

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1) 2132/08-09
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/3/08/1

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

Minutes of meeting
held on Thursday, 14 May 2009, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
- Public officers attending** : Dr Kitty POON
Under Secretary for the Environment
- Mr Carlson K S CHAN
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)
- Mr MOK Wai-chuen
Acting Assistant Director (Air Policy)
Environmental Protection Department
- Mr PANG Sik-wing
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Air Policy)
Environmental Protection Department
- Ms Alice AU YEUNG
Principal Transport Officer
Transport Department

Clerk in attendance : Miss Becky YU
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in attendance : Mr Franco KWONG
Council Secretary (1)1

I. Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1498/08-09 — Minutes of the meeting held on 19 March 2009)

The minutes of the meeting held on 19 March 2009 were confirmed.

II. Meeting with the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 733/08-09(04) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 13 January 2009
(*issued for the meeting 12 February 2009*)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1463/08-09(01) — Administration's response to CB(1) 733/08-09(04)
(*issued on 30 April 2009*)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1537/08-09(01) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 16 April 2009
(*issued on 8 May 2009*)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1537/08-09(02) — Administration's response to CB(1) 1537/08-09(01)
(*issued on 8 May 2009*)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 733/08-09(02) — Submission from Professor Anthony J HEDLEY, The University of Hong Kong (English version only)
(*issued for the meeting on 12 February 2009*)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1562/08-09(01) — Administration's response to CB(1) 733/08-09(02))

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

3. The Administration was requested to -

(a) provide the parameters and details of the feasibility study on setting up of low emission zones (LEZ) and advise the possible corridors for LEZs. In addition to franchised buses, all vehicles with higher exhaust emissions should be restricted from entering LEZ. Apart from the types of vehicle, restriction should also be imposed on the number of passengers on board of vehicles entering LEZ;

(b) advise the outcome of consultation with franchised bus companies on the proposed setting up of LEZ. To facilitate compliance with the new Air Quality Objectives (AQOs) and the setting up of LEZs by franchised buses, consideration should be given to subsidizing or extending the \$3.2 billion scheme grant to cover franchised bus companies to encourage early replacement of their bus fleets;

- (c) advise the plan on rationalization of bus routes, the number of bus routes which have been cancelled, amalgamated and truncated, as well as the number of buses which have been saved as a result;
- (d) advise the latest progress of negotiation with the power companies regarding the increased use of liquefied natural gas (LNG) for power generation, taking into account the agreement between Hong Kong and Guangdong on LNG supply; and
- (e) consult the Subcommittee before release of the public consultation on the pace, priority and price for implementing the proposed Phase I control measures under the review of AQOs.

4. Members agreed to continue discussion on the progress of measures to reduce emissions from ferries and power plants at the next meeting scheduled for Thursday, 18 June 2009, at 10:45 am.

III. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 June 2009

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Thursday, 14 May 2009, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000001 - 000232	Chairman	The minutes of the meeting held on 19 March 2009 were confirmed.	
<i>Agenda Item II - Meeting with the Administration</i>			
000233 - 000958	Chairman Administration	Administration's explanation on its response to the list of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 13 January 2009. (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1463/08-09(01))	
000959 - 001211	Ms Miriam LAU	<p>Discussion on Appendices III and VI to LC Paper No. CB(1) 1463/08-09(01) regarding progress of measures to control emissions from motor vehicles, study on low emission zones (LEZ), rationalization of bus routes, and bus-bus interchange (BBI) schemes</p> <p>Ms Miriam LAU's views -</p> <p>(a) need to rationalize bus routes in order to relieve traffic congestion and to improve air quality. Rationalization of bus routes usually did not have the support of District Councils (DCs) on account of the inconvenience caused to residents. Besides, some DC members were concerned that they might risk their chances of re-election if they supported the rationalization of bus routes within their district; and</p> <p>(b) commuters would need to accept rationalization of bus routes and BBI schemes as otherwise there would be a proliferation of bus routes</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
001212 - 002016	Mr KAM Nai-wai Chairman Ms Miriam LAU	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's views -</p> <p>(a) DC members would not support rationalization of bus routes because this would unlikely be welcome by residents; and</p> <p>(b) the effectiveness of BBI schemes was very much in doubt as few commuters were aware of the fare concessions and routings of BBI schemes</p> <p>Ms Miriam LAU's view that the Administration should adhere to objective standards/principles in rationalizing bus routes and should not yield to pressure from DCs</p> <p>Chairman's enquiry on the need for the Administration to engage a consultant to conduct studies on the rationalization of bus routes and BBI schemes</p>	
002017 - 002600	Administration	<p>Environment Bureau's response -</p> <p>(a) through bus service rationalization efforts, a large number of bus trips passing through Central, Yee Wo Street and Nathan Road had been removed from 1999 to 2008;</p> <p>(b) Transport Department (TD) would continue to pursue further bus service rationalization where practicable in consultation with DCs; and</p> <p>(c) some 120 000 passengers had been using BBI schemes and enjoying the associated fare concessions everyday</p> <p>TD's response -</p> <p>(a) TD had continuously reviewed the passengers' demand of different bus routes;</p> <p>(b) franchised bus companies were required to submit a five-year forward planning programme which comprised a route development plan (RDP) to the Administration every year;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) TD would consult DCs on the RDP submitted by the franchised bus companies with reference to the general guidelines on bus rationalisation;</p> <p>(d) consideration would be given to the situation on the ground including passengers' demand before deciding on the rationalization of bus routes; and</p> <p>(e) some 500 buses were saved between 2002 and 2008 through rationalization of bus routes.</p>	
002601 - 002750	Chairman Administration	<p>Chairman's enquiry on the outcome of consultation with DCs on the rationalization of bus routes</p> <p>Administration's response –</p> <p>(a) DCs would be briefed on the proposed plans on rationalization of bus routes at the start of each year; and</p> <p>(b) some bus routes had been cancelled after consultation with DCs</p>	The Administration to advise the plan on rationalization of bus routes, the number of bus routes which have been cancelled, amalgamated and truncated, as well as the number of buses which have been saved as a result
002751 - 002955	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's enquiry on whether fare concessions associated with BBI schemes could be extended to cover bus routes operated by different franchised bus companies</p> <p>Administration's response that there were currently over 200 BBI schemes involving about 400 bus routes operated by different franchised bus companies.</p>	
002956 - 003433	Chairman Administration Mr KAM Nai-wai	<p>Chairman's enquiry on the plan to set up LEZ</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) a study on the feasibility of setting up of a pilot LEZ at one or more busy corridors, such as Yee Wo Street and Des Veoux Road Central, to restrict the entrance of franchised buses with higher exhaust emissions was being</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>carried out;</p> <p>(b) in considering the setting up of pilot LEZ, the study would also ensure the continuous provision of effective services by franchised bus companies to passengers in various districts, and minimization of disruption of road traffic in different districts; and</p> <p>(c) the feasibility study was expected to be completed in 2009-2010</p>	
003434 - 004009	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's enquiry on the parameters and details of the feasibility study on setting up of LEZ</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the decision on the types of vehicles to be allowed to enter LEZ would depend on the availability of buses which could meet the required emission standards; and</p> <p>(b) reference would be made to overseas experience on the duration for restriction (busy hours only or round-the-clock)</p>	
004010 - 004340	Chairman Administration Mr KAM Nai-wai	<p>Chairman's views -</p> <p>(a) apart from restricting the types of vehicle entering LEZ, consideration should be given to restricting the number of passengers on board of vehicles entering the zone; and</p> <p>(b) in addition to franchised buses, all vehicles with higher exhaust emissions should be restricted from entering the LEZ</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the focus of LEZ was to restrict the entry of buses with higher exhaust emissions; and</p> <p>(b) BBI schemes would be reviewed following the setting up of LEZ</p>	<p>The Administration to provide the parameters and details of the feasibility study on setting up of LEZ and advise the possible corridors for the zones. In addition to franchised buses, all vehicles with higher exhaust emissions should be restricted from entering the zones. Apart from the types of vehicle, restriction should also be imposed on the number of passengers on board of vehicles entering the zone</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
004341 - 004821	Chairman Administration	<p>Discussion on the progress of the one-off grant scheme to encourage the replacement of old diesel commercial vehicles</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) before introduction of the incentive scheme, there were about 60 000 pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles in Hong Kong;</p> <p>(b) about 11 000 pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles had been replaced under the scheme;</p> <p>(c) about 26 000 pre-Euro diesel vehicles and 16 000 Euro I diesel vehicles were still in use;</p> <p>(d) about 30% of pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles had been scrapped since the introduction of the incentive scheme; and</p> <p>(e) deadline for application of the incentive scheme had been extended to March 2010</p>	
004822 - 005328	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's view that the Administration should consider providing one-off grants to owners who scrapped their old vehicles without replacement</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) owners who replaced their pre-Euro and Euro I commercial vehicles would get subsidy of about 12% and 18% of the replacement cost respectively;</p> <p>(b) about 6 000 old diesel commercial vehicles were scrapped, and their owners did not apply for any subsidies under the incentive scheme to purchase replacement vehicles; and</p> <p>(c) it might not be cost-effective to grant subsidy to those owners who scrapped their vehicles without any intention to procure new vehicles to continue with their business</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005329 - 005600	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's enquiry on the means to enhance the attractiveness of the scheme</p> <p>Administration's response that it did put forth a proposal of introducing financial disincentive through higher licence fees for old polluting vehicles, but it was not supported by the Panel on Environmental Affairs</p>	
005601 - 010830	Administration Chairman	<p>Chairman's views -</p> <p>(a) the amount of subsidy should be increased to enhance the attractiveness of the scheme; and</p> <p>(b) subsidy should be granted to vehicle owners who scrapped their vehicles without replacement</p> <p>Administration's explanation that it might not be cost-effective to grant subsidy to those owners who scrapped their vehicles without any intention to procure new vehicles to continue their business</p>	
010831 - 011338	Mr KAM Nai-wai Chairman Administration	<p>Discussion on the replacement of old franchised buses</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the franchised bus companies were required to submit each year a five-year forward planning programme which comprised a vehicle replacement plan;</p> <p>(b) franchised bus companies had committed to using buses below 18 years old for their franchised bus services;</p> <p>(c) reference would be made to the outcome of Review of Air Quality Objectives (AQOs) when formulating the replacement plans for old buses and commercial vehicles; and</p> <p>(d) in the past three years, over 400 old buses were scrapped and replaced by some 300 new buses</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
011339 - 012823	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration Chairman	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's view that the studies and consultation might not be necessary if the franchised bus companies supported the incentive scheme for early replacement of old buses and the introduction of LEZ</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the franchised bus companies had already deployed mostly Euro II or above buses to service many busy corridors, but the Administration would prefer Euro III or IV buses in order to further improve roadside air quality; and</p> <p>(b) need to consult the franchised bus companies on the availability of cleaner buses for servicing LEZ</p> <p>Chairman's request for information about the outcome of consultation with the franchised bus companies on the setting up of LEZ</p>	<p>The Administration to advise the outcome of consultation with franchised bus companies on the proposed setting up of LEZ. To facilitate compliance with the new AQOs and the setting up of LEZ by franchised buses, consideration should be given to subsidizing or extending the \$3.2 billion scheme grant to cover franchised bus companies to encourage early replacement of their bus fleets</p>
012824 - 013840	Mr KAM Nai-wai Chairman Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's concern about the cost implications in implementing the proposed Phase I control measures under the review of AQOs.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) public consultation would be conducted on the Review of AQOs, including the 19 measures proposed by the consultant; and</p> <p>(b) parties to be consulted would include the Legislative Council, DCs and stakeholders</p>	<p>The Administration to consult the Subcommittee before release of the public consultation on the pace, priority and price for implementing the proposed Phase I control measures under the review of AQOs</p>
013841 - 015053	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views and enquiries -</p> <p>(a) whether all franchised buses in use complied with the statutory emission standard;</p> <p>(b) need to step up enforcement against smoky buses;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) whether the Administration or the franchised bus companies would bear the replacement costs if the outcome of the consultation revealed that the public supported the use of cleaner buses, but not the expected increase in bus fare</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) all franchised buses in use complied with the prevailing emission standard at the time of first registration (the emission standard was Euro IV since 2006);</p> <p>(b) smoky buses was largely relating to inadequate maintenance;</p> <p>(c) in the past year, about 100 buses were found to have emission problems and had since been repaired;</p> <p>(d) the Smoky Vehicle Control Programme was in place to monitor smoky vehicles; and</p> <p>(e) in considering the apportionment of costs in implementing air quality improvement measures, reference would be made to the outcome of consultation</p>	
015054 - 015319	Chairman Ms Cyd HO	Members agreed to hold the next meeting on 18 June 2009 at 10:45 am to discuss Appendices IV and V to LC Paper No. CB(1) 1463/08-09(01) regarding measures to reduce emissions from ferries and power plants	
015320 - 015914	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	Ms Cyd HO's request for the latest progress of negotiation with the power companies regarding the increased use of liquefied natural gas (LNG)	The Administration to advise the latest progress of negotiation with the power companies regarding the increased use of LNG for power generation, taking into account the agreement between Hong Kong and Guangdong on LNG supply

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015915 - 015950	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat Mr KAM Nai-wai	The Subcommittee's acceptance of Mr Andrew CHENG's application for withdrawal from the Subcommittee	
015951 - 020106	Chairman	The Subcommittee would discuss the drafting of its report at the next meeting	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 June 2009