

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1010/07-08
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/BC/4/07/2

Bills Committee on Product Eco-responsibility Bill

**Minutes of the second meeting
held on Saturday, 23 February 2008, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
- Members absent** : Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
- Public officers attending** : **For item II**
Environmental Protection Department

Mr Raymond FAN
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection

Mr Alfred LEE
Assistant Director (Waste Management Policy)

Mr TE Chi-wang
Senior Administrative Officer
(Waste Management Policy Division)

Mr Patrick LIU
Senior Environmental Protection Officer
(Regional South)

Department of Justice

Miss Shandy LIU
Senior Government Counsel
Law Drafting Division

**Attendance by
invitation**

: For Item II

SEIYU (Shatin) Co., Ltd

Mr Raymond CHEUNG
General Manager (Finance and Administration)

Green Council

Ms Linda HO
Chief Executive Officer

Greeners Action

Mr HO Hon-wai
Executive Director

Green Sense

Ms Zara LO
Project Officer

Hong Kong Plastic Bags Manufacturer's Association

Mr Rickly WONG
Executive Vice President

Green Manufacturing Alliance

Mr Robert YAN
Chairman

Advisory Council on the Environment

Professor POON Chi-sun
Chairman of Waste Management Sub-committee

Green Power

Dr MAN Chi-sum
Chairman

Christians for Eco-concern

Mr H W LAI
Moderator

Democratic Party

Mr Gary FAN
Deputy Spokesman on Environmental Affairs

Consumer Council

Ms Rosa WONG
Head, Research and Trade Practices Division

The Conservancy Association

Ms Lister CHEUNG
Chief Executive

Hong Kong Retail Management Association

Mr Philippe GIARD
Chairman, Government Regulations Sub-Committee

Circle K Convenience Stores (HK) Ltd

Mr LAI Chun-pang
General Manager - Operations

Clerk in attendance : Miss Becky YU
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in attendance : Miss Kitty CHENG
Assistant Legal Adviser 5

Mrs Mary TANG
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

I Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 835/07-08 -- Minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2008)

The minutes of meeting on 24 January 2008 were confirmed.

II Meeting with deputations and the Administration

Meeting with Seiyu (Shatin) Co Ltd

Meeting with Green Council
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(01))

Meeting with Greeners Action

Meeting with Green Sense
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(02))

Meeting with Hong Kong Plastic Bags Manufacturers' Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(03))

Meeting with Green Manufacturing Alliance
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(04))

Meeting with Advisory Council on the Environment
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(05))

Meeting with Green Power

Meeting with Christians for Eco-concern
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(06))

Meeting with Democratic Party
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(07))

Meeting with Consumer Council
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(08))

Meeting with The Conservancy Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 879/07-08(01))

Meeting with Hong Kong Retail Management Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(09))

Meeting with Circle K Convenience Stores (HK) Ltd
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 879/07-08(02))

2. The Chairman also drew members' attention to the following submissions from deputations not attending the meeting -

LC Paper No. CB(1) 879/07-08(09) -- Submission from Democratic Alliance for Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(10) -- Submission from Mr YAU Wing-kwong, Tai Po District Council member

LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(11) -- Submission from Friends of the Earth (HK)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(12) -- Submission from The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers

Meeting with the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(13) -- List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion on 24 January 2008

LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(14) -- Administration's response to LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(13))

3. The Committee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex A**).

4. Members agreed to re-schedule the next meeting originally scheduled for 7 March 2008 to Thursday, 13 March 2008, at 4:30 pm.

III Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:15 am.

**Proceedings of the
Bills Committee on Product Eco-responsibility Bill
Meeting on Saturday, 23 February 2008, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
000000 - 000249	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2008 (LC Paper No. CB(1) 835/07-08)	
000250 - 000510	Chairman	Welcoming remarks	
000511 - 000641	Mr Raymond CHEUNG, General Manager (Finance and Administration) SEIYU (Shatin) Co., Ltd	Expression of views	
000642 - 000918	Ms Linda HO, Chief Executive Officer Green Council	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(01))	
000919 - 001232	Mr HO Hon-wai, Executive Director Greeners Action	Expression of views	
001233 - 001441	Ms Zara LO, Project Officer Green Sense	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(02))	
001442 - 001757	Mr Rickly WONG, Executive Vice President Hong Kong Plastic Bags Manufacturer's Association (HKPBMA)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(03))	
001758 - 002028	Mr Robert YAN, Chairman Green Manufacturing Alliance (GMA)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(04))	
002029 - 002327	Professor POON Chi-sun, Chairman of Waste Management Sub-committee Advisory Council on the Environment (ACE)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(05))	
002328 - 002718	Dr MAN Chi-sum, Chairman Green Power	Expression of views	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
002719 - 003056	Mr H W LAI, Moderator Christians for Eco-concern (CEC)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(06))	
003057 - 003443	Mr Gary FAN, Deputy Spokesman on Environmental Affairs, Democratic Party (DP))	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(07))	
003444 - 003815	Ms Rosa WONG, Head, Research and Trade Practices Division, Consumer Council (CC)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(08))	
003816 - 004157	Ms Lister CHEUNG, Chief Executive The Conservancy Association (CA)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 879/07-08(01))	
004158 - 004524	Mr Philippe GIARD, Chairman of Government Regulations Sub-Committee Hong Kong Retail Management Association (HKRMA)	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 837/07-08(09))	
004525 - 004534	Mr LAI Chun-pang, General Manager - Operations Circle K Convenience Stores (HK) Ltd	Expression of views (LC Paper No. CB(1) 879/07-08(02))	
004535 - 010515	Chairman Administration	Administration's response to deputations' views - (a) the scope of the Bill was not confined to the six types of products as set out in Clause 2 of the Bill; (b) the major regulatory measures of other Producer Responsibility Schemes (PRSs) could be added to the primary legislation through amendment bills, while their implementation details would be set out in subsidiary legislation; (c) environmental levy was meant to serve as an incentive to reduce waste and not to generate revenue;	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(d) the use of other means, such as deposit refund schemes, to encourage reuse and recycling could complement the proposed environmental levy; and</p> <p>(e) continued efforts were needed to enhance public education and publicity on waste reduction</p>	
010516 - 013437	<p>Ms Audrey EU Mr Rickly WONG, HKPBMA Ms Linda HO/Green Council Mr Robert YAN/GMA Professor POON Chi-sun/ACE Dr MAN Chi-sum/ Green Power Mr Philippe GIARD/ HKRMA Chairman Administration</p>	<p>Discussion on how the PRS on plastic shopping bags could be further improved</p> <p>Deputations' views -</p> <p>(a) the Bill should target at indiscriminate use of plastic shopping bags;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should be held accountable on how the environmental levy would be used;</p> <p>(c) used plastic bags could be recycled for use as raw materials for manufacturing plastic bags;</p> <p>(d) reference should be made to the practice in Taiwan to specify the thickness of plastic bags to facilitate recycling as plastic bags which were too thin would have very low value for recycling;</p> <p>(e) biodegradable bags should be promoted;</p> <p>(f) clean used plastic bags could be collected at retail outlets for re-use by customers who did not want to pay the environmental levy; and</p> <p>(g) the scope of PRS on plastic shopping bags should be reviewed after one year of implementation to see if it should be further expanded to cover more retailers</p> <p>Ms Audrey EU's views -</p> <p>Consideration could be given to introducing a product take-back scheme under which used plastic bags could be returned for recycling</p>	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Bill aimed at reducing waste at source and discouraging indiscriminate use of plastic shopping bags; and (b) collection of clean used plastic shopping bags could be considered with the agreement and cooperation of retail outlets 	
013438 - 014143	Mr Vincent FANG	<p>Mr Vincent FANG's concern -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) plastic shopping bags covered under the Bill were mostly re-used as bin-liners and without these, consumers would have to buy garbage bags instead; and (b) about the "switching effect" upon introduction of the environmental levy and its implications <p>Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a phased approach was adopted, with the first phase covering "prescribed retailers" where "switching" was less likely; (b) the experience of Ireland suggested that there would be a significant net decrease in the use of plastic bags, even after taking into account the slight increase in the use of garbage bags; and (c) extension of the levy scheme would be carefully considered after one year of implementation, with due consideration to the "switching" effect 	
014144 - 015359	<p>Mr Vincent FANG Chairman Administration Mr Rickly WONG/HKPBMA Ms Lister CHEUNG/CA Dr MAN Chi-sum/ Green Power</p>	<p>Discussion on the disposal of biodegradable bags</p> <p>Deputations' views -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) clarification that biodegradable and non-biodegradable plastic shopping bags could be mixed and recycled as 	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
	Mr H W LAI/CEC	<p>raw materials in the manufacture of plastic bags;</p> <p>(b) the public would need to be convinced about the effectiveness of PRS; and</p> <p>(c) overseas experience revealed that there was an overall reduction in disposal of plastic bags following introduction of PRS</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) a review would be conducted on the effectiveness of the scheme one year after implementation; and</p> <p>(b) implementation details of PRSs would be set out in subsidiary legislation</p>	
015400 - 015556	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Chairman Mr H W LAI/CEC	Discussion on the acceptability of the Bill	
015557 - 021405	Chairman Professor POON Chi-sun/ACE Administration Miss CHAN Yuen-han Ms Lister CHEUNG/CA	<p>Discussion on the need for early implementation of PRSs on plastic shopping bags and other products, including waste tyres</p> <p>Administration's explanation on the progress of implementation of voluntary PRSs on various types of products</p>	
021406 - 024530	Chairman	<p>Date of next meeting</p> <p>The next meeting originally scheduled for 7 March 2008 was re-scheduled to 13 March 2008</p>	