

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1124/04-05
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PL/ES/1

**Panel on Economic Services and
Panel on Planning, Lands and Works**

**Minutes of joint meeting held on
Monday, 28 February 2005, at 10:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Members of the Panel on Economic Services

Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP (Chairman)
* Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP
Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Hon TAM Heung-man

Members of the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works

Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

(* Also members of the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works)

Members absent : Members of the Panel on Economic Services

* Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, JP
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Members of the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works

Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

(* Also members of the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works)

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item II

Mr Stephen IP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Ms Sandra LEE
Permanent Secretary for Economic Development and
Labour (Economic Development)

Mr Wilson FUNG
Deputy Secretary for Economic Development and Labour
(Economic Development)

Mr Darryl CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Economic Development
and Labour (Economic Development)

Mr Thomas TSO
Deputy Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands
(Planning and Lands) 1

Ms Christine TSE
Acting District Planning Officer (Hong Kong)
Planning Department

Mr MA Lee-tak
Project Manager (HK Island & Islands)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Miss CHEUNG Siu-hing
Deputy Secretary for Security

Captain West WU
Senior Pilot
Government Flying Services

Mr LEUNG Yu-keung
Deputy Director-General of Civil Aviation

Clerk in attendance : Mr Andy LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Senior Council Secretary (1)9

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Election of Chairman

Mr James TIEN was elected Chairman for the meeting.

II Motion on development of heliport facilities in Hong Kong

(LC Paper No. CB(1)990/04-05(01)&(02) - The original motion moved by Hon Howard YOUNG and the amendments moved by Hon CHAN Wai-yip, Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon CHOY So-yuk (updated version)

LC Paper No. CB(1)990/04-05(03) - Procedure to be followed for handling the motion and amendments on "Development of heliport facilities in Hong Kong"

LC Paper No. CB(1)968/04-05(03) - Information paper on "Proposed shared-use of the Government heliport at the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre with commercial operators" provided by the Administration

Action

- | | |
|--|---|
| LC Paper No. CB(1)968/04-05(04) | - Letter from Hon WONG Kwok-hing |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)980/04-05(01)&(02) | - Submissions dated 18 February 2005 from Hong Kong Regional Heliport |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)769/04-05(04) | - Information paper provided by the Administration for the joint meeting on 31 January 2005 |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)769/04-05(05) | - Supplementary information on movement statistics of the Government Flying Service at Central Heliport/Wanchai Temporary Heliport provided by the Administration |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)770/04-05 | - Background brief on the proposed development of a domestic heliport in Sheung Wan prepared by the Secretariat |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)376/04-05(04) | - Information paper provided by the Administration for the meeting of the Panel on Economic Services on 7 December 2004 |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)769/04-05(01) | - Submission from Hong Kong Express Airways Limited |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)769/04-05(02) | - Submission from The Hong Kong Regional Heliport Working Group |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)791/04-05(03) | - Further submission from The Hong Kong Regional Heliport Working Group |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)769/04-05(03) | - Submission from Designing Hong Kong Harbour District |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)399/04-05(01) | - Submission from Central and Western District Council |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)791/04-05(02) | - Submission from Wan Chai District Council |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)791/04-05(01) | - Submission from Hong Kong General Chamber of Commerce |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)802/04-05(01) | - Submission from The British Chamber of Commerce in Hong Kong |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)416/04-05(01) | - Submission from Sir Elly Kadoorie & Sons Limited |
| LC Paper No. CB(1)581/04-05(01) to (05) and LC Paper No. | Correspondence between the Administration and Sir Elly |

Action

CB(1)442/04-05(01) & (02)

Kadoorie & Sons Limited on
the proposed domestic heliport
development)

2. Members noted the following papers tabled at the meeting –

(a) submission dated 25 February 2005 from Citizen Envisioning @ Harbour; and

(b) the Administration's reply to the letter from Hong Kong Regional Heliport Working Group.

(Post-meeting note: The above papers were issued vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1038/04-05 on 2 March 2005.)

3. The Chairman recapitulated that at the last joint Panel meeting on 31 January 2005, the Panels had received views from various interested parties on the development of heliport facilities in Hong Kong. After much deliberation, Mr Howard YOUNG had moved a motion on the matter. Thereafter, Mr Albert CHAN, Ir Dr Raymond HO and Mr CHAN Kam-lam had separately verbally proposed amendments to Mr YOUNG's motion. Miss CHOY So-yuk had also verbally proposed an amendment to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's proposed amendment. After all members who wished to speak had spoken and the Administration had given its response, the meeting had already overrun for 15 minutes. As such, there was not sufficient time to deal with Mr YOUNG's motion and the amendments. Members then had agreed to deal with the motion and amendments at another joint meeting to be held this morning.

4. The Chairman further said that subsequent to the last meeting, the Clerk had sought confirmation from the above members on the wordings of their motion and amendments, which were now set out in LC Papers Nos. CB(1)990/04-05(01)&(02). He then briefed members on the suggested procedure for dealing with the motion and amendments as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)990/04-05(03). Members agreed to the suggested procedure.

5. The Chairman referred members to the letter from Mr CHAN Kam-lam tabled at the meeting. In the letter, Mr CHAN indicated that he would not be able to attend this meeting. If either Mr Albert CHAN's amendment or Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment was passed, he would withdraw his amendment. If neither Mr Albert CHAN's amendment nor Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment was passed, Mr WONG Ting-kwong would move his amendment on his behalf.

6. Mr Howard YOUNG said that he would not repeat his view points which had been clearly expressed at the last joint panel meeting on 31 January 2005. He however indicated his objection to Mr Albert CHAN's amendment and support for Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment.

Action

7. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that at the meeting between Legislative Council Members and Islands District Council (IDC) members on 3 February 2005, IDC members had expressed grave concern about the proposal of allowing commercial helicopter services operators to use the planned permanent helipad for the Government Flying Services (GFS) outside the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre (HKCEC). Highlighting that residents on outlying islands relied heavily on the emergency services of GFS to meet their emergency needs, Mr WONG relayed the concern of IDC that the shared-use arrangement might adversely affect the emergency operations of GFS. Mr WONG further said that IDC however also indicated that if it could be confirmed by the Administration that arrangements could be made to ensure that the emergency operations for the residents on outlying islands would always be accorded priority over commercial services under the shared-use arrangement, then IDC would not object to the shared-use arrangement.

8. The Deputy Secretary for Security said that the overriding principle was that the efficiency and effectiveness of emergency and essential Government flying services would not be adversely affected. Noting that at the previous meeting the possibility of sharing the proposed Government helipad at the HKCEC site with commercial operators without reclamation had been floated, the Security Bureau had issued an information note setting out the relevant considerations in examining the feasibility and desirability of making the proposed helipad at the HKCEC available for both Government and commercial operators. It should be noted that without reclamation, only one single take-off/landing pad would be provided at the HKCEC helipad. From the security point of view, the shared-use of a single take-off/landing pad would likely give rise to practical problems. In fact, at the then Central Heliport where there were two landing/take-off pads and that the number of commercial helicopter flights was subject to restrictions, there had been instances where Government's operations had been delayed due to the need to wait for private helicopters to clear out from the landing pad. As the emergency and essential Government flying services had direct impact on the public's safety, the Administration held the view that the shared-use option would only be regarded as feasible if it could be established that the conditions as set out in paragraph 6 of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)968/04-05(03)) could be met. At the present stage, the Administration had not made an in-depth assessment of the practicability of the shared-use option, and would like to highlight those crucial considerations to facilitate members' deliberation on the matter.

9. The Chairman suggested that the Administration also briefed IDC on the matter.

10. Mr Ronny TONG recalled that at the last meeting, the majority of members agreed that GFS and commercial helicopter services should be accommodated at one heliport as far as possible. The remaining issue was harbour reclamation that might be required for the provision of a heliport for shared use. He noted that recently, the Administration had affirmed its stance on the necessity to build the Central Wanchai Bypass (CWB). He asked that in the event harbour reclamation at Wan Chai was approved to provide land for the construction of CWB, how such reclamation would

Action

affect the proposed heliport development at the HKCEC site.

11. The Deputy Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)¹ replied that the progress of the comprehensive planning and engineering review of Wan Chai Development Phase II (WDII) was underway, and the Administration at this stage did not have a confirmed proposal on how the construction of CWB would be accommodated under the WDII project. In any event, the Administration must ensure that any harbour reclamation would be in full compliance with the requirements of the Protection of the Harbour Ordinance (Cap. 531) and the judgment of the Court of Final Appeal of 9 January 2004 on reclamation. As such, only minimum harbour reclamation would be undertaken and on this basis, any reclamation under WDII was most unlikely to extend to the site outside HKCEC designated for a Government heliport.

12. The Panels then proceeded to deal with the motion and amendments regarding the proposed heliport facilities in Hong Kong.

13. Mr Howard YOUNG moved his motion.

14. Mr Albert CHAN said that he had reconsidered his amendment to Mr YOUNG's motion, and had decided to withdraw his amendment. He explained that he basically supported the proposal of developing a heliport at the HKCEC site for shared use by GFS and commercial helicopter service operators. As the plan for harbour reclamation for the construction of CWB was still in a state of flux, and there was the possibility of co-ordinating the design of the HKCEC heliport with that of the reclamation for CWB, he considered it preferable to allow greater flexibility for the heliport development.

15. As Mr Albert CHAN had withdrawn his amendment, Ir Dr Raymond HO then moved his amendment. The Chairman put Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment to vote. As a majority of the members voting voted for the amendment, the Chairman declared that Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment was passed.

16. As Mr CHAN Kam-lam had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment if either Mr Albert CHAN's amendment or Ir Dr Raymond HO's amendment was passed, the Chairman then put Mr Howard YOUNG's motion as amended by Ir Dr Raymond HO to vote. As a majority of the members voting voted for the motion, the Chairman declared that Mr YOUNG's motion as amended by Dr HO was passed. The wording of the motion was as follows:

“經濟事務委員會及規劃地政及工程事務委員會促請政府加快在港島商業市中心內提供永久的商用直升機場及設施，並在不違法填海的原則下容許商業直升機公司與政府共用香港會議展覽中心的直升機場。”

Action

English translation

“That, the Panel on Economic Services and the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works urge the Government to expedite the provision of a permanent commercial heliport and associated facilities in the central business district of the Hong Kong Island, and, under the principle of no unlawful reclamation, allow the heliport at the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre to accommodate both commercial uses by helicopter operators and government uses.”

III Any other business

17. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:45 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
17 March 2005