

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-453
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/HS/2/04

**Subcommittee on
West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

**Minutes of thirty-third meeting held on
Wednesday, 3 October 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Margaret NG
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

Members absent : Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung

**Public officers
attending**

: Mr TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Mrs Carrie YAU, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Ms Esther LEUNG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Vincent FUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 1

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District) 2

Mr Chris WARDLAW
Deputy Secretary for Education (5)

Dr CHAN Ka-ki
Principal Assistant Secretary for Education
(Curriculum Development)

Mr Philip YUNG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)

Mr Anthony LOO
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Urban

Mr Alan SIU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Commerce & Economic
Development (Communications & Technology)

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi, JP
Deputy Director of Leisure & Cultural Services
(Culture)

Miss Ophelia WONG, JP
Deputy Director of Planning/District

Mr CHEUNG Hok-ying
Acting Government Economist

Mr Steven HO
Research Analyst (2)
Economic Analysis & Business Facilitation Unit

Attendance by invitation : GHK (Hong Kong) Ltd.

Ms Fiona WATERS
Director

Knight Frank

Mr Alnwick CHAN
Executive Director

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance : Ms Pauline NG
Assistant Secretary General 1

Mr Anthony CHU
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

- I Recommendation report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District**
(Paper No. WKCD-398 -- Paper on "Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District" provided by the Administration)

The Subcommittee noted the following papers tabled at the meeting –

- (a) Letter dated 2 October 2007 from Hon LEE Wing-tat setting out a list of questions for the Administration's written response (Paper No. WKCD-407); and
- (b) Comparison between the recommendations in the Phase I and

Phase II Study Reports of the Subcommittee and the recommendations of the Consultative Committee prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Paper No. WKCD-408).

(Post-meeting note: The above papers were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)26/07-08 on 10 October 2007.)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

3. The Chairman remarked that pursuant to members' request at the previous meeting on 12 September 2007, this meeting was held for the Subcommittee to continue to discuss with the Administration the Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (the Recommendation Report).

Funding arrangements

4. Mr LEE Wing-tat highlighted the importance of proper monitoring of the WKCD Authority by the public and the Legislative Council (LegCo). Instead of an upfront endowment of \$19 billion to finance the capital costs of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project, Mr LEE suggested that the endowment could be appropriated by LegCo in phases to ensure accountability of the Authority. This view was shared by Ms Margaret NG and Prof Patrick LAU. While Mr Abraham SHEK agreed that the Authority should be accountable to both the public and LegCo for its work, he was of the view that an upfront endowment approved in one-go would enable the WKCD Authority to carry out long-term planning with the assurance of sufficient funds for the capital costs of the WKCD project.

5. The Secretary for Home Affairs (SHA) advised members that after the enactment of the enabling legislation for the WKCD Authority, the Administration would seek the necessary funding appropriation from LegCo. Members would have ample opportunities to discuss details of the funding arrangements when the application was submitted to the Finance Committee.

WKCD Authority

6. Members supported early establishment of the WKCD Authority but cautioned that sufficient time should be provided for Members to scrutinize the relevant Bill. Given the important functions of the WKCD Authority, members expressed concern about the composition of the Authority and how its members were to be selected from the relevant sectors. In this connection, Mr Albert HO suggested that consideration could be given to having some members of the Authority nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors with reference to the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) or selected from the

representatives of the public.

7. Ms Margaret NG suggested that the Administration should introduce a White Bill for the WKCD Authority to facilitate public consultation and discussion by LegCo. In the meantime, a provisional body could be established to take up the necessary preparatory work. In response, SHA said that the Administration intended to introduce the enabling legislation for the WKCD Authority upon completion of the current public engagement exercise if there was a public consensus on the way forward for the project. If the relevant bill was not passed before the end of the current LegCo term, the Administration would consider the option of setting up a provisional WKCD body.

Software development

8. Members expressed concern that the cultural software development in Hong Kong could not be kept in pace with the hardware development in WKCD. Dr KWOK Ka-ki stressed the importance that part of the WKCD Authority's annual budget should be devoted to software development.

9. In reply, the Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) (DS/HA(3)) advised that the Administration had implemented a series of measures on software development through various department/organizations, such as the Leisure and Cultural Services Department, HKADC and the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts, at an annual provision of around \$2.5 billion. The Administration would consider allocating additional resources in this area to complement the WKCD project.

10. In reply to Mrs Selina CHOW's enquiry on the appropriate forum for LegCo to follow up on software development and the recommendations to revamp the management of existing public arts and cultural facilities, SHA suggested that the Administration would brief the Panel on Home Affairs on the updated progress of the matters.

Museum Plus

11. Members expressed different views on the **Museum Plus (M+)**. While Prof Patrick LAU supported the concept, Mr LEE Wing-tat and Dr KWOK Ka-ki were concerned whether the four proposed themes could meet the needs of the public and its long term viability given its huge capital costs and low cost recovery rate. DS/HA(3) said that M+ was proposed by the Museum Advisory Group after extensive public consultation. M+ was an innovative idea emphasizing active community participation and required detailed planning for its successful implementation. The concept was fluid and the themes should continue to be re-examined during the course of development, based on the professional expertise of the curators, prevailing international trends and feedback from visitors and experts.

Questions raised and information requested for the Administration's written response

Admin 12. The Administration was requested to provide written response on the following:

- (a) A timetable setting out the Administration's schedule for the various aspects of work to implement the WKCD project, in particular the work on the enactment of legislation to establish the WKCD Authority and the town planning work.
- (b) The Administration indicated at the meeting that it had no plan to set up a high-level body vested with the responsibility for arts and cultural development in Hong Kong. The Administration was requested to explain how the long-term arts and cultural vision to make Hong Kong a cultural metropolis could be achieved without such an institutional setup for strategic planning and co-ordination of the work of various bureaux/departments and relevant organizations on arts and cultural development.
- (c) The Administration indicated at the meeting that funding for nurturing of art talents, community art education, training of management and marketing professionals for art and cultural facilities etc. to complement the WKCD project had not been taken into account in the proposed financial arrangements for the WKCD project, but the funding requirements for these purposes would be taken into account in the Government's normal budgeting process. The Administration was requested to provide details on the current and future budgeting arrangements.
- (d) There were rich art and heritage collections held by private bodies and individuals in the community. The Administration was requested to consider measures to mobilize these resources to promote the appreciation of art and heritage in the community during the lead time before the WKCD project commenced.
- (e) Information on the funding modes for arts and cultural development in other places. How far reference could be drawn from these places in formulating the Government's funding policy for local arts and cultural organizations and the financial arrangements for WKCD.
- (f) What measures the Government would take or would the Government allow the WKCD Authority to take if the Authority ran into financial difficulty in developing/operating the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD.

- (g) Details of the town planning process for WKCD, in particular when and how the master layout plan would be drawn up and at what stages the public would have opportunities to participate in the planning process.
- (h) How the Government would fully integrate the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD as well as its overall planning with its neighbouring areas, so as to cultivate an appropriate cultural ambience in the district and its immediate vicinity.
- (i) Detailed information on the survey conducted by the Education Bureau on the efficacy of arts education in primary and secondary schools and how the survey results compared with the situation of other comparable places.
- (j) Why the Consultative Committee and the Government had not adopted the Subcommittee's recommendation to set up consultation panels to conduct structured public consultation for the Public Engagement exercise being undertaken and for the future implementation and operation of the WKCD.

(Post-meeting note: The above list, which had been amended to include other information requested by members subsequent to the meeting, was forwarded to the Administration for written response on 8 October 2007. The confirmed full list (Paper No. WKCD-409) was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)26/07-08 on 10 October 2007.)

13. Members noted that the next two Subcommittee meetings scheduled for 9 and 23 October 2007 would be devoted to receiving views from the public on the Recommendation Report.

II Any other business

14. The meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

**Proceedings of the thirty-third meeting of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on Wednesday, 3 October 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 - 000255	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000256 - 000533	Administration	Briefing by the Administration	
000534 - 001324	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	<p>Mr LEE suggested that in order to ensure proper monitoring by LegCo, LegCo should approve the funding for the WKCD Authority to finance the capital costs of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project in phases.</p> <p>Mr LEE's expression of concern that the projection of the attendance rate of the Museum Plus (M+) might be too optimistic and in order to boost attendance and revenue, M+ might have to resort to programmes/activities that departed from its original objectives.</p> <p>The Administration's response that Members could discuss details of the funding for WKCD project when the application was submitted to the Finance Committee.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that M+ was an innovative idea resulted from a bottom-up deliberation process. The proposal had received very favourable comments from the overseas museum managers and experts. If the idea was be accepted by the public, a provisional body would be set up in the interim to take up the necessary preparatory work at an early stage.</p>	
001325 - 002045	Ms Margaret NG Administration	<p>Ms NG's expression of views that –</p> <p>a) the WKCD Authority should be set up expeditiously. To this end, the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Administration could consider introducing a White Bill on the Authority;</p> <p>b) given the wide-ranging powers and functions of the WKCD Authority, clear delineation of the check and balance measures was required; and</p> <p>c) a provisional body could be set up to take up the preparatory work pending the establishment of the WKCD Authority.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it intended to submit the Bill for establishment of the WKCD Authority after the completion of the public engagement exercise. If the Bill could not be passed before the end of the current Legislative Council (LegCo) term, the Administration would consider the option of setting up a provisional body.</p>	
002046 - 002823	Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	<p>Dr KWOK expressed concern that the development of cultural software in Hong Kong could not match with the hardware development in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD).</p> <p>Dr KWOK expressed concern about the potentially huge deficits incurred by M+, and enquired about the justifications for the four proposed themes for M+ and queried if these themes could respond to the needs of the public.</p> <p>The Administration explained how the four proposed themes were selected, and advised that there were already rich collections on these themes. It also advised that the proposed four themes were not meant to be permanent, and might be changed with the times. An</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>important feature of M+ was that it allowed interfaces and dialogues between different art forms and high level of participation of the relevant sectors and the community.</p>	
002824 - 003535	Prof Patrick LAU Administration	<p>Prof LAU enquired whether the Administration would increase the funding for the WKCD project accordingly if the outturn land revenue was in excess of the estimate.</p> <p>Prof LAU's expression of view that the Administration should take immediate actions to enhance cultural software development.</p> <p>The Administration's response that -</p> <p>a) the development of arts and cultural facilities in WKCD would be separated from the sale of land in WKCD; and</p> <p>b) the Administration would strengthen software development through the existing channels. A manpower survey would be conducted to comprehensively assess the demand and supply of cultural and arts talents.</p>	
003536 - 004237	Ms Emily LAU Administration	<p>Ms LAU expressed the view that the Administration should provide details about the WKCD Authority for the Subcommittee's discussion at an early stage if the Administration hoped that the relevant enabling legislation could be passed before the end of the current LegCo term. She asked when the Bill would be introduced into LegCo.</p> <p>Ms LAU expressed concern on the composition of the WKCD Authority and asked whether its members would be nominated by the relevant sectors.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration's explanation that the Recommendation Report of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the WKCD (the Recommendation Report) had made substantive recommendations on the WKCD Authority, which provided a good basis for the drafting of the enabling legislation. Hopefully, the Administration could brief the Subcommittee on further details of the framework for establishment of the Authority by the end of 2007.</p>	
004238 - 004948	Mr Albert HO Administration	<p>Mr HO's suggestion that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) some members of WKCD Authority could be nominated/elected by the relevant arts and cultural sector; and b) the Administration should make full use of the rich art and heritage collections held by private bodies and individuals in the community to promote art and heritage appreciation. <p>Mr HO's view that the WKCD project and the formation of the WKCD Authority needed to be considered in conjunction with Government's cultural policy, cultural software development and the future arrangements for existing arts and cultural venues. The Administration should provide the relevant details by the time the enabling legislation on the WKCD Authority was introduced.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it was fully aware of the rising aspirations of the community for a quality cultural life, and that WKCD was the catalyst and not the confines of Hong Kong's arts and cultural development. When drafting the enabling legislation for the WKCD</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Authority, reference would be made to other existing statutory public bodies, such as HKADC.</p>	
004949 - 005352	Mr SIN Chung-kai Administration	<p>Mr SIN's suggestion that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) advanced technology elements should be incorporated into the performing venues and museums in WKCD to enhance their attractiveness; and b) the exhibits and programmes of the Science Museum and Space Museum should be upgraded to maintain their attractiveness. <p>The Administration's explanation that multi-media and modern technologies would be employed for M+. While the Science Museum launched new exhibitions from time to time, there were also plans to upgrade the facilities in the Space Museum.</p>	
005353 - 010123	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Administration	<p>Miss CHAN's expression of concerns on –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the layout of different land uses in WKCD; b) how WKCD could revitalize the old districts in West Kowloon; and c) timing of the establishment of WKCD Authority. <p>The Administration's explanation that upon completion of the Public Engagement exercise, the Town Planning Board would amend the draft South West Kowloon OZP by inclusion of the planning parameters for WKCD. The revised draft OZP would then undergo the statutory town planning procedures. The future WKCD Authority would be responsible for drawing up the Master Layout Plan for WKCD for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>approval by the Town Planning Board. The Administration would carefully consider how WKCD would help revitalize the old districts in West Kowloon. The plan making process would be akin to the experience of the Kai Tak Planning Review.</p>	
010124 - 011024	Mr Abraham SHEK Administration	<p>Mr SHEK's expression of support for the endowment for the WKCD Authority to be appropriated by LegCo in one-go.</p> <p>In response to Mr SHEK's enquiry about complementary measures on art education, the Administration explained that art education and creativity were the core competencies of the new senior secondary curriculum. Chinese literature and culture had been included under the whole-person education since 2002. 5% of the school hours for the new senior secondary education would be devoted to art appreciation. Appropriate training had been provided to teachers. According to a survey conducted by the Education Bureau, the majority of the primary and secondary students concerned had responded that they had enjoyed and participated in arts appreciation.</p>	
011025 - 011734	Mr CHAN Kam-lam Administration GHK (Hong Kong) Ltd Knight Frank	<p>Mr CHAN's expression of concern about the measures the Administration or the WKCD Authority would take if the WKCD Authority ran into financial difficulties.</p> <p>The Financial Advisor (FA)'s explanation on the methodology and assumptions for its financial projections.</p> <p>The Administration's response that under such circumstances, it would be incumbent upon the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Administration to examine with the WKCD Authority how to tackle the financial difficulties.	
011735 - 012136	Mr James TIEN Administration GHK (Hong Kong) Ltd Knight Frank	In response to the enquiry of Mr TIEN, the FA provided the assumed per square metre accommodation value for the residential, hotel, retail and office developments and the average monthly rent for the retail facilities.	
012137 - 012929	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman's enquiry about –</p> <p>a) allocation of resources for software development; and</p> <p>b) how WKCD could catalyze the realization of a long-term arts and cultural vision for Hong Kong without a high level coordinating body.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation on its existing measures on software development and its intention to increase the relevant funding provisions in the coming year to strengthen the efforts.</p>	
012930 - 013559	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG's expression of views that –</p> <p>a) the criteria for appointment of members of the WKCD Authority should be made public;</p> <p>b) there should clear standards and guidelines for the provision of subsidies for art and cultural bodies; and</p> <p>c) successful experience overseas revealed that art and cultural development was an organic process, and the availability of cheap accommodation and workshop spaces was crucial for art and cultural talents to amass and hence the incubation of an</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>organic cultural district. Provision of performing venues alone would not help much in raising the cultural sophistication of a society.</p> <p>The Administration's response that there were divergent views on whether the Government should play an active role in art and cultural development. There were established principles for appointment of members to statutory bodies and reference could be made to the mechanisms adopted for existing bodies such as the Airport Authority in drafting the enabling legislation for the WKCD Authority.</p>	
013600 - 014527	Mrs Selina CHOW Administration	<p>Mrs CHOW's enquiry about how LegCo would follow up software development and the recommended measures to improve the existing arts and cultural facilities.</p> <p>The Administration's reference to the recommendations from the Committee on Performing Arts and Committee on Museums.</p> <p>The Administration's suggestion that the issues mentioned by Mrs CHOW could be followed up at the Panel on Home Affairs.</p>	
014528 - 015639	Mr LEE Wing-tat Dr KWOK Ka-ki Ms Margaret NG Administration Miss CHAN Yuen-han Chairman Ms Emily LAU	Request for information	Administration to take necessary follow-up actions
015640 - 015836	Chairman Ms Emily LAU	Next Subcommittee meeting to receive views on the Recommendation Report and the attendance of Government officials at the meeting	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 December 2007