleaning, leaflet distribution, etc. Although the average daily income of SW service users only ranged from \$5 to \$82 in 2001-02, <u>DSW</u> pointed out that people earning \$5 a day were those with serious MH/PH. <u>DSW</u> also pointed out that service users of SE who gained employment remained as service users or trainees were not employees as such, and it was not appropriate to compare their income with workers in the ordinary sense.
- 34. As to offering concessionary transport fares to the disabled, <u>DSW</u> said that whilst she could not comment on the transport policy, resources were provided under the rehabilitation policy to facilitate people with disabilities to go to work or attend training. These included \$20 million a year funding the provision of Rehab buses and centre-based transport service operated by NGOs under subventions. The problem was one of capacity and equity in access.
- 35. As regards the issue of discrimination against people with disabilities, <u>DSW</u> said that SWD would continue to educate the public to accept people with disabilities but more time was needed for the community at large to accept the same. It was gratifying that the District Councils had now become more receptive to requests for setting up centres for people with disabilities in their Districts. However, there was still much resistance from residents of the building or housing estates in which the centre was proposed to be located. <u>DSW</u> further said that no incident of employers of service users of SE exploiting the latter had been detected. In SWD's contact with these employers, there was also no sign of any discrimination against people with disabilities.
- 36. On the suggestion of incorporating rehabilitation services for adults with MH/PH in mainstream welfare services, <u>DSW</u> said that SWD welcomed it but pointed out that this would take a long time to realise. Apart from persuading users of mainstream services to include people with disabilities in their activities, corresponding measures, such as modifications to facilities, would also need to be

made.

V. An update on the issue of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance

- 37. <u>DSW</u> said that no decision had yet been made about adjusting the standard payments of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance (CSSA) downward according to the deflationary situation. <u>DSW</u> further said that if this was implemented, adequate time would be allowed for CSSA recipients to adapt to the new arrangements. <u>DSW</u> also said that a proposal would be submitted to the Finance Committee on 21 February 2003 to seek a supplementary provision of \$250 million for the CSSA Scheme. <u>DSW</u> explained that the supplementary provision was necessary to ensure that there would be adequate fund to meet the three-month expenditure from January to March 2003, given that the trend of increase of CSSA cases was likely to continue or even accelerate under the current economic situation.
- 38. Mr Fred LI and Mr WONG Sing-chi asked whether changing the residency requirement for the CSSA Scheme was one area under consideration by the Administration in an attempt to control expenditure on public assistance. Mr WONG further asked whether drastic measures, including the aforesaid and time-limiting the CSSA benefits and setting a ceiling on CSSA, mentioned by DSW at the meeting on 11 November 2002 to avoid CSSA expenditure from going out of control, were now being seriously considered by the Administration.
- 39. <u>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan</u> asked whether Members would be consulted before reducing the CSSA standard rates.
- 40. <u>The Chairman</u> asked whether the reduction of CSSA standard rates would be applied across the board and whether consideration would be given to spreading out the percentage of reduction over two to three years and raising the amount of disregarded earnings.
- 41. <u>DSW</u> clarified that no decision had yet been made on when the downward adjustment of CSSA standard rates would be implemented, but since the current rates would only be valid till end March 2003, a decision would have to be made soon. <u>DSW</u> further clarified that drastic measures mentioned by her at the meeting on 11 November 2002 to prevent CSSA expenditure from going out of control were not the views of the Administration, but were suggestions from various quarters in the community.
- 42. <u>DSW</u> further said that she could not divulge further information on the adjustment of CSSA standard rates, apart from the fact that a grace period would

be provided to enable CSSA recipients to adapt to the adjusted rates. She, however, pointed out that Members' views and that of the public had been taken into account in the adjustment exercise. DSW added that apart from adjusting the CSSA standard rates to optimise the use of limited resources, various steps were being undertaken by the Administration to help the socially disadvantaged. For instance, the reviews on the Support for Self-reliance Scheme and the "Ending Exclusion" Project to better help the unemployed and single parents to gain employment, and the review on the existing social security schemes for elders with a view to developing a sustainable financial support system which could better target resources at those older persons most in need. The population policy, to be finalised by the Chief Secretary for Administration, should also shed light on preventing CSSA expenditure from going out of control.

VI. Any other business

43. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:56 pm.

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
4 March 2003

Sustainability Indicators

Economy	• Economic return as determined through cost benefit analysis.
	 Percentage change in income less income tax for the upper quartile
	household minus the percentage change in income less income tax for
	the lower quartile.
	 Gross domestic fixed capital formation as a ratio to GDP.
	• Expenditure on primary, secondary and tertiary education as a ratio to
	GDP.
	Unemployment rate.
Health and	 Notification of communicable diseases.
Hygiene	• In patient discharges and deaths per 100,000 population due to
	diseases of the respiratory system.
Natural	• Consumption of energy per unit of output (\$ GDP).
Resources	 Quantity of municipal solid waste, public fill and construction and
	demolition waste requiring final disposal per capita.
	• The total remaining landfill capacity (by volume).
	 Volume of freshwater supplied per capita.
	 Percentage of demand met by locally-derived freshwater resources.
	Area of countryside.
Society and	 Average length of waiting list for public rental housing.
Social	 Median rent to income ratio for private housing.
Infrastructure	 Percentage of households residing in inadequate housing.
	• Living space per person.
	Number of registered volunteers.
	 Waiting lists for subsidized residential care homes for the elderly.
	Number of student members of civic education and community
	services organizations.
	 Proportion of people of working age who have received
	post-secondary education or above.
Biodiversity	Area of Hong Kong of high terrestrial ecological value.
	 Area of Hong Kong of high marine ecological value.
	 Area of managed terrestrial habitat for conservation.
	 Area of managed marine habitat for conservation.

Number of recorded archaeological sites.
Number of recorded cultural and historical sites.
• Percentage of population living within districts with a shortfall of
required provision of open space.
Annual ticket sales for major cultural, entertainment and sporting
events.
• Composite index for criteria air pollutants based on percentage of the
Air Quality Objectives.
Composite index for toxic air pollutants based on percentage of
Acceptable Risk.
• Quantity (tonnes) of carbon dioxide emitted per year.
 Percentage of population exposed to excessive noise.
 Percent of EPD's river monitoring stations ranked "Excellent" or
"Good" using the EPD's Water Quality Index.
Composite index for marine water quality pollutants based on
percentage of the Water Quality Objectives.
• Number of beach-days per year ranked "Good or "Fair".
Average travel distances; the distance in kilometres travelled by
passengers during morning peak by all major groups of transport
modes.
Average network speed; calculated as total passenger kilometers
divided by total passenger hours.
• The cost of road-based freight transport; the cost of charges and
operating costs as a ratio to GDP.