司法及法律事務委員會(供 2005 年 7 月 12 日會議用)

就載有令執行機構"滿意"一詞 (該草擬方式)的法例條文進行檢討

PANEL ON ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE AND LEGAL SERVICES (FOR MEETING ON 12 JULY 2005)

REVIEW OF LEGISLATIVE PROVISIONS CONTAINING THE PHRASE "TO THE SATISFACTION" OF AN ENFORCEMENT AGENCY (THE DRAFTING FORMULA)

Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services (for Meeting on 12 July 2005)

Review of legislative provisions containing the phrase "to the satisfaction" of an enforcement agency (the drafting formula)

Introduction

In December 2003, we provided at this Panel's request a paper that examined, in the light of the judgment of the Court of First Instance (CFI) in <u>HKSAR</u> v <u>Lam Geotechnics Limited</u> (HCMA 379/2000), the extent of the problem with respect to provisions in subsidiary legislation containing the drafting formula. It also set out our preliminary view on the conduct of a review of those provisions.

2. During the meeting on 18 December 2003, this Panel requested the Administration to undertake an analysis of the judgment in the <u>Lam Geotechnics</u> case with a view to assessing the extent of its impact on existing legislative provisions containing the formula – before deciding whether to conduct a comprehensive review of the legislative provisions.

Background

3. In the <u>Lam Geotechnics</u> case, the appellant appealed against a conviction for a contravention of regulation 44(1)(c) of the Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 59I) as in force at the time. Under regulation 68(1) of Cap. 59I, a contravention of regulation 44 is an offence punishable by a maximum fine of \$50,000. Cap. 59I was made by the Commissioner for Labour under section 7 of the Factories and Industrial Undertakings Ordinance (Cap. 59).

Regulation 44(1) stated –

[&]quot;A contractor shall ensure that -

⁽a) every flywheel and moving part of any prime mover;

⁽b) every part of transmission machinery; and

⁽c) every dangerous part of other machinery (whether or not driven by mechanical power), for which he is responsible is securely fenced to the satisfaction of the Commissioner [for Labour] unless it is in such a position or of such construction as to be as safe to every workman on the construction site as it would be if it were securely fenced.".

- 4. The main ground of appeal was that the Magistrate erred in law by ruling that the appellant had a case to answer. The appellant argued that
 - (a) because of the ambiguity and uncertainty inherent in the phrase "to the satisfaction of the Commissioner", the elements of the offence were incompletely defined;
 - (b) the elements of the offence were not sufficiently defined unless fencing criteria that would satisfy the Commissioner were prescribed by law or in the absence of that, the Commissioner had previously taken sufficient steps to notify what his criteria were, either generally or to the appellant; and
 - (c) regulation 44 was ultra vires Cap. 59 because by including the phrase "to the satisfaction of the Commissioner", it failed to prescribe with sufficient particularity the elements of an offence, i.e. the means of ensuring the safety of persons in industrial undertakings, or the means of securing the removal of any danger or defect, as required by section 7(1)(h) & (i) of Cap. 59.
- 5. The CFI allowed the appeal. It was satisfied that the elements of offence purportedly set out in regulation 44 were incompletely defined because of the uncertainty in the phrase "to the satisfaction" of the Commissioner, which meant that those who were required to regulate their conduct according to the regulation could not ascertain, before a prosecution was brought, what fencing measures would satisfy the Commissioner. The CFI found that regulation 44 as in force at the time was ultra vires Cap. 59.

Our analysis

6. We accept this ruling. Section 7(1)(h) & (i) of Cap. 59 empowers the Commissioner for Labour to prescribe or provide for, by regulation, specific means of ensuring the safety of persons in industrial undertakings and of securing the removal of danger or defects. By requiring a contractor to ensure machinery to be fenced to the Commissioner's satisfaction, the Commissioner has not prescribed or provided for such means under regulation 44 as in force at the time. In the light of this ruling, regulation 44 was amended to prescribe the specific measures required.²

See the Construction Sites (Safety)(Amendment) Regulation 2003 (LN 258 of 2003), as amended under a Resolution of the Legislative Council (LN 257 of 2003). The Amendment Regulation came into operation on 28 November 2003.

7. The <u>Lam Geotechnics</u> case was decided on the basis that by including the phrase "to the satisfaction of the Commissioner", regulation 44 failed to prescribe with sufficient particularity the elements of an offence and was ultra vires section 7 of Cap. 59. While a legislative provision in subsidiary legislation containing the drafting formula may raise concern about certainty and vires issues, each provision has to be assessed individually.

Imprecise and vague offences

- 8. Another important question is whether or not the validity of a legislative provision containing the drafting formula can be challenged on other grounds. This would affect those legislative provisions contained in subsidiary legislation that stand up to challenges on vires grounds and those contained in principal legislation.
- 9. In <u>Shum Kwok Sher</u> v <u>HKSAR</u> [2002] 2 HKLRD 793, the appellant argued before the Court of Final Appeal (CFA) that the common law offence of misconduct in public office was too vague, uncertain and ill-defined to comply with
 - (a) Article 39 of the Basic Law (BL 39)³; and
 - (b) Articles 11(1) of the Hong Kong Bill of Rights (HKBOR)⁴ equivalent to Art 14.2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR).
- 10. On the interpretation of BL 39 and Article 11(1) of the HKBOR, the CFA held that –

"International human rights jurisprudence has developed to the point that it is now widely recognised that the expression 'prescribed by law', when used in the context such as art 39 of the Basic Law mandates the principle of legal certainty. This principle is likewise incorporated in the expression 'according to law' in art 11(1) of the [Hong Kong Bill of Rights]."

"The provisions of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Internation Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and international labour conventions as applied to Hong Kong shall remain in force and shall be implemented through the laws of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

The rights and freedoms enjoyed by HK residents shall not be restricted unless as prescribed by law. Such restrictions shall not contravene the provisions of the preceding paragraph of this Article.".

BL 39(2) –

⁴ Art 11(1) of the HKBOR –

[&]quot;Everyone charged with a criminal offence shall have the right to be presumed innocent until proved guilty according to the law.".

In order to be consistent with the presumption of innocence provision under the ICCPR as incorporated through BL 39, an offence has to satisfy the principle of legal certainty, whether or not it also attracts a penalty of imprisonment that would restrict the rights and freedom enjoyed by HK residents under Art 5 of HKBOR. This rationale would apply to a statutory offence.

- 11. While the CFA noted that the law must be accessible and sufficiently precise to enable the citizen to regulate his conduct, it also pointed out that the degree of precision would vary according to the context of the law in question, quoting from a decision of the Privy Council⁵: "[t]he fact that a law is expressed in broad terms does not mean that it must be held to have failed to reach the required standard".
- 12. The CFA found that while the common law offence of misconduct in public office was cast in general terms to cover many forms of misconduct on the part of public officers, the broad terms in which the offence was cast were sufficient to enable a public officer to regulate his conduct. Thus, the offence was not so imprecise as to offend the requirement of BL 39 or of Article 11(1) of the HKBOR. On this basis, the CFA dismissed the appeal.
- 13. While a legislative provision containing the drafting formula may raise an issue of legal certainty from the human rights perspective, each provision has to be assessed individually.

Extent of problem

- 14. A legislative provision containing the drafting formula can be challenged on two grounds.
- Such a provision may fail to prescribe with sufficient particularity the elements of an offence and be ultra vires the enabling provision. In our paper to this Panel in December 2003, we set out 86 provisions whose validity might become doubtful because of the <u>Lam Geotechnics</u> case.⁶ We reproduce those provisions in Annex I. It is important to ascertain whether they fail to prescribe with sufficient particularity the elements of an offence and are ultra vires the enabling provision.

Per Lord Hope of Craighead in Sabapatehee v Mauritius [1999] 1 WLR 1836, at 1843.

As explained in that paper, some other provisions, though containing the drafting formula, do not create any uncertainty in the offence –

⁽a) provisions containing "... or otherwise to the satisfaction" of an enforcement agency;

⁽b) provisions where the enforcement agency's administration decision does not determine the question whether there is a breach of duty; and

⁽c) provisions where there is no uncertainty because of the context.

- 16. In view of the Shum Kwok Sher case, it is also important to ascertain whether the offences under those 86 provisions, as well as the 10 provisions contained in principal legislation set out in Annex II, are sufficiently certain to comply with the requirements of BL 39 and of Article 11(1) of the HKBOR. In the Lam Geotechnics case, the CFI ruled that the elements of the offence were incompletely defined in a provision containing the formula. While this ruling was made for the purpose of that case, it is unclear to what extent it will be followed in the context of the certainty of an offence as a constitutional imperative.
- 17. We have conducted a preliminary review of those 96 provisions. It appears that the elements of offence under those provisions are not clearly set out.
- 18. The same problem would arise from the legislative provisions containing such drafting formulas as "acceptable to" an enforcement agent, "in the opinion of" an enforcement agent, or if an enforcement agent "thinks fit". However, there are not many such provisions.

Review

- 19. While the Administration is inclined to conduct a review of the legislative provisions containing the formula, the Administration will consider the way forward after having regard to the view of this Panel.
- 20. Meanwhile, the Director of Public Prosecutions has alerted all prosecutors of the ruling in the <u>Lam Geotechnics</u> case. If there is evidence of an offence under a provision containing the formula (or a similar formula), the provision will be examined to decide whether or not prosecution will proceed and, where prosecution will not proceed because of concerns about the validity of the provision in question, a recommendation will be made to the bureau/department concerned to amend the provision.

Department of Justice July 2005

	Sub. Leg. (Bureau)	Provisions containing the drafting formula "to the satisfaction" of an enforcement agency	Offence
1.	Boilers and Pressure Vessels Regulations (Cap. 56A) (EMB)	12. Every pipe that conveys oil, steam or water under pressure to or from a boiler, steam receiver or steam container shall be protected to the satisfaction of the Authority against the effect of weather and damp and against external damage.	reg. 17
2.	Boilers and Pressure Vessels Regulations (Cap. 56A) (EMB)	13. Every pipe that conveys oil or steam under pressure shall be lagged to the satisfaction of the Authority with fire-proof material.	reg. 17
3.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	30. Every factory shall be enclosed, constructed, maintained and cleansed to the satisfaction of the Commissioner.	reg. 104(2)
4.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	33. All goods in a factory shall be stored to the satisfaction of the Commissioner and manufactured goods shall be stored apart from unmanufactured goods and dutiable goods shall be stored apart from duty-paid goods.	reg. 104(2)
5.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	34. In every factory the manufacturer shall, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, keep, and at least once in any day on which manufacturing is carried on in that factory make due entry of the particulars prescribed in, a stock book and a factory book which shall be in such form as the Commissioner may specify.	reg. 104(2)
6.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	38. (1) The licensed premises shall be enclosed by walls or fences to the satisfaction of the Commissioner. (4) Every part of the premises shall be illuminated to the satisfaction of the Commissioner. (5) The premises shall at all times be kept in good and substantial repair and in sanitary condition to the satisfaction of the Commissioner. (6) (a) The licensee shall provide and maintain in the premises, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, office accommodation, with all necessary furniture, writing materials, heating and cooling equipment, cleaning and lighting, and lavatory accommodation, for the use of members of the Customs and Excise Service on duty at the premises.	reg. 104(2)
7.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	40. (4) All machinery, apparatus, utensils, vessels or receptacles of every kind shall be kept in a clean and sanitary condition to the satisfaction of the Commissioner.	reg. 104(1)
8.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A)	41. The licensee shall provide and maintain upon the premises, and permit any and every member of the Customs and Excise Service to use, sufficient and just beams, scales	reg. 104(1)

	(FSTB)	or weighing machines and standard weights, gauges and measures (including glass measures graduated in millilitres for the determination of the contents of bottles, and also a cask or vessel capable of containing the contents of the largest cask or container intended to be sent out from the brewery) and other necessary and reasonable appliances to the satisfaction of the Commissioner.	
9.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	52. Every distillery shall be enclosed by walls or fences and every part thereof and every fixture therein or thereon constructed and maintained in good and substantial repair and in sanitary condition, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, and in particular –	reg. 104(1)
		(b) the distillery shall be illuminated and ventilated to the satisfaction of the Commissioner;	
		the distiller shall provide and maintain, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, clean office accommodation and all necessary furniture, writing materials, heating and cooling equipment, lighting, and lavatory accommodation, for the use of members of the Customs and Excise Service on duty at the premises and no charge shall be levied for the facilities required by this paragraph.	
10.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	55. (1) All containers and utensils for distillation and storage of liquor shall be kept clean to the satisfaction of the Commissioner.	reg. 104(2)
11.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	81. Every warehouse and every part thereof and every fixture therein or thereon shall be constructed and maintained in good and substantial repair and sanitary condition to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, and in particular – (a) the warehouse shall be illuminated and ventilated to the satisfaction of the Commissioner;	reg. 104(2)
12.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	83. (1) When required so to do by the Commissioner, the warehouse-keeper shall provide and maintain in the premises to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, office and lavatory accommodation, with heating and cooling equipment, lighting, furniture and writing materials, for the use of the members of the Customs and Excise Service on duty at the warehouse.	reg. 104(2)
13.	Dutiable Commodities Regulations (Cap. 109A) (FSTB)	84. Every warehouse-keeper, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, shall provide and maintain, in a suitable place in the warehouse – (a) adequate receptacles, accurate measures,	reg. 104(1)

		beams and scales or weighing machines, for examining, testing, sampling, bottling, blending, mixing, denaturing, repacking, grading, reconditioning and otherwise treating dutiable goods; and (b) adequate receptacles for refuse.	
14.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	59. Every person licensed to keep a public dance hall shall exhibit and keep exhibited the words "Licensed for dancing" in English and in Chinese the characters "已領有 跳舞牌照" in some conspicuous place near the door and on the outside of the premises to the satisfaction of the licensing authority.	reg. 17
15.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	71. (1) Every person licensed to keep a public dance hall shall provide and maintain on the premises to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services - (a) fire appliances adequate for the protection of the premises, at all times free from obstruction and ready for use;	reg. 17
		(2) Every person licensed to keep a public dance hall shall provide and maintain on the premises to the satisfaction of the Building Authority adequate means of escape in case of fire for all persons from every part of the premises.	
16.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	75. Every person licensed to keep a public dance hall shall provide and shall maintain in a clean and wholesome condition on the premises adequate latrine, urinal or watercloset accommodation to the satisfaction of the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene.	reg. 17
17.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	76. Every person licensed to keep a public dance hall shall provide adequate measures for ventilating, cleansing and otherwise securing hygienic conditions in the premises and shall maintain the premises in a hygienic condition to the satisfaction of the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene.	reg. 17
18.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	108. Every person licensed to keep a dancing school shall exhibit and keep exhibited "Licensed for Dancing Instruction" in English and in Chinese the characters "特許教授跳舞" in some conspicuous place near the door and on the outside of the premises to the satisfaction of the licensing authority.	reg. 17
19.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	121. (1) Every person licensed to keep a dancing school shall provide and maintain on the premises to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services - (a) fire appliances adequate for the protection of the premises, at all times free from obstruction and ready for use;	reg. 17
		(2) Every person licensed to keep a dancing school shall provide and maintain on the premises to the	

		satisfaction of the Building Authority adequate means of escape in case of fire for all persons from every part of the premises.	
20.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	125. Every person licensed to keep a dancing school shall provide and shall maintain in a clean and wholesome condition on the premises adequate latrine, urinal or water-closet accommodation to the satisfaction of the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene.	reg. 17
21.	Miscellaneous Licences Regulations (Cap. 114A) (HAB)	126. Every person licensed to keep a dancing school shall provide adequate measures for ventilating, cleansing and otherwise securing hygienic conditions in the premises and shall maintain the premises in a hygienic condition to the satisfaction of the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene.	reg. 17
22.	Funeral Parlours Regulation (Cap. 132AD) (HAB/HWFB)	7. The following provisions shall apply to every funeral parlour - (a) every part of the premises shall be adequately lighted and ventilated to the satisfaction of the Director, either by natural means or mechanical means or partly by natural means and partly by mechanical means;	s. 14(2)
23.	Funeral Parlours Regulation (Cap. 132AD) (HAB/HWFB)	12. The licensee of any funeral parlour shall, at all times, keep the premises, including all fittings, equipment, furniture, utensils and apparatus therein, in a clean and sanitary condition to the satisfaction of the Director.	s. 14(1)
24.	Offensive Trades Regulation (Cap. 132AX) (HAB/HWFB)	17 Where any part of the premises is used for sleeping purposes such part shall be partitioned off from the remainder of the premises to the satisfaction of the Director, and no part of the trade shall be carried on and no storage of raw materials or finished products shall be permitted therein.	s. 23
25.	Places of Amusement Regulation (Cap. 132BA) (HAB/HWFB)	15. The licensee shall to the satisfaction of the Director provide adequate urinal and watercloset accommodation in the licensed premises and shall maintain such accommodation in a clean and wholesome condition.	s. 19
26.	Places of Amusement Regulation (Cap. 132BA) (HAB/HWFB)	22. The licensee of a billiard establishment shall exhibit and keep exhibited- (a) the words "Licensed for billiards" in English and in Chinese the characters "已預有桌球館牌照" in some conspicuous place near the door and on the outside of the licensed premises to the satisfaction of the Director; and	s. 19

27.	Places of Amusement Regulation (Cap. 132BA) (HAB/HWFB)	24. The licensee of a public bowling-alley shall exhibit and keep exhibited the words "Licensed bowling-alley" in English and in Chinese the characters "已領有保齡球場牌照" in some conspicuous place near the door and on the outside of the licensed premises to the satisfaction of the Director.	s. 19
28.	Places of Amusement Regulation (Cap. 132BA) (HAB/HWFB)	26. The licensee of a public skating rink shall exhibit and keep exhibited the words "Licensed for skating" in English and in Chinese the characters "已領有溜冰場牌照" in some conspicuous place near the door and on the outside of the licensed premises to the satisfaction of the Director.	s. 19
29.	Public Cleansing and Prevention of Nuisances Regulation (Cap. 132BK) (HAB/HWFB)	5. (3) A notice under subsection (1) or (2) may also require the person on whom it is served - (a) to clean the area or common part of a building specified therein to the satisfaction of the public officer serving the notice within such period as may be prescribed in the notice; and (b) thereafter to keep such area or common part of a building clean to the satisfaction of the public officer serving the notice for such period not exceeding 30 days, as may be prescribed in the notice.	s. 23(1)(c)
30.	Public Cleansing and Prevention of Nuisances Regulation (Cap. 132BK) (HAB/HWFB)	19. (2) Every dustbin provided shall be (e) of a capacity not exceeding 100L and not less than 30L; and (f) generally made to the satisfaction of the Director. (4) The occupier of any premises or part of any premises in which no waste chute is provided shall- (a) at all times maintain every dustbin provided by him in good repair and in a clean condition to the satisfaction of the Director;	s. 23(1)(b)
31.	Sanitation and	7. (2) Every such sanitary pail or container shall –	s. 10(3)

32.	Slaughterhouses Regulation (Cap. 132BU) (HAB/HWFB)	26. A licensee shall install and maintain - (a) adequate lighting in the licensed slaughterhouse to the satisfaction of the Director;	s. 36
33.	Public Health (Animals and Birds)(Animal Traders) Regulations (Cap. 139B) (HAB/HWFB)	9. A licensed animal trader shall comply with the following requirements – (c) a programme for the control and destruction of insects, ectoparasites, avian and mammalian pests on the licensed premises shall be approved by, and maintained to the satisfaction of, the Director;	reg. 13(2)(b)
34.	Dairies Regulations (Cap. 139D) (EDLB)	12. (4) The following provisions shall apply to every building or other place in which cattle are kept in any dairy – (b) the floor thereof shall (iii) communicate directly, by means of an independent drain, constructed to the satisfaction of the Director, with a covered cement catch-pit.	reg. 27(4)
35.	Dairies Regulations (Cap. 139D) (EDLB)	14. The effluent from any building or other place in which cattle are kept in any dairy or which is a milk room shall at all times be disposed of to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 27(4)
36.	Dairies Regulations (Cap. 139D) (EDLB)	16. (1) Every building or other place in which cattle are kept in any dairy or to which cattle have access or which is a milk room shall be thoroughly cleansed as often as may be necessary to ensure that the same is at all times clean to the satisfaction of an inspector.	reg. 27(4)
37.	Public Health (Animals and Birds)(Exhibitions) Regulations (Cap. 139F) (EDLB)	7. Except as may reasonably be justified for the purpose of veterinary treatment, a person to whom a licence has been granted shall comply with the following requirements – (f) a programme for the control and destruction of insects, ectoparasites, avian and mammalian pests at the place at which the animals or birds are kept shall be established and maintained to the satisfaction of the Director;	reg. 9
38.	Public Health (Animals)(Boarding Establishment) Regulations	8. Except as may reasonably be justified for the purpose of veterinary treatment, a person to whom a licence has been granted shall comply with the following requirements –	reg. 9

	(Cap. 139I) (EDLB)	(f) a programme for the control and destruction of insects, ectoparasites, avian and mammalian pests at the place at which the animals are accommodated shall be established and maintained to the satisfaction of the Director;	
39.	Places of Public Entertainment Regulations (Cap. 172A) (HAB)	53. (1) Fire Service installations and equipment shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director of Fire Services.	reg. 171
40.	Places of Public Entertainment Regulations (Cap. 172A) (HAB)	87. If it is desired to instal in the auditorium or main hall any lamp or apparatus for the purposes of stage illumination, advertisement or special effects, such lamp or apparatus shall be contained in a suitable enclosure arranged to the satisfaction of the licensing authority.	reg. 171
41.	Places of Public Entertainment Regulations (Cap. 172A) (HAB)	88. Except with the consent of the licensing authority and subject to any conditions of such consent, any lamp which may be used in the auditorium for projecting advertisements, stage illumination, special effects or for any other purpose shall be contained in a suitable enclosure to the satisfaction of the licensing authority.	reg. 171
42.	Public Bus Services Regulations (Cap. 230A) (ETWB)	7. (1) A driver and conductor of a bus when acting as such shall ensure that — (e) there is displayed on the bus, to the satisfaction of the Commissioner, - (i) a statement, in English and Chinese characters, of the maximum number of seated and standing passengers authorized to be carried on the bus; (ii) the authorized fare for passengers boarding on the section of the route on which the bus is currently operating; and	reg. 25(1)
43.	Child Care Centres Regulations (Cap. 243A) (HWFB)	43. (3) First aid boxes shall be maintained fully equipped to the satisfaction of the Director at all times and so placed as to be inaccessible to the children.	reg. 46(4A)
44.	Peak Tramway (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 265A) (ETWB)	25. (1) The company shall, to the satisfaction of the Director, provide adequate equipment and facilities for the rescue of passengers in the event of an accident or emergency.	reg. 35
45.	Peak Tramway (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 265A) (ETWB)	27. (1) The company shall, to the satisfaction of the Director, provide reasonable numbers of personnel and facilities for the control and safety of persons using, or being in the vicinity of, the tramway.	reg. 35

46.	Mining (General) Regulations (Cap. 285A) (ETWB)	12. The holder of a prospecting licence shall fill in or otherwise render secure, to the satisfaction of the Superintendent of Mines, all unproductive shafts, excavations or trenches made by him in the course of prospecting.	reg. 37
47.	Mines (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 285B) (ETWB)	8. All engines, ladders, windlasses, brakes, ropes, winding gear and other mechanical appliances shall be kept in good condition and repair to the satisfaction of a mines officer.	reg. 105
48.	Mines (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 285B) (ETWB)	9. (2) Efficient safety guards shall be provided to the satisfaction of a mines officer to such parts of machinery as may in his opinion be a source of possible danger to persons.	reg. 105
49.	Mines (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 285B) (ETWB)	41. (1) The manager shall provide and maintain to the satisfaction of a mines officer such ladders or other ways as will furnish effectual means of exit or ascent of persons from any underground workings without the assistance of winding machinery.	reg. 105
50.	Mines (Safety) Regulations (Cap. 285B) (ETWB)	62. All parts of every underground working shall be properly and sufficiently ventilated to the satisfaction of a mines officer.	reg. 105
51.	Dangerous Goods (General) Regulations (Cap. 295B) (SB)	31. After the grant or renewal of any licence for the manufacture of explosives – (b) all parts of the factory, its fittings and equipment, shall be maintained in good repair to the satisfaction of the Authority.	reg. 60(7)
52.	Dangerous Goods (General) Regulations (Cap. 295B) (SB)	73. (1) No container containing liquid oxygen or liquid nitrogen shall be stored otherwise than in a place approved by the Authority and marked, to the satisfaction of the Authority, by one or more notices, in English and Chinese, indicating the storage of liquid oxygen or liquid nitrogen, as the case may be.	reg. 79(2)
53.	Dangerous Goods (General) Regulations (Cap. 295B) (SB)	78C. (1) After the grant or renewal of any licence for the storage of gas – (b) every distribution pipeline leading from the store shall be maintained at all times in good order and condition to the satisfaction of the Authority.	reg. 78C(3)
54.	Dangerous Goods (General) Regulations (Cap. 295B) (SB)	178. (1) After the grant or renewal of any licence for the storage of dangerous goods in any category – (b) the store, and its fittings and equipment, shall be maintained at all times in good order and condition to the satisfaction	reg. 178(3)

		of the Authority.	
55.	Reserved Commodities (Control of Imports, Exports and Reserve Stocks) Regulations (Cap. 296A) (CITB)	18. (3) Such stock shall be maintained in good condition to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 25(1)
56.	Air Pollution Control (Dry-Cleaning Machines) (Vapour Recovery) Regulation (Cap. 311T) (ETWB)	8. (2) The owner of a dry-cleaning laundry in which is installed a dry-cleaning machine which cannot be used by virtue of subsection (1) shall, as soon as is reasonably practicable after the machine cannot be used by virtue of that subsection but, in any case, not later than 14 days after the machine cannot be used by virtue of that subsection — (a) render the machine, or cause the machine to be rendered, permanently inoperable to the satisfaction of the Authority; or	s. 11(3)
57.	Marine Fish Culture Regulations (Cap. 353A) (EDLB)	7. A licensee or permittee shall - (a) to the satisfaction of the Director, cause the number of his licence or permit to be permanently marked in conspicuous lettering upon each raft or impoundment used by him; and	reg. 11(1)
58.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369R) (EDLB)	50. (1) Automatic control systems and an alarm system, to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority, shall be provided for all important functions including pressures, temperatures and fluid levels. The control system shall be such that through the necessary automatic arrangements the services needed for the operation of the main propulsion machinery and its auxiliaries are ensured.	reg. 80(1)
59.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369S) (EDLB)	3A. (3) Where a double bottom is required by this regulation to be fitted in a ship, its depth shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority and the inner bottom shall be continued out to the ship's sides in such a manner as to protect the bottom to the turn of the bilge.	reg. 64(1)
60.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369S) (EDLB)	5. (1) In every ship the watertight decks, trunks, tunnels, duct keels and ventilators shall be of the same strength as the watertight bulkheads at corresponding levels. The means used for making them watertight and the arrangements adopted for closing openings in them shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority. Watertight ventilators and trunks shall be watertight at least up to the freeboard deck.	reg. 64(1)
61.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship	22. (2) In every ship in which oil or gaseous fuel is used, the arrangements for the storage, distribution and	reg. 64(1)

	Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369S) (EDLB)	utilization of the fuel shall be such that, having regard to the hazard of fire and explosion which the use of such fuel may entail, the safety of the ship and of persons on board is preserved. The arrangements shall comply at least with the following provisions- (k) every oil fuel pipe shall be made of steel or other suitable material except that flexible pipes may be permitted in positions where the Certifying Authority is satisfied that they are necessary; such flexible pipes and their attachments shall be constructed to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority;	
62.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369S) (EDLB)	39. (1) An automatic control system, and an alarm system shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority for all important functions including pressures, temperatures and fluid levels. The control system shall be such that through the necessary automatic arrangements the services needed for the operation of the main propulsion machinery and its auxiliaries are ensured.	reg. 64(1)
63.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Cargo ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369S) (EDLB)	52. (1) In every ship stairways and ladderways shall be arranged so as to provide ready means of escape to the lifeboat embarkation deck from all accommodation spaces, service spaces and other spaces in which the crew are normally employed. In particular the following shall be complied with — (f) the width and continuity of the means of escape shall be to the satisfaction of the Director; (2) In all cargo spaces intended for the carriage of motor vehicles with fuel in their tanks for their own propulsion where the crew is normally employed the number and locations of escape routes to the open deck shall be to the satisfaction of the Director but shall in no case be less than two and shall be as widely separated as possible. (5) From machinery spaces other than machinery spaces of Category A, escape routes shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director having regard to the nature and location of the space and the number of persons normally	reg. 64(1)
64.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built Before 25 May 1980) Regulations (Cap. 369W) (EDLB)	48. (1) Except as provided in subregulations (2A) and (3), every tanker of Class VII(T) of 20000 tonnes deadweight or over constructed or adapted and used to carry crude oil and petroleum products having a closed fishponds not exceeding 60 degrees Clesius, the Reid vapour pressure of which is below atmospheric pressure, and other liquids having a similar fire hazard shall be provided with an inert gas system complying with Schedule 1.	reg. 75

		0.1.1		
		construe satisfa design and ma tanks flamm	nert gas system shall be designed, ucted and tested to the action of the Director. It shall be ed and operated so as to render aintain the atmosphere of the cargo including the slop tanks nonable at all times, except where anks are to be gas free; and	
		sub-su shall b Direct adequa the ir permit water audible of wat	tion to the water seal mentioned in bparagraph (i)(G) arrangements be made to the satisfaction of the or for the maintenance of an attereserve of water at all times and attegrity of the arrangements to the automatic formation of the seal when the gas flow ceases. The e and visual alarm on the low level ter in the water seal shall operate the inert gas is not being supplied;	
65.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Appliances)(Ships Built On or After 25 May 1980 but Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369X) (EDLB)	constri satisfa so des and m tanks flamm necess (s) (vii) in rela subpar be ma Direct adequa the aut when and vi water	nert gas system shall be designed, acted and tested to the action of the Director. It shall be signed and operated as to render aintain the atmosphere of the cargo including the slop tanks nonable at all times, except where it is ary for such tanks to be gas free; tion to the water seal referred to in ragraph (i)(G), arrangements shall add to the satisfaction of the or for the maintenance of an attereserve of water at all times for tomatic formation of the water seal the gas flow ceases. The audible sual alarm on the low level of the in the water seal shall operate the inert gas is not being supplied;	reg. 77
66.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Appliances)(Ships Built On or After 25 May 1980 but Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369X) (EDLB)	accord shall b to the shall require (12) The arranger freeing of empty tanks as be to the satisfaction of the accumulation of hydro	inert gas system fitted in lance with regulation 46(1A)(a) be designed, constructed and tested satisfaction of the Director and comply with the following ements of this regulation. In the Director and shall be such that be processed in a tank is minimised	reg. 77

67.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Appliances)(Ships Built On or After 25 May 1980 but Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369X) (EDLB)	51B. (1) (a) Every inert gas system fitted in accordance with regulation 46(1A)(b) shall be designed, constructed and tested to the satisfaction of the Director and shall comply with the following requirements of this regulation. (12) (a) The arrangements for inerting, purging or gas-freeing of empty tanks as required by subregulation (2) shall be made to the satisfaction of the Director and shall be such that the accumulation of flammable vapours in pockets formed by the internal structural members in a tank is minimized.	reg. 77
68.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Appliances)(Ships Built On or After 25 May 1980 but Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369X) (EDLB)	75. In every ship where a fixed fire extinguishing installation not required by these regulations is provided, such an installation shall be to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 77
69.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Appliances)(Ships Built On or After 25 May 1980 but Before 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369X) (EDLB)	11. (1) (a) In every ship of Class I an efficient patrol system shall be maintained so that any outbreak of fire may be promptly detected. In special category spaces in which the patrol is not maintained by a continuous fire watch at all times during the voyage there shall be provided in that space an automatic fire detection system complying with Schedule 12.	reg. 77
		Sch. 12 (13) In cargo spaces the system shall comply with the following additional requirements – (b) The type, number and spacing of detectors shall be to the satisfaction of the Director taking into account the conditions of ventilation and other factors prevailing in the space in which the detectors are installed.	
70.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	49. (3) (a) Every inert gas system provided in accordance with this regulation shall be designed, constructed and tested to the satisfaction of the Director. It shall be designed and operated so as to render and keep the atmosphere of the cargo tanks including the slop tanks non-flammable at all times, except where such tanks are to be gas free. (8) Where a liquid cargo (other than one of those referred to in subregulation (2)) which presents particular fire hazards is intended to be carried a means or system of	reg. 146

		fire extinguishing appropriate to the cargo to be carried shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director.	
71.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	66. In every ship where a fixed extinguishing system not required by these regulations is provided, such a system shall be to the satisfaction of the Director, shall be installed outside the space or spaces protected by such systems and shall be so arranged that a fire in the space or spaces protected will not put any such system out of action.	reg. 146
72.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	75A. (3) If the space below the helicopter deck is of a high fire risk, the insulation standard shall be to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 146
73.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	91A. (3) If the space below the helicopter deck is of a high fire risk, the insulation standard shall be to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 146
74.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	112A. (3) If the space below the helicopter deck is of a high fire risk, the insulation standard shall be to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 146
75.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	125. (1) In every ship stairways and ladderways shall be arranged so as to provide ready means of escape to the lifeboat and liferaft embarkation deck from all accommodation spaces, service spaces and other spaces in which the crew are normally employed. In particular the following shall be complied with – (f) the width and continuity of the means of escape shall be to the satisfaction of the Director; and (2) In all cargo spaces intended for the carriage of	reg. 146
		motor vehicles with fuel in their tanks for their own propulsion where the crew is normally employed the number and locations of escape routes to the open deck shall be to the satisfaction of the Director but shall in no case be less than 2 and shall be as widely separated as possible.	

		(5) From machinery spaces other than machinery spaces of Category A, escape routes shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director having regard to the nature and location of the space and the number of persons normally employed in that space.	
76.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	128A. (3) If the space below the helicopter deck is of a high fire risk, the insulation standard shall be to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 146
77.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Fire Protection)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369Y) (EDLB)	142. (1) In every ship stairways and ladderways shall be arranged so as to provide ready means of escape to the lifeboat and liferaft embarkation deck from all accommodation spaces, service spaces and other spaces in which the crew are normally employed. In particular the following shall be complied with — (f) the width and continuity of the means of escape shall be to the satisfaction of the Director; (4) From machinery spaces other than those of Category A, escape routes shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Director having regard to the nature and location of the space and the number of persons normally employed in that space.	reg. 146
78.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(Passenger Ship Construction and Survey)(Ships Built On or After 1 September 1984) Regulations (Cap. 369AM) (EDLB)	14. (1)(b) In every ship of Classes I, II and II(A) the number of openings in watertight bulkheads shall be reduced to the minimum compatible with the design and proper working of the ship and means shall be provided for closing these openings to the satisfaction of the Director.	reg. 86
79.	Merchant Shipping (Safety)(GMDSS Radio Installations) Regulations (Cap. 369AR) (EDLB)	15. (3) Adequate information to the satisfaction of the Director shall be provided on every ship to enable the equipment to be properly operated and maintained. (4) Adequate tools and spares to the satisfaction of the Director shall be provided on every ship to enable the equipment to be maintained and the Director may specify in a Merchant Shipping Notice the tools and spares to be provided on Hong Kong ships.	s. 20
80.	Road Traffic (Construction and Maintenance of Vehicles) Regulations (Cap. 374A) (ETWB)	42. (2) Every taximeter shall be so constructed that - (a) it may be sealed to the satisfaction of the Commissioner;	reg. 121(1)

81.	Road Traffic (Construction and Maintenance of Vehicles) Regulations (Cap. 374A) (ETWB)	43. (2) All cable and taximeter gear box or transducer connections shall be capable of being sealed to the satisfaction of the Commissioner.	reg. 121
82.	Road Traffic (Construction and Maintenance of Vehicles) Regulations (Cap. 374A) (ETWB)	 46. (2) Every plate referred in paragraph (1) shall comply with the provisions of Part II of the Sixth Schedule. Part II, Schedule 6 3. Subject to the provisions of regulation 46 every such plate shall be affixed to the vehicle to the satisfaction of the Commissioner. 	reg. 121
83.	Merchant Shipping (Prevention of Oil Pollution) Regulations (Cap. 413A) (EDLB)	14. (3) Subject to paragraph (4) of this regulation – (b) ships of less than 400 GRT (other than an oil tanker) shall be equipped so far as practicable and reasonable, (in the case of Hong Kong ships to the satisfaction of the Director), with installations to ensure the storage of oil or oily mixtures on board and their discharge to reception facilities, or to ensure the discharge of such mixtures is in accordance with regulation 12.	reg. 37(2)
84.	Merchant Shipping (Prevention of Oil Pollution) Regulations (Cap. 413A) (EDLB)	 20. (2) The arrangements and operational procedures for dedicated clean ballast tanks shall comply with the requirements of Schedule 6 hereto. Sch. 6 4.1.2 The selection of the dedicated clean ballast tanks shall be such that the hull stresses in the ballast and loaded conditions are to the satisfaction of a Certifying Authority. 	reg. 37(1)
85.	Merchant Shipping (Prevention of Oil Pollution) Regulations (Cap. 413A) (EDLB)	 21. (2) The crude oil washing installation and associated equipment and arrangements (including qualification of personnel) shall comply with the requirements and specifications set out in Schedule 7 hereto. Sch. 7 4.2.3 Tank washing machines shall be mounted in each cargo tank and the method of support shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority. Where the tank washing machines are positioned well below the deck level to cater for protuberances in the tank, consideration may need to be given to additional support for the machine and its supply piping. 4.2.6 The number and location of the tank washing 	reg. 37(1)
		machines shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority. 4.4.1 The design of the system for stripping crude oil	

		from the bottom of every cargo tank shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority. 5.1 The training requirements of ships' personnel engaged in the crude oil washing of tankers shall be to the satisfaction of the Director. 7. The Operations and Equipment Manual shall be to the satisfaction of the Certifying Authority and shall contain the following information and operational instructions- (a) The complete text of the Specifications for the Design, Operation and Control of Crude Oil Washing Systems as set out in this Schedule.	
86.	Entertainment Special Effects (General) Regulation (Cap. 560A) (CITB)	32. (1) In addition to any other conditions specified in a store licence, the holder of a store licence shall ensure that- (a) the store and its fittings and equipment are maintained at all times in good order to the satisfaction of the Authority;	s. 32(2) & (3)

	Ordinance (Bureau)	Provision containing ''to the satisfaction of''	Offence (Penalty)
1.	Insurance Companies Ordinance (Cap. 41) (FSTB)	 35. (1) Subject to section 26(5), the Insurance Authority may require an insurer to take such action in respect of its affairs, business or property as the Insurance Authority considers appropriate. 35A. (1) Without limiting the generality of section 35(1), a requirement imposed under that section on an insurer may include a requirement that the insurer - (b) shall place in the custody of the Insurance Authority, on a date not later than the date specified in that requirement, a receipt, or 	41(1)(a) (max term: 2 yr; max fine: \$200,000)
		other document, that evidences, to the satisfaction of the Insurance Authority, that the deposit referred to in paragraph (a) has been made;	
2.	Boilers and Pressure Vessels Ordinance (Cap. 56) (EMB)	13. The owner of a new boiler or pressure vessel, other than a pressurized fuel container, shall, not less than 30 days before the day on which he intends to put the boiler or pressure vessel into use, deliver to the Authority - (b) documentary evidence, to the satisfaction of the Authority, that the boiler or pressure vessel complies with a recognized engineering standard or code in respect of - (i) the welders employed and welding procedures used in the construction and erection of and, if repairs have been carried out, in the repairs to, the boiler or pressure vessel;	s. 50(1) (max fine: \$10,000)
3.	Boilers and Pressure Vessels Ordinance (Cap. 56) (EMB)	14. The owner of a new steam container shall, not less than 30 days preceding the day on which he intends to put the same into use, deliver to the Authority in respect thereof — (b) 2 copies of a plan thereof prepared, to the satisfaction of the Authority, by a boiler inspector.	s. 50(2) (max fine: \$10,000)
4.	Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) (HPLB)	24A. (1) Where any building works or street works have been or are being, carried out in such a manner as, in the opinion of the Building Authority, will cause, or will be likely to cause, a risk of injury to any person or damage to any property, the Building Authority may, by order in writing, require that such work as he may specify therein be carried out, to ensure that the works will cease to constitute such a risk. (2) An order made under subsection (1) - (a) may specify -	s. 40(1B) (max term: 1 yr; max fine: \$50,000)

		(iii) that the work shall be carried out with due diligence to the satisfaction of the Building Authority; and	
5.	Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) (HPLB)	28A. (3) Any approval by the Building Authority of plans showing the relevant works shall include a requirement to maintain the relevant works to the satisfaction of the Building Authority for any period specified in the requirement; and section 28B shall apply in relation to the maintenance of the relevant works as it applies in relation to the carrying out of the works.	s. 40(3A) (max term: 1 yr; max fine: \$50,000)
6.	Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap. 132) (HAB/HWFB)	14. (1) If the Authority is of the opinion that any premises or any part of any premises are in such a state as to be - (a) a nuisance; or (b) injurious or dangerous to health, or are in such a state as to affect injuriously or disfigure the amenities of any place or locality, the Authority may cause a notice to be served upon the owner or occupier of the premises requiring him to limewash, paint, cleanse, disinfect or disinfest such premises or any part thereof to the satisfaction of the Authority within such period as may be specified in the notice.	s. 14(2) (pay the expenses)
7.	Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap. 132) (HAB/HWFB)	20. (2) A notice under subsection (1) shall require the person on whom it is served to remove the litter or waste, and may require him also to clean to the satisfaction of the Authority the area in which the litter or waste is found, within such period, not being less than 24 hours after the service of the notice, as may be specified therein.	s. 20(3) (pay the expenses)
8.	Aerial Ropeways (Safety) Ordinance (Cap. 211) (HPLB)	20. (1) The owner of an aerial ropeway shall, to the satisfaction of the Director, provide personnel and facilities for the control and safety of persons using, or being in the vicinity of, the ropeway.	s. 27(1) (max term: 6 mth; max fine: \$10,000)
9.	Waste Disposal Ordinance (Cap. 354) (ETWB)	20F. (1) Where a person is convicted of an offence under section 20E in respect of the import or export of any waste, the waste disposal authority may – (b) by notice in writing require the convicted person, within a specified time - (i) in the case of a conviction in respect of the import of waste, to return the waste to the state of export, or to dispose of the waste in Hong Kong to the satisfaction of the waste disposal authority;	S. 20F(2) (max term: 6 mth; max fine: \$200,000)
10.	Mass Transit Railway Ordinance (Cap. 556) (ETWB)	11. (1) The Corporation shall keep, to the satisfaction of the Secretary, records in respect of the following matters relating to the railway - (a) the number and carrying capacity of trains in use or under maintenance;	s. 11(4) (max fine: \$25,000)