

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC96/03-04
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 12th meeting
held in the Chamber of Legislative Council Building
on Wednesday, 23 June 2004, at 10:00 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, JP (Chairman)
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon Eric LI Ka-cheung, GBS, JP
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai
Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan
Hon YEUNG Yiu-chung, BBS
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Dr Hon LAW Chi-kwong, JP
Dr Hon TANG Siu-tong, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
Hon Henry WU King-cheong, BBS, JP
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon IP Kwok-him, JP
Hon LAU Ping-cheung

Members absent:

Hon Kenneth TING Woo-shou, JP
Dr Hon David CHU Yu-lin, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

Miss Amy TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr Y C LO, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works)
Mrs Rita LAU, JP	Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)
Mr Rob LAW, JP	Director of Environmental Protection
Miss Janice TSE	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr Raymond CHEUNG	Director of Drainage Services
Mr David CHEUNG	Chief Engineer of Drainage Services (Project Management)
Mr K W MAK	Chief Engineer of Drainage Services (Consultants Management)
Mrs Cherry TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Education and Manpower (2)
Mr David WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education and Manpower (Infrastructure & Research Support)
Mr N C TINSLEY	Chief Technical Advisor/ Subvented Projects (Acting) Architectural Services Department
Mr Patrick LI, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr C H YUE, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Ms Venner CHEUNG	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Administration)
Mr CHEUNG Hing-wah	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Youth and Corrections)
Mr LEUNG King-hang	Deputy Regional Commander (Acting) New Territories North Region Hong Kong Police Force
Mr Robert CHAN, JP	Chief Staff Officer, Civil Aid Service
Mr Vincent LIU	Principal Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Food and Environmental Hygiene) ²

Mr Donald TONG	Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Administration and Development)
Ms Rhonda LO	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations)3
Mr YEUNG Shun-kui	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operations)2
Ms Eva CHENG, JP	Commissioner for Tourism
Mrs Winifred CHUNG	Assistant Commissioner for Tourism
Mr CHOI Kwok-kuen	General Engineering Services Manager Electrical & Mechanical Services Department
Mr Charles WONG	Deputy Secretary for Security 2 (Acting)
Mr W P TAM	Deputy Director (Strategy) Housing Department
Mr Peter YUEN	Project Director 1 Architectural Services Department
Mr MOK Kam-kwan, JP	Deputy Government Property Administrator
Mr LAM Kin-ha	Chief Property Manager (Acquisition, Allocation and Disposal) Government Property Agency
Mr David HOOI	Principal Management Services Officer for Security (Security)

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Chief Council Secretary (1)6
--------------	------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Matthew LOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)3
Ms Caris CHAN	Senior Legislative Assistant 1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant 2

HEAD 704 - DRAINAGE

PWSC(2004-05)29 126CD Drainage improvement in East Kowloon

Members noted that an information paper on the proposed drainage improvement works in Tsim Sha Tsui, To Kwa Wan, Wong Tai Sin and Yau Tong had been circulated to members of the LegCo Panel on Planning, Lands and Works (PLW Panel) on 12 May 2004.

2. Mr Fred LI noticed that the Administration had planned to convert the surplus Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) flats in Yau Tong to departmental quarters for the disciplined services. As Yau Tong was one of the flood prone areas in East Kowloon, Mr LI was concerned that the future intake of new residents into the HOS flats would impact adversely on the drainage system of the area. In response, the Director of Drainage Services (DDS) advised that the proposed drainage improvement works were aimed to alleviate the risk of flooding, which arose mainly from severe rainstorms. The intake of additional population into the area would have little impact on the drainage system. Nevertheless, the Administration had taken into account various factors including the projected developments in the catchment area in designing the proposed improvement works.

3. On Mr Fred LI's enquiry about the scope of the project, DDS advised that the proposed improvement works included the replacement of existing drains of insufficient capacity with larger drain pipes or box culverts, and constructing new drains. These works were designed based on the findings of the comprehensive assessment of the drainage system in the catchment area of East Kowloon. The Drainage Services Department would repair damaged drains and clear blockage as part of their routine maintenance to ensure that the drainage system would continue to function properly.

4. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2004-05)28 110CD Drainage improvement in Tsuen Wan, Kwai Chung and Tsing Yi - urban drainage improvement works

5. Members noted that the Administration had consulted PLW Panel on the proposed drainage improvement works in Tsuen Wan and Kwai Chung at the meeting on 27 April 2004.

6. The item was voted on and endorsed.

HEAD 708 - CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT

PWSC(2004-05)35 44EC A private independent school (secondary-cum-primary) at Shum Wan Road, Aberdeen

7. Members noted that the Administration had consulted the LegCo Panel on Education (Education Panel) on the planning and provision of public sector school places at the Panel meeting held on 30 January 2004. The draft paper for submission to the Public Works Subcommittee had also been forwarded to members of the

Education Panel for advance information on 14 June 2004.

8. Dr Eric LI informed the Clerk in writing that he declared interest that he was a member of the Advisory Committee of the proposed private independent secondary-cum-primary school sponsored by the Shanghai Victoria Education Foundation.

9. The item was voted on and endorsed.

HEAD 703 - BUILDINGS

**PWSC(2004-05)37 187SC Joint-user complex at Tseng Choi Street,
Tuen Mun**

10. The item was voted on and endorsed.

HEAD 703 - BUILDINGS

**PWSC(2004-05)33 6NT Conversion of aqua privies into flushing
toilets - phase 1**

11. Members noted that this item had been discussed at the meeting of the LegCo Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene (FSEH Panel) on 25 November 2003.

12. Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired about the total number of aqua privies in Hong Kong and the timetable for the conversion of the remaining 70 aqua privies into flushing toilets in the next two phases of the project. The Principal Assistant Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food (Food and Environmental Hygiene)² (PAS(FEH)²) replied that there were some 540 aqua privies under the management of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) in Hong Kong. The present conversion project covered 100 aqua privies which were of heavy usage or located at popular sightseeing spots. The Administration planned to submit the funding proposals for the conversion of the remaining 70 aqua privies in the 2004/05 legislative session and the entire project would be completed by end 2007.

13. Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired about the mechanism for identifying aqua privies for inclusion in this conversion project, and asked whether an existing aqua privy located at Shatin Pass Road, which was heavily used by hikers and rambblers, had been included in the project. The Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Administration and Development) (DD(Adm&Dev)) explained that in identifying aqua privies for inclusion in this conversion project, the Administration had taken into account factors like the accessibility, location and usage rate of the aqua privies. One necessary condition was that the aqua privies were accessible by

Admin

land or sea transport for tankering away of the waste. The relevant District Councils had been consulted on the list. DD(Adm&Dev) confirmed that the aqua privy at Shap Yi Watt Village on Shatin Pass Road had been proposed for inclusion in the subsequent phases of the conversion projects. At the request of Mr CHAN, the Administration agreed to provide the list of the remaining 70 aqua privies to be converted into flushing toilets at the next two phases of the project.

14. In reply to Dr TANG Siu-tong's enquiry, DD (Adm & Dev) confirmed that for the safety of users in particular elderly persons, handrails would be installed in the toilets with the squatting type water closets.

15. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**PWSC(2004-05)30 23NM General improvement works at Ngau
Tau Kok Market and Cooked Food
Centre**

16. Members noted that this item had been considered at the meeting of FSEH Panel on 3 March 2004.

17. Mr LAU Ping-cheung declared interest as the firm he worked for might participate in bidding the contract for the proposed works.

18. Noting that the proposed works for the Ngau Tau Kok Market (the Market) and Cooked Food Centre (the CFC) would last for about 14 months, Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired about the works implementation plan and arrangements to minimize disruption to the stall lessees concerned. PAS(FEH)2 advised that to minimize disruption to stall lessees, the proposed works would be implemented in phases through dividing the project area into smaller work zones. The works at the CFC would be carried out in summer during which the patronage was relatively low. As the proposed works included replacement of floor finishes, affected stalls would have to suspend operation during the replacement works. The works period in each zone would be seven days for the Market area and 31 days for the CFC area.

19. Mr CHAN Kam-lam was concerned whether the affected stall lessees had been well-informed of and agreed to the proposed arrangements. DD(Adm&Dev) advised that the Administration was fully aware that cooperation of stall lessees was essential for the smooth implementation of the proposed works and of the need to minimize disruption to their business during the works period. FEHD had maintained close communication with the stall lessees concerned and had made appropriate arrangements in response to their requests. To relieve affected stall lessees from the impact of the improvement works on their business, FEHD would waive the stall rental for the works period and for the first seven days and the first month upon business resumption for the affected stallholders in the Market area and the CFC respectively.

20. Noting that the proposed works for the CFC included the replacement of existing skylights, Mr Fred LI was concerned that the skylights would let in more sunlight and raise the temperature in the CFC. In reply to his enquiry about the material used for the new skylights, the Director of Architectural Services (D Arch S) said that transparent materials such as tinted glass with heat insulation effect would be used. In addition, the ventilation system would be upgraded to allow a higher frequency of fresh air intake and air change. There would be significant improvement in the ventilation of the Market and the CFC after the improvement works.

21. In reply to Mr LAU Ping-cheung's enquiry about the details of the upgrading of the mechanical ventilation system, D Arch S illustrated with the example of poultry stalls that the upgrading works included the installation of two exhaust systems to provide two layers (via high-level and medium level air grilles) of extraction system in each poultry stall to improve air movement. Pre-filters would be installed to prevent large particles from flowing from the poultry stalls to the outside areas. Ultraviolet light would be added in the exhaust air duct to eliminate germs. As regards the maintenance of the upgraded system, D Arch S said that the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department would undertake regular monitoring of the air quality in the Market and the CFC and conduct regular maintenance of the ventilation system.

22. In reply to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry about the \$1 million increase in the estimated annual recurrent expenditure after the improvement works, PAS(FEH)2 explained that the increase was mainly attributed to the higher electricity and maintenance costs of the upgraded mechanical ventilation system.

23. Citing the example of the inflexible design of the seating area in a CFC in Tai Po, Mr WONG Yung-kan enquired whether the Administration had taken into account the special needs of some customers, such as pregnant women and disabled persons, in the design of the seating areas of Ngau Tau Kok and Ngau Chi Wan CFCs (Improvement works for Ngau Chi Wan CFC were covered in item PWSC(2004-05)31). D Arch S advised that the seating area of the CFC in Tai Po had been designed in consultation with the stall lessees concerned and FEHD. A designated seating area was provided in the CFC for the convenience of customers with special needs. Mr WONG commented that it would be more desirable if the design of the whole seating areas in the two CFCs under consideration could cater for customers with special needs so that they could patronize any of the food stalls they liked.

24. DD(Adm&Dev) advised that in designing the seating areas for the CFCs under individual improvement projects, the Administration had given full consideration to the views and operational needs of the stall lessees concerned. Indeed, the varied designs for the seating areas of the three CFCs being considered at this meeting had been drawn up according to the specific requests of the stall lessees of each CFC. For instance, the seating area of the Ngau Tau Kok CFC would be provided with fixed tables only; that of the Ngau Chi Wan CFC would not be

provided with any fixed tables or seats, and that of the Shek Wu Hui CFC would be provided with both fixed tables and seats without backrests.

25. Miss CHAN Yuen-han asked whether the Administration had offered to provide both tables and seats for the three CFCs in its consultation with the stall lessees. Miss CHAN stressed that thorough and genuine consultation with affected stall lessees was important. DD(Adm&Dev) assured members that the Administration aimed at providing a better trading environment and enhancing the viability of the Markets and the CFCs venues. In the course of designing the seating areas of the CFCs, FEHD had offered to provide all tables and seats. The designs currently proposed for the three CFCs were drawn up according to the requests of the stall lessees of the three CFCs. He added that in addition to improving the physical conditions of the Markets and the CFCs, FEHD would carry out publicity for individual Markets and CFCs after the completion of the relevant improvement works with a view to boosting patronage and had set up a small team in FEHD for this purpose.

26. Mr Albert CHAN said that while he supported the improvement works for FEHD's markets, he had repeatedly stated his view against the improvement works for FEHD's existing CFCs. In his view and based on his personal exchanges with the CFC stall lessees, the existing CFCs were basically out-dated and unable to compete with the eating establishments in modern private premises. He opined that it would be more cost-effective to offer a buy-back package to CFC stall lessees than undertaking improvement works for the CFCs. Mr CHAN Kam-lam said that he had contacted the stall lessees in the Ngau Tau Kok CFC and gathered that they in general supported the improvement works and looked forward to the improved trading environment.

27. In response to Mr Fred LI's concern about the need to improve the existing escalators in the Ngau Tau Kok Market and CFC, DD(Adm&Dev) advised that FEHD had separately planned the improvement works for the escalators and the works were scheduled to commence in the next few months for completion in late 2004/early 2005. Funds for the works would be charged to the relevant block allocation.

28. Mr Fred LI enquired whether the Administration would take the opportunity of the proposed improvement works to implement the segregation of live poultry from customers at the poultry stalls in Ngau Tau Kok Market and Ngau Chi Wan Market. DD(Adm&Dev) advised that the segregation of live poultry from customers would require a greater extent of modifications of poultry stalls in the two Markets. As the poultry stalls in the two Markets had very high occupancy rates at present, such modification works would only be feasible when some poultry stall lessees terminated their tenancies, and this in turn hinged upon whether the funding approval by the Finance Committee could be obtained for the Government's proposed ex-gratia payments to live poultry retailers voluntarily surrendering their fresh provision shop licences with endorsement to sell live poultry or public market tenancies.

29. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2004-05)31 31NM General improvement works at Ngau Chi Wan Market and Cooked Food Centre

30. Members noted that this item had been considered at the meeting of FSEH Panel on 3 March 2004.

31. Mr CHAN Kam-lam recalled that when retro-fitting of air-conditioning (A/C) system was considered for the Ngau Chi Wan CFC, the consultant engaged by the Administration had recommended alteration of the existing stall layout so that all cooked food stalls would be facing the seating area. Mr CHAN asked whether consideration had been given to altering the stall layout when planning the proposed improvement works. In reply, DD(Adm&Dev) explained that the design of the CFC, including the layout of cooked food stalls, was made in consultation with the stall lessees concerned and had their support. He pointed out that the proposal submitted for consideration at the meeting included improvement of lighting, signage as well as construction of additional plant rooms for water scrubbers. These improvement works would enhance the overall trading environment of the Market and the CFC. He reiterated that the Administration would undertake publicity for the Market and the CFC after completion of the improvement works with a view to boosting patronage.

32. In reply to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry about the works implementation arrangements, DD(Adm&Dev) confirmed that the works scheduling and rent waiver arrangements would be similar to those for the improvement works in the Ngau Tau Kok Market and CFC. He advised that at the request of the stall lessees of dry goods stalls in the Ngau Chi Wan Market, replacement of floor finishes would not be carried out for the dry goods zone. As these dry goods stalls would not have to suspend operation during the works period, the stall lessees concerned would not be granted the 7-days rent waiver. For the CFC stall lessees, their rent would be waived for the six-week works period and for the first month after the resumption of business.

33. Noting that the costs for building works for the Ngau Tau Kok Market and CFC project and the Ngau Chi Wan Market and CFC project amounted to \$32 million and \$22.3 million respectively, Mr Abraham SHEK enquired about the reasons for the disparity. In reply, D Arch S explained that there were differences in the details of the improvement works under the two projects. For example, the extent of replacement of floor finishes and the improvement works for the plumbing and drainage systems were different in the two projects. In the Ngau Tau Kok Market and CFC project, the proposed works included the replacement of skylights and waterproofing to the roof but such works were not included in the Ngau Chi Wan Market and CFC project. He advised that the estimated construction unit costs of the two improvement projects were comparable if the differences in details of works were

taken out.

34. Miss CHAN Yuen-han highlighted that the existing ventilation at the Ngau Chi Wan Market was far from satisfactory, in particular for an inner area on the ground floor where the temperature was unbearably high in summer. Given the defects in the structural design of the Market building, Miss CHAN doubted whether the proposed upgrading works for the ventilation system could adequately address the existing problem. Miss CHAN asked whether the Administration had considered making structural alterations in forming openings on the external walls of the market to improve the ventilation of the inner area. She pointed out that this idea had been raised by the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food during their joint site visit to the Ngau Chi Wan Market some time ago.

Admin

35. D Arch S advised that under the proposed improvement works, additional ventilation fans would be installed and the ventilation system would be upgraded to increase the volume of fresh air intake and the frequency of air changes. The ventilation in the market building would be improved to a certain extent compared with the current condition. DD(Adm&Dev) undertook to explore the feasibility of making structural alterations in forming openings on the external walls of the market in consultation with stall lessees and the Architectural Services Department.

36. Mr Henry WU enquired why modification was proposed for only one of the existing two lifts to make the lift suitable for use by disabled persons. D Arch S advised that modification of an existing lift into a lift suitable for use by disabled persons would meet the current statutory requirement.

37. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2004-05)34

25NM

Retro-fitting of air-conditioning and general improvement works at Shek Wu Hui Cooked Food Centre, Sheung Shui

38. Noting that that the Shek Wu Hui CFC would need to be closed for five and a half months for the proposed improvement works, Mr WONG Sing-chi asked if the Administration had conducted thorough consultation with the stall lessees on the related arrangements. The Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Operation)³, FEHD said that FEHD had consulted the stall lessees on the proposed improvement works and the related arrangements including the closure of the CFC during the works period. In response to the request of the stall lessees, the Administration had taken actions to enable earlier implementation of the project so that the improvement works could be carried out in the summer months when the patronage of the CFC was lower. She also advised that the stall lessees had asked for ex-gratia payments but the Administration had informed them that in accordance with the established policy in respect of improvement works for FEHD's markets and CFCs, only rent waiver could be granted.

39. Mr WONG Sing-chi sought confirmation on whether the stall lessees concerned were satisfied with the Administration's proposed arrangements. DD(Adm&Dev) said that very often, the stall lessees concerned might raise specific requests in terms of ex-gratia payments and rent waiver when consulted on proposed improvement works for FEHD's markets and CFCs. The Administration had to be very cautious about the financial implications on the Government of such requests. The Administration had already shouldered the capital costs for the proposed improvement works. It would be prudent for the Administration to follow the established policy of granting only rent waiver to provide financial relief for the stall lessees concerned. In this case, the stall lessees had been informed that they would be granted rent waiver for the closure period and the first two months upon resumption of business. PAS(FEH)2 confirmed that more than 85% of the stall lessees of the CFC accepted the proposal of retro-fitting air-conditioning at the CFC with full understanding of the CFC closure and rent waiver arrangements.

40. Mr LAU Kong-wah commended the Administration's efforts to expedite the project, as the stall lessees had called for early completion of the improvement works. Noting from the illustrations provided in the Administration's paper that the seats and tables at the seating area of the CFC were fixed, he expressed concern that the design would present difficulty to patrons who were stout or pregnant. He suggested that the seats should be movable so that patrons could move the seats to suit their individual needs. D Arch S said that the tables and seats of the CFC were designed with reference to those at fast food shops and samples would be made for consultation with FEHD and the stall lessees. He undertook to review the design of the seats with FEHD taking into account Mr LAU's suggestion.

Admin

41. Mr LAU Kong-wah drew the Administration's attention to certain aspects of the improvement works. He observed that the tables were too close to one another and it would be dangerous for patrons to move around carrying hot stuff. The air curtain at the entrance of FEHD's CFCs was often not strong enough and this caused discomfort for patrons sitting near the entrance. The functioning of the air-conditioners in some CFCs would deteriorate quickly after only a few years of installation. The Administration agreed to give special attention to these aspects in undertaking the improvement works.

42. Mr LAU Kong-wah said that according to the experience of other markets retro-fitted with an A/C system, the amount of A/C electricity costs paid by stall lessees was based on the relevant estimation made by the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) at the beginning of the lease period, and no refund would be made to stall lessees if there was an overpayment. He opined that it would be fairer for stall lessees to pay for the actual electricity costs. DD(Adm&Dev) said the FEHD could look into this, but remarked that for the arrangement to be fair, any difference between the estimated costs and the actual costs would have to be refunded or collected from the stall lessees, as the case might be.

Admin

43. In this connection, Mr LAU Kong-wah requested for figures on the estimated A/C electricity costs and the actual costs for FEHD's markets retro-fitted with an A/C system before the relevant Finance Committee (FC) meeting. In response, DD(Adm&Dev) said that he would contact EMSD for the requested information. As FC would consider this item at its meeting on 2 July 2004, EMSD might not have sufficient time to collate the requested information. Mr LAU then requested that before the FC meeting, the Administration should provide the figures in respect of Luen Wo Hui Market in Sheung Shui. DD(Adm&Dev) agreed to provide such information, if possible, before the FC meeting but much would depend on whether the data was readily available from EMSD. He supplemented that the estimated operating and maintenance costs for the A/C system of Shek Wu Hui CFC was about \$4,350 per month per stall.

44. Mr Andrew WONG pointed out that there would be difficulty in calculating the A/C electricity costs if the CFC stalls shared a common electricity meter. He requested for details of the method to calculate the A/C electricity costs in the case that individual stalls were not installed with an independent electricity meter. DD(Adm&Dev) said that FEHD would request EMSD and the Architectural Services Department to install separate electricity meters for the entire CFC portion and the entire market portion as far as possible. If for technical reasons it was not possible to install individual electricity meters for these two separate portions, the costs would be estimated based on the air-flow volume. Although the air-flow volume was not as accurate as an electricity meter, it was still objective and measurable. In the case of Shek Wu Hui CFC under the present proposal, a separate electricity meter would be installed for the A/C system serving the whole CFC.

45. In response to Mr Andrew WONG's enquiry, DD(Adm&Dev) said that separate electricity meters were installed for measuring the A/C power consumption in the market area and CFC area of Tai Po Hui Market and CFC. As the CFC stalls operated up to two o'clock in the morning while most market stalls closed in the evening, it would be undesirable for the CFC to share an electricity meter with the market stalls. He further confirmed that the A/C electricity costs for individual stalls in Tai Po Hui Market and CFC were calculated on the basis of stall size irrespective of business nature.

Admin

46. In reply to Mr Henry WU's enquiry, D Arch S said that one new lift would be installed in Shek Wu Hui CFC and it probably would be the only lift in the CFC. As the new lift was marked as "proposed new fireman's lift" in Enclosure 1 to the Administration's paper, Mr Henry WU requested the Administration to check whether the lift would also serve as a lift for disabled persons or there would be another lift for disabled persons.

47. The item was voted on and endorsed.

HEAD 703 - BUILDINGS**PWSC(2004-05)32 398RO Implementation of Harbour Lighting Plan - phase 2**

48. Members noted that the Administration had consulted the LegCo Panel on Economic Services on the implementation of phase 2 of the Harbour Lighting Plan (the Plan) at the meeting on 24 May 2004.

49. The Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works) declared interest that he was the Chairman of the Executive Board of the Electrical and Mechanical Services Trading Fund.

50. On account of the success of “A Symphony of Lights” (the Show), a multi-media light and sound show staged across the Harbour every night since January 2004, Mr LAU Kong-wah expressed support for the implementation of phase 2 of the Plan. He enquired about the arrangements for the narrative soundtrack of the Show. He remarked that the soundtrack was an important part of the Show, and with the broadcast of the soundtrack at various viewing locations, the effect of the Show could be much enhanced. He believed that the cost of the audio equipment required would not be very high and thus it might be worth to include the equipment in phase 2 of the Plan.

51. In reply, the Commissioner for Tourism (C for Tourism) advised that the soundtrack of the Show was broadcast every night along the Avenue of Stars in Tsim Sha Tsui at present. Spectators could also listen to the soundtrack by radios in different languages through FM frequency or via mobile phones. Mr LAU Kong-wah opined that it was unrealistic to ask tourists to bring along their own radios or use mobile phones to listen to the soundtrack of the Show. Echoing Mr LAU’s view, Mr IP Kwok-him said that the Administration should consider extending the broadcast of the soundtrack to other viewing locations in order to make the Show more appealing. Since architectural lighting would be installed for three government buildings in Kowloon and some private buildings in Kowloon might also join phase 2 of the Plan, Mr LAU and Mr IP suggested that public address (PA) systems should be installed along the harbourfront promenades on both the Hong Kong Island and the Kowloon side.

52. In response, C for Tourism advised that it was the Administration’s long-term plan to broadcast the soundtrack of the Show at suitable locations along the waterfront on both sides of the harbour. At present, the soundtrack of the Show was only broadcast along the Avenue of Stars because the broadcast outside Hong Kong Cultural Centre (HKCC) had discontinued due to the commencement of the Tsim Sha Tsui Promenade Beautification Project. She added that upon completion of the beautification project, the entire stretch of the promenade would be equipped with PA systems. As regards the Hong Kong Island, C for Tourism advised that the Tourism

Commission was planning to beautify the Golden Bauhinia Square and that opportunities would be taken to install PA systems in the area.

53. Mr Andrew WONG Wang-fat said that he had reservation about the idea of broadcasting the same soundtrack every night extensively along the harbourfront as this might not be appropriate for some locations or fit the taste of some people. He also considered it not desirable for the Government to control all the sound systems along the harbourfront areas.

54. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2004-05)36 50JA Purchase of surplus Home Ownership Scheme flats for reprovisioning departmental quarters for the disciplined services

55. Members noted that the Administration had consulted the LegCo Panel on Housing (Housing Panel) on the proposed reprovisioning of departmental quarters for the disciplined services at the meeting held on 7 June 2004.

56. Mr Henry WU declared interest that he was a member of the Housing Authority.

57. Miss CHAN Yuen-han recalled that at the Housing Panel meeting held on 7 June 2004, she and Ms LI Fung-ying had expressed grave concern about the staff response to the proposed reprovisioning arrangements. They had called upon the Administration to conduct comprehensive consultation with the affected staff on the details of the reprovisioning arrangements to avoid possible conflicts. Miss CHAN said that she had arranged a meeting for the Administration to meet with the representatives from eight affected departmental quarters this morning. She was disappointed to note that the Administration had not consulted the affected staff. Some staff even complained that the Administration had not responded to their enquiries about the reprovisioning arrangements made five months ago. Miss CHAN said that the affected staff generally supported the proposed use of surplus HOS flats for reprovisioning departmental quarters for disciplinary services, but they were not satisfied with the lack of staff consultation and did not agree to the proposed intake timetable under which some 4 300 affected households would have to move into the HOS flats by early 2006. She cited the clearance programme of Diamond Hill Squatter Area as an example and pointed out that the Administration had spent five years to rehouse around 7 000 affected households. Miss CHAN strongly urged the Administration to immediately consult the affected staff on the detailed reprovisioning arrangements and to revise the reprovisioning timetable accordingly.

58. The Deputy Secretary for Security 2 (DS(S)2) advised that the present proposal was aimed at making beneficial use of the otherwise idling surplus HOS

flats to re-provision the existing old or substandard departmental quarters. Some 4 300 households would benefit from the proposal as they moved into quarters of a higher standard. The existing departmental sites, once vacated, would also become available for alternative uses such as sale for private developments. The Administration had carried out preliminary consultation with the disciplined services staff associations and received favourable feedback. The Administration would conduct further staff consultation on the implementation details, such as the method of allocation of new departmental quarters and the timetable for removals from the existing quarters. DS(S)2 also advised that the suggested timing of complete decantation of the existing 15 departmental quarters sites by early 2006 was based on the assumption that the fitting-out works for the HOS flats would be completed in mid-2005. The affected staff would have around two years to make their removal arrangements.

59. Miss CHOY So-yuk said that she had discussed the proposed re-provisioning arrangements with the representatives from Tanner Road Police Married Quarters, Wanchai Police Married Quarters, Western Police Station Married Quarters, Homantin Police Married Quarters, Kwai Chung Police Married Quarters, Sha Tin Police Married Quarters and Au Tau Departmental Quarters. She was informed that over 80% of the staff in these departmental quarters did not support the re-provisioning arrangements currently proposed. Miss CHOY was dissatisfied that the affected staff had not been consulted. She was of the view that the proposed intake arrangement was unreasonable as the affected staff were provided with little flexibility in respect of the locations of the new quarters and timing of removal. Miss CHOY suggested that the Administration adopted a more flexible approach by allowing staff, including non-disciplined services staff, living in other departmental quarters to apply for the re-provisioned HOS flats, and identifying additional surplus HOS flats in other districts for the re-provisioning exercise. Miss CHOY said that she would not support the present proposal if the Administration failed to address the affected staff's concern before the relevant FC meeting.

60. Mr CHAN Kam-lam supported Miss CHOY So-yuk's suggestion and stressed that the Administration should adopt an accommodating approach in making the re-provisioning arrangements for the affected staff. He also suggested that the Administration should withhold and reconsider the proposed re-provisioning of those departmental quarters in which more than 50% of the affected staff objected to the proposed re-provisioning arrangements.

61. Mr IP Kwok-him stated that the Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (DAB) had carried out consultation with the disciplined services staff associations. The associations generally welcomed the proposal but expressed concern that the affected staff should be allowed sufficient time for making removal arrangements. Mr IP advised that Members of DAB supported the proposal in principle but stressed that the Administration should carefully work out the implementation details and fully address staff concerns.

62. Mr Fred LI said that he supported the proposal as it could relieve the Housing Authority from the burden of managing and maintaining the vacant surplus HOS flats. In fact, for some of the surplus HOS flats covered in the present proposal, the intake of residents was long overdue, and this had seriously affected the signed-up tenants of the shops located at the HOS estates.

63. Taking note of members' comments and suggestions, DS(S)2 advised that the Administration had received only one submission from the staff in Sha Tin Police Married Quarters stating that around 130 out of the 251 households did not accept the locations of the four proposed HOS sites. Representatives from other affected Police departmental quarters only informed the Administration of their stance at the meeting arranged by Miss CHAN Yuen-han held before this PWSC meeting. DS(S)2 pointed out that the majority of the affected staff at the 15 departmental quarters sites welcomed the reprovisioning proposal as their living environment would be improved. The Administration had undertaken to conduct further staff consultation on the implementation details, and would follow up objections from individual households. DS(S)2 further pointed out that apart from moving into the reprovisioned HOS flats, the affected staff might apply for other vacant departmental quarters and they would be given extra marks under the respective department's quarters allocation system.

64. The Deputy Director (Strategy) (DD(Strategy)) of the Housing Department supplemented that the HOS flats concerned were well provisioned and conveniently located with good transport facilities. The Administration was sure most if not all staff concerned would be convinced in subsequent consultation that the HOS flats were reasonable replacement for their existing sub-standard quarters. He further explained that, even for general clearance projects, Government could not always guarantee that those affected could be re-housed in the same area, and the problem was becoming more acute. He hoped that staff concerned would appreciate the problem which Government and the general public affected by clearance programme had to face and would accept that there were practical difficulties in arranging the reprovisioning of quarters in urban areas for the affected staff.

65. Miss CHAN Yuen-han criticized that it was irresponsible for the Administration not to give due regard to the wish of the affected staff of rehousing within the same district or region. She urged the Administration to carry out staff consultation immediately and revise the reprovisioning plan in response to staff concern before the relevant FC meeting. She would also abstain from voting on this item.

66. DD(Strategy) clarified that he was only trying to explain the practical difficulties in arranging reprovisioning of departmental quarters to HOS flats in urban areas. He said that the Administration would of course continue to conduct consultation with staff organizations with a view to resolving any problem that might arise.

67. Miss CHOY So-yuk understood that the Administration had frozen all applications for allocation of quarters in the 15 departmental quarters in question as early as April 2003. She queried whether the Administration had already decided to re-provision these departmental quarters at that time. In response, DD(Strategic) clarified that the Administration did not have any firm proposal of using surplus HOS flats as departmental quarters until recently. He said that subject to the funding approval for the present proposal, the Administration would arrange site visits for the affected staff to the HOS flats concerned and conduct further staff consultation on the re-provisioning arrangements.

68. Ms Miriam LAU supported the proposal to provide disciplined services staff with quarters of a higher standard, but considered that there had been insufficient consultation with the affected staff. Noting that all the HOS flats concerned were located in Kowloon and New Territories, Ms LAU enquired whether any surplus HOS flats could be identified on the Hong Kong Island so that some affected staff currently living in the departmental quarters on the Hong Kong Island could be re-provisioned to the same or an adjacent district. In reply, DD(Strategic) advised that the present proposal was to put the vacant HOS flats to beneficial use and there were a number of constraints in identifying suitable HOS flats for the re-provisioning of departmental quarters. For example, a whole block of HOS flats should be available for the re-provisioning and the size and facilities of each HOS flat should be comparable to those of the quarters to be re-provisioned. DD(Strategic) confirmed that no suitable HOS flats were available in Sha Tin or on the Hong Kong Island for the proposed re-provisioning exercise.

69. Ms Miriam LAU was concerned about the extent of flexibility of the schedule for the decantation of the existing 15 departmental quarters. She suggested that before the Administration had undertaken thorough consultation with the affected staff, the Administration should not set a deadline for the decantation. Miss CHOY So-yuk considered that the affected staff should have at least four to five years to make their relocation arrangement. Mr IP Kwok-him also considered that the affected staff should be given a sufficiently long period to arrange removal, and he concurred with Ms LAU's suggestion that the Administration should not specify a deadline for the decantation of the 15 existing departmental quarters at this stage.

70. DS(S)2 and DD(strategy) advised that the proposed timetable to decant the existing department quarters in early 2006 was only a preliminary schedule. There was in fact no confirmed deadline for the completion of the re-provisioning exercise. In response to members' concern, DS(S)2 undertook to confirm the extent of flexibility of the schedule for the decantation of the existing 15 departmental quarters. In this connection, the Deputy Government Property Administrator (DGPA) drew members' attention that a longer decantation period would add to the Government's financial burden of paying the management expenses of both the HOS flats and the existing departmental quarters.

Admin

71. Ms Miriam LAU, Miss CHAN Yuen-han and Miss CHOY So-yuk urged the Administration to immediately consult relevant staff associations and staff groups on the detailed reprovisioning arrangements and report the results of the consultation to PWSC before the relevant FC meeting. In response, DS(S)2 said that the Administration would try to heed this request as far as possible.

Admin

72. Mr Andrew WONG noted with concern that some of the departmental quarters identified for reprovisioning were not very old. For example, Sha Tin Police Married Quarters were only built in 1979 and the facilities were still in good conditions. Mr WONG urged the Administration to provide detailed justification for the proposed demolition of the existing 15 departmental quarters. The Administration agreed.

73. As the primary objective of the proposal was to put the idling surplus HOS flats to beneficial use, Mr WONG Sing-chi said that Members of the Democratic Party supported the proposal provided that the affected staff accepted the reprovisioning arrangements. Noting the strong objection from Sha Tin Police Married Quarters, Mr WONG suggested that the Administration might withhold the reprovisioning plan for these quarters and proceed with the reprovisioning of the remaining departmental quarters first. Mr WONG also shared Mr Andrew WONG's view that the Administration should provide detailed justification for the proposed demolition of the departmental quarters concerned.

74. On behalf of Mr James TO, Mr Fred LI enquired about the provision of carparking spaces in the HOS flats concerned. He said that Mr TO was concerned whether more carparking spaces would be provided to meet the operational needs of disciplined services staff. In response, DGPA said that all along, the Government did not make special provision of carparking spaces for departmental quarters. Separate arrangement would be made for carparking requirements arising from operational needs. The proposal of purchasing 538 ancillary carparking spaces from the Housing Authority was made with reference to the recommended standard in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines that generally, one carparking space should be provided for every eight flats in high density residential developments.

Admin

75. Miss CHOY So-yuk expressed grave concern that 245 000 cubic metres of construction and demolition (C&D) materials would be generated from the project. In response, D Arch S and the Project Director 1 advised that as the project involved the demolition of 45 existing buildings, a large amount of C&D materials would be generated. Around one-third of these materials would be recycled. Mr Andrew WONG requested the Administration to provide information on the estimated amount of demolition materials in respect of each of the 15 departmental quarters. The Administration agreed.

76. Mr LAU Ping-cheung enquired whether the proposed purchase price of \$2,750 million had taken into account the land premium. DGPA advised that no land

premium was included in the purchase price as the HOS flats concerned were sold to the Government and hence the land premium payment was exempted. He also advised that these flats would be owned by the Government instead of the individual departments concerned.

77. The item was voted on and endorsed.

78. The meeting ended at 12:50 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 June 2004