立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)712/07-08 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/BC/13/06

Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill

Minutes of meeting held on Thursday, 6 December 2007, at 2:30 pm in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Members : Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP (Chairman)

present Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

Hon Margaret NG

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Members : Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

absent Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

Public Officers : Mrs Jessie TING, JP

attending Deputy Secretary for Security

Ms Manda CHAN

Principal Assistant Secretary for Security

Ms Jane LEE

Assistant Secretary for Security

Mr MA Wai-luk

Assistant Commissioner of Police (Service Quality Wing)

Wing)

Ms WONG Ching-han Senior Inspector of Police

Ms Fanny IP

Acting Deputy Law Draftsman

Ms Lonnie NG

Senior Government Counsel

Attendance by invitation

Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor

Mr LAW Yuk-kai

Director

Mr KWOK Hiu-chung Education Officer

Action for REACH OUT

Miss Kendy YIM Kit-sum

Executive Director

Mr KAM Man-fai Programme Officer

Civil Human Rights Front

Miss Connie CHAN

Member of Human Rights Commission Tasks Force

Zi Teng

Miss YIM Yuet-ngor

Representative

JJJ Association

Miss LAM Yee-ling Representative

Ms YIP Yee-chun Representative

Clerk in attendance

Mrs Sharon TONG

Chief Council Secretary (2) 1

Staff in attendance

Mr LEE Yu-sung

Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Raymond LAM

Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Ms Camy YOONG Clerical Assistant (2) 1

I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration

The Bills Committee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at Annex).

- 2. The Bills Committee received the views of the following organisations on the Bill
 - (a) Action for REACH OUT;
 - (b) Civil Human Rights Front;
 - (c) Zi Teng;
 - (d) JJJ Association; and
 - (e) Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor.
- 3. The Bills Committee requested the Administration -
 - (a) to consider adding a provision in the Bill to require the Police to provide information on "cases which are neither Reportable Complaints nor Non-Reportable Complaints" to the IPCC for monitoring purpose;

- (b) to advise when the Hong Kong Bar Association and The Law Society of Hong Kong had been consulted on the proposals in the Bill and to provide the views, if any, received in such consultation;
- (c) to advise whether members of the existing IPCC were provided with copies of complaint letters addressed to IPCC and whether such a practice would be adopted for the proposed statutory IPCC;
- (d) to consider amending "reportable" and "non-reportable" complaints in the Bill as "pursuable" and "non-pursuable" complaints;
- (e) to consider allowing a complaint to be lodged by a person other than the aggrieved;
- (f) to advise on the safeguards and the Police's guidelines, if any, against the disclosure of information about a complaint to other Police officers:
- (g) to provide information on the Police's guidelines on the procedures involved in receiving complaints against the Police, including that on the assignment of a case number for each complaint received;
- (h) to consider appointing representatives from vulnerable groups such as sex workers and ethnic minorities to the proposed statutory IPCC; and
- (i) to advise whether and how a complainant could be informed of the contents of the Complaints Against Police Office's report on his or her case submitted to IPCC.
- 4. The Bills Committee agreed that the views of the Hong Kong Bar Association and the Law Society of Hong Kong would be sought on the Bill.
- 5. The Bills Committee also agreed that clauses 10(c), 10(d) and 14 should be further discussed.

II. Date of next meeting

6. The Bills Committee noted that the next meeting had been scheduled for 13 December 2007 at 2:30 pm to receive the views of IPCC on the Bill.

7. The meeting ended at 4:30 pm.

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 2 January 2008

Proceedings of meeting of the Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill on Thursday, 6 December 2007, at 2:30 pm in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
000000 - 000443	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000444 - 000849	Representative of Action for REACH OUT	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)499/07-08(03))	
000850 - 001314	Representative of Civil Human Rights Front	Presentation of views (LC Paper No. CB(2)499/07-08(04))	
001315 - 001755	Representative of Zi Teng	Presentation of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)473/07-08(01), CB(2)530/07-08(01) and CB(2)531/07-08(01))	
001756 - 002221	Representatives of JJJ Association	Presentation of views (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)499/07-08(01) and CB(2)530/07-08(01))	
002222 - 002626	Representative of Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor	Presentation of views	
002627 - 003342	Admin	Administration's response to issues raised by deputations	
003343 - 004056	Hon James TO Representative of Action for REACH OUT Representative of JJJ Association Representative of Zi Teng	Whether complaints had been lodged in respect of the cases raised by the attending deputations	
004057 - 005756	Hon Audrey EU Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Chairman Representative of Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor Representative of JJJ Association Admin	Whether the Bills Committee could move a Committee Stage amendment empowering the Independent Police Complaints Council (IPCC) to conduct investigations into complaints; whether the attending deputations supported enactment of the proposed legislation;	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		whether persons other than the aggrieved could lodge complaints against the Police; mechanism for the investigation of complaints against the Complaints Against Police Office (CAPO)	
005757 - 010737	Hon Emily LAU Representative of Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor Representative of JJJ Association Representative of Action for REACH OUT Chairman Representative of Civil Human Rights Front	Urging all members of the public who had undergone strip search by the Police to provide their case numbers to the Panel on Security; how the existing mechanism for monitoring complaints against the Police should be improved; adequacy of resources for the IPCC Secretariat; composition of IPCC	
010738 - 011435	Dr Hon Joseph LEE Admin Chairman	Declaration as Vice-Chairman of IPCC; channel for lodging complaints against the Police; whether there were statistics on complaints not handled by CAPO	
011436 - 012008	Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung	Whether IPCC should be provided with independent investigative power; whether the proposed legislation should be enacted	
012009 - 013742	Hon Alan LEONG Admin Chairman	Whether IPCC should be provided with independent investigative power; whether persons other than the aggrieved should be allowed to lodge complaints against the Police; whether clause 10(c) and (d) of the Bill should be deleted; adding a provision in the Bill to require the Police to provide information on "cases which are neither Reportable Complaints nor Non-Reportable Complaints" to the IPCC for monitoring purpose	Admin to consider adding a provision in the Bill to require the Police to provide information on "cases which are neither Reportable Complaints nor Non-Reportable Complaints" to the IPCC for monitoring purpose

Time	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action
marker 013743 - 014020	Hon Margaret NG Admin Chairman	Whether the Hong Kong Bar Association (the Bar) and the Law Society of Hong Kong (the Law Society) had been consulted on the proposals in the Bill; seeking the views of the Bar and the Law Society on the Bill	Required Admin to advise when the Hong Kong Bar Association and The Law Society of Hong Kong had been consulted on the proposals in the Bill and to provide the views, if any, received in such consultation
014021 - 014605	Chairman Admin Representative of JJJ Association	Whether members of the existing IPCC were provided with copies of complaint letters addressed to IPCC and whether such a practice would be adopted for the proposed statutory IPCC	Admin to advise whether members of the existing IPCC were provided with copies of complaint letters addressed to IPCC and whether such a practice would be adopted for the proposed statutory IPCC
014606 - 014956	Hon James TO Admin	Whether complaints lodged by persons other than the aggrieved should be categorised as reportable complaints	
014957 - 015318	Hon Audrey EU Chairman Admin	Amending "reportable" and "non-reportable" complaints in the Bill as "pursuable" and "non-pursuable" complaints; allowing a complaint to be lodged by a person other than the aggrieved; further discussion of clauses 10(c), 10(d) and 14 in the future	Admin to consider amending "reportable" and "non-reportable" complaints in the Bill as "pursuable" and "non-pursuable" complaints; to consider allowing a complaint to be lodged by a person other than the aggrieved
015319 - 015932	Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Admin Chairman	Whether the Police had issued any guidelines against the disclosure of information about a	Admin to advise on the Police's guidelines, if any,

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
	Hon Audrey EU	complaint to other Police officers; Police's guidelines on the procedures involved in receiving complaints against the Police, including that on the assignment of a case number for each complaint received	against the disclosure of information about a complaint to other Police officers; to provide information on the Police's guidelines on the procedures involved in receiving complaints against the Police, including that on the assignment of a case number for each complaint received
015933 - 020258	Hon Emily LAU	Safeguards against the disclosure of information about a complaint to other Police officers; appointing representatives from vulnerable groups such as sex workers and ethnic minorities to the proposed statutory IPCC; whether and how a complainant could be informed of the contents of CAPO's report on his or her case submitted to IPCC	Admin to advise on the safeguards against the disclosure of information about a complaint to other Police officers; to consider appointing representatives from vulnerable groups such as sex workers and ethnic minorities to the proposed statutory IPCC; to advise whether and how a complainant could be informed of the contents of CAPO's report on his or her case submitted to IPCC

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 2 January 2008