

**Mrs. Grace Lee Chan Ka-yan**

Your Ref: CB(3)/PAC/R49

6th December 2007

Clerk to Public Accounts Committee  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
Legislative Council Building  
8 Jackson Road  
Central, Hong Kong

Attn: Ms. Miranda Hon

Dear Madam,

**The Director of Audit's Report on the  
results of value for money audits (Report No.49)**

**Chapter 5 - Hong Kong Tourism Board:  
Corporate governance and administrative issues**

Thank you for your letter to Mr. Anthony Lau, Executive Director of the Hong Kong Tourism Board (HKTB) dated 5th December 2007 (which was copied to me). I note that you have instructed the HKTB to provide documents to me and assume you have informed them and identified the documents that are relevant to me for the public hearing. I attach a copy of their email to me and my email to them today for your reference.

I also refer to your letter of 6th December 2007. With regard to the hearing, I note that you have proposed that I attend the hearing on 13th December 2007 and in addition to Chapter 5, the Committee has now decided to invite me to the public hearing on Chapter 6. As I have mentioned, I will not be available until after 11th December 2007. Further, I need to also inform you that another of my final examination paper for my Doctor Degree Programme is due on 18th December 2007. Until I have received all the relevant documents from the Hong Kong Tourism Board, I will not have any idea on how much time I need to spend to consider them. It will also be helpful if you could let me know of the scope of questions which will be directed to me. I believe that as a matter of fairness, I should be informed by the Committee as to whether there are any allegations which are going to be made against me, and if so, the substance of the materials in support of them.

You will appreciate that as a matter of fairness I will need time to go through the relevant documents to enable me to respond to the request for information and to any allegation that may be directed at me. Allowing me proper time to review the documents would also enable me to render more useful assistance to the Committee at the hearing. I therefore suggest that when the Hong Kong Tourism Board has delivered the documents to me and when you have provided to me a general scope of questions/allegations with the materials in support of them, we could then discuss the alternative dates.

I thank you for your kind attention.

Yours faithfully,



Grace Lee Chan Ka Yan

c.c. **Mr Anthony Lau, Executive Director, HKTB**  
**Mrs Daisy Lam, Deputy Executive Director, HKTB**  
**Ms. Clara Chong**

**From:** Grace Lee  
**Sent:** Friday, December 07, 2007 12:00 AM  
**To:** 'Paul Chan'  
**Cc:** 'Anthony Lau'; 'Daisy Lam'; 'Portia Chan'; chung [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: The Director of Audit's Report (No. 49) on Hong Kong Tourism Board

Dear Paul,

Further to Portia's email below, I am approaching you to seek your assistance to provide the necessary documents to me. I wrote to the Clerk to LegCo's Accounts Committee on Tuesday, 4 December 2007 requesting for their kind assistance in sending me a full set of all documents that are likely to be relevant to me and in relation to which the Committee would like me to give evidence. I note that the Committee has in turn requested the HKTB to do so. In Portia's email, she has requested I contact you in this regards.

I would therefore be grateful if you could provide me with the aforesaid documents as requested by the Committee.

I note Clara's email to you and agree with her observations in the penultimate paragraph which I would reiterate.

Thank you for your assistance .

Regards,

Grace

**From:** Portia Chan [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 05, 2007 7:53 PM  
**To:** chung [REDACTED]; grace [REDACTED]; selina [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Anthony Lau; Daisy Lam; Paul Chan  
**Subject:** The Director of Audit's Report (No. 49) on Hong Kong Tourism Board

Dear Clara, Grace and Selina,

We have just received a letter of 5 December 2007 from the Public Accounts Committee requesting HKTB to provide relevant information and documents to you to facilitate your preparation for the public hearing on the above matter.

To enable HKTB to do so, we would appreciate you contact our Mr Paul Chan, Chief Internal Auditor, at Tel [REDACTED] (email address copied) for necessary arrangement.

Please note that information or documents will be provided on need basis with documents list subject to confidentiality obligation as mentioned in the Financial Circular No. 3/2005 (copy attached).

<<A342b928e-a6f2-41c9-aca2-35616d934e0b.PDF>>

We should like to bring your attention to:

a. Paragraph 6 of the said Financial Circular stipulates that, until the Director of Audit report is tabled in Legislative Council (LegCo), individual issues under investigation are confidential. Under no circumstances should you disclose in the public the issues under investigation.

b) Paragraph 10 of the said Financial Circular stipulates that, after tabling of the report at LegCo and before the public hearings of the Public Accounts Committee, you should refrain from initiating publicity with a view to countering the Audit findings.

You will be requested to sign a deed of undertaking (copy attached) to confirm receipt of the information and documents we provide, the Financial Circular and compliance with the confidentiality obligation in the Financial Circular.

<<former office bearers deed of undertaking.doc>>

Thank you for your attention.

Regards,

Portia Chan  
Legal Counsel  
Hong Kong Tourism Board  
Email: [REDACTED]  
Direct line: +852 [REDACTED]  
Direct fax: +852 [REDACTED]  
Website: [www.DiscoverHongKong.com](http://www.DiscoverHongKong.com)