

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2581/09-10
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/SS/8/09

**Subcommittee on Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance
(Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2010**

**Minutes of the first meeting on
Tuesday, 8 June 2010, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

Members absent : Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item II**

Mr Alan K M CHU
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 3

Miss Erica NG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 2

Mr David TO
Assistant Commissioner / Planning
Transport Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Stephen LAM
Assistant Legal Adviser 4

Ms Sarah YUEN
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Miss Angela LAM
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Election of Chairman

Ms Miriam LAU was elected Chairman of the Subcommittee.

II Meeting with the Administration

- (L.N. 67 of 2010 — Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2010
- File Ref: THB(T) CR 1/4651/94 — The Legislative Council Brief issued by the Transport and Housing Bureau
- LC Paper No. LS 68/09-10 — Legal Service Division Report on Subsidiary Legislation Gazetted on 20 May 2010
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2133/09-10(01) — Marked-up copy of the Schedule to Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance (Cap.393) prepared by the Legal Service Division
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2150/09-10 — Paper on Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2010 prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

3. Members noted that there was little room for Members to amend the Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2010 other than making minor technical amendments, and that the Legislative Council could not repeal the Notice. Members expressed the following views and concerns about the toll increase reflected by the Notice, in particular the following –

Action

- (a) Whether the proposed toll increase was justified having regard that the Tate's Cairn Tunnel Company Limited (TCTC) was making a profit;
- (b) The toll increase might trigger a round of fee increases by other public utilities, and a suggestion that TCTC should be urged to offer additional toll concessions, in particular those for buses considering their high patronage;
- (c) More vehicles might divert to the Lion Rock Tunnel (LRT) owing to the widened toll disparity between LRT and the Tate's Cairn Tunnel (TCT) as a result of the toll increase; and
- (d) The impact of the toll increase on the traffic flow and toll level of Route 8.

4. The Administration agreed to convey members' views and concerns to TCTC, and made the following points –

- (a) TCT's tolls took up less than 1% of the total operational cost of bus companies; and
- (b) The toll increase was forecast to cause only a slight traffic diversion of about 500 and 100 vehicles daily to LRT and Route 8 respectively.

5. Members agreed to schedule another meeting for Tuesday, 15 June 2010, at 4:30 pm to meet with TCTC and to enable the Administration to report on the outcome of its negotiation with TCTC for additional toll concessions. Members also agreed that the Chairman should move a motion to extend the scrutiny period of the Notice to 14 July 2010.

Admin
Clerk

III Any other business

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:20 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
23 July 2010

**Proceedings of the first meeting of
the Subcommittee on Tate's Cairn Tunnel Ordinance
(Amendment of Schedule) Notice 2010
on Tuesday, 8 June 2010, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Election of Chairman			
000057– 000120	Ms Miriam LAU Mr WONG Kwok-hing Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming	- Opening remarks and election of Chairman	
Agenda item II – Meeting with the Administration			
000121 – 000514	Chairman Administration	- Administration's briefing on the Notice	
000515 – 001049	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expression of regrets that no representative from TCTC attended the meeting - Expression of concern that the toll increase might trigger a round of fee increases by other public utilities, and call for additional toll concessions to mitigate the above impact - Discussion on the need to examine the option of buying back TCT to obviate further toll increases by TCTC, and on the progress of the study on rationalizing the utilization of road harbour crossings 	
001050 – 002015	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Discussion on the concern about the diversion of more vehicles to LRT owing to the widened toll disparity between LRT and TCT as a result of the toll increase - Discussion on the impact of the toll increase on the toll level of Route 8 - Discussion on the impact of the toll increase on the traffic flow of Route 8, and hence the need to relieve the serious congestion during morning peak hours at the Shatin section of Tai Po Road near New Town Plaza, which was the road leading to Route 8 - Discussion on the cause of the above congestion problem, namely, the failure to seek approval from Sha Tin District Council for the permanent closure of the slip road in front of Scenery Court to facilitate widening of the above section of Tai Po Road, and on the possible solutions to the problem 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
002016 – 002324	Chairman Mr IP Wai-ming Administration	- Discussion on the impact of the toll increase on the operational cost and hence bus fares, and in turn the need to offer toll concessions for buses	
002325 – 003300	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration Mr IP Wai-ming	- Discussion on the need to schedule another meeting to meet with TCTC and to enable the Administration to report on the outcome of its negotiation with TCTC for additional toll concessions - Decision to extend the scrutiny period to 14 July 2010	The Administration and the Clerk to take follow-up action (paragraph 5 of minutes)

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
23 July 2010