

**Measures Alternative to Prosecution
for Handling**

**Unruly Children and Young Persons:
Overseas Experiences and
Options for Hong Kong**

**Measures Alternative to Prosecution
for Handling**

**Unruly Children and Young Persons:
Overseas Experiences and
Options for Hong Kong**

August 2003

Commissioned by: Security Bureau, HKSAR Government

Prepared by: Youth Studies Net, City University of Hong Kong

Dr. T. Wing Lo

Dr. Dennis S. W. Wong

Dr. Gabrielle Maxwell

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.1.1 Objectives of the Study	2
1.1.2 The Sample	2
1.2 Youth Services in Hong Kong	3
1.2.1 Social Welfare Department	4
1.2.2 The Police	10
1.2.3 The Court	12
1.3 Conclusion	14
Chapter 2 Alternatives to the Prosecution of Children and Young Persons in Singapore	15
2.1 Objectives of Youth Justice	15
2.2 Target Groups where Measures Apply	16
2.3 Main Features of the System	16
2.3.1 Ministry of Community Development and Sports	16
2.3.2 Pre-Court Diversion Measures	17
2.3.3 Juvenile Court Measures	17
2.4 Alternatives to Prosecution	18
2.4.1 Streetwise Programme	18
2.4.2 Guidance Programme	22
2.4.3 Measures for Children and Young Persons Beyond Parental Control	25
2.5 Conclusion	29
Chapter 3 Alternatives to the Prosecution of Children and Young Persons in England and Wales	31
3.1 Objectives of Youth Justice	31
3.2 Target Groups where Measures Apply	31
3.3 Main Features of the System	32

Published by:
Security Bureau, HKSAR Government

Prepared by:
Dr. T. Wing Lo, Dr. Dennis S. W. Wong and Dr. Gabrielle Maxwell
Youth Studies Net, City University of Hong Kong

15 August 2003

3.4	Alternatives to Prosecution	34	5.4.5	Extrajudicial Sanctions under the Y.C.J.A.	77
3.4.1	Reprimand and Final Warning	34	5.4.6	Offenders under 12: Child-Welfare Responses	78
3.4.2	Referral Order and Youth Offender Panel	39	5.4.7	Offenders under 12: Voluntary Programs—Earls court in Toronto	80
3.4.3	Local Child Curfew Schemes	41	5.5	Effectiveness of the Measures	82
3.4.4	Child Safety Orders	43	5.6	Conclusion	82
3.4.5	Anti-social Behaviour Order	44			
3.4.6	Parenting Order	47			
3.5	Conclusion	50			
Chapter 4	Alternatives to the Prosecution of		Chapter 6	Alternatives to the Prosecution of	
	Children and Young Persons in Belgium	53		Children and Young Persons in Queensland, Australia	85
4.1	Objectives of Youth Justice	53	6.1	Objectives of Youth Justice	85
4.2	Target Groups where Measures Apply	53	6.2	Target Groups where Measures Apply	86
4.3	Main Features of the System	53	6.3	Main Features of the System	86
4.3.1	Police and the Public Prosecutor	53	6.4	Alternatives to Prosecution	88
4.3.2	The Youth Court	55	6.4.1	Warnings	88
4.3.3	Special Assistance to Youth and Prevention	57	6.4.2	Cautioning	88
4.4	Alternatives to Prosecution	61	6.4.3	Community Conferencing	89
4.4.1	Community Service	62	6.4.4	Drug Diversion	96
4.4.2	Victim Offender Mediation	63	6.4.5	Police Counsels for Child Offenders under Ten Years of Age	97
4.4.3	Family Group Conferences	64	6.4.6	Youth and Family Support Service for At Risk Children and Young People	98
4.5	Conclusion	65	6.5	Conclusion	101
Chapter 5	Alternatives to the Prosecution of		Chapter 7	Alternatives to the Prosecution of	
	Children and Young Persons in Canada	67		Children and Young Persons in New Zealand	103
5.1	Objectives of Youth Justice	67	7.1	Objectives of Youth Justice	103
5.2	Target Groups where Measures Apply	69	7.2	Target Groups where Measures Apply	104
5.3	Main Features of the System	69	7.3	Main Features of the System	107
5.4	Alternatives to Prosecution	70	7.3.1	Police	107
5.4.1	Extrajudicial Measures under the Y.C.J.A.	70	7.3.2	Youth Justice Co-ordinator	108
5.4.2	Police and Prosecutorial Discretion to Divert	73	7.3.3	The Family Group Conference	108
5.4.3	Youth Justice Committees	75	7.3.4	Youth Court	109
5.4.4	Youth Justice Conferences	75	7.4	Alternatives to Prosecution	111
			7.5	Effectiveness of the Measures	111
			7.5.1	Diverting Young People from Courts and Custody	111

7.5.2	Participation and Involvement	113	10.2	Data on Child Offenders	146
7.5.3	Accountability	113	10.3	Ways Ahead	147
7.5.4	Enhancing Wellbeing and Reintegration	114	10.4	Principles to Guide Responses to Children who Offend	148
7.6	Conclusion	116	10.5	Existing Options for Responding to Unruly Children: the Care or Protection Order	150
Chapter 8	The Changing Face of Youth Justice	117	10.6	New Options for Future Response to Unruly Children	152
8.1	Influences on Youth Justice up until 1989	117	10.7	Details of Proposed New Options	155
8.1.1	The Recognition of Age and Maturity as Factors in Responses to Offending	117	10.7.1	Police Child Support Service	155
8.1.2	The Development of an Emphasis on Welfare	118	10.7.2	Family Support Conference	158
8.1.3	The Move to Diversion and Decarceration	120	10.7.3	Empowerment Programme	163
8.1.4	The Influence of Concerns for the Rights of Children and Young People	122	10.7.4	Community Alternatives to Institutional Placements	166
8.1.5	The Need to Separate Welfare and Justice Concerns and to Increase Accountability for Offending	123	10.8	Conclusion	168
8.1.6	Shift in Resources from Government to Private Sector	125	Chapter 11	Options for Handling Young Offenders	169
8.1.7	Empowerment	125	11.1	Introduction	169
8.2	The Emergence of Restorative Justice Approaches to Juvenile Offending	129	11.2	Reasons for Hong Kong to Examine Alternatives to Prosecution for Young Persons	170
Chapter 9	Objectives, Principles and Standards: Changing Philosophies and New Research	135	11.3	Principles for the Future Juvenile Justice System	171
9.1	Introduction	135	11.3.1	Protection	171
9.2	Recent Developments in the Use of Restorative Justice for Juveniles	137	11.3.2	Welfare	172
9.3	Objectives and Principles in Hong Kong Compared to Six Other Countries	138	11.3.3	Justice	173
9.4	Objectives and Principles Reflecting the Move to a Restorative Approach	140	11.3.4	De-institutionalization	173
9.5	Basic Principles and Standards for Restorative Youth Justice Systems	141	11.3.5	Empowerment	173
9.6	Restorative Justice Procedures and the Role of Law	143	11.3.6	Repair of Harm	174
Chapter 10	Options for Handling Unruly Children	145	11.3.7	Reintegration	174
10.1	Introduction	145	11.4	Current Options of Diversion	174
			11.4.1	Police Superintendents' Discretion Scheme	174
			11.4.2	Community Support Service Scheme	175
			11.5	New Options for Young Persons Who Offend	176
			11.5.1	Family Group Conferences	178
			11.5.2	Empowerment Programme	185
			11.5.3	Victim Offender Mediation	188
			11.6	Next Steps in Determining the Appropriateness of These Options	189

Chapter 12 Summary of Research Findings and Recommendations	191
12.1 Introduction	191
12.2 Measures Alternative to Prosecution in Selected Overseas Jurisdictions for Responding to Unruly Children and Young People	192
12.2.1 The Objectives of the Measures	192
12.2.2 The Effectiveness of the Measures	193
12.2.3 Summary of the Six Jurisdictions	195
12.3 The Case for Introducing New Measures Alternative to Prosecution to Hong Kong	201
12.4 Options for Implementing Such Measures	202
12.4.1 Police Child Support Service	202
12.4.2 Family Support Conference	203
12.4.3 Empowerment Programme (for Unruly Children)	204
12.4.4 Community Alternatives to Institutional Placements	204
12.4.5 Family Group Conference	205
12.4.6 Empowerment Programme (for Young Offenders)	205
12.5 Roles, Recruitment and Training of Professionals	206
12.5.1 The New Role of the Police	206
12.5.2 The New Role of Welfare Services and Professionals	207
12.5.3 The New Role of Prosecution, Lawyers, Court Staff and the Judiciary	208
12.6 Further Issues in Implementation	209
12.6.1 Inter-disciplinary Collaboration—The Youth Justice Committee	209
12.6.2 Monitoring and Standards for New Measures	209
12.6.3 Financial Issues	210
12.6.4 Interim Planning and Management	210
12.7 Conclusion	211
References	213

List of Figures

Chapter 1	
Figure 1.1 Services for young people in Hong Kong	6
Chapter 2	
Figure 2.1 Strategic partners of the Streetwise Programme	20
Figure 2.2 Flow chart of juveniles placed on Guidance Programme	23
Figure 2.3 Flow chart of beyond parental control cases	27
Chapter 3	
Figure 3.1 The English youth justice system in outline	33
Chapter 4	
Figure 4.1 The most important trajectories according to the Special Youth Support Decree, in combination with the Youth Protection Act	60
Chapter 5	
Figure 5.1 Youth justice system and alternatives in Canada (12-17 Yrs)	71
Figure 5.2 Welfare responses to child offenders under 12 in Canada	79
Chapter 6	
Figure 6.1 Ways of referrals made to community conferences	90
Chapter 7	
Figure 7.1 Pathways through the system	106
Figure 7.2 Rates per 10,000 aged 10 – 16 years of distinct cases in the Youth Court for the June/July years 1987 to 2001	112
Figure 7.3 Custodial sentences for Youth Court cases from 1987 to 2001	112
Chapter 10	
Figure 10.1 Pathway of handling unruly children after the raise of the age of criminal responsibility	152
Figure 10.2 The proposed system for responding to unruly children	154
Chapter 11	
Figure 11.1 The proposed system for young offenders aged 10-17	177
Figure 11.2 Members of a Family Group Conference	180

List of Tables

Chapter 1

Table 1.1	Major sentencing options for young offenders as of May 2003	13
-----------	---	----

Chapter 3

Table 3.1	The New Youth Justice: principal institutional features	32
-----------	---	----

Chapter 6

Table 6.1	Sentencing options for juvenile offenders in Queensland	87
-----------	---	----

Chapter 7

Table 7.1	Potential responses to children and young people who offend in New Zealand	105
Table 7.2	Recommendations of the Family Group Conference comparing the combinations of primarily restorative, restrictive, rehabilitative and reintegrative measures for the retrospective sample	114

Chapter 12

Table 12.1	Measures alternative to prosecution in overseas countries	194
------------	---	-----

A copy of this document is kept at the Legislative Council Library.
Please contact the Legislative Council Library if you wish to refer to this document.