## Panel on Planning, Lands and Works

## Subcommittee to Review the Planning for the Central Waterfront (including the Tamar Site)

## Summary of views on the planning for the Central Waterfront raised by deputations and in submissions to the Panel and the Administration's response

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Planning principles and me	chanism	
Expert Panel on Sustainable Transport Planning and Central-Wan Chai Bypass	<ul> <li>The focus of the Expert Panel's review is on recommending a sustainable solution for relieving the traffic congestion on the strategic route (not congestion of local roads).</li> <li>The following recommendations are made by the Expert Panel in its report: <ul> <li>(a) Short-term measures</li> <li>Transportation management measures</li> <li>Tunnel toll adjustment</li> <li>Managing development programme</li> <li>Pedestrian access to the waterfront</li> </ul> </li> <li>(b) Medium-term measures <ul> <li>Enhancing the multi-modal transport network</li> <li>Environmental and social concerns</li> <li>P2 road</li> <li>Road pricing</li> <li>Complementariness of road pricing and the CWB</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Transport Planning and Central-Wan Chai Bypass

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<ul> <li>(c) Long-term measures</li> <li>Holistic approach towards transport/land use planning</li> <li>Area-wide pedestrian network to the Harbour-front</li> <li>Incident management capability</li> <li>Maintenance of reserve capacities</li> <li>Sustainable transportation</li> </ul>	We welcome the Expert Panel's medium and long term recommendations, especially the recognition of the need for Road P2 as an important interim measure to address traffic congestion in the Central reclamation area. We will take them on board when formulating the transport plan for the area. The Government has been adopting an integrated approach towards transport and land use planning. In designating the land use zonings and imposing development restrictions on the relevant OZPs, due regard has been/will be given to traffic, infrastructural and other planning and urban design considerations. On the issue of pedestrian accessibility, the planning and urban design framework adopted in the Central District (Extension) OZP is structured upon a waterfront promenade and three principal design corridors, providing a direct and uninterrupted pedestrian network between the existing urban area and the waterfront.
Citizen Envisioning@ Harbour	<ul> <li>(a) The Government should heed the principles of "sustainable transport planning", "integrated land and transport planning" and "stemming of development" to ensure sustainability of Hong Kong's urban environment. One of the key elements for a sustainable transport solution is the reduction of development density along Hong Kong Island North shore, including that at the Tamar site.</li> </ul>	The Government has been adopting an integrated approach towards transport and land use planning. In determining the appropriate development intensity, due regard has been/will be given to traffic, infrastructural and other planning and urban design considerations. Land use planning for the new Central waterfront has put an emphasis on creating a world class waterfront as well as providing a comfortable setting for

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	(b) Four sustainability principles are suggested to serve as guidance for sustainable development –	enjoyment of the people which is amenable to the sustainability principle. An obvious illustration is the generous provision of open space (about 9 ha which is
	A quality-of-life approach, instead of a utilitarian approach, shall be adopted in devising any reclamation plan or harbour front design.	equivalent to about half of the reclaimed land under CRIII) for the enjoyment of the public. To maintain a
	The planning gains to be achieved through urban design of the harbour front should be fairly distributed to the entire spectrum of the community.	waterfront. The OZP has stipulated stringent building height restrictions to reflect this urban design
	A public participatory process should be established in parallel with the administrative process and the legislative process as triple safeguard to the integrity and functionality of the harbour shoreline.	participation in harbour-front enhancement. The question of whether to set up a single accountable
	Either a government executing agency or a coordinating office should be presented to the public as a single accountable body to take full responsibilities for the planning, design, execution and operation of any project involving new reclamations or renewal of harbour frontage.	frontage should be carefully considered.
	The Administration should conduct a review of the plans for the Central and Wan Chai harbour-front (including the Tamar site) under the framework of a Sustainable Transport Solution prior to committing the	

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	proposed development for Tamar.	
Civic Exchange	Concerned that the Administration's priority is to maximize revenues along the harbour-front rather than to create a total waterfront experience that meets the public's demands.	In planning for the reclaimed land under CRIII, we aim at maintaining a balanced development. On the one hand, open space will be provided to develop a vibrant waterfront promenade for direct access and enjoyment by the public. On the other hand, the use of the reclaimed land under CRIII shall be optimized to meet the long-term economic and social needs of Hong Kong.
The Experience Group	<ul> <li>The Government's urban and transport planning mechanisms, development and transport policies may not have been properly adjusted to ensure that the city and harbour are world class and sustainable given the new constraints on harbour reclamation.</li> <li>The regeneration of the harbour-front around Victoria Harbour as a whole requires a specific statutory body to promote and co-ordinate development. This can be achieved by expanding the West Kowloon Authority to a Harbour Agency. It should be responsible for the planning and coordination of the work necessary to deliver the vision in an efficient and time effective manner, working with the Harbour-front Enhancement Committee for public consultation, coordinating the relevant government departments and seeking approvals from the TPB. A Deputy Chief Executive, who would have the experience in innovative strategic planning and development, should be appointed to lead this Agency.</li> </ul>	We have placed greater emphasis on providing a spacious, easily accessible promenade with good connectivity with the adjoining areas and the hinterland where the public can freely walk, rest and enjoy. The Town Planning Board (TPB) has re-examined and re-affirmed these planning intentions in August 2005 arising from three rezoning requests and decided that the land use zonings on the OZP are appropriate. The TPB accepted however that it will be useful to set out the planning objectives clearly through the preparation of planning/design briefs using the urban design framework for the waterfront. This will guide future developments and ensure that only proposals which can demonstrate compatibility with the waterfront setting, facilitation of pedestrian access, and promotion of visual permeability will be approved by the TPB. To take forward the TPB's decision, Planning Department will prepare planning/design briefs for the Central waterfront area, in particular the proposed groundscraper at the "Comprehensive Development Area" ("CDA") site and the sites for waterfront related commercial and leisure

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		uses.
		The question of whether to set up a specific statutory body, such as expanding the proposed statutory body for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project to a harbour agency, should be carefully considered taking into account the experience of the proposed establishment of a statutory body for the WKCD project.
Harbour Business Forum	<ul> <li>design of Hong Kong's harbour and harbour-front districts;</li> <li>the lack of a consistent and transparent framework to make decisions on harbour;</li> <li>the lack of willingness, on the part of the Government, to engage with the relevant parties to discuss amendments to planning on the harbour and harbour-front districts;</li> <li>the lack of overall coordination of the 17 or so</li> </ul>	The HEC is set up to advise the Government on the planning, land uses and developments along the existing and new harbour-front of the Victoria Harbour. It has also facilitated public participation in the process.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Land-use and infrastructur	re planning for the Central waterfront – Need or other	wise for review of the Central OZP
Mr Gerry KIPLING	1 0 0	To maintain a clear view towards the harbour and the ridgeline, all waterfront developments in CRIII are subject to building height restrictions and only low to medium rise buildings will be built. Building heights will generally decrease from south to north towards the harbour. The section of the proposed CWB within the boundary of the CRIII project will be built in the form of a tunnel.
Mr Tim STEINERT	developing public uses of and access to our harbour.	There will be a generous provision of open space along the Central waterfront, including a world class waterfront promenade extending in an east-west direction. There are waterfront related commercial and leisure uses including festival market, cafes, restaurants, and retail shops to enhance the vitality and attraction of the waterfront. A site is also reserved for possible future cultural and recreational facilities.
Ms Michelle GARNAUT	The harbour front on the north of Hong Kong Island is poorly planned and badly used. Locating CGC on Tamar will disfigure the Harbour more and aggravate the pollution and traffic problems.	

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Ms Rachel PLECAS	increase traffic and destroy views should consult the	The Central District (Extension) OZP is an approved plan which has already undergone a due process of public consultation and objections under the Town Planning Ordinance. The overall planning concept is structured upon a comprehensive planning and urban design framework which aims at creating a world class waterfront for Hong Kong. To maintain a clear view towards the harbour and the ridgeline, all waterfront developments are subject to building height restrictions and only low to medium rise buildings will be built. Building heights will generally decrease from south to north towards the harbour.
Action Group on Protection of the Harbour	under review, the Administration should take this	The TPB has re-examined and re-affirmed the planning intentions of the Central District (Extension) OZP in August 2005 arising from three rezoning requests and decided that the land use zonings on the OZP are appropriate. The TPB accepted however that it will be useful to set out the planning objectives clearly through the preparation of planning/design briefs using the urban design framework for the waterfront. This will guide future developments and ensure that only proposals which can demonstrate compatibility with the waterfront setting, facilitation of pedestrian access, and promotion of visual permeability will be approved by the TPB. To take forward the TPB's decision, Planning Department will prepare planning/design briefs for the Central waterfront area, in particular the proposed groundscraper at the "Comprehensive Development Area" ("CDA") site and the sites for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Civic Exchange	<ul> <li>poor harbour-front experience into one that befits the city's natural endowment. To make this transformation, it will require not only sound planning and reprioritization with the long-term view in mind, but also substantial financial investments to ensure that there will be a proper mix of open space, low density recreational developments, the right community facilities, and appropriate commercial developments.</li> <li>To fulfill the "Harbour Vision", a fundamental review of the Central OZP is required to make the required major town planning and transport planning changes. The Town Planning Board</li> </ul>	About 9 ha or half of the reclaimed land under CRIII is zoned "Open Space" (about 47%) to provide recreational space for the enjoyment of the public. There are also waterfront related commercial and leisure uses including festival market, cafes, restaurants, and retail shops to enhance the vitality and attraction of the waterfront. The TPB has re-examined and re-affirmed the planning intentions of the Central District (Extension) OZP in August 2005 arising from three rezoning requests and decided that the land use zonings on the OZP are appropriate. The TPB accepted however that it will be useful to set out the planning objectives clearly through the preparation of planning/design briefs using the urban design framework for the waterfront. This will guide future developments and ensure that only proposals which can demonstrate compatibility with the waterfront setting, facilitation of pedestrian access, and promotion of visual permeability will be approved by the TPB. To take forward the TPB's decision, Planning Department will prepare planning/design briefs for the Central waterfront area, in particular the proposed groundscraper at the "Comprehensive Development Area" ("CDA") site and the sites for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses.
Mr Winston CHU	commitments to enhance the harbour and harbourfront; that the Central Reclamation is only for the purpose of resolving traffic congestion; and	CRIII will provide land for the essential transport infrastructure required in the area (including the proposed CWB, the Road P2 network, and the extended overrun tunnel of the Airport Railway) and the reprovisioning of the existing piers and sea-water cooling pumping stations.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	review as directed by TPB on 5 August 2005 with proper public consultation and input from the community. Pending the outcome of the review, any decision on the development of Tamar will be	
	down its judgment on the test of "overriding public need" for carrying out reclamation, the Government has not conducted any further public consultation nor given the public the opportunity of objecting to the Central Reclamation based on	The TPB has re-examined and re-affirmed the planning intentions of the Central District (Extension) OZP in August 2005 arising from three rezoning requests and decided that the land use zonings on the OZP are appropriate. The TPB accepted however that it will be useful to set out the planning objectives clearly through the preparation of planning/design briefs using the urban design framework for the waterfront. This will guide
	<ul> <li>When the matter was debated in 2002, the Government gave LegCo a wrong interpretation of the Protection of the Harbour Ordinance. Just as the public, LegCo was equally misled.</li> <li>The public must be given the opportunity to object to the Government's proposal to sell the five pieces of reclaimed land totaling 800,000 sq.ft. for extensive office and commercial developments</li> </ul>	future developments and ensure that only proposals which can demonstrate compatibility with the waterfront setting, facilitation of pedestrian access, and promotion of visual permeability will be approved by the TPB. To take forward the TPB's decision, Planning Department will prepare planning/design briefs for the Central waterfront area, in particular the proposed groundscraper at the "Comprehensive Development Area" ("CDA") site and the sites for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses.
Mr Norman de BRACKINGHE	-	Planning for the Central waterfront area is structured upon a comprehensive planning and urban design framework. A comprehensive pedestrian network is planned for the area to provide a safe and uninterrupted pedestrian network between the existing urban area and the waterfront.

- 9 -

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Mr John BATTEN	there is really no more room to build. By building	The Government has been adopting an integrated approach towards transport and land use planning. We would continue to enhance our efforts on this front. The Expert Panel pointed out in its report that the existing road network would not be able to cope with travel demand a decade from now even if nil car growth and no further land development in the Central and Wan Chai area are assumed.
The Experience Group	<ul> <li>suffers from a number of problems such as a pedestrian unfriendly environment and little diversity in economic activities, job or business opportunities. The present zoning for Tamar and Central waterfront shows an aggravation of these problems for the last remaining open land in the harbour-front.</li> <li>The current planning for Tamar and Central shows</li> </ul>	environment, a mixture of land uses is planned along the waterfront including open space, waterfront related commercial and leisure uses (such as restaurants and retail shops), cultural facilities and high quality offices.
The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong	<ul> <li>the proposed office/commercial use on the reclaimed land for the following reasons:</li> <li>(a) Office/commercial use could not satisfy the test of overriding public need espoused in the CFA judgment;</li> <li>(b) Provision of substantial private office space on the reclaimed land was contrary to the strategy of</li> </ul>	The land uses of the reclamation area under CRIII were drawn up in accordance with the statutory procedures and have gone through several rounds of public consultation. About half of the land reclaimed is zoned "Open Space" (about 8.78 ha or 47%). The "Comprehensive Development Area", which may be used for commercial and retail purposes, accounts for just 14% of the reclaimed land on which buildings of two to no more than ten storeys will be built. As regards the sites zoned

- 11 -	
--------	--

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	Strategy; (c) The proposed area of "OU – Waterfront related	
Mr Chris WATTS		

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
Ms Karen POLSON	•	A comprehensive pedestrian network is planned for the area to provide a safe and uninterrupted pedestrian network between the existing urban area and the waterfront for both residents and tourists.
Asian Cultural Council	be transformed into a landscape that can compete with the harbour cities of the world. The decision on Tamar should be part of a larger planning for the entire area. The Administration should create a magnificent	The planning and design framework for the Central waterfront area aims to create a world class waterfront which is featured by a waterfront promenade intersecting with three principal design corridors. The design of the Tamar development and the civic place will be integrated with the waterfront promenade so as to create a harmonious and coherent character at the waterfront.
Ms Vicki LUKINS	Tamar must be considered as an integral part of the entire waterfront, not as a discrete site. The high density development under the current OZP for Central undermines the efforts of the Administration and the community to reduce air pollution and traffic congestion.	
Ms Winnifred Che Yeung WONG	<ul> <li>entire harbour and harbour-fronts.</li> <li>The Panel should discuss the Central waterfront project in the context of the motion passed at the Panel meeting on 25 October 2005 requesting for a substantial reduction in the area for commercial uses under the Central Reclamation Phase III (CRIII) and the prohibition on the use of the</li> </ul>	

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	infrastructure, both existing and planned, for Central. Only by replanning will the Administration offer opportunities to improve the outdated Central Extension OZP and enhance the accessibility of the waterfront.	
Professional Property Services	<ul> <li>Government to focus less on price and more on value. The harbour front is valuable in financial terms and the contingent value to the public as a whole. It should be an accessible, vibrant and dynamic asset for Hong Kong people and tourists. CGC would act as a barrier between the harbour and the rest of Central.</li> <li>The plot ratio which is permitted by the OZP in</li> </ul>	
Civic Exchange	1	There is no decision on the future uses of the existing CGO and Murray Building sites at this stage yet, as we would have to take into account the prevailing community aspirations and socio-economic needs nearer the completion of the Tamar project, in deciding on the optimum use of the sites.

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		Any changes of the existing zoning of the CGO and Murray Building sites (i.e. "Government, Institution or Community") would be subject to a public consultation and planning process under the provisions of the Town Planning Ordinance.
WWF Hong Kong	displays a lamentable planning sensitivity, involving	The land use proposals on the Central District (Extension) OZP has been carefully planned with due regard to the traffic and infrastructural considerations. Only broad land use zonings are designated on the OZP. The development layout will be determined at the detailed design stage.
Harbour Business Forum	The current design brief for Central reclamation will lead to significantly sub-optimal outcomes.	To take forward TPB's decision on 5.8.2005, Planning Department will prepare planning/design briefs for the Central waterfront area, in particular the proposed groundscraper at the "Comprehensive Development Area" ("CDA") site and the sites for waterfront related commercial and leisure uses.
The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors	The Institute supports the land-use planning for CRIII.	Noted.
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki	The Government originally justified CRIII by the need to resolve traffic congestion, but now has included a substantial amount of commercial developments on the reclaimed land, which in turn would generate additional vehicular and pedestrian traffic. It is necessary to review holistically the planning for CRIII including the Tamar project.	CRIII will provide land for the essential transport infrastructure required in the area (including the proposed CWB, the Road P2 network, and the extended overrun tunnel of the Airport Railway) and the reprovisioning of the existing piers and sea-water cooling pumping stations. The reclamation will also provide Hong Kong with an opportunity to restructure the existing waterfront and create a world class waterfront at the heart of the city

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		which is vibrant and accessible for enjoyment of its people.
		About half of the land reclaimed is zoned "Open Space" (about 8.78 ha or 47%). The "Comprehensive Development Area", which may be used for commercial and retail purposes, accounts for just 14% of the reclaimed land on which buildings of two to ten storeys will be built. As regards the sites zoned "Other Specified Uses" annotated "Waterfront Related Commercial and Leisure Uses" (about 2.50 ha or 13%), they are intended for festival markets, cafes, restaurants, etc., which will be subject to a building height restriction of one to four storeys.
Land-use and infrastructur	re planning for the Central waterfront - Sustainability	in traffic terms
Action Group on Protection on the Harbour	the commercial property development under the CRIII. The lands in CRIII designated as Comprehensive Development Area will add an additional 850 000 square metres of gross floor area. According to the information submitted by the Transport Department to the Expert Panel Forum on Sustainable Transport Planning and Central-Wan Chai Bypass, even if all the proposed roads are built, traffic will still be saturated by 2016. Then the Government might ask for further	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
The Hong Kong Institute of Engineers		The planned road infrastructures such as the CWB and Road P2 will be able to cope with the planned new developments.
Mr Winston CHU Ms Taura EDGAR Ms Bethan GREAVES Mr Tian TSE	Transport Department to the Expert Panel Forum on Sustainable Transport Planning and Central-Wan Chai Bypass, the intensive development of the 9 sites including Tamar in the Central reclamation area will produce 9.25 million square feet of gross floor area and will attract an additional 7 623 vehicle trips her hour to Central. Even if all the proposed roads are built, traffic will still be saturated by 2016. The proposed	According to the information submitted by Transport Department to the Expert Panel in August 2005, the 9 sites in the Central reclamation areas would attract and generate traffic trips of 2,360 and 1,700 private car unit per hour respectively during the AM peak hour. Transport Department's submission to the Expert Panel indicates that the CWB would operate at a volume to capacity ratio of about 0.7 by 2016, which means that the CWB would have sufficient capacity to cope with the volume of vehicular traffic under consideration and the resultant traffic would flow smoothly.
Civic Exchange The Hong Kong University of Science & Technology	<ul> <li>The original rationale for CRIII was provision of CWB to solve congestion but the developments in CRIII will add to local surface road traffic</li> <li>Even with the proposed roads, traffic in Central will be saturated by 2016 and there will be no more reclamation. It defies common sense to purposely move thousands of jobs and the corresponding traffic flow into this small area.</li> <li>So long as Government feels it can increase density wherever its short term revenues are highest, there will be no solution to worsening traffic congestion or relief to a poor quality of life near the Central</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>built in the form of a tunnel and will not occupy the surface area of the reclaimed land. The current land use proposal allows optimized use of the reclaimed land to meet the long-term economic and social needs of Hong Kong.</li> <li>The CWB would operate at a volume to capacity ratio of about 0.7 by 2016, which means that the CWB would have sufficient capacity to cope with the</li> </ul>

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	waterfront.	<ul> <li>volume of vehicular traffic under consideration and the resultant traffic would flow smoothly.</li> <li>Our current policy is to better integrate the transport and land use planning. We would continue to enhance our efforts on this front for better quality of life.</li> </ul>
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki	traffic congestion in Central in 2016 when the	The CWB would operate at a volume to capacity ratio of about 0.7 by 2016, which means that the CWB would have sufficient capacity to cope with the volume of vehicular traffic under consideration and the resultant traffic would flow smoothly.
The Hong Kong Construction Association	The Association supports construction of the portion of Central-Wan Chai Bypass (CWB) within the CRIII reclamation area as it will provide relief to the traffic condition in Central.	
Land-use and infrastructur	e planning for the Central waterfront – Roadway prov	vision and pedestrian access to the waterfront
Professional Property Services	-	The CRIII project is needed to provide land for essential transport infrastructure including the CWB, the Road P2 network, and the extended overrun tunnel of the Airport Railway. Land uses proposed on the reclaimed land are consequential to the reclamation primarily determined by the essential transport infrastructure and the reprovisioned waterfront facilities.
Civic Exchange	Under the current planning scheme, the presence of many roads will compromise the environmental	

-	18	-
---	----	---

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
	<ul> <li>quality of the planned spaces. In particular, air pollution will get worse. The quality of open space should be questioned.</li> <li>Pedestrians will no longer be able walking at grade. Instead, they will have to walk on bridges and raised structures to reach the waterfront.</li> </ul>	including implementation of mitigation measures as required, to address environmental concerns.
Mr Winston CHU		Road P2 will be a dual 2-lane distributor road with additional turning pockets in front of road junctions to enhance the junction performance. There will be at-grade crossings along Road P2 in Central reclamation areas to allow pedestrian walking from the hinterland to the waterfront.
Save our Shorelines	surface roads in CRIII area is questionable. A full review of roadway provisions in light of current development plans and projections should be conducted	Results of traffic study have revealed that a dual-2 lane Road P2 with widening at junctions, as currently proposed, would be needed to cope with the full development of CRIII. As development will proceed gradually over a period of time, a review on the configuration of the at-grade Road P2 has been conducted in respect of a phased approach commensurate with the likely gradual completion of development. Preliminary assessment indicates that the provision of some capacity enhancing features such as turning pockets in front of

Organization/individual	Views	Administration's response
		road junctions and lay-bys could be deferred in the interim.
WWF Hong Kong	traffic load and smog. The Administration's policy of road and highway building goes contrary to its	The construction of the CWB and Road P2 will follow the statutory requirements of the EIA Ordinance, including implementation of mitigation measures as required, to address environmental concerns.
Ms Taura EDGAR		There will be at-grade crossings along Road P2 in Central reclamation areas to allow pedestrian walking from the
Ms Bethan GREAVES	groundscrapper is poor planning.	hinterland to the waterfront. In addition, the future Road P2 fronting the Tamar site will be built in the form
Mr Tian TSE		of an underpass. There will be direct at-grade pedestrian access from the waterfront promenade to the civic place of the Tamar site over an open deck of about 50m-60m wide above the depressed section of Road P2.

Council Business Division 1 Legislative Council Secretariat 8 February 2006