

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2425/08-09
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/2/08/1

Panel on Development

Subcommittee on Harbourfront Planning

**Minutes of fourth meeting held on
Thursday, 11 June 2009, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Tanya CHAN (Deputy Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Members absent : Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Public officers attending : **Agenda item II**

Mr Raymond YOUNG Lap-moon, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)

Ms Alice CHEUNG Yan-wai
Principal Assistant Secretary (Harbour)
Development Bureau

Ms Jacinta WOO Kit-ching
Acting Chief Town Planner/Studies and Research
Planning Department

Ms Brenda AU Kit-ying
District Planning Officer/Hong Kong
Planning Department

Mr Eric YUE Chi-kin
District Planning Officer/Kowloon
Planning Department

Agenda item III

Mr Raymond YOUNG Lap-moon, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)

Ms Alice CHEUNG Yan-wai
Principal Assistant Secretary (Harbour)
Development Bureau

Ms Jacinta WOO Kit-ching
Acting Chief Town Planner/Studies and Research
Planning Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Anita SIT
Chief Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance : Ms Elyssa WONG
Deputy Head (Research and Library Services)

Mr Andy CHAN
Research Officer (Research and Library Services) 4

Mr Michael YU
Research Officer (Research and Library Services) 7

Mr WONG Siu-yee
Senior Council Secretary (1)7

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)7

I Confirmation of minutes
(LC Paper No. CB(1)1824/08-09 -- Minutes of meeting on
6 April 2009)

The minutes of the meeting held on 6 April 2009 were confirmed.

**II Discussion with the Administration on harbourfront
enhancement initiatives and related issues**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)1823/08-09(01) -- Administration's paper on
harbourfront enhancement
initiatives and related issues)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at
Annex).

3. The Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
briefed members on the progress of various harbourfront enhancement
initiatives as set out in the Administration's paper.

**III Briefing by Research and Library Services Division of the
Legislative Council Secretariat and the Administration on
overseas harbour authorities**

(LC Paper No. IN18/08-09 -- Paper on waterfront
management in selected
cities prepared by the
Research and Library
Services Division
(Information note)

LC Paper No. CB(1)1483/08-09(01) -- Administration's paper on

studies on overseas harbour authorities and liaison with District Councils on harbourfront enhancement)

4. The Deputy Head (Research and Library Services) briefed members on the information note on waterfront management in selected cities prepared by the Research and Library Services Division.
5. The Acting Chief Town Planner/Studies and Research, Planning Department briefed members on the studies on overseas harbour authorities conducted by the Administration.

IV Any other business

The way forward

6. Members considered that it would be useful to conduct a duty visit to two or a few cities relevant to Hong Kong's experience in waterfront management. As the visit organized by the Parliamentary Liaison Subcommittee for a delegation of the Legislative Council to Eastern Europe was scheduled for 13 to 23 September 2009, there was a suggestion that the proposed duty visit of the Subcommittee could be conducted within the period from late September to early October 2009. In this regard, it was agreed that a circular should be issued to members to invite them to indicate interest and preferences of timing and places for the visit.
7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:15 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 August 2009

Panel on Development

Subcommittee on Harbourfront Planning

**Proceedings of the fourth meeting
on Thursday, 11 June 2009, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000033	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes (LC Paper No. CB(1)1824/08-09)	
000034 – 000655	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks The Administration's briefing on its paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)1823/08-09(01))	
000656 – 001049	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Administration	Declaration of interest by Miss CHAN that she was a non-official non-executive director of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) Miss CHAN 's enquiry on the proposed uses of the Western Wholesale Food Market The Administration's response that -- (a) URA had been invited to examine the revitalization of the idle piers and URA would explore the feasibility of providing facilities such as alfresco dining facilities and shops at the piers; (b) the Central and Western District Council objected to letting out of the vacant space in the Western Wholesale Food Market to a Government department; and (c) it was not easy to relocate the Western Wholesale Food Market and the site could be considered for	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		commercial uses in the long term	
001050 – 001457	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Administration	<p>Ms HO's view that the Administration could consider constructing a small scale promenade or foot path along the coast from Kennedy Town to Sha Wan and discuss with the Southern District Council on the matter</p> <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the suggestion was interesting but needed feasibility studies; and (b) the coastal areas concerned were outside the harbour limit and due to resources constraints, the focus of harbourfront enhancement works at present was on sites within the harbour limit 	
001458 – 003226	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Administration	<p>Mr LEONG's enquiries on the feasibility of --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) constructing structures such as an elevated promenade at the eastern part of the Shaukeiwan Typhoon Shelter; (b) imposing constraints on the future development of the adjoining private site to prevent possible obstacles for creating a continuous harbourfront; and (c) implementing a strategy to prevent private harbourfront sites from hindering the creation of continuous promenades <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) no feasibility study for constructing structures such as elevated viewing galleries/promenade at those sites 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>had been conducted but the Administration would explore the idea; and</p> <p>(b) the study area of the Hong Kong Island East Harbour-front Study included the harbourfront sites referred to above; the study would be completed by the end of 2010 and it included exploring the feasibility of constructing boardwalks from North Point to Heng Fa Chuen;</p> <p>(c) harbourfront enhancement works on private sites had to wait until the right opportunity arose; and</p> <p>(d) it would be possible to prevent Government harbourfront sites from hindering the creation of continuous promenades, and requirements for the provision of promenades could be included in the lease for undeveloped sites</p> <p>The Chairman's view that planning methods such as rezoning could facilitate the creation of continuous promenades</p> <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <p>(a) while rezoning reflected the long-term planning intention, materialization of that intention would depend on whether obstacles were present, and actual implementation and planning intention were separate matters; and</p> <p>(b) some facilities such as shipyards had to be located at the harbourfront due to operational reasons</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Chairman's enquiry on pedestrian accessibility at the A Kung Ngam harbourfront</p> <p>The Administration's response that there was an existing pedestrian link under the Island Eastern Corridor</p>	
003227 – 003758	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Administration	<p>Miss CHAN's view that planning controls such as height restriction should be imposed on harbourfront sites such as the one adjacent to Shun Tak Centre</p> <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the existing policy was to control building height along the harbourfront and the Town Planning Board was reviewing the relevant Outline Zoning Plans; (b) the buildings near the said commercial site were of considerable height, and the Administration had already agreed to impose restrictions on plot ratio and building height on the said site; and (c) the said site had been temporarily withdrawn from the Application List because an interim site acceptable to the local community could not be identified to accommodate the public transport interchange <p>Miss CHAN's view that as the developments near the said site were already high, the height limit of the said site should be reduced so that the development density in the area could be lowered</p>	
003759 – 004150	Chairman	Ms Emily LAU's enquiry on why the	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Ms Emily LAU Administration	<p>Administration did not anticipate any major difficulty in securing resources or funding for harbourfront enhancement projects and the resources or funding required</p> <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) projects such as the Harbourfront Signage Scheme and temporary waterfront promenades could be carried out as Category D projects because their costs would not exceed \$21 million; and (b) the Leisure and Cultural Services Department would apply for funding for permanent waterfront promenades from the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council <p>Ms Emily LAU's enquiry on the way forward for the Subcommittee and the Chairman's advice that the subject would be discussed at the later part of the meeting</p>	
004151 – 005234	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<p>Dr LEUNG's views that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) there should be boulevards leading from the hinterland to the harbourfront; (b) the sites near the Hung Hom Ferry Pier should not be placed on the Application List; and (c) the local community hoped that a waterfront promenade could be constructed along the Yau Ma Tei Public Cargo Handling Area <p>The Administration's response that --</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) the provision of boulevards could be considered at the relevant planning stage;</p> <p>(b) the Administration had imposed sufficient planning controls on the sites near the Hung Hom Ferry Pier, conducted air ventilation assessment, and maintained wind corridors and non-building areas;</p> <p>(c) the planning briefs would serve as a basis for preparing the master layout plan for approval by the Town Planning Board;</p> <p>(d) the provision of a permanent waterfront promenade had been specified in the relevant Outline Zoning Plan and a temporary waterfront promenade could be constructed; and</p> <p>(e) although the Yau Ma Tei Public Cargo Working Area would not be relocated in the near future due to operational needs, the Administration was studying the feasibility of enhancing the existing pedestrian link thereat and discussing with the relevant District Council on the provision of further open space along the harbourfront</p>	
005235 – 005718	Chairman Mr IP Kwok-him Administration	<p>Mr IP's views that Public Cargo Working Areas had operational needs to continue to exist and solutions such as constructing elevated viewing galleries should be explored so that different uses could co-exist at harbourfront sites</p> <p>The Administration's response that it would explore the feasibility of Mr IP's suggestion</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005719 – 010850	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<p>Dr LEUNG's views that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in relation to the Application List, the Administration should be fair in handling the inclusion or removal of sites on both sides of the harbour; (b) the sites near Hung Hom Ferry Pier should not be placed on the Application List; and (c) boardwalks and elevated footbridges could improve pedestrian connectivity along the harbourfront without the need for relocating Public Cargo Working Areas <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) inclusion or removal of sites on both sides of the harbour would be handled in a fair manner based on the individual circumstances of each case; (b) its intention was to eventually include the site near Shun Tak Centre on the Application List; and (c) the due statutory town planning process for approving the Hung Hom Outline Zoning Plan had been followed 	
010851 – 012116	Chairman Deputy Head (Research and Library Services)	Briefing on the information note by the Deputy Head (Research and Library Services) (LC Paper No. IN18/08-09)	
012117 – 012611	Chairman Administration	The Administration's briefing on its paper (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1483/08-09(01))	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Chairman's enquiry on when the Task Group on the Management Model for the Harbourfront of the Harbour-front Enhancement Committee (HEC) would release its Recommendation Report and how the Administration would handle the Report</p> <p>The Administration's response that the Report was being prepared and HEC had to consider the Report before releasing it</p>	
012612 – 012916	Chairman Mrs Sophie LEUNG	<p>Mrs LEUNG's views that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) there was no need to set a model for harbourfront management for Hong Kong hastily because overseas experience indicated that developing a successful model required a long process; (b) apart from the views of concern groups, the views of other relevant sectors should be taken into consideration in studying the issue; and (c) the issue should be considered after the development of harbourfront areas, such as the Kai Tak Development, had reached maturity and studied from a more macro perspective <p>The Chairman's view that as revealed by the experience of overseas waterfront cities, the implementation of major harbourfront projects often served as the impetus to the revamp of waterfront planning and management modes. As the West Kowloon Cultural District, Kai Tak Development and the new Central harbourfront, which were important harbourfront projects, were in the pipeline, it would be opportune to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		examine possible harbourfront management models for Hong Kong	
012917 – 013712	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Administration	<p>Mr LEONG's views that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the present was a critical period because the three projects referred to by the Chairman would affect the outlook of the harbour; (b) the institutional arrangements for harbourfront management should be studied in a timely manner, otherwise it might be difficult to introduce changes to developments that had already been implemented; and (c) the Administration should consider establishing an overarching high level body to guide the development of the three projects to safeguard the sustainable development of the harbour <p>The Chairman's view that consideration could be given for HEC to evolve into a harbour authority</p> <p>The Administration's response that --</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) HEC was an advisory body with extensive public participation but the body proposed by Mr Alan LEONG was intended to be a statutory body; (b) different harbour authorities varied significantly in various aspects and the Administration had no definite views on the issue of establishing a harbour authority; and (c) the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority had been established and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>its relationship with the proposed body, if established, had to be carefully considered</p> <p>The Chairman's suggestion that the Hong Kong Planning and Infrastructure Exhibition Gallery could be used as a venue for conducting public engagement activities and displaying information related to harbourfront development</p> <p>The Administration's response that it would consider the suggestion and a location had already been reserved for setting up a permanent gallery</p>	
013713 – 014052	<p>Chairman Administration Mr Alan LEONG Miss Tanya CHAN Clerk</p>	<p>Discussion on the way forward</p> <p>The Chairman's solicitation of members' views on conducting an overseas duty visit and his advice that a circular should be issued to members in this regard</p> <p>A proposal should be submitted to the House Committee for consideration if members decided to conduct the proposed visit</p>	