

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 9

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 30 November 2005 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long  
The Daniel LAM Wai-keung, BBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

The Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP

Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mr Ray CHAN Yum-mou, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>  | <b><u>L.N. No.</u></b> |
|---|------------------------|
| 1. Import and Export (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 25.11.2005)   | 206/2005               |
| 2. Reserved Commodities (Control of Imports, Exports and Reserve Stocks) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 25.11.2005)           | 207/2005               |
| 3. Prevention of the Spread of Infectious Diseases (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 25.11.2005)                                 | 208/2005               |
| 4. Air Pollution Control (Emission Reduction Devices for Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (gazetted on 25.11.2005)                 | 209/2005               |
| 5. Substitution of References to Commencement Date of Revenue (Abolition of Estate Duty) Ordinance 2005 Notice (gazetted on 25.11.2005) | 210/2005               |

### **Other Papers**

No.34 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Director of Social Welfare Incorporated together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 March 2005 (published on 23.11.2005)

No.35 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the second quarter of 2005-06 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 23.11.2005)

Report of the Subcommittee on Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005 (published on 28.11.2005)

Report of the Bills Committee on Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2005 (published on 25.11.2005)

## **Addresses**

Hon Fred LI, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005, addressed the Council on the Subcommittee's Report.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon Vincent FANG Kang consecutively addressed the Council on Harmful Substances in Food (Amendment) Regulation 2005, which was subsidiary legislation laid on the Table of the Council on 12 October 2005.

## **Questions**

1. Hon Fred LI asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Nine Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

3. Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

4. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **First Reading**

**St. Stephen's College Incorporation (Change of Name of the Council of St. Stephen's College and General Amendments) Bill 2005**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Second Reading**

**St. Stephen's College Incorporation (Change of Name of the Council of St. Stephen's College and General Amendments) Bill 2005**

The Secretary for Education and Manpower moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2005**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 18 May 2005 resumed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill

2005, addressed the Council on the Report of the Bills Committee on the Bill.

One Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2005**.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 13 to 16, 18 to 30, 32 to 36 and 38 to 51 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 4, 5, 9, 12, 17, 31 and 37 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 4, 5, 9, 12, 17, 31 and 37, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 25A, 25B, 27A and 38A read the first time.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 25A, 25B, 27A and 38A read the second time.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill proposed.



The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour moved amendments to the schedule and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour reported that

**the Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels and  
Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2005**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Members' Motions**

**Conducting a referendum on the full implementation of  
elections by universal suffrage in 2007 and 2008**

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council requests the Central Government to arrange for all Members of the Legislative Council to visit Beijing so that Members can truly reflect to it the public opinions in Hong Kong on the dual elections by universal suffrage, and urges the Hong Kong SAR Government to conduct a referendum on the selection of the Chief Executive and the election of the Legislative Council by universal suffrage in 2007 and 2008 respectively; furthermore, this Council appeals to all the people of Hong Kong to stand out against the Fifth Report of the Constitutional Development Task Force on 4 December this year, so as to demonstrate once again their determination to fight for elections by universal suffrage.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another 14 Members and Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion.

At 3:52 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion.

The President allowed another Member who had not spoken to speak on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke again.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the motion and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Preventing avian influenza**

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as cases of avian influenza have successively occurred in many countries, in order to guard against the recurrence of an avian influenza outbreak in Hong Kong and prevent human infections of avian influenza, this Council urges the Government to consider establishing, as early as possible, a steering group led by the Chief Executive to combat the pandemic, to set up a fund to defray the expenditure in this regard, to enhance the preventive efforts by strengthening influenza vaccination and public education on influenza prevention, etc, to expeditiously introduce a trial scheme on regional slaughtering after putting in place proper arrangements for compensating the live poultry trade and assisting affected trade operators to switch their

business or jobs, and to further improve the sanitary conditions in farms as well as live poultry and birds wholesale and retail outlets.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Yung-kan and Hon Vincent FANG Kang would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Andrew CHENG would also move an amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Yung-kan, Hon Vincent FANG Kang, Hon Andrew CHENG and 12 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "consider establishing, as early as possible," after "this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with ": (a) closely monitor the avian influenza developments in and outside Hong Kong, including the routes of migratory birds and the means of virus transmission by such birds, and to assess the risks of a pandemic outbreak and conduct drills on contingency measures, so as to ensure that"; to delete ", to" after "combat the pandemic" and substitute with "can be set up immediately in the event of a drastic change in the pandemic situation; (b)"; to add "with a proper monitoring mechanism" after "set up a fund"; to delete ", to" after "in this regard" and substitute with "; (c)"; to delete ", to expeditiously introduce a trial scheme on regional slaughtering after putting in place proper arrangements for compensating the live poultry trade and assisting affected trade operators to switch their business or jobs, and to further improve" after "influenza prevention, etc" and substitute with "; (d) vigorously bring into play the strength of the whole medical and health care sector, including the Chinese medicine sector, to make cooperative efforts on all fronts from the prevention of a pandemic outbreak to clinical treatment, so as to achieve better preventive and curative effects; (e) further improve the environmental hygiene in Hong Kong and organize territory-wide cleansing days on a regular basis; (f) enhance the efforts in intercepting smuggled food products, so as to prevent the smuggling of poultry and bird products into Hong Kong from infected areas and the resultant risks of pandemic transmission; and (g) actively cooperate with the live poultry trade in further improving"; and to add ", and to strengthen quarantine and disease prevention of live poultry as well as

the work of segregating humans from live poultry" after "retail outlets".

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion or amendments thereto on "Preventing avian influenza", the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "set up a fund" after "combat the pandemic, to" and substitute with "set aside sufficient funds"; to add "and procure health care equipment" after "in this regard"; to delete "and to further improve" after "their business or jobs," and substitute with "prohibit individuals from rearing poultry and strictly implement the policy of a fifty-fifty supply of imported and local live poultry, with a view to further improving"; and to add "; the Government should also step up efforts in monitoring the movements of migratory birds in the territory" after "retail outlets".

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment:

To add ", on condition that a proper monitoring mechanism has been put in place," after "set aside sufficient funds"; to add ", ensure that the government officials responsible for

coordinating the work of combating the pandemic can flexibly deploy the resources" after "in this regard"; and to add "according to the exigencies of the work" after "health care equipment".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to divide under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment, as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG, to Hon Fred LI's motion put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon Andrew CHENG put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 7 December 2005 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:25 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 30/11/2005  
 時間 TIME: 04:34:23 下午

動議 MOTION: 「為在2007年及2008年實行全面普選進行全民公投」議案  
 MOTION "CONDUCTING A REFERENDUM ON THE FULL IMPLEMENTATION OF  
 ELECTIONS BY UNIVERSAL SUFFRAGE IN 2007 AND 2008"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 26                                | 25                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 26                                | 24                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 6                                 | 13                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 20                                | 11                                  |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0                                 | 0                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     | 反對 NO      | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       |            | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 反對 NO      |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   | 反對 NO      | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       | 贊成 YES     | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 贊成 YES     | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          |            |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      | 反對 NO      | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 反對 NO      | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 反對 NO      |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     |            | 涂謹申 James TO                            |            |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 反對 NO      | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       | 反對 NO      |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 反對 NO      | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 反對 NO      |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     |            |
| 劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat                      | 反對 NO      | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      | 反對 NO      |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 反對 NO      | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       |            | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 反對 NO      | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 反對 NO      |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      |            | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         | 反對 NO      |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 反對 NO      | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 反對 NO      | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       | 反對 NO      |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         |            |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        | 反對 NO      | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 反對 NO      | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 贊成 YES     | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        | 反對 NO      |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                | 贊成 YES     | 馬力 MA Lik                               | 反對 NO      |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   | 反對 NO      | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    | 反對 NO      | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU                       | 反對 NO      | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 反對 NO      |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     | 反對 NO      | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     | 贊成 YES     | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 贊成 YES     |

秘書 CLERK \_\_\_\_\_

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 30/11/2005  
時間 TIME: 07:18:54 下午

動議 MOTION: 黃容根議員對李華明議員就「防範禽流感」所提議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUNG-KAN TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON  
"PREVENTING AVIAN INFLUENZA"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 21                                | 20                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 21                                | 19                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 7                                 | 7                                   |                      |
| 反對 No      | 7                                 | 9                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 7                                 | 3                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 否決 Negatived                        | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     |            | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       | 反對 NO      | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   | 反對 NO      | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           | 反對 NO      |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       |            | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 反對 NO      |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 反對 NO      | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          |            |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      | 反對 NO      | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 反對 NO      |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     |            | 涂謹申 James TO                            |            |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 贊成 YES     | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     | 反對 NO      |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat                      |            | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      |            |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 反對 NO      |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       |            | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 反對 NO      | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      | 贊成 YES     | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           |            |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      |            | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        | 反對 NO      |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 贊成 YES     | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       |            |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         |            |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        |            | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 反對 NO      |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        | 反對 NO      |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                | 反對 NO      | 馬力 MA Lik                               |            |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   | 贊成 YES     | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          |            |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    |            | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉秀成 Patrick LAU                       | 反對 NO      | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     | 贊成 YES     | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          |            |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     |            | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 反對 NO      |

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 30/11/2005  
 時間 TIME: 07:22:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 鄭家富議員就方剛議員對李華明議員的「防範禽流感」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
 HON ANDREW CHENG'S AMENDMENT TO HON VINCENT FANG'S AMENDMENT TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "PREVENTING AVIAN INFLUENZA"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 20                                | 19                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 20                                | 18                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 14                                | 11                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 2                                 | 6                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 4                                 | 1                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 通過 Passed                         | 通過 Passed                           | 通過 Passed            |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鑑泰<br>Dr Raymond HO                  |            | 范徐麗泰<br>Mrs Rita FAN                    | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶<br>Dr David LI                    |            | 田北俊<br>James TIEN                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 呂明華<br>Dr LUI Ming-wah                | 贊成 YES     | 何俊仁<br>Albert HO                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 吳靄儀<br>Margaret NG                    |            | 李卓人<br>LEE Cheuk-yan                    |            |
| 張文光<br>CHEUNG Man-kwong               | 贊成 YES     | 李柱銘<br>Martin LEE                       |            |
| 陳智思<br>Bernard CHAN                   | 贊成 YES     | 李華明<br>Fred LI                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬<br>Mrs Sophie LEUNG              | 贊成 YES     | 周梁淑怡<br>Mrs Selina CHOW                 | 贊成 YES     |
| 單仲偕<br>SIN Chung-kai                  |            | 涂謹申<br>James TO                         |            |
| 黃宜弘<br>Dr Philip WONG                 | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳婉嫻<br>CHAN Yuen-han                    | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃容根<br>WONG Yung-kan                  | 反對 NO      | 陳鑑林<br>CHAN Kam-lam                     | 反對 NO      |
| 楊孝華<br>Howard YOUNG                   | 贊成 YES     | 梁耀忠<br>LEUNG Yiu-chung                  | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉皇發<br>LAU Wong-fat                   |            | 曾鈺成<br>TSANG Yok-sing                   |            |
| 劉健儀<br>Miriam LAU                     | 贊成 YES     | 楊森<br>Dr YEUNG Sum                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 霍震霆<br>Timothy FOK                    |            | 劉千石<br>LAU Chin-shek                    |            |
| 石禮謙<br>Abraham SHEK                   | 贊成 YES     | 劉江華<br>LAU Kong-wah                     | 反對 NO      |
| 李鳳英<br>LI Fung-ying                   | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 劉慧卿<br>Emily LAU                        |            |
| 張宇人<br>Tommy CHEUNG                   |            | 蔡素玉<br>CHOY So-yuk                      | 反對 NO      |
| 方剛<br>Vincent FANG                    | 贊成 YES     | 鄭家富<br>Andrew CHENG                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 王國興<br>WONG Kwok-hing                 | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗<br>TAM Yiu-chung                    |            |
| 李國麟<br>Dr Joseph LEE                  | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業<br>Albert CHAN                      |            |
| 林偉強<br>Daniel LAM                     |            | 馮檢基<br>Frederick FUNG                   | 贊成 YES     |
| 林健鋒<br>Jeffrey LAM                    | 贊成 YES     | 余若薇<br>Audrey EU                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥<br>Andrew LEUNG                   | 贊成 YES     | 李永達<br>LEE Wing-tat                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 郭家麒<br>Dr KWOK Ka-ki                  | 贊成 YES     | 李國英<br>LI Kwok-ying                     | 反對 NO      |
| 張超雄<br>Dr Fernando CHEUNG             | 贊成 YES     | 馬力<br>MA Lik                            |            |
| 黃定光<br>WONG Ting-kwong                | 反對 NO      | 梁家傑<br>Alan LEONG                       |            |
| 詹培忠<br>CHIM Pui-chung                 |            | 梁國雄<br>LEUNG Kwok-hung                  | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉秀成<br>Patrick LAU                    | 贊成 YES     | 張學明<br>CHEUNG Hok-ming                  | 反對 NO      |
| 鄭志堅<br>KWONG Chi-kin                  | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 湯家驊<br>Ronny TONG                       |            |
| 譚香文<br>TAM Heung-man                  |            | 鄭經翰<br>Albert CHENG                     | 反對 NO      |

秘書 CLERK