

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)787/04-05

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/HA

Panel on Home Affairs

**Minutes of special meeting
held on Monday, 3 January 2005 at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP (Chairman)
Hon TAM Heung-man (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

Members absent : Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBS, JP
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

Public Officers attending : Mr Stephen FISHER
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (1)

Ms Esther LEUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (1)

Ms Fony LUI
Senior Executive Officer (1)4, Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Y S LEE
Chief Project Manager, Architectural Services Department

Attendance by invitation : Commission on Youth

Dr Philemon CHOI
Chairman

IBM Business Consulting Services

Mr Bruce WILLIAMSON
Consultant

Ms Michelle KAM
Consultant

Session A

Baptist Oi Kwan Social Service

Dr Zarina LAM
Chief Executive Officer

Mrs Eltha WONG
Deputy Chief Executive Officer

Zion Social Service Ltd

Mr CHAN Chi-wah
Social Work Assistant

Miss WONG Man-lam
Assistant Social Work Officer

Hong Kong Air Cadet Corps

Mr Wilson CHAN
Staff Officer

Hong Kong Family Welfare Society

Mrs Cecilia KWAN
Executive Director

Youth Outreach

Father Peter NEWBERY
Executive Director

YMCA of Hong Kong

Mr Chuck ALLISON
Executive Director

Dr Alice YUK
General Manager

Junior Chamber International Hong Kong

Mr Kamsuo WONG
National Community Concern Group Member

St. James' Settlement

Mr Cooke CHEUNG
Senior Manager

Mr Alan LAU
Centre Manager

Methodist Centre

Mr YUNG Kin-lam
Service Coordinator

Breakthrough Ltd

Ms Eileen MOK
Manager

Dr LEUNG Wing-tai
General Secretary

Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd

Mr Samuel YUNG Wing-ki
Chairman

Mr Jimmy C H WONG
Treasurer

The Hong Kong Award for Young People

Mr LAI Pui-wing
Chief Executive Officer

Mr Peter YEUNG
Executive Officer

City University of Hong Kong

Dr T Wing LO
Associate Professor, Department of Applied Social Studies

Session B

The Salvation Army Chai Wan Integrated Service for
Young People

Mr CHEUNG Ho-yeung
Member

Miss CHAU Ngan-ching
Service Supervisor, The Salvation Army Hong Kong
Island East

Hong Kong Youth Association

Mr TONG Wai-yuen
Deputy Secretary General

Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr Charles CHAN
Chairperson, Specialised Committee on Children & Youth

Ms Angela NG
Chief Officer (Children & Youth)

Lions Clubs International District 303 Hong Kong & Macau

Mr Tony T N CHAN
Immediate Past District Governor & Chairman, Hong
Kong & Macau Lions Foundation

Christian Family Service Centre

Ms NG Kwok-tung
Senior Programme Director

Mr Charles NG
Programme Director

Eastern District Council

Mr CHAO Shing-kie
Eastern District Councilor

Mr KUNG Pak-cheung
Eastern District Councilor

Caritas – Hong Kong

Mr Anthony CHENG Chi-keung
Member

Hong Kong Christian Service

Ms Winnie YING
Principal Coordinator

Alliance of Hong Kong Youth Groups

Mr CHAN Tak-ming
Chairman

Mr SZE Lun-hung
Vice-General Secretary

Hong Kong Youths Unified Association

Mr Vincent LEUNG Wai
Secretary

Hok Yau Club

Mr HUI Kwai-ming
Vice-Chairman

Mr CHUI Yat-hung
Director, Student Guidance Centre

Youth Development Concern Group of Eastern District

Mr CHU Wai-joe
Advisor

Mr HO Man-tat
Member

Po Leung Kuk

Ms YUE Mui-ying
Principal Social Services Secretary

Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong

Mr CHUNG Shu-kun
The Chairman of Hong Kong Island East

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan
The Chairman of Young DAB

Clerk in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Miss Sherman WOO
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

I. The Centre for Youth Development Project
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)342/04-05(01)-(02) and CB(2)555/04-05(03)]

The Chairman welcomed the representatives of the deputations and of the Administration to attend the meeting. The Chairman said that due to the large number of deputations attending the meeting and the limited seating capacity of the venue, the meeting comprised two sessions, with 13 deputations attending session A and 14 deputations attending session B. The Chairman further said that the Administration would be invited to give an overall response to the views expressed by all the deputations at the end of session B.

Action

Briefing on the latest developments and fundamental principles

2. Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (1) (DSHA(1)) informed members that the validity of the tender for the superstructure works of the Centre for Youth Development (CYD) project had been extended to 2 March 2005.
3. DSHA(1) highlighted the following features of the Administration's current proposal on the CYD project –
 - (a) The objective of the CYD remained the same as that stated in the proposal approved by the Finance Committee (FC) in 2001, i.e. to serve as the focal point for territory-wide youth development activities and provide support to all non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and youth groups in promoting youth development.
 - (b) In 2001, FC approved the funding application for the CYD project on the understanding that no recurrent financial resources would be required as the project could operate on a self-financing basis during the initial 10-year period, and that sufficient operating profits could be accumulated for future maintenance. Moreover, the Government would retain the ownership over the site of the CYD and over the CYD building. The current proposal was still following these fundamental principles.
 - (c) The current proposal was to adopt a Public Private Partnership (PPP) approach for the CYD in the form of a single Operation and Maintenance (O&M) contract. In adopting the proposed PPP model, the Administration would spell out detailed specifications of youth development programmes and other requirements as service requirements for the purpose of the open tendering exercise for the single O&M contract of the CYD. For example, the Administration would specify in the contract that a director for youth development would be appointed and his/her appointment would have to be endorsed by the Government or the relevant management committee. Various provisions would also be included in the O&M contract to ensure compliance with the youth development objectives of the CYD and to monitor the operator's performance.

Action

Meeting with deputations
Session A

Baptist Oi Kwan Social Service

4. Dr Zarina LAM and Mrs Eltha WONG said that Baptist Oi Kwan Social Service supported the CYD project but was concerned whether the CYD would be able to operate on a self-financing basis.

Zion Social Service Ltd
[LC Paper No. CB(2)612/04-05(01)]

5. Mr CHAN Chi-wah presented the views of Zion Social Service as detailed in its submission. Mr CHAN said that Zion Social Service supported implementing the CYD project. However, it was concerned whether the CYD would be able to operate on a self-financing basis and suggested that the proposed mode of operation and management should be further looked at. Zion Social Service was also concerned whether the remote location of the CYD would make it difficult to serve as a focal point for territory-wide youth development activities.

Hong Kong Family Welfare Society
[LC Paper No. CB(2)612/04-05(02)]

6. Mrs Cecilia KWAN presented the views of Hong Kong Family Welfare Society as detailed in its submission. Mrs KWAN said that Hong Kong Family Welfare Society considered that the CYD would be an important project in fostering youth development in Hong Kong and every possible measure should be taken by the Government to ensure compliance with the youth development objectives of the CYD in the future.

Youth Outreach

7. Father Peter NEWBERY said that he was confident that the CYD would be able to operate on a self-financing basis if it was operated by a private enterprise experienced in the relevant fields. He suggested that the facilities of the CYD should serve to achieve a distinctive objective related to youth development.

YMCA of Hong Kong

8. Dr Alice YUK said that it was possible for the CYD to operate on a self-financing basis. She suggested that the proposed initial contract term should be lengthened to nine years or more, and that the Government should review the proposed restrictions to be imposed on the future operator of the CYD, which seemed too many to her and might curtail the operator's flexibility.

Action

Junior Chamber International Hong Kong

9. Mr Kamsuo WONG said that Junior Chamber International Hong Kong supported implementing the CYD project but was concerned about the co-ordination between the operator and the potential users of the CYD, the mechanism to be put in place to monitor the performance of the operator and whether the programmes organised in the CYD would be able to meet the changing youth needs.

Methodist Centre

[LC Paper No. CB(2)573/04-05(01)]

10. Mr YUNG Kin-lam presented the views of Methodist Centre as detailed in its submission. Mr YUNG said that Methodist Centre supported implementing the CYD project, which should organise more international youth exchanges in the future.

St. James' Settlement

11. Mr Cooke CHEUNG said that St. James' Settlement supported implementing the CYD project. It suggested that the Government should widely consult the potential users and youngsters on the facilities to be included in the CYD and ensure that diversified youth development programmes would be provided to meet divergent needs. Mr CHEUNG further said that St. James' Settlement, however, did not see adequate information was provided by the Administration to show that the proposed PPP approach was the most suitable one for the CYD.

Breakthrough Ltd

12. Dr LEUNG Wing-tai said that Breakthrough Ltd supported implementing the CYD project to enhance the quality of youth development services in Hong Kong.

Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd

13. Mr Samuel YUNG said that Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd supported implementing the CYD project and the proposed mode of operation and management for the CYD to ensure that it could operate on a self-financing basis.

The Hong Kong Award for Young People

[LC Paper No. CB(2)573/04-05(02)]

14. Mr LAI Pui-wing said that the Hong Kong Award for Young People supported implementing the CYD project, which would hopefully serve as a

Action

platform for Hong Kong young people to participate in international activities. Mr LAI further said in adopting the proposed PPP approach, the Government should assume an overall coordinating role in taking forward youth development work instead of relying on the future single contractor of the CYD in pursuing such work.

City University of Hong Kong

15. Dr T Wing LO said that City University of Hong Kong supported implementing the CYD project. He pointed out that it was an important project as the CYD would enhance youth development work in Hong Kong by assuming a leadership role and providing support, resources and necessary networking.

Hong Kong Air Cadet Corps

16. Mr Wilson CHAN said that he had nothing to add.

Discussion

17. Mr Albert HO considered that the CYD should best be managed and operated by a non-profit making youth organisation which had participated in youth development work on a long-term basis, in order to ensure fulfillment of the youth development objectives of the CYD and that different NGOs/youth groups would have equal opportunities in using the facilities in the CYD for youth development activities. Noting that some of the deputations attending the meeting also had experience in operating cafeterias/hostels, Mr HO asked whether they would be interested in forming themselves into partnership to bid for the single O&M contract of the CYD.

18. Mr Chuck ALLISON of YMCA of Hong Kong responded that it would require tremendous commitment to run the CYD and at present, his organisation probably had no intention to bid for the contract. He said that the proposed PPP approach was not a bad idea and should be able to achieve financial sustainability for the CYD.

19. Mr LAI Pui-wing of the Hong Kong Award for Young People said that he was worried that a commercial operator might lack a vision in youth development work. He considered that Mr Albert HO's suggestion should be further explored.

20. Dr LEUNG Wing-tai of Breakthrough Ltd said that while the collaborative model suggested by Mr Albert HO could be further explored, he was concerned that there would be problems in the coordination among the different NGOs forming the partnership under such a model. He pointed out that some commercial organisations also had a sense of social commitment and

Action

a vision in youth development work and it would not necessarily be unsuccessful if the CYD was operated by a private company based on market-led principles.

21. Mrs Cecilia KWAN of Hong Kong Family Welfare Society said that the sector was supportive of the CYD project but it lacked time to look at it in detail. She agreed that the operator of the CYD had to be one with strong commitment in youth development work and the proposed collaborative model should be further discussed by the sector. Mrs KWAN considered that the Administration should allow more time for the sector to pursue the idea.

22. Father Peter NEWBERY of Youth Outreach said that he expected that in order to ensure that the facilities in the CYD would operate on a self-financing basis, any NGO appointed to operate the CYD would probably contract out the management and operation of its facilities to organisations which had commercial experience in running such business. He was worried that there might be a duplication of efforts if an NGO was assigned to operate the CYD. He added that if the Administration decided to have the CYD run by NGOs, it would be better to have the CYD run by one NGO only in order to avoid problems of coordination.

23. Dr Alice YUK of YMCA of Hong Kong said that she would prefer to have a non-profit making social service organisation rather than a commercial operator to run the CYD, as the former would have a clearer vision in youth development work than the latter. Moreover, it should not be assumed that social service organisations had no knowledge in marketing and management experience. Dr YUK further said that while the responsible social service organisation would take on full responsibility for the management and operation of CYD, it could engage relevant professional bodies in providing management and operation services only for certain facilities of the CYD, such as the youth hostel/cafeteria.

24. Mr Albert HO pointed out that as profit making would be the priority for a private company, he was concerned whether the current proposal to outsource the management and operation of the CYD to a private company would lead to commercialised operations of the CYD. Mr HO suggested that consideration should be given to removing the requirement that the CYD would have to operate on a self-financing basis so that the Administration could have more flexibility in exploring alternative modes of management and operation of the CYD and some NGOs might be willing to operate the CYD.

25. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that the sector was most concerned about whether the CYD would turn out to be a white elephant with a low utilisation rate or fail to achieve the original youth development objectives, and whether its use would be monopolised by certain NGOs and youth organisations and the principle of fair participation of diversified youth service providers would be

Action

compromised. Dr CHEUNG shared Mr HO's view that the requirement that the CYD would have to operate on a self-financing basis was the greatest constraint. Dr CHEUNG said that he did not see there was consensus among the deputations on the appropriate mode of management and operation for the CYD and on the facilities to be included in it. Dr CHEUNG also expressed concern that the proposed O&M mode with a single contract did not provide sufficient channels for young people to take part in the development of the CYD. Dr CHEUNG suggested that the sector should be given six more months to discuss the subject and provide further views to the Administration for consideration.

26. Dr Philemon CHOI of the Commission on Youth (COY) said that even if the construction of the superstructure works for the CYD could be resumed as soon as possible, it would not be completed until early 2007. Dr CHOI further said that there was no need to put on hold the project for the purpose of conducting public consultation, as the Administration and COY could still further consult NGOs and youth organisations on the project in the next two years when the CYD was being built. Dr CHOI pointed out that any further delays could incur additional construction costs.

27. Dr Philemon CHOI further said that the CYD was not to cater for local service needs (which were being met by existing youth service centres) but should mainly seek to provide international and cross-border youth exchanges programmes. Dr CHOI further said that the CYD would also provide venues for the operation of the youth forums under the COY. Dr CHOI stressed that COY would still be responsible for advising on the strategy, objectives and management of the CYD under the proposed PPP model, and COY would ensure the participation of young people and frontline social workers in discussions on the content and requirements of the youth development programmes to be organised in the CYD. Dr CHOI said that many organisations had expressed interest in contributing to the youth development programmes in the CYD, and the operator would have to cooperate with the specified partner organisations for the purpose of running the youth development programmes under specified range of themes.

28. Mr Albert CHAN said that he had voted against the funding proposal on the CYD project when it was scrutinised by FC in 2001 because he considered that the location of the CYD was wrongly chosen. Mr CHAN pointed out that for such a large-scale international youth development centre, it was wrong to have it located in Chai Wan which was remote from the urban area. Mr CHAN further said that it would take about three hours for a person who lived in Sheung Shui, Tin Shui Wai or Yuen Long to go to the CYD just for attending one activity there. Mr CHAN considered that given its remote location, the CYD could not serve as a focal point for territory-wide youth development activities. Mr CHAN suggested that consideration should be given to scrapping the project and identifying another suitable location for the CYD.

Action

He invited views from deputations on his suggestion.

29. Dr T Wing LO of the City University of Hong Kong said that it was more important to ensure that the CYD was managed and operated by people fully committed to its youth development work than to ensure the suitability of its physical location only. Dr LO further said that although the proposed location in Chai Wan was a bit remote, it was at least located next to the MTR Station and there were no vice activities in the vicinity. He supported the currently proposed PPP approach to be adopted for the project to resolve the anticipated financial problem of the centre. Mr Samuel YUNG of Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd agreed that the location should not pose a very great problem, given that the CYD was mainly to organise international youth exchanges and, with rapid infrastructural development in Hong Kong, its accessibility would be further improved. Mr YUNG further said that while he preferred the CYD to be managed and operated by NGOs, he had no objection to the Government collaborating with the private sector in taking the CYD project forward.

30. Mr Albert CHAN pointed out that when FC approved the funding proposal on the CYD project, it was clearly stated in the proposal that the objective of the CYD was to serve as the focal point for territory-wide youth development activities and its facilities were for use by Hong Kong young people. Mr CHAN said that what he had heard at the meeting seemed to suggest that the CYD had changed to be mainly for organising international exchange programmes. He considered that this point was very important and had to be clarified.

31. Dr Alice YUK of YMCA of Hong Kong shared Mr Albert CHAN's concern. She further suggested that, given the availability of many high quality youth centres and civic centre facilities throughout the territory, the Administration should consider scrapping the CYD project and selling the site, and the funding so saved could be re-deployed to setting up a fund to finance youth services. She believed that this would be more cost-effective in enhancing youth development than building the CYD.

32. Miss CHOY So-yuk asked whether non-subvented youth organisations had been consulted on the CYD project. Dr Philemon CHOI responded that the COY had consulted many local organisations, including the non-subvented ones and students' organisations. He added that the COY had tried to extend the coverage of the consultation exercise as far as possible. Miss CHOY said that as far as she knew, many non-subvented youth organisations had not been consulted, and they had expected that the CYD would provide them with affordable facilities for youth development activities instead of focusing on international exchange programmes. The Chairman suggested that Miss CHOY could provide information on those non-subvented youth organisations which had not been consulted to the Administration for follow-up.

Action

Meeting with deputations
Session B

The Salvation Army Chai Wan Integrated Service for Young People

33. Mr CHEUNG Ho-yeung said that the Salvation Army Chai Wan Integrated Service for Young People was of the view that priority should be given to ensuring quality of the youth development programmes of the CYD, instead of only ensuring financial sustainability of the centre. Mr CHEUNG further said that the CYD should aim at facilitating the international exposure of young people and should provide visual audio facilities, such as teleconferencing facilities, facilities for production of television programmes, Internet conferencing, etc. which were not available at ordinary youth centres. Mr CHEUNG also questioned the market positioning of the shops proposed to be set up in the CYD, given its location and the fact that there were already three shopping malls in the vicinity of the centre. Mr CHEUNG added that representatives of young people should play a role in the supervision of the operation of the CYD and that more information should be provided on the criteria of the selection of the single contractor.

Hong Kong Youth Association
[LC Paper No. CB(2)612/04-05(03)]

34. Mr TONG Wai-yuan presented the views of Hong Kong Youth Association as detailed in its submission. Mr TONG said that Hong Kong Youth Association supported implementing the CYD project and urged the Government to ensure that the CYD would be able to cater for the needs of both subvented and non-subvented youth groups and to widely consult the public on youth development policies. Moreover, a mechanism with the participation of representatives from NGOs should be put in place to monitor the management and development of the CYD.

Lions Clubs International District 303 Hong Kong & Macau

35. Mr Tony CHAN said that Lions Clubs International District 303 Hong Kong & Macau supported in principle the implementation of the CYD project and the adoption of the proposed PPP approach for delivery of the project. Mr CHAN said that consideration should be given to enhancing the value of the CYD building by improving its accessibility and offering longer contract term to the operator.

Hong Kong Council of Social Service
[LC Paper No. CB(2)555/04-05(01)]

36. Mr Charles CHAN presented the views of Hong Kong Council of Social Service (HKCSS) as detailed in its submission. Mr CHAN said that HKCSS

Action

supported the implementation of the CYD project. It, however, requested more detailed information to be provided by the Administration on the viability of the proposed PPP approach to be adopted for delivery of the CYD.

Christian Family Service Centre
[LC Paper No. CB(2)510/04-05(02)]

37. Ms NG Kwok-tung presented the views of Christian Family Service Centre as detailed in its submission. Ms NG expressed concern about the remote location of the CYD, the cost-effectiveness of building the CYD and the financial viability of the centre. He was also concerned whether there was adequate participation of young people in the planning and implementation of the youth development programmes organised in the CYD.

Eastern District Council

38. Mr CHAO Shing-kie and Mr KUNG Pak-cheung said that Eastern District Council (EDC) supported the implementation of the CYD project, and the proposed changes to the mix of the facilities in the CYD and its project scope. Mr CHAO further said that EDC was of the view that while the operation of the youth hostel should be on a self-financing basis, the Government should subsidise the youth development programmes organised in the CYD and ensure that its services would not be affected by funding problems. EDC also suggested that the Government should re-consider whether the proposed youth hostel was necessary since there was objection raised by residents in the vicinity, who considered that the hostel was too near to residential area. Mr CHAO added that some EDC members hoped that the Government could provide a temporary community hall in Chai Wan for the time being to meet local service needs before the CYD was built.

Caritas – Hong Kong

39. Mr Anthony CHENG referred members to the views about the CYD in his written submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)510/04-05(05)]. He said that he had been waiting for a long time for the CYD to be built and it would be a great waste if the CYD project was scrapped. However, it was necessary for the Administration to widely consult NGOs and youth groups to seek their views on details of the implementation of the project.

Hong Kong Christian Service

40. Ms Winnie YING said that Hong Kong Christian Service supported the implementation of the CYD project to enhance youth development services in Hong Kong. She urged the Administration to work out specific objectives for the youth development programmes organised in the CYD and ensure that the programmes were diversified enough to cater for varied needs of young people.

Action

She added that Hong Kong Christian Service was concerned about the proposed changes to the mix of facilities in the CYD and requested the Administration to widely consult the sector on the proposed changes.

Alliance of Hong Kong Youth Groups
[LC Paper No. CB(2)555/04-05(02)]

41. Mr CHAN Tak-ming presented the views of Alliance of Hong Kong Youth Groups as detailed in its submission. Mr CHAN said that Alliance of Hong Kong Youth Groups was concerned that many changes were proposed for the CYD project but youth organisations did not have the opportunity to comment on them. He urged the Administration to widely consult youth organisations' views on the project.

Hong Kong Youths Unified Association

42. Mr Vincent LEUNG said that he abstained from speaking on the subject.

Po Leung Kuk

43. Ms YUE Mui-ying said that Po Leung Kuk supported the implementation of the CYD project to enhance youth development services. Ms YUE said that Po Leung Kuk suggested that only the youth hostel and other commercial facilities should be required to operate on a self-financing basis, whereas youth development programmes organised in the CYD should be subsidised to ensure that the provision of such programmes would not be based on commercial principles only. Ms YUE further said that Po Leung Kuk was also concerned about the mechanism to be put in place to monitor the performance of the single contractor in the future.

Hok Yau Club

44. Mr CHUI Yat-hung said that Hok Yau Club supported the implementation of the CYD project and believed that the centre would be able to operate on a self-financing basis if the future operator was allowed adequate flexibility in operations. He, however, queried the need to include retail areas in the CYD.

Youth Development Concern Group of Eastern District
[LC Paper No. CB(2)510/04-05(03)]

45. Mr HO Man-tat presented the views of Youth Development Concern Group of Eastern District as detailed in its submission. Mr HO said that Youth Development Concern Group of Eastern District preferred the CYD to be managed and operated by a NGO which had long experience in providing youth service.

Action

Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong

46. Mr CHUNG Shu-kun said that Democratic Alliance for Betterment of Hong Kong (DAB) supported the implementation of the CYD project. He said that DAB was of the view that discussion on the desirability of the CYD should not be re-opened and that the location was not too remote since it was next to the MTR Station.

47. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan said that DAB did not object to the proposed O&M model with a single contract. Mr CHEUNG said that the sector was concerned whether there would be dominant use of the CYD for youth development activities by well-established youth organisations, to the detriment of other smaller NGOs and youth groups. Mr CHEUNG further said that different NGOs and youth organisations should be allowed to form one single consortium to bid for the single O&M contract under the current proposal.

Other submissions received

48. Members noted that submissions were also provided by Tung Wah Group of Hospitals, Hong Kong Adventure Corps, Mr LUI Chi-man, EDC member, and Mr Anthony CHENG (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)510/04-05(01), (04) and (05) and CB(2)527/04-05(01))

(Post-meeting note: a submission was subsequently provided by Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Chai Wan) which was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(2)612/04-05(04) on 11 January 2005.)

The Administration's reponse

49. At the Chairman's invitation to give an overall response to the views expressed at the meeting, DSHA(1) made the following points –

- (a) The proposal to scrap the project and sell the site of the CYD was not a feasible option. The piling and basement works for the CYD which cost about \$110 million had already been completed. The site would not be sold for a very high price given its many constraints: it was currently zoned as Government /institution/community use, and the roundabout of the MTR was within the site. Moreover, if the Administration were to sell the site of the CYD, it would first have to reinstate the site and that would cost about \$30 million. If the CYD project were to be scrapped, the funding approved for the project would be returned to the general revenue and the donated amount would also have to be returned to the Board of Management of the Chinese Permanent Cemeteries.

Action

- (b) Discussion on the suitability of the location of the CYD should not be re-opened as it had already been considered by FC when it approved the funding proposal in 2001.
- (c) If the Panel supported the current proposal, which was still in line with the fundamental principles of the funding proposal approved by FC, there would be no need for the Administration to re-submit the proposal to FC for discussion again. The Administration would then arrange the tender for the construction of superstructure works to be awarded before 2 March 2005 and the construction works could be resumed as soon as possible.
- (d) If FC agreed that the requirement that the project would have to operate on a self-financing basis during the initial 10-year period could be relaxed, the Administration would have more flexibility in exploring alternative modes of management and operation for the CYD.
- (e) Under the proposed O&M model with a single contract, interested NGOs and youth organisations could form a partnership or collaborate with a consortium to bid for the single O&M contract of the CYD.
- (f) Non-subsided youth organisations could also use the facilities in the CYD for youth development activities.

50. Dr Philemon CHOI said that although various concerns about the CYD project had been raised at the meeting and all of which were, in his view, well-justified, almost all the deputations attending the meeting did not object to the implementation of the CYD project. He reiterated that further consultation with NGOs, youth organisations and young people on the content and requirements of the youth development programmes organised in the CYD would continue to be conducted and their views would be accommodated as far as possible. He added that given the importance of the CYD, its construction should not be further delayed.

Way forward

51. Mr Albert HO considered that many deputations attending the meeting had expressed concern about the proposed PPP approach even though they supported the CYD project. He said that many of the deputations were more in favour of the option that non-profit making youth organisation(s) should assume a leading role in the management and operation of the CYD and oversee its development, while they did not object to introducing some degree of commercial elements to the CYD. Mr HO further said that if such a mode

Action

was to be adopted, it would be necessary to relax the requirement that the project had to operate on a self-financing basis during the initial 10-year period. Mr HO proposed that FC's approval be sought to relax this requirement. Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Ms Emily LAU expressed support for Mr HO's proposal.

Admin

52. As suggested by Ms Emily LAU, the Panel requested that the Administration should submit to FC a paper setting out the Administration's proposals, including the proposed relaxation of the requirement that the project had to operate on a self-financing basis during the initial 10-year period, and the views of NGOs and youth organisations. Ms Emily LAU also requested the Administration to provide the paper well in advance to FC so that NGOs and youth organisations concerned would have the opportunity to put forward their views, if any, on the Administration's paper to FC for Members' consideration. The Panel further requested that the Administration should not proceed with the award of tender before FC completed discussion of the CYD project.

Admin

Admin

II. Any Other Business

Discussion item proposed by Mr Albert HO and Mr Andrew CHENG

53. The Chairman informed members that Mr Albert HO and Mr Andrew CHENG had proposed that the Panel should invite the Secretary for Home Affairs to attend a meeting to discuss with members the criteria of appointment of the Chairperson of the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) and also invite the EOC Chairperson (designate) to brief members on his work plan. The Chairman asked Mr Albert HO and Mr Andrew CHENG whether they had any strong views if the Panel discussed the proposed subject at the regular meeting on 4 February 2005. Mr HO and Mr CHENG said that they had no objection.

54. After discussion, members agreed to discuss the appointment of the EOC Chairperson and the work of EOC at the said regular meeting. The Chairman said that the Panel could further discuss at the next regular meeting on 14 January 2005 what other items should be included for discussion at the meeting on 4 February 2005.

55. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:30 pm.