

立法會
Legislative Council

Paper No. WKCD-450

Ref: CB1/HS/2/04

Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development

**Summary of views of various organizations and individuals
expressed at the meetings on 9 and 23 October 2007**

* * * * *

Contents

Section		Page
I	General comments	1 - 6
II	Vision of the West Kowloon Cultural District project, cultural policy	7 - 11
III	Cultural software	12 - 17
IV	Arts and cultural facilities	18 - 25
V	Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues	26 - 32
VI	Statutory body to oversee the development of the West Kowloon Cultural District	33 - 36
VII	Financing approach	37 - 39
VIII	Public engagement process	40 - 41

I. General comments

- Mr CHAN Kin-shing*
- The West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project has been on the drawing board for a very long period. The project should be implemented as soon as possible, so that Hong Kong can become a well developed city and reputable international metropolis.
- Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay*
- In general, the new WKCD proposal is a significant improvement from the 2004 proposal presented by the Government.
 - Hong Kong has the capability to make WKCD an outstanding cultural achievement, if the community has the will.
- Happening Group*
- The WKCD development should incorporate Hong Kong, China and international perspectives. Every aspect of the development should be implemented in phases, led by the community, executed by professionals and coordinated by the Government.
- The Fringe Club*
- Subject to certain conditions, the organization supports the WKCD project. In the medium to long term, WKCD can solve the problem of shortage of cultural venues. WKCD can also alleviate the monopoly by the Government of cultural venues.
- Hong Kong Dance Company*
- The arts and cultural sector is ready to produce quality programmes to attract more audience. WKCD will stimulate the work of the artists and attendance of arts and cultural programmes. Popularization of arts and culture will benefit the whole society.
 - The organization supports the WKCD development and considers that it should be implemented as soon as possible to facilitate Hong Kong's long-term arts and cultural development, enhance Hong Kong's status as an international metropolis and provide an ideal working environment and a driving force for artists to realize their dreams.

I. General comments

- Hong Kong Ballet*
- The organization supports the WKCD development and considers that it should be implemented aggressively and quickly. WKCD should provide the necessary firmware for Hong Kong's arts and culture. There is a crucial complementary relationship between performance and venue. A good complementary relationship will bring an enhanced experience for performers and audience.
- Museum of Site*
- The organization has doubt on whether the integrative approach of the costly WKCD will be successful and whether the public will evaluate this approach as pragmatic and feasible. There is also reservation on whether Hong Kong has ever earned a reputation in running an edging, forward-looking, world-class project.
- Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union*
- Hong Kong needs a cultural focal centre for organizing various kinds of cultural programmes constantly. A consensus on WKCD should be reached as soon as possible. The Government should strike a balance between various interests in society. This is beneficial for facilitating international cultural exchange and enhancing the cultural standard of the citizens. WKCD can also promote economic development and create employment opportunities for the construction industry.
 - Unnecessary disputes should be avoided because the overall development of society and the livelihood of workers will be affected.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District*
- The organization suggests de-linking the development of arts and culture from West Kowloon and creating a comprehensive plan for Hong Kong as a whole. This will accomplish true diversity in funding and management of venues, proper and better urban and land planning and provide a more balanced arts and culture development in Hong Kong.
 - The organization disagrees to the arguments that clustering will enhance the tourism impact and WKCD will resolve the problems that current venues lack a mix land use setting. The appropriate action is to resolve the problems surrounding the existing venues first, and then learn how to plan West Kowloon correctly.

I. General comments

- Professional Property Services Group* • The organization welcomes the proposals to develop much needed venue spaces for a wide range of arts and cultural activities, but is concerned that there are too many venues concentrated in one district and under one overall authority. This arrangement, although efficient, is not conducive to encouraging a broad based interest in and enjoyment of the arts throughout the community.
- Local Action/Community Concern* • *Cultural* • WKCD is important in enriching local culture, enhancing the living standard of citizens and improving the general environment of the West Kowloon community.
- The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)* • The organization is unconvinced that WKCD is the only or indeed the best solution to enhancing Hong Kong's cultural infrastructure. However, the organization considers that the Museum Advisory Group's recommendations do represent a marked step forward in the development of a vision and a strategy for the WKCD project.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.* • The organization welcomes the proposed increase in arts facilities in WKCD because it will help alleviate the pressure on existing performance venues. The new venues will help accelerate development of the cultural sector and expand the audienceship to include a significant proportion of non-residents and this in turn will increase Hong Kong's tourism and other related earnings. The new development will be a boost to Hong Kong's competitive advantage in the region and on a global basis.
- Hong Kong needs to catch up in arts infrastructure because it is falling behind other urban centres in the region. WKCD is an investment in the city's image and competitive advantage for attracting talent and developing knowledge based creative industries.
- The Hong Kong Institute of Architects* • There is no precedent in Hong Kong which may indicate conditions for the success of WKCD. Therefore, it is prudent to allow adequate flexibility in the scale and components of main facilities, development requirements and modes of operation so that there are rooms for adjustment in future.

I. General comments

- WKCD should not be perceived as an independent facility. It should be a part of and fit into an overall arts and cultural facility network of Hong Kong.
- Hong Kong Arts Centre*
- The organization subscribes to and supports in principle the WKCD project.
 - Arts and culture can educate people to conduct critical reflections on various issues. WKCD can become a public and diversified space for citizens and artists to communicate, and this space should be expanded to the whole community.
- Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration*
- Every link of the WKCD project should proceed with care.
 - The organization supports and subscribes to the 50-year development and operation plan, and recommends the Government to actively consider major urban design issues.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society*
- WKCD will become a tourist attraction, bring about the development of West Kowloon and the adjoining areas and promote Hong Kong's economic development.
- Hong Kong Construction Association*
- Contracts for infrastructure facilities to be provided by the Government should be rolled out as quickly as possible and in parallel with the establishment of the WKCD Authority.
- Hong Kong Repertory Theatre*
- The organization supports the WKCD project, agrees to the recommendations in Chapter 4 of the Recommendation Report and appreciates the Government's acknowledgement that WKCD is an investment in arts and culture.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong*
- With government initiative, Hong Kong can gradually change to a more multi-faceted, creative and knowledge-based society through stronger culture, arts and theatre curriculums in schools.
- The Association of Architectural Practices Ltd.*
- The association requests that the development of WKCD should be conducted in a fair and transparent manner, allowing professionals in the industry to participate.

I. General comments

- Zuni Icosahedron Ltd.*
香港小童群益會長沙灣中心
- The relevant statutes which regulate street performances and the behaviour of the public in public places should be reviewed to facilitate the growth of artistic expression, whether spontaneous or programmed, in public places in Hong Kong.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong*
- Hong Kong lacks world-class performing venues.
 - The WKCD project would have a positive impact on the Xiqu sector, which has been adversely affected by the shortage of performance venues caused by high land cost.
- Ink Society*
- The organization supports the WKCD project and considers that the Recommendation Report is an improvement over the Invitation for Proposals. The Government should formulate new cultural, legal and education frameworks to foster a cultural ambience making use of WKCD opportunity.
 - WKCD is a major step in the right direction; the Government would provide the physical infrastructure and funding while an independent WKCD Authority would oversee its development. Meanwhile, the private sector would be invited to play a key role in the entire project.
- The Association of Managers, Cultural Services*
- The association supports the WKCD project as the Government has not invested in new arts and cultural facilities for a long time.
- 香港小童群益會長沙灣中心
- WKCD should have a social development function; it should promote social cohesion and serve to break down the social barriers between different strata of the society.
 - High art culture, community-based culture, popular culture, as well as minority cultures, should be presented at WKCD.
- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts*
- The organization supports the WKCD project, which has the potential as a legacy for future generations. WKCD could be a place where people fulfil their dreams, a driving force for future cultural growth and progress, so that people are attracted to Hong Kong and want to stay in Hong Kong and stimulate further cultural and economic prosperity. It is time for Hong Kong to act on WKCD.

I. General comments

- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • The organization supports implementing WKCD as soon as possible. The recommendations on Core Arts and Cultural Facilities have in general responded to the calls in the views received by the organization from the cultural sector.
- Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra* • The organization supports the recommendations in the Recommendation Report.
- Hong Kong Alternatives* • The organization disapproves all the proposals on WKCD put forward by the Government
- The organization's alternative proposal is that the 40-hectare WKCD site should be used as a "Cultural Green Park" and there is public support for the proposal; a world renowned architect should be invited to oversee the conceptual design of the Park; the Government should form a Hong Kong Cultural Authority, an independent and autonomous body, which should be tasked to build the Park and formulate long term planning of arts and cultural development of Hong Kong.

II. Vision of WKCD project, cultural policy

- Mr CHAN Kin-shing*
- The Government lacks a cultural vision and there is no cultural policy. Drawing reference from the recommendations of the Culture and Heritage Commission, WKCD should be planned with a view to promoting the holistic development of culture (including cultural industries), taking full advantage of the Mainland being Hong Kong's hinterland and our favourable position in the exchange and integration of Chinese and foreign cultures, and creating an environment conducive to the vibrant development of culture.
- Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay*
- There is no holistic cultural policy to establish a nurturing ecology for arts and culture. A cultural policy with clear visions based on in-depth assessment of Hong Kong's own cultural potential is essential.
 - An effective mechanism to train professionals in arts and cultural management and nurture audience at a broader community level is also essential.
 - An in-depth research on the success and failure of the operation of the existing public cultural facilities is required.
- Happening Group*
- The cultural policy should be formulated by the Government together with the civic community rather than exclusively led by the WKCD Authority. The possibility of adopting cultural assets as the pillar for economic development should be considered.
 - International cultural exchange should be bi-directional. Sourcing non-local programmes at a high price unilaterally should be avoided.
- Hong Kong Ballet*
- Hong Kong should create an environment and a quality of life that will be competitive with other world cities, and a vibrant and diverse cultural life is a critical component of quality of life.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.*
- The Government should develop a cultural blueprint for Hong Kong to guide cultural planning. Cultural activities should not be limited to WKCD.
 - Another dedicated culture authority will be needed if the WKCD Authority is merely a property management authority responsible for managing arts and cultural venues.

II. Vision of WKCD project, cultural policy

- The Hong Kong Institute of Planners* • Comprehensive short-term, medium-term and long-term arts and cultural policies incorporating the needs of society are required to ensure good integration of hardware and software and efficient use of resources.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • The organization suggests replacing "WKCD" with "Hong Kong" in the vision statement in the Recommendation Report (page 78), and creating a comprehensive plan for the cultural development of Hong Kong as a whole.
- The Government should be guided by a commission in formulating the cultural policy.
- Civic Party*
- As the existing cultural policy formulation mechanism lacks clarity, the goal and direction for nurturing cultural production and management talents, enhancing audience education, and implementing interactive development between arts and the community are unclear and there are many difficulties.
 - The organization questions as to what cultural convictions and policy mechanism the Government will adopt for formulating a strategy for developing cultural software.
 - The Government should consider taking the lead to establish a high level and representative Cultural Development Committee or Cultural Development Board.
- Museum of Site*
- The organization supports the establishment of a government bureau on cultural affairs to oversee the overall planning of arts and cultural facilities over Hong Kong and to ensure that the existing public arts and cultural facilities would complement with those in WKCD.
- Community Concern* *Cultural* • An ideal WKCD should play a leading role in providing cultural facilities, formulating cultural policy and revitalizing old urban districts. There should be coordination between cultural policy and planning. However, not only is there no cultural policy, spatial planning of the facilities is also lacking.

II. Vision of WKCD project, cultural policy

- Fringe Club* • Enhancing cultural living and leisure activities and creating a civic pride are important. Cultural vibrancy is required in addition to economic vibrancy in a modern society. Implementing the concept of a creative nation requires coordination by various Government departments, Government and legislative support and a mindset shift of the citizens.
- The People's Panel on West Kowloon* • In implementing WKCD, equal attention should be given to town planning and cultural planning. The Government has failed to provide concrete details of Hong Kong's cultural policy. Without a concrete and substantive cultural policy, the effectiveness of investing in cultural software is doubtful. The imperative move is to establish a cultural metropolis think tank.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.* • In order to confirm Hong Kong's leadership position, stimulate and inspire our own artists and develop an informed audience, WKCD should aspire to become one of the venues in which the top performers of the world seek to perform. This audience will in turn help to raise the level of work produced and presented locally, in a virtuous cycle of continued improvement.
- The Hong Kong Institute of Architects* • Its members' responses to the Government's recommendations have generally been positive and the six visions of WKCD are shared and supported.
- The Democratic Party* • The cultural policy should be formulated together by the community and the Government through a bottom-up approach.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society* • The organization agrees to the Government's policy direction to create an environment to facilitate free expression and arts production, and WKCD is a comprehensive measure to implement the existing arts and cultural policy.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong* • A heritage conservation policy to preserve local indigenous culture will be highly desirable.

II. Vision of WKCD project, cultural policy

- Hong Kong Arts Centre*
- A healthy arts performing and cultural ecology is the prerequisite for the sustainability of a cultural district.
 - The Government should create an environment conducive to the development of profit-driven arts and culture so that the incubation and nurturing of art talents can go beyond the realm of non-profit-making organizations. In this regard, the Government may need to change its land policy or provide economic incentives for private arts and cultural groups and facilities to enhance their viability and even to flourish in terms of economic values.
- Zuni Icosahedron Ltd.*
- Hong Kong needs thorough discussions to formulate a substantive cultural policy. The recommendations of the Committees on Performing Arts, Museums and Library are too passive without a forward-looking perspective. After the dissolution of the former municipal councils, the Government arts and cultural facilities have not been under public scrutiny and monitor. A special LegCo committee should be established to follow up the formulation of cultural policy.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong*
- The Government should give due emphasis on the contents rather than just the hardware for the cultural development in Hong Kong.
- Ms HO Loy*
- The Government should stop using land sale proceeds for cultural development. Since there is no time urgency to develop WKCD, the Government should first engage the public in formulating a cultural policy. The development of community-based culture should have a higher priority.
 - Culture is intertwined with daily life and the role of WKCD in the public daily life should first be ascertained. Instead of Museum Plus (M+), "street plus" is more preferable.
- The Association of Managers, Cultural Services*
- The association considers that the development of WKCD cannot be considered separately from the cultural policy, which should provide a clear direction for all government departments to follow.

II. Vision of WKCD project, cultural policy

- 香港小童群益會長沙灣中心 • Planning of WKCD should take into account the cultural needs of different social strata.
- Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon Culture District*
- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • WKCD can also achieve a synergistic effect in which it could provide a one-stop-shop for patrons attending different art performances at a central location.
- WKCD could help Hong Kong rediscover its potential and influence thinking on development of cultural landscape and adding arts and cultural vitality to the quality of life of the whole of Hong Kong.
- Hong Kong Arts Administrators Association* • The vision of a vibrant, mutually supportive mix of business and culture in WKCD has not been fully articulated to the Hong Kong public.

III. Cultural software

- Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay* • An effective mechanism to train professionals in arts and cultural management and nurture audience at a broader community level is essential.
- Fringe Club* • Conserved heritage buildings can be used for creating clusters of cultural venues and provide a training ground for arts and cultural management personnel. The training school previously used by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) could be opened up and used as a training ground.
- Tertiary institutions should develop arts and cultural management degree programmes as soon as possible. Arts and cultural management can also be included as an additional subject in the curriculum of Master of Business Administration programmes.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.* • Apart from training professionals for managing performance venues, training and retaining artists are even more important. If there are insufficient competent local artists, WKCD will have to rely heavily on non-local artists for its programmes. There should be sufficient opportunities for graduates in the arts and cultural sector.
- Museum of Site* • There is no provision to prepare for the set-up of WKCD before 2016 in areas such as cultural software improvements for Hong Kong as a whole and to provide more funding support to the Hong Kong Arts Development Council and other independent groups. The organization is concerned about whether the budget will be sufficient for nurturing public engagement and conducting researches/workshops on manpower and training needs for the arts and cultural sector before 2016.
- Happening Group* • The success of a cultural district depends on promotional and educational efforts. However, there is no indication of the proportion of the \$19 billion that will be spent in the early and middle stages for these purposes.

III. Cultural software

- Hong Kong Ballet*
- The funding for the development should be integrated with funding for local arts and cultural organizations. Otherwise, the potential of WKCD will not be fully realized. World-class resident companies are required in WKCD. There is a need to nurture such local organizations to prepare for the future operation of WKCD.
- Community Cultural Concern*
- There are succession problems in nurturing the new generation of local literary talents.
- The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)*
- It is of paramount importance to identify, utilize, empower and cultivate local talent and expertise in the staffing and running of M+ and/or any other new cultural institutions in Hong Kong, so as to make WKCD or any other new cultural institutions truly reflective of Hong Kong's unique cultural perspective on an international scale.
- Hong Kong Arts Centre*
- The Government should cooperate with arts and cultural organizations and other sectors of the community to study and implement some appropriate complementary measures during the interim.
- The People's Panel on West Kowloon*
- There should be a comprehensive and long-term plan to nurture talents to facilitate organic and interactive development of culture and the community. The development of cultural software is the key to the success of the WKCD project.
 - Planning for a "cultural community" and "community culture" should be the core strategy. Nurturing of diversified cultural creativity, cultural education and manpower training for cultural management should be the key objectives.
 - The Government should discuss, study and formulate various plans for nurturing cultural talent and creativity education with all sectors of the community.
- The Hong Kong Institute of Architects*
- The ultimate success of WKCD will depend largely on the software. WKCD's well being, including financial viability, depends on a sensible plan to run, manage and operate, which should be formulated early to guide the design and planning of the physical development.

III. Cultural software

- The Democratic Party*
- The success of WKCD depends on the success of public participation and promotional and educational efforts at the early stage. The Government should provide resources for complementary cultural software activities.
 - There should be comprehensive complementary cultural software. The foremost task is to enhance the general public's interest, understanding and appreciation in arts and culture, but there are no detailed plans at present.
- Hong Kong Repertory Theatre*
- The development of cultural software and hardware should proceed in parallel. It is time to provide enhanced training for theatre management staff, including designing appropriate overseas training and providing incentives.
 - The Government should invest in the training of professional scriptwriters. Quality scripts are a prerequisite for quality performances which will attract a large audience. Quality works with local characteristics will tie in with the sustainable development of a world-class arts and cultural district.
 - The Government should continue to make targeted cultural investments, including support for the development of professional arts organizations. These organizations should implement creative plans through the "Venue Partnership Scheme" so as to accumulate experience for stationing in WKCD in future.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council*
- The organization welcomes the strategy for developing cultural software as mentioned in Chapter 8.2 of the Recommendation Report, and hopes that the Government will continue to support and increase resources for strengthening the work related to cultural software and training.
 - Research and surveys should be conducted to formulate the contents and direction for nurturing talents so that software and hardware can complement each other for better results.
- Professional Commons*
- Creative industries should be encouraged in WKCD. Special design and planning areas will be necessary to encourage the development of office complexes that are suitable for and affordable to creative talent.

III. Cultural software

- Zonta Club of Hong Kong*
- The proactive identification of local artistic talents as well as local arts groups or organizations will assist in building the software which is necessary to support and justify the hardware of WKCD.
 - The government can encourage the growth of artistic endeavour through granting subsidies and free space to artists' and theatre groups which represent genuine, grass-root level developments in local arts and culture.
- Hong Kong Society For Education In Art*
- Arts education to build up audience is essential for the successful implementation of the WKCD project. A far-sighted and comprehensive plan to nurture arts audience across different sectors is especially important.
 - Arts education should not be confined to primary and secondary school levels. The targets should be broadened to include toddlers and adults of different strata.
 - An Art Incubation Center should be established in WKCD, for arts education and participation of students of different levels, arts education workers and artists, and for exchanges among these people.
- Zuni Icosahedron Ltd.*
- The arts and cultural sectors have fewer budding professional talents and arts administration personnel as LCSD has frozen the recruitment of new cultural service managers and the Government has not put strong emphasis to support the creative industries. The Government has not put forward any concrete steps to address these issues.
 - The organization suggests that a loan fund should be set up for the training of manpower in the relevant sectors. Exchange programmes with overseas arts institutes should also be organized to provide on-the-job trainings for local artists and arts administration personnel.
- Ink Society*
- While it is important to nurture Hong Kong creative talents, Hong Kong should always actively seek and invite the best creative talents from China to work and study in Hong Kong.

III. Cultural software

- The Association of Cultural Service Managers, Cultural Service* • Before the commissioning of the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, the Government should allocate more resources in building up audience.

 - Limited resources have hampered arts promotion to the community. By way of illustration, with an establishment of 201 cultural service managers, there is a succession gap. Having to organize some 900 educational programmes for 210 000 participants annually, the limited manpower of the cultural service managers could not provide internship and training opportunities for tertiary students who wanted to pursue a career in the field.
 - The Government should allocate more resources in the training of arts administrators to tie in with the WKCD project.

- Action Group on Protection of West Kowloon Culture District* • The organization expresses concern on whether cultural software development could complement the WKCD project.

- 香港小童群益會長沙灣中心* • Resources for software development should be allocated equitably to cater for the underprivileged and the poor so that these people would also be empowered culturally. The general public should be engaged in the formulation of software development plans.

- The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts* • The Government, arts and cultural sector, education institutions and the community could team up to build a pluralistic strategy for arts and cultural development which looks at how to work across all art form expressions and disciplinary boundaries to create a path to realize synergistic relationships and develop the software potentials.

 - The organization supports the development of people or cultural software. Developed countries have looked to the promotion of arts and culture as economic regenerators, an attraction to cultural tourists, and measures to encourage the growth of creative industries and for the innovation of business practices.

III. Cultural software

- Hong Kong could use the development of community-based arts practice to support neighbourhood urban and cultural renewal. Hong Kong's cultural transition needs exchange among all parties, so that arts and culture become catalysts for new spheres of influence in the community and help to deliver international quality provision for WKCD and future cultural vision for Hong Kong.

*Hong Kong
Administrators
Association*

- Arts*
- Before the opening of WKCD, the Government should immediately proceed with the improvement of the existing LCSD performing venues and museums, development of human resources and management talent within the existing arts sector and the nurturing of local talent and audience education.
 - The Government should establish a specialist arts secondary school.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- Hong Kong Institute of Archaeology* • Hong Kong's archaeological heritage is a cultural resource that should not be overlooked in setting up M+ and implementing its visions. M+ can capitalize on Hong Kong's archaeological heritage without any cost, and the opportunities for promoting heritage conservation, general education, creative industries and cultural tourism; appreciation of cultural heritage; understanding of local history; and enhancing local identity are unlimited.
- Mr CHAN Kin-shing*
- A mega performance venue with 15 000 seats and four medium size venues with 2 000 seats are the most urgently required. Other performance venues with small seating capacities can be provided by the Government and civic organizations in other areas rather than concentrating them in WKCD.
 - The gross floor area of museum facilities can be further reduced. Instead of building a sizable M+, consideration should be given to providing smaller museums in WKCD in cooperation with the existing museums managed by LCSO.
 - There should be outdoor performance venues in WKCD. The Government can adopt a licensing system in designating these venues and coordinating the time and area for performances. There should be promotion on outdoor performances and a West Kowloon Outdoor Performance Festival should be organized.
 - The construction period of performance and museum facilities should be shortened to three to five years. The Government can designate some temporary performance venues for Cantonese opera.
- Mr Oscar HO Hing-kay*
- M+ should make arts approachable to the public. It should be forerunning, professional and distinctive, and capable of standing proudly among its international competitors with outstanding visions and directions.
 - The concept of "visual cultures", which is the focus of M+, is about a broad multi-layers interpretation that accommodates approaches from anthropology, sociology, cultural studies and other disciplines. The Government should further explain the concept to the public to instill good understanding of the M+ proposal.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)

- The organization strongly supports that M+ should build, house and preserve collections. The related recommended functions of education and outreach; exhibition and display; and research and publications are not only commendable but indispensable. It also supports a multi-functional Exhibition Centre in the nature of the European *kunsthalle*.
- The need for museum facilities and programmes specifically designed and targeted for children must be addressed and resolved.
- For M+, expanding the scope of the initial four areas of focus to encompass architecture, design, moving image, popular culture and visual arts is more reflective of Hong Kong's contemporary cultural climate.
- M+'s relation to existing facilities, missions and operations should be more fully explored and defined. M+ should be tied to a reorganization of existing resources. Recruitment matters relating to professional staff should be discussed and defined. Recruitment of principal positions should be international and contract-based.
- If M+ is indeed to become a reality, it is necessary to begin concrete actions now. An interim advisory committee of museum professionals and experts and an interim M+ facility for development and training purposes should be established.
- The setting up of a public trust, which will have full ownership of all M+ collections, and of statutes clearly defining governance of financial and administrative structures must be accomplished before meaningful development can go forward.

Habitus

- M+ and black box theaters cannot cater for the needs of emerging artists who mainly use public space. The Government should reduce commercial and residential developments in WKCD and increase public space. Control on the use of public space should be relaxed and the relevant legislation should be reviewed.

Zonta Club of Hong Kong

- While WKCD is a very good location for performance and rehearsal venues, it is somewhat awkward for an art museum as it does not have natural traffic. When there are no exhibitions on show, attendance will be low.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- In the absence of great collections, **M+** can become an exhibition space not unlike that of the Hong Kong Arts Centre or the Hong Kong Visual Arts Centre. One way to get around this problem is to make it a franchise of a foreign museum. However, this will not distinguish it from other similarly franchised museums around the world.
- **M+** should strive to be a magnificently original structure by engaging a visionary architect.

Ms Sabrina M Y FUNG

- **M+** will position Hong Kong at the forefront of Asia's rapidly evolving contemporary art scene and present a new and exciting approach to exhibiting and developing visual culture from the 20th century and beyond. Its open structure, both structurally and conceptually, will simultaneously facilitate and encourage cross-media art, happenings, and events, as well as alternative art experiences. The transformability of **M+** will also serve as a highly unique platform for future curators who will bring Hong Kong stimulating and multi-cultural art experiences.
- **M+** will perform a critical and essential role as a cultural link, nourishing and developing Hong Kong's art community and the general public, especially our younger audience. As **M+** will have far greater flexibility to embrace new artistic forms than a traditional museum, this will help sustain **M+**'s edge in the ever-changing contemporary art world. This significant quality will differentiate **M+** from other Asian contemporary art institutions and museums.
- **M+** will build upon Hong Kong's extensive art and cultural development, both privately and publicly, over the past few years. Several art schools and cultural spaces have recently opened and many more are planned. These new venues reflect the Hong Kong public's growing awareness of and interest in contemporary art and culture. **M+** will represent an essential and timely continuation of this evolving cultural process.
- The interim measures for developing **M+** should proceed urgently to enable this groundbreaking art project to become a reality for Hong Kong.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

Civic Party

- The organization agrees that in operating **M+**, the principles of curatorial independence and professional excellence should be guaranteed. However, the Administration should explain how **M+** will effectively operate, how it will be held accountable and its relationship with the WKCD Authority.

Hong Kong Curators Association

- The Association has reservation on the "popular culture" theme under **M+** as this theme would duplicate the collections of the existing museums. As items under popular culture would have been provided at commercial exhibitions and shopping malls, the attractiveness of the theme is in doubt. While WKCD should cover not only arts but culture and heritage, the Association suggests that the popular culture theme should be replaced by other themes, such as a museum for children.
- The integrative and cross-disciplinary approach of **M+** is not new and some overseas precedents are not successful.
- \$100 million for building up the collection for **M+** is too little whereas the estimated attendance of two million visitors per annum is too optimistic. By way of illustration, the Guggenheim Bilbao Museum only has an annual attendance of 900 000. The Government should review the assumptions made in arriving at the projected attendance figure.
- The guidelines on **M+** in the Recommendation Report are too broad and a pilot project should be implemented to test its attractiveness and viability.
- Legislative Council should ensure that the Government or the WKCD Authority would not deploy existing museum resources to set up **M+**.

Ms HO Loy

- The **M+** concept is outdated and boring. WKCD should stress creativity in its development.

Ink Society

- The organization is disappointed that the ink museum is no longer one of the four "core" groups represented in the proposed **M+**. Instead, ink art is replaced by a broad and loosely defined "contemporary culture". Having said so, it does not mean there are no opportunities to develop an ink museum elsewhere in Hong Kong. The Ink Society will continue to work with the Government to find a suitable alternative.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • The organization supports the review of the operation modes of existing performing venues and museums of LCSD.
- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • It is blatantly contradictory to set out a policy objective of "encouraging diversified and balanced development" and "ensuring a 'common wealth' accessible and affordable to the public at large", and then to propose placing a cluster of 16 venues on a podium, away from the public domain, managed with a motivation to maximize retail, entertainment and dining revenues, and designed to maximize tourism impact. The risk of West Kowloon as a cultural district turning into a white elephant is now greater than ever.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • District-based venues in buildings and structures which offer spaces no longer required for their original use will enjoy the benefit of local transport and food and beverage facilities and help develop a bottom-up arts and culture scene. Funding can be provided from some part of the \$19 billion for a period of time until these venues can become self-sufficient. The experience gained in managing these venues will also be invaluable when WKCD eventually comes into operation. There should be fewer large-scale structures and a much wider range of smaller district-based venues.
- Happening Group*
- There should be room for spontaneous development of cultural hardware.
 - WKCD should be a cultural-led development. Commercial facilities should be ancillary. Cultural facilities should be implemented before commercial developments so as to attract talents and pedestrian flow.
 - The recommended cultural venues need to be justified by substantive reasons and quantitative evidence. The purported clustering effect of cultural, leisure, commercial and residential elements should also be examined from a practical angle.
 - International cultural exchange should be bi-directional. Sourcing non-local programmes at a high price unilaterally should be avoided.
- The Hong Kong Institute of Planners* • To sustain vibrancy and a high usage rate of the 15 arts performing venues will be a very difficult task.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- The high concentration of arts and cultural venues in WKCD reflects an unhealthy bias. Part of the venues should be developed in other districts to reduce the pressure of WKCD and create alternative local cultural districts.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.*
- The organization fully supports the WKCD project because Hong Kong lacks large performance venues and outdoor performance venues. Hardware provision should be considered on a territory-wide basis or even a Greater Pearl River Delta basis.
- Hong Kong Dance Company*
- Hong Kong lacks arts and cultural venues.
- Spring-Time Stage*
- There are insufficient cultural venues in Hong Kong.
- Hong Kong Arts Centre*
- The organization expresses concern on whether there is room for non-profit-making and private cultural facilities to develop outside WKCD. The planning of these facilities and economic incentives for these facilities should be considered.
- Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration*
- The Government can consider erecting gigantic screens so that citizens in various districts can watch cultural activities held in other districts.
- The Democratic Party*
- The organization is concerned about the sizable scale and high operating expenses of M+.
 - It is worried that the venues in WKCD will be used for non-cultural activities in order to increase usage rate.
 - The Government should provide plenty of public space in WKCD for spontaneous development of cultural activities.
 - Open design competitions should be organized for all Core Arts and Cultural Facilities in WKCD.
 - Cultural developments should be implemented before commercial developments so as to amass cultural talents and pedestrian flow in the district.
 - International cultural exchange should be bi-directional. Avoid sourcing programmes at a high price unilaterally.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society* • Hong Kong needs arts and cultural venues of a sizable scale to facilitate the staging of world-class productions, project local culture, allow creative industries to develop in a diversified and healthy way, and satisfy the needs of the local arts and culture sector and audience.
- Hong Kong Construction Association* • There has been a serious shortage of centrally located, purpose designed performing arts venues of various seating capacities to meet the needs of different performances. There is also insufficient museum space and a lack of "flagship" museums with impressive architectural design to showcase the cultural characteristics of Hong Kong and the region.
- The organization does not have a strong view on the proposed 15 performing arts venues.
- Professional Commons* • As the demand for cultural facilities will likely change over time, it may be necessary to consider a more gradual phased development of the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities so as to allow for more flexibility and opportunities for future fine-tuning and incorporation of updated designs and concepts. As small and medium size venues are currently in short supply, the development of this type of venues can be expedited.
- Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra* • The organization welcomes the inclusion of a concert hall, a chamber music hall and space for resident companies. In designing the concert hall and chamber music hall, priority consideration should be given to the acoustics aspect and the stakeholders should be consulted on the acoustics design. Sections 4.31 to 4.37 of the Report of the Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group have provided a detailed and comprehensive suggestion on the design and technical aspects of the concert hall to cater for the different requirements for Western and Chinese orchestral music.
- The Association of Managers, Cultural Services* • The association points out that most of the performance venues managed by LCSD are built for multi purposes and could not meet the requirements of professional performances. These venues should instead take up the role of nurturing budding artists and audience at a district level.

IV. Arts and cultural facilities

- The association has reservation on the LCSD Venue Partnership Scheme to develop characters for the venues, as the scheme will restrict the variety of programmes offered to the local community.
- Hong Kong* *Arts*
- Administrators*
- Association*
- The development of WKCD should not preclude district based cultural hubs which will provide an important audience development function and a training ground for arts managers in preparation for WKCD. Districts could also house resident companies' production and rehearsal facilities.
 - The clustering effect is an essential feature of the WKCD proposal and the 15 performing venues should be seen as the minimum provision.
 - Different operation modes should be explored to suit the nature of each facility, including outsourcing and public-private-partnership to enhance community involvement.
 - The proposed LCSD venue partnership scheme is only a stop-gap measure. The role of LCSD venues should be revised and consideration could be given to transferring management of LCSD civic centres to resident performing companies who would subsidize their operating costs from theatre rental income.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong*
- The development of Retail/Dining/Entertainment (RDE) space in WKCD should be genuinely ancillary and be limited to servicing the patrons of the venues in WKCD. Any large scale RDE development should be subject to the normal land disposal process and be developed and managed by the private sector.
- Spring-Time Stage*
- The organization disagrees that there should not be commercial and residential developments in WKCD. Some existing arts and cultural venues lack pedestrian flow and are segregated from ancillary facilities such as dining facilities, and thus become unattractive as a performance venue.
 - Overseas experience demonstrates that cultural and museum facilities can be well-integrated with commercial, office, hotel, dining and residential developments. The concept of a "cinema street" where various facilities are available should be seriously considered in planning WKCD so as to attract people to the area.
- Mr CHAN Kin-shing*
- Residential developments are unnecessary in WKCD. The gross floor area for residential developments can be redeployed for hotel, commercial, office and exhibition venue developments.
 - There should be good connectivity with neighbouring old districts, in particular Tsim Sha Tsui and Jordan, and various kinds of pedestrian access facilities and public transport facilities, including ferries, should be available.
- Museum of Site*
- The organization has doubts on whether cultural projects and residential and commercial activities can simply be intermingled under one umbrella.
- Local Action/Community Concern* *Cultural*
- Reclaimed land in West Kowloon should be used for reducing the population density and providing more open space for the neighbouring areas. There should not be any luxury residential developments and large scale commercial developments. A WKCD park should be constructed instead.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- The old and new areas should be connected so that residents can easily access WKCD. However, the existing WKCD site is surrounded by expensive property developments and separated from the old areas by massive roads. There should be complete integration with neighbouring areas in planning WKCD.
- Professional Property Services Limited*
- There is concern over the connectivity and the integration of WKCD with the rest of Hong Kong. People should enjoy easy access to the waterfront and to the facilities on it. Accessibility and the movement of large numbers of people should not be underestimated.
- Hong Kong Institute of Planners*
- Integration of cultural facilities with residential and commercial developments and the need to manage the vehicular and pedestrian traffic generated from these developments present a big challenge for the planning of the district.
- Habitus*
- WKCD is positioned as a luxurious commercial and residential district. The planning of WKCD has not taken into consideration the integration with neighbouring districts and the need to facilitate residents of old districts in using the cultural facilities. This is non-conducive to the development of community-based arts and culture.
 - WKCD can incorporate shops selling metal ware and stationery found in old districts. These shops, often visited by artists, will create job opportunities and facilitate social integration. Culture should be diversified and fixating on ideas like Broadway and West End will not bring any merits.
- Hong Kong Arts Centre*
- While appreciating that there will be more than 20 hectares of public open space in WKCD, the organization hopes that the Government will not plan the open space in isolation, but would give attention to the interaction among different spaces, people and the natural environment. The existing policy on public space is more concerned about regulating people's behaviour in public space rather than offering free living space for the public. If quality public space is to be provided in WKCD, research relating to space and activities has to be conducted and spatial planning

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

should take the results of the research into consideration. An expert group should be formed to discuss and study public space planning for WKCD.

- There are insufficient details on the connection between the public space in WKCD and adjoining areas and the modes of connection. WKCD should not be segregated and there should be good pedestrian and vehicular connection with adjoining areas.
- The People's Panel on West Kowloon*
- The planning for WKCD should be just. The planning should cover the 330 hectares rather than just the 40-hectare WKCD project site. Facilities that have been promised for the old districts should be realized through the planning of WKCD. There must be sufficient connectivity between WKCD and the neighbouring old districts and there should be interactions between WKCD and the 18 districts in Hong Kong.
 - The planning for WKCD should be sustainable. There should be good balance among density, space and economic values.
- Hong Kong Institute of Real Estate Administration*
- The proposed plot ratio of 1.81 is reasonable to keep developments along the Victoria Harbour at a lower density.
 - The Government can consider appropriately raising the plot ratio for sites at fringe areas of WKCD to attract developers to acquire sites with higher returns to compensate for the costs of developing lower density developments in WKCD.
 - The proposed height limit of 50 to 100 mPD is reasonable to maintain a varying height profile, balanced distribution and gradation of the developments at the harbourfront.
 - In developing the Master Layout Plan, the Government should be innovative in areas like zoning; calculation and exemption of gross floor area and site coverage; and distribution, transfer and conversion of plot ratio and site coverage. The traditional method of first zoning the plots and then formulating lease conditions may not meet the requirements of the master planning.
 - There should be a heavy-weight landmark in WKCD.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- Developers should join hands and place the overall interests of the WKCD project above individual interests by integrating cultural and non-cultural facilities to create a synergy effect. A successful WKCD as a whole will help raise the cost recovery rate of individual facilities.

Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd. • The interests of entertainment, tourism and business sectors are not always regarded as being aligned with those of the arts community. However, in the development of WKCD, these do come together in a shared interest in enhancing Hong Kong as a whole.

The Hong Kong Institute of Architects • The organization is highly appreciative of the Government's decision to scrap the developer-led mode for the WKCD project.

- WKCD should adopt a sustainable and innovative design. Appropriate policies and requirements should be included in the design, planning and development briefs.
- WKCD is an integral part of our city and should be treated as so. Connectivity and interactions with urban areas near and far will bring enhancements and synergies benefiting the entire city. Its harbourfront presence is expected to add charm and vitality to our harbour and urban scenes.
- To generate creative design and planning ideas, the organization strongly advocates for open design competitions for the WKCD master plan and major development packages, not limited to just the 3 icon facilities.
- An urban design led visionary master plan of much wider perspectives and greater depths is essential. Simplistic, rigid building height control can only hinder creative design. It can never nurture a desirable outcome. To ensure compatibility with the overall WKCD goals, master development plans for all individual packages should be scrutinized.
- The organization takes a strong view that residential and commercial developments in WKCD should contribute meaningfully to the promotion of arts and culture. This should be a key criterion in scheme selection.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- It is important for the Government to define all the external conditions as early as possible, so that WKCD can be planned and designed in response to these external conditions.
- Rigid and unsympathetic building laws cause severe detriments to creative ideas. It is essential to devise a mechanism to encourage the adoption and realization of creative design.

The Democratic Party

- The planning of WKCD should be led by the community, executed by professionals and coordinated by the Government.
- Attention should be given to the clustering effect of cultural, leisure, commercial and residential districts; and integrated development of cultural and non-cultural projects.
- There should be more public space on the ground for leisure activities.

Association of Engineering Professionals in Society

- The organization agrees to a phased development of arts and cultural facilities and the provision of land reserve for their future growth. Cultural and non-cultural facilities should be integrated during the phased development to attract people, generate synergy and increase income so that WKCD can be sustainable.
- The organization has no objection on the 20% gross floor area limit for residential developments and the maximum plot ratio of 1.81. However, there should be flexibility in building height and layout. The design should take into consideration of wind direction to avoid creating the wall effect.
- WKCD should cater for the needs of the general public by providing waterfront promenades, parks, meadows and open-air cultural piazzas.
- There should be a landmark building to establish the representativeness of WKCD in arts and culture and boost tourism and economic benefits.
- Infrastructure development in WKCD should comply with the principle of sustainable development and strive to reduce the effects on the environment.

Hong Kong Construction Association

- There is a strong desire for a free and accessible open space that is to be made available to the citizens and visitors of Hong Kong.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- WKCD should adopt fast track construction contract arrangements, such as Design and Build, Design-Build-Operate, or other accelerated project delivery methods, for at least the initial phases of the development.
- WKCD will draw huge crowds at times and the transportation and pedestrian network will have to be carefully worked out under a master plan. The planning, layout and overall aesthetic consideration of iconic structures will be of paramount importance.

Professional Commons

- The proposed gross floor areas for the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities and residential developments in WKCD will likely result in less vibrant daytime activities and lower financial returns for the retail/dining/entertainment facilities. The currently proposed development mix may not be the most conducive to the vibrancy of WKCD.
- The provision of open space should not rely on the private sector. Options should be explored to allow for more quality public open space which should not be dispersed and be provided at ground level.
- Direct and easy connections between WKCD and its less affluent neighbouring areas will encourage cultural diversity and enhance the usage of facilities. Innovative and environmentally friendly means of access should be incorporated in the Master Layout Plans.

Zonta Club of Hong Kong

- WKCD should incorporate as much parkland as possible to provide green space for people to go and relax and admire the natural beauty of the harbour.
- The thoroughfares leading to the WKCD vicinities will need to be reviewed to cater for possible substantial increase of road traffic.

Ms HO Loy

- As the West Kowloon Reclamation area was originally planned to provide more open space for residents living in the old districts in West Kowloon, the WKCD project should address their needs and integrate with the neighbouring districts.
- The transport links between WKR and Hong Kong Island West should be planned.

V. Development mix, connectivity with other districts and other planning issues

- Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon Culture District*
- The organization is concerned that not enough open space would be provided in WKCD and whether the open space would be provided at ground level for easy access by the residents in the neighbouring districts.
 - The organization is concerned that the iconic buildings in WKCD would only be "screen-type" buildings without unique characters.
- 香港小童群益會長沙灣中心
- The provision of open space should cater for the needs of different social strata. More open space instead of office and residential developments should be provided.
 - Transport facilities should be improved to increase the accessibility of WKCD from neighbouring districts.

VI. Statutory body to oversee the development of WKCD

- Designing Hong Kong Harbour District* • The Government should be guided by a commission in formulating the cultural policy. The WKCD Authority should not take up this function. It should be a venue management organization.
- The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong* • The WKCD Authority should be limited in its powers and not be allowed to grow into a publicly-funded corporation in competition with the private sector. Development rights should not be used to avoid proper accountability of the funding for WKCD. It should seek funding from the Legislative Council as in the case of other public works or publicly funded projects.
- The Fringe Club* • A WKCD Trust may be more appropriate than a WKCD Authority. The WKCD Trust should have the ability to manage cultural venues in WKCD and train professionals for such a purpose. It should give due attention to the distribution of arts and cultural facilities in Hong Kong.
- Mr CHAN Kin-shing* • Mr CHAN is concerned that the powers and portfolio of the WKCD Authority will be too extensive. Individual arts and cultural venues should be managed separately. The WKCD Authority should be responsible for leasing some commercial facilities designated by the Government and it need not intervene into the operation of other commercial facilities.
- High-level officials with professional experience are required to be in charge of arts and culture.
- Professional Property Services Limited* • The membership of the WKCD Authority will require careful consideration. It should comprise relevant experts and interest groups, and should not be used as an occasion to reward "friends of Government". The membership needs to be independent and pro-active but above all should care about Hong Kong's sustainability and cultural development.
- The Composers & Authors Society of HK Ltd.* • The organization has reservation on having some members of the WKCD Authority nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors, similar to that adopted by the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC). Before a better nomination could be worked out, appointment by the Government of people with high standing in the arts and cultural industries would be more preferable.

VI. Statutory body to oversee the development of WKCD

- Museum of Site*
- The organization is against the WKCD Authority having some members nominated by the relevant arts and cultural sectors, similar to that adopted by HKADC, which might easily lead to monopolization by some arts and cultural organizations. As such, it is more preferable for the Authority's members to be appointed by the Government.
- The International Association of Art Critics (Hong Kong Chapter)*
- The organization recommends setting up the WKCD Authority as soon as possible with an independent Board of Governors comprising enlightened art and culture professionals, architects, business-people and Government representatives who are passionate about art and culture.
- Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon Culture District*
- Representatives of the public, such as elected District Council members and Legislative Council Members, should be represented in the WKCD Authority.
- Habitus*
- The discussion on WKCD has focused on the need to establish the WKCD Authority, but does not touch on its accountability and functions, how to ensure that it will not be biased towards the commercial sector, and how to ensure it will plan with justice.
- Hong Kong Curators Association*
- Museum professionals should be represented in the WKCD Authority.
- The People's Panel on West Kowloon*
- The primary mission of the WKCD Authority is to establish a people-oriented cultural metropolis through WKCD. Rather than being a large property and venue management company, it has the responsibility to reveal and implement a comprehensive cultural development plan. Its membership should include various representatives from the community and have a solid community base. The approach of having all members appointed should not be adopted.
- Civic Party*
- It is disappointing that the recommended powers of the WKCD Authority do not include the development of cultural software or formulation of a strategy for such.
 - The policy accountability of the WKCD Authority will also need to be addressed.

VI. Statutory body to oversee the development of WKCD

- A mode of operation like the Airport Authority is inappropriate for WKCD because it will create a gap between the WKCD Authority and community wisdom and needs.
 - The functions of the WKCD Authority should include establishing an effective system and a mechanism to resolve various complicated conflicts and problems.
 - The membership composition of the WKCD Authority should ensure that the highest regard be given to community representatives and community views.
- Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.*
- The organization is highly appreciative of the establishment of a WKCD Authority.
 - The organization echoes the suggestion for a Provisional WKCD Authority. Design and planning should commence urgently if the Government's proposed schedule to complete Phase I by 2015 is to be accomplished.
- The Democratic Party*
- The membership of the WKCD Authority should include two to three representatives from the arts and cultural sector, one to two from the planning and architecture sector, one from the Legislative Council and one to two from civic organizations.
 - The WKCD Authority should establish the Hong Kong, China and international perspectives of WKCD and explore the possibility of using cultural assets as the pillar for Hong Kong's economic development in future.
- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society*
- The organization agrees to the establishment of the WKCD Authority to implement the WKCD project as soon as possible.
- Hong Kong Construction Association*
- The WKCD Authority should follow Government practices in tendering and administration of construction contracts.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council*
- The organization hopes that the views of the arts and cultural sector will be adequately reflected through its representatives in the WKCD Authority.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong*
- The WKCD Authority needs sufficient autonomy to employ/hire its staff outside of the civil service and make decisions about its finances, but some degree of governmental participation may be preferable. A mechanism of checks and balances might be desirable.

VI. Statutory body to oversee the development of WKCD

- Hong Kong Society For Education In Art* • The WKCD Authority should establish channels to enhance communication with frontline workers in arts education.
- The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong* • The association is concerned about the composition, functions and policies of the WKCD Authority. The Xiqu sector should be actively engaged in the establishment of the Authority and in its formation of policies.
- The members of the WKCD Authority and its staff responsible for the management of arts and cultural facilities should be familiar with arts and culture in Hong Kong and should adopt a flexible attitude in dealing with the artists and performing arts groups.
- Hong Kong Arts Administrators Association* • "WKCD Trust" is preferable to "WKCD Authority" as the latter does not connote an organization entrusted with the creation, management, programming and future development of a significant part of the cultural sector.
- The enabling legislation should ensure that the Trust's mission and objectives are very clearly set out and establish clear delineation between the roles of governance in the hands of the Board of Trustees, and that of management in the hands of the directors of the cultural facilities. Governance should address policy, long-term planning and compliance with statutory obligations. Management should address artistic programming and day-to-day operation of the cultural facilities and public open space.
 - The legislation can also define the types of people that should be appointed or elected to the WKCD Trust, set up particular categories of representation, and The Trust should be empowered with a broad scope of responsibilities so as not to hamper its independence.
 - WKCD Trust should comprise the Chairman, art expertise, expertise in other professions and public representatives.

VII. Financing approach

- Happening Group*
- Subsidies that might be provided by the WKCD Authority to attract business enterprises, operation of commercial facilities by the WKCD Authority itself or cross-subsidization between commercial and cultural facilities will result in unfair competition and will be in breach of Hong Kong's spirit of free economy.
- Mr CHAN Kin-shing*
- Instead of a one-off grant of \$19 billion, the development of cultural hardware and software in WKCD should be financed by the land sale proceeds of WKCD.
- Museum of Site*
- WKCD should be developed in phases so that the Legislative Council can monitor the use of public resources as the project progresses.
- The Fringe Club*
- The Government should not only focus on infrastructure development, investment returns and a fiscal balance in funding the development WKCD but to create city vibrancy and foster civic pride among the Hong Kong community.
- Hong Kong Ballet*
- Funding for WKCD should be considered as an investment with direct and indirect economic benefits. Indirect economic benefits, although difficult to measure, are greater in the long run. Soft assets such as brand name constitute a greater part of the economic value of many global companies.
- Hong Kong Institute of Planners*
- Using a financially self-sustaining principle to operate the facilities in WKCD would aggravate the disparity between the rich and the poor in the society.
- The Democratic Party*
- Every aspect of the WKCD project should be developed by phases. Instead of a one-off appropriation of \$19 billion, the Legislative Council should provide funding by two to three phases to facilitate monitoring.
 - The organization expresses concern on the financial sustainability of WKCD. To provide an additional source of steady income for the WKCD Authority, the Government can consider injecting land sales proceeds into a special reserve fund for contingency use, or allocating part of the hotel and office sites for use as complementary facilities to be managed by the WKCD Authority.

VII. Financing approach

- Association of Engineering Professionals in Society* • The organization agrees to the proposed financing arrangements of providing a one-off grant and using rents from non-cultural facilities as income for the WKCD Authority.
- Hong Kong Construction Association* • The organization is pleased to note that the Government has engaged a Financial Advisor to explore various options and develop a financial model for the project.

 - The organization supports an upfront endowment of \$19.2 billion but does not have strong views on whether the injection is to be made in phases. The overriding consideration must be that the overall time frame in the delivery of the facilities must not be unreasonably delayed.
- Hong Kong Arts Development Council* • The organization welcomes a one-off appropriation of \$19 billion because it will ensure that the WKCD project will not be delayed due to changes in the economy.
- Zonta Club of Hong Kong* • The organization expresses concern on whether the Government be willing to shoulder more costs for M+'s exhibitions.

 - An important criterion for sustainable development of the WKCD vision is the availability of sufficient financial resources for continued maintenance and operation. This important issue should be closely studied and publicly discussed.
 - As the main source of income will be from the hiring and utilization of the facilities, sufficient caution should be taken in post-completion financial projection to ensure that financial feasibility and stability continues, especially in the infancy period of WKCD.
- Action Group on Protection of the West Kowloon Culture District* • The organization is concerned about the projected deficit of M+ and the principle of developing and operating WKCD on a self-financing basis as a whole. In order to make up for the deficits of the arts and cultural facilities, WKCD may become another property development project and thus would not fulfill its original vision of fostering growth and development of culture and creative industries.

VII. Financing approach

- Hong Kong Alternatives* • Given Hong Kong's improved public finance, the Government does not need to sell land in WKCD for the \$19 billion to fund the arts and culture development in the project. The Cultural Green Park proposed by the organization will become the lungs of the urban centre and a better environment will attract more investment and talents to Hong Kong. Land sale of any part of WKCD site will create deep social disharmony.

VIII. Public engagement process

- Local Action/Community Concern* *Cultural*
- There should be bottom-up participation by the public in developing WKCD. The consultation conducted by the Advisory Groups focused on professionals and the arts and business sectors only. West Kowloon residents have not been consulted on the planning issues.
 - There are no formal channels and opportunities for the general public to express their views. It is therefore difficult to build up a consensus in society.
 - The deputations hope that the planning, design, development and management of WKCD would be a truly democratic participation process.
 - The Government should set up community workshops to engage the public intensively in the planning of WKCD.
- Happening Group*
- The success of a cultural district depends on public engagement in the early stage.
 - Every effort should be made to strive for public-private-partnership in every aspect of the WKCD development.
- People's Foundation* *Democracy*
- How to deepen the discussion and establish a quality participatory culture is no less important than democracy in election. Consultations on WKCD have not been genuine and participatory planning is the way out.
- The People's Panel on West Kowloon*
- Consultations on WKCD should be genuine.
- The Hong Kong Institute of Architects*
- WKCD is an important public asset to be shared and enjoyed by the whole community. To ensure its success, meaningful and accountable public consultation is essential.
- Hong Kong Construction Association*
- The organization commends the work that has been carried out by the Consultative Committee and its three Advisory Groups. It shares the views solicited and in particular the public's desire for the early implementation of the project.
 - The organization fully supports developing WKCD into an arts and cultural district. It is of paramount importance to have the public consultation and deliberation finalized as quickly as possible and a decision made on the way forward so that the master layout plan can be finalized without further delay and the scheme implemented.

VIII. Public engagement process

Ms HO Loy

- The public should be engaged in revamping the existing arts and cultural facilities to complement the WKCD project.
- The Government should take more proactive and innovative steps to facilitate public engagement on the WKCD project, such as organizing more activities at the WKCD site for the public before actual development takes place.