

Ref : CB2/PL/CA

LC Paper No. CB(2)1734/09-10

(These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Panel on Constitutional Affairs

Minutes of special meeting held on Tuesday, 12 January 2010, at 2:45 pm in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Members present	:	Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman) Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Deputy Chairman) Hon Albert HO Chun-yan Dr Hon Margaret NG Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC Hon CHIM Pui-chung Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS Hon WONG Yuk-man Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Members absent	:	Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP Hon LEE Wing-tat Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP Hon Tanya CHAN Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
Public Officers attending	:	Mr Stephen LAM Sui-lung Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Mr Joshua LAW Chi-kong Permanent Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
Attendance by invitation	:	Session OneMr CHEUNG Yan-hongMr SIU Yu-kenKowloon City District Resident AssociationMr PUN Kwok-wah Vice-chairmanMr WONG KwanHong Kong Federation of StudentsMiss CHOW Ching SecretariatHong Kong Polytechnic University Students' UnionMr WONG Kai-hing External Vice-PresidentCity University of Hong Kong Students' UnionMr WONG Chun-kin
		Representative <u>The Student Union of the Hong Kong Baptist University</u> Miss YIP Cho-yan

Acting President

- 3 -

Lingnan University Students' Union

Miss SO Pui-man General Officer, Ad hoc Administrative Committee

The Student Union of Hong Kong Shue Yan University

Miss KIANG Yan-sin

惠妍芳婦女會

Ms POON Wai-fong

Miss SHEK Mei-po

Session Two

Mr Rock CHEN Chung-nin

The Singapore & Malaysia & Thai Overseas Returned Chinese

Mr LEUNG Ping-kwong Member

Hong Kong Youth Think-Tank

Mr CHAN Chi-ho Chairman

Mr SZE Wine-him

The Student Union of the Chinese University of Hong Kong

Mr LAI Yan-ho Representative

<u>善為扶貧助學會</u>

Mr Gary LUNG

Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations

Mr CHAU ON Ta-yuen Vice-Chairman

Mr NG Hi-on

Mr FONG Chi-fai

Ms TAM Miu-fan

4 -

Session Three

The Fukienese Association Ltd.

Mr SZE Chin-hung Permanent Honorary Chairman

<u>逸東社區網絡協會</u>

Mr KWOK Chung-man

<u>Ms LEUNG Yuk-fung</u> Member of Kwai Tsing District Council

<u>Ms CHAU Chuen-heung</u> Member of Islands District Council

<u>Ms YUNG Wing-sheung</u> Member of Islands District Council

Civil Human Rights Front

Mr LEE Yiu-kee Member

<u>Ms LAM Yau-han</u> Member of Islands District Council

自由論壇

Mr CHIN Wai-lok

Mr LUM Kei-po

Mr LAU Chun-yip

Mr CHOY Chak-man

Mr CHAN Chung-kit

Mr WONG Wa-pan

Ms CHENG So-ngor

Ms CHIU Fung-yi

Clerk in attendance :

Miss Flora TAI Chief Council Secretary (2)3

Staff in attendance	:	Mr Arthur CHEUNG Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
		Ms Clara TAM Assistant Legal Adviser 9
		Ms Amy YU Senior Council Secretary (2)3
		Mrs Fonny TSANG Legislative Assistant (2)3
		Miss Lulu YEUNG Clerical Assistant (2)3

Action

I. Consultation Document on Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012

[Consultation Document on Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012 and Statement by the Chief Secretary for Administration on "Consultation Document on Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012" at the Council meeting on 18 November 2009]

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

<u>Members</u> noted that this was the last special meeting scheduled by the Panel to receive views from the deputations/individuals which/who had requested to make submissions on the Consultation Document on Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") and for Forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012 ("Consultation Document"). A summary of the views given by deputations and individuals on the Consultation Document is in the **Appendix**.

Administration's response to the views of deputations/individuals

Issues regarding universal suffrage

2. <u>Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs</u> ("SCMA") expressed disagreement with the views of Mr WONG Kai-hing of Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union and Ms LEUNG Yuk-fung that the Administration's proposals for the two electoral methods for 2012 were retrogressive. Neither did he subscribe to Mr LAU Chun-yip's view that the Administration had not tried its utmost to advance Hong Kong's democratic development. He pointed out that the Administration had succeeded in securing a timetable for implementation of universal suffrage. According to the decision made by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress ("NPCSC") on 29 December 2007 on issues

Action

relating to the methods for selecting CE and for forming LegCo in 2012 and on issues relating to universal suffrage ("the 2007 NPCSC Decision"), universal suffrage for CE and LegCo could be implemented in 2017 and 2020 respectively. Furthermore, when compared with the package of proposals put forth in 2005, the Administration had further enhanced the democratic elements of the two elections by proposing to exclude appointed District Councils ("DC") members' participation in the election of representatives of DCs to the Election Committee ("EC") and LegCo.

Noting the call for the implementation of dual universal suffrage in 2012 3. from the representatives of the students unions of various universities and the Civil Human Rights Front, SCMA said that in the light of the 2007 NPCSC Decision, there was no constitutional basis for further pursuing the implementation of universal suffrage in 2012. He elaborated that the report submitted by CE to NPCSC on 12 December 2007 on the two electoral methods for 2012 ("the CE Report") had reflected faithfully the views of different sectors of the community on the issue of universal suffrage received during the public consultation period, including that more than half of the public supported the implementation of universal suffrage for CE and LegCo in 2012. At the same time, about 60% of the public accepted the implementation of universal suffrage for CE in 2017 and more than half of the public accepted the implementation of universal suffrage for LegCo in 2016 or thereafter, if universal suffrage for the two elections could not be attained in 2012. Having considered the CE Report, NPCSC made a decision on 29 December 2007 that universal suffrage for CE and LegCo could be implemented in 2017 and 2020 respectively. Under Article 62 of the Constitution of the People's Republic's of China, it was for the National People's Congress to determine systems to be practised in a Special Administrative Region. Thus, when NPCSC made the Decision in 2007 that CE could be returned through universal suffrage in 2017 and LegCo in 2020, the Decision had constitutional status and had legal effect. He further said that the timetable for universal suffrage provided in the 2007 NPCSC Decision had provided a clear basis and direction for the constitutional development of Hong Kong. While some people might not consider 2017/2020 to be the most ideal timetable, there was only a difference of one term between the years 2012 and 2017. He hoped that the whole community would take this timetable as the basis for rolling forward democracy in Hong Kong.

4. On the comment made by Mr LEE Yiu-kee of the Civil Human Rights Front that the implementation of universal suffrage should accord with paragraph (b) of Article 25 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights ("ICCPR"), <u>SCMA</u> said that while the Basic Law ("BL") provided that provisions of ICCPR as applied to Hong Kong should remain in force, the Central People's Government had notified the United Nations Secretary-General in clear terms in June 1997 that the reservation entered into by the United Kingdom Government in 1976 in respect of paragraph (b) of Article 25 of ICCPR would continue to apply to the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region ("HKSAR") after the establishment of the SAR. Nevertheless, the Administration had made clear that in attaining universal suffrage for CE and LegCo, the principles of universality and equality must be complied with.

5. Referring to Mr Rock CHEN's comment that Hong Kong's constitutional development should not stall, <u>SCMA</u> said that had the package of proposals put forth by the Administration in 2005 been implemented, the two electoral methods for 2007/2008 would have progressed democratically. The Administration sincerely hoped that there would be progress in the two electoral methods for 2012. However, even if no progress could be made for the electoral methods for 2012, universal suffrage for CE could still be implemented in 2017.

6. Noting Mr NG Hi-on's agreement with the Administration that it should focus on dealing with the two electoral methods for 2012 in the Consultation Document, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration was aware that some political parties and some individuals and organisations in the community hoped that discussion on universal suffrage models for 2017/2020 could commence as soon as possible. The current-term HKSAR Government would summarise and conclude any views relating to universal suffrage received during the current public consultation exercise for the consideration of the Fourth-term and Fifth-term HKSAR Government.

Method for electing CE in 2012

7. In response to the view expressed by Miss CHOW Ching of the Hong Kong Federation of Students that the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of members of EC from 800 to 1 200 would not inject any democratic elements into the CE election, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration's proposal of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four sectors of EC by the same proportion would help uphold the principle of balanced participation. As the composition of EC might be used as the basis for that of the nominating committee when universal suffrage for CE was implemented in 2017, the Administration's proposal would ensure that the CE elected through universal suffrage would have the broad support of different sectors of the community.

8. Referring to the views of Mr CHEUNG Yan-hong and Mr SIU Yu-ken that all the proposed new seats for the fourth sector of EC should be allocated to DC members, <u>SCMA</u> clarified that under the Administration's proposal for the 2012 CE election, most, and not all, of the 100 new seats for the fourth sector should be allocated to DC members. The remaining seats could be allocated to other subsectors within the fourth sector, such as Heung Yee Kuk and the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference.

9. On Mr CHEUNG Yan-hong's proposal of replacing "corporate votes" with "director's/ executive's/ association's/ individual votes" in the two electoral methods for 2012, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration was inclined not to adopt such a proposal as there were divergent views on the issue and it would be difficult to forge consensus both within and outside LegCo.

10. Noting that Ms POON Wai-fong of 惠妍芳婦女會 was supportive of the Administration's proposal of maintaining the existing requirement that CE should not have any political affiliation, <u>SCMA</u> said that the proposal reflected the public's views that the requirement could ensure that CE would maintain impartiality when dealing with requests from different political parties. He added that while CE did not have any political affiliation, he would continue to be the most important political figure in Hong Kong, as he would have to work with different political parties and organisations in handling political matters in Hong Kong.

11. As regards the view of Mr FONG Chi-fai that consideration should be given to lowering the nomination threshold for the CE election from one-eighth to one-tenth of the total membership of EC, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration considered it appropriate to maintain the current threshold as it already could allow sufficient competition. Should the membership size of EC be expanded to 1 200 as proposed by the Administration, the Administration believed that persons from different political backgrounds, including those from the pan-democratic camp, would be able to secure the required support from 150 EC members (i.e. one-eighth of 1 200 members).

Method for forming LegCo in 2012

12. <u>SCMA</u> disagreed with the view of Miss So Pui-man of the Lingnan University Students' Union that the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats from 60 to 70 would not bring about any democratic progress. He pointed out that the Administration's proposal aimed at freezing the 29 "traditional" functional constituency ("FC") seats, while expanding the number of the DC FC seat which had the broadest electorate base among existing FCs. The Administration reckoned that such a proposal could have a higher chance of being accepted by two-thirds of LegCo Members.

13. On Ms LAM Yau-han's proposal that all the 10 new LegCo seats be returned by geographical constituencies ("GCs") through direct elections, <u>SCMA</u> said that the proposal did not comply with the 2007 NPCSC Decision that the half-and-half ratio for Members returned by FCs and Members returned by GCs through direct elections should be maintained.

14. Regarding the comment made by Mr WONG Chun-kin of the City University of Hong Kong Students' Union on the narrow electorate base of FCs, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration had strived to expand the electorate base of FCs by proposing to increase the number of DC FC seats from one to six and to have all such seats returned through election by elected DC members from among themselves. Such a proposal would expand the electorate base of FCs as elected District Councillors had a broad electorate base of over 3.3 million registered voters.

SCMA noted that Mr LAI Yan-ho of the Student Union of the Chinese 15. University of Hong Kong had queried why the Administration proposed to retain FCs in its proposals for the 2012 LegCo election even though it had acknowledged that the FC system in its present form did not comply with the principles of universal and equal suffrage. SCMA pointed out that it was required by the NPCSC Decision that there should be a half-and-half ratio for Members returned by FCs and Members returned by GCs through direct elections. Under the framework of the NPCSC Decision, the Administration had strived to enhance the democratic elements of the 2012 LegCo election so that close to 60% of the seats in LegCo would be returned by GCs through direct or indirect elections. Further progress could be made in the 2016 LegCo election, paving way for the implementation of universal suffrage in 2020. SCMA further explained the constitutional arrangements for amending the two electoral methods in Hong Kong. He pointed out that although Hong Kong was not an autonomous state, it enjoyed a high degree of autonomy and could take certain initiatives to advance Hong Kong's constitutional development. Under the relevant constitutional arrangements, CE could make a report to NPCSC as to whether there was a need to amend the two electoral methods. After a determination had been made by NPCSC, the HKSAR Government could introduce motions on amendments to the two electoral methods to LegCo. Should such amendments be endorsed by a two-thirds majority of all LegCo Members and subject to the consent of CE, the relevant bill should be reported to NPCSC for approval or for the record.

16. Noting that Mr WONG Kwan and Mr Gary LUNG of 善為扶貧助學會 had indicated support for the Administration's proposal of having all the five new FC seats returned through election by elected DC members from among themselves in 2012, <u>SCMA</u> pointed out that should such a proposal be adopted, 41 of the 70 seats in LegCo would be returned by GCs through direct or indirect elections. <u>SCMA</u> further said that while some deputations/individuals attending the meeting including Ms YUNG Wing-sheung and Mr KWOK Chung-man of 逸東社區網絡協會 had expressed objection to the proposal, it was indisputable that elected DC members had a very broad electorate base of over 3.3 million registered voters. He also stressed that when the next DC election was held in 2011, voters would know clearly then that the DC members they voted for could be elected to join EC or LegCo. As regards the election method for returning

elected DC members to the six DC FC seats, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration had not put forth any proposal in this regard and would welcome the views of different political parties and members of the public.

17. Referring to Ms TAM Miu-fan's view that FCs should be retained, <u>SCMA</u> said that in accordance with the 2007 NPCSC Decision, the half-and-half ratio between Members returned by FCs and Members returned by GCs through direct election should remain unchanged for the 2012 LegCo election. However, the community should continue to discuss the future of FCs beyond 2012.

18. As regards the view of Ms CHENG So-ngor and Ms CHIU Fung-yi that the five new GC seats should be allocated on the basis of seat-to-population ratio, <u>SCMA</u> said that should the Administration's proposal of expanding the number of LegCo seats be approved, detailed arrangements on the delineation of GCs would be discussed in the context of the amendments to be made to the Legislative Council Ordinance (Cap. 542) and other relevant legislation.

19. Noting that the Kowloon City District Resident Association had expressed support for the Administration's proposal of maintaining the existing arrangement of allowing permanent residents of Hong Kong who were not of Chinese nationality or who had the right of abode in foreign countries to stand in the elections for 12 FC seats, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration had proposed to maintain the existing arrangement as it reflected Hong Kong's cosmopolitan and pluralistic nature and allowed LegCo to attract talents from different backgrounds.

Other issues

20. While noting Ms Yung Wing-sheung's objection to the ex-officio DC membership of chairmen of the Rural Committees, <u>SCMA</u> said that in considering the membership of the New Territories DCs, it was necessary to take into account the historical background of the New Territories. He added that a democratic election system was in place for the election of village representatives in the New Territories.

21. On the proposals made by Mr KWOK Chung-man of 逸東社區網絡協會 to change the existing "single seat, single vote" election system of DCs, <u>SCMA</u> said that the existing election system had been used for many years. He believed that it would be very difficult to forge consensus on proposals which sought to introduce significant changes to the existing election system of DCs.

22. In response to CHAN Chung-kit's question as to whether the Administration had taken stock of the experience in constitutional development since the handover, <u>SCMA</u> said that in the report on the Green Paper on Constitutional Development and the CE Report published in 2007, the

Administration had summarised the constitutional development in Hong Kong since the handover. In the recently released Consultation Document, the Administration had also given a summary of the views received over the past few years on the two electoral methods for 2012.

23. <u>SCMA</u> said that he shared the view of Ms CHAU Chuen-heung that it was important to roll forward democratic development in the 2012 elections so as to pave the way for the implementation of universal suffrage for CE in 2017. He further said that the CE elected in 2012 and the LegCo formed in 2012 would work together to address the issues regarding the specific model for implementing universal suffrage for CE in 2017. As for the model for implementing universal suffrage for LegCo in 2020, the CE returned by universal suffrage in 2017 would work with the LegCo formed in 2016 to deal with the matter.

Discussion

Functional constituencies

24. Noting the proposal of Mr CHAU ON Ta-yuen of the Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations to allocate two of the five new FC seats to the Hong Kong Federation of Guangdong Associations and the Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations respectively, <u>Ms Cyd HO</u> sought clarification from Mr CHAU ON as to whether it was his view that FC seats should also be allocated to people of other provincial origins such as Shanghai. <u>Mr CHAU ON</u> responded that he had so proposed having regard to the significant contributions to the Hong Kong community made by these two Associations in their long history. The same criterion could be used in considering whether FC seats should be allocated to associations representing people of other provincial origins.

25. <u>Ms Cyd HO</u> further said that Mr CHAU ON Ta-yuen's proposal of creating FC seats for people of certain provincial origins followed the logic of FCs which sought to divide Hong Kong people into different groups. She invited SCMA to respond to Mr CHAU ON's proposal.

26. <u>SCMA</u> said that while he appreciated that the Hong Kong Federation of Guangdong Associations and the Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations had a long history and sizeable memberships, the Administration had made clear its position that no new traditional FCs would be created. The Administration welcomed the two Associations to field candidates to participate in the 2012 LegCo election through FCs or GC direct elections. The Associations could also field candidates to stand for the DC elections. Under the Administration's proposals, elected DC members could elect among themselves representatives to fill the six DC FC seats.

Action 199

27. <u>Mr Paul TSE</u> considered it unfair to deny altogether the value of the FC system merely on account of the unsatisfactory performance of certain FC Members. He pointed out that many FC Members had discharged their duties conscientiously and made significant contributions to the community. He criticised the Administration for not having reformed the FC system earlier to make it better able to meet the needs of the community

Methods for selecting CE in 2012

28. In response to Mr WONG Ting-kwong's invitation to elaborate his views, <u>Mr CHAN Chi-ho</u> of Hong Kong Youth Think-Tank said that more progressive proposals should be put forth for the CE election in 2012 so as to pave way for the implementation of universal suffrage for CE in 2017. For instance, to make EC more broadly representative, its composition should include representatives from the elderly, women, students, persons with disabilities and ethnic minorities. <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration welcomed views on the composition of EC. Noting that Mr SZE Wine-him had also proposed to create a subsector for youths in EC, <u>SCMA</u> said that the Administration would consider the views of Mr CHAN Chi-ho and Mr SZE Wine-him and see whether there was any room for expanding the subsectors in the third sector of EC.

Ms Emily LAU opined that only one-person-one-vote could ensure genuine 29. She invited Mr SZE Chin-hung of the Fukienese balanced participation. his views balanced participation. Association Ltd. to elaborate on Mr SZE Chin-hung said that in respect of the CE election, given that the EC in 2012 might be transformed into the nominating committee when universal suffrage for CE was implemented, it was important to uphold the principle of balanced participation in the composition of EC. It was for that reason that he had expressed reservation about the Administration's proposal of allocating most of the 100 new seats in the fourth sector of EC to DC members.

Other issues

30. In response to Mr WONG Ting-kwong's invitation to elaborate his views, <u>Mr Rock CHEN</u> said that many opinion polls had revealed that the majority of the public wanted to break the stalemate in constitutional development and roll forward the electoral system towards universal suffrage. He urged the Administration to listen to views expressed by different sectors of the community with a view to forging consensus.

31. <u>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</u> noted that Mr CHOY Chak-man had expressed disappointment at the Members who had planned to resign in order to bring about a "de-facto referendum" to demand for universal suffrage ("mass resignation plan"), as these Members by doing so would no longer be able to represent members of the public who had voted them into LegCo. <u>Mr LEUNG</u> said that

_

Action 199

his voters had asked him to fight for the implementation of genuine dual universal suffrage in 2012, the drawing up of the timetable and roadmap for universal suffrage as soon as practicable and the abolition of FCs, and had expressed support for his resignation. In resigning, he was being accountable to his voters. In contrast, CE was only accountable to the 800 members of EC who elected him and did not have public mandate. <u>SCMA</u>, however, said that in expressing objection to the mass resignation plan, Mr CHOY Chak-man had reflected a prominent view of members of the public.

32. The meeting ended at 6:02 pm.

Council Business Division 2 Legislative Council Secretariat 8 June 2010

Panel on Constitutional Affairs

Special meeting on Tuesday, 12 January 2010

Consultation Document on Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012 ("Consultation Document")

Summary of views of deputations/individuals

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
Sessi	ion One			
1.	Mr CHEUNG Yan-hong [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(01)]	 The membership size of the Election Committee ("EC") should be expanded to 1 600, with the number of members of the four existing EC sectors to be increased by the same proportion. All the new seats in the fourth EC sector should be allocated to District Council ("DC") members. Supports the Administration's proposal of electing all the DC representatives in EC from among elected DC members. "Corporate votes" should be replaced with "director's/ executive's/ association's/ individual votes". Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current nomination threshold of one-eighth of the total membership of EC. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. "Corporate votes" should be replaced with "director's/ executive's/ association's/ individual votes". Supports the Administration's proposal of returning all the five new functional constituency ("FC") seats and the existing DC seat through election by elected DC members from among themselves. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the existing arrangement of allowing Hong Kong permanent residents who are not of Chinese nationality or who have right of abode in foreign countries to stand in the election of 12 FC seats. 	

No.	Deputation/ Individual	 Executive ("CE") in 2012 Disagrees with the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current arrangement of not setting an upper limit on the number of subscribers in nominating candidates for the CE election. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current requirement 	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
2.	Mr SIU Yu-ken [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(01)]	 that CE should not have any political affiliation. Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. All the new seats in the fourth EC sector should be allocated to DC members. Supports the Administration's proposal of electing all the DC representatives in EC from among elected DC members. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. The five new geographical constituency ("GC") seats should be allocated to the existing five GCs in accordance with the population ratio. 	• Supports the Consultation Document for complying with the Basic Law ("BL"), the decision made by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress ("NPCSC") in December 2007 on issues relating to the methods for selecting CE and for forming LegCo in the year 2012 and on issues relating to universal suffrage ("the 2007 NPCSC Decision"), and the principle of gradual and orderly progress.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
3.	Kowloon City District Resident Association [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(02)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. Some of the new seats in the fourth EC sector can be allocated to elected DC members. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to EC. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70 to broaden the scope for political participation. The five new GC seats should be allocated to the existing five GCs in accordance with the population ratio. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to FCs. 	• The Consultation Document is consistent with BL and the 2007 NPCSC Decision, and facilitates the gradual and orderly progress of democratisation in Hong Kong.
4.	Mr WONG Kwan [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(03)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. All the new seats in the fourth EC sector should be allocated to DC members. 	 of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. The five new GC seats should be allocated to the existing five GCs in accordance with the population ratio. 	• Supports the Administration's proposals for the two electoral methods in 2012, as they are in line with BL, the 2007 NPCSC Decision and the principles of gradual and orderly progress and balanced participation, and facilitate

No.	Deputation/ Individual	MethodsforselectingtheChiefMethodsforformingtheLegisExecutive ("CE") in 2012Council ("LegCo") in 2012	slative Other issues raised
		 Supports the Administration's proposal of electing all the DC representatives in EC from among elected DC members. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to EC. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to EC. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to EC. 	of DCs economic development.
5.	Hong Kong Federation of Students [LC Paper No. CB(2)432/09-10(27)]	 The Consultation Document shows that the Administration is not committed implementation of dual universal suffrage, as evidenced by the following - (a) the proposed expansion of the membership size of EC from 800 to 1 200 do change the nature of the CE election being a small-circle election; and (b) while the Administration acknowledges that the FC system does not compl the principles of universal and equal suffrage, it has proposed to further in the number of FC seats which will further impede the eventual abolition of . The Administration should - (a) request NPCSC to withdraw its Decision made in 2007; (b) implement dual universal suffrage in 2012; (c) abolish all FCs in LegCo; and (d) ensure that CE candidates are not required to go through a preliminary sel process. 	bes not Document which fails to provide the roadmap and timetable for implementing universal suffrage. It is also y with crease a rehash of the package of proposals set out in the Fifth Report of the Constitutional Development Task Force published in 2005 ("the 2005 proposed package").

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selectingtheChiefMethods for forming theLegislativeExecutive ("CE") in 2012Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
6.	Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union	 Strongly urges the Administration to - (a) relay to the Central Authorities the Hong Kong community's aspiration for the implementation of universal suffrage in 2012; and (b) request the Central Authorities to withdraw the 2007 NPCSC Decision. Objects to any form of expansion of the FC system which will pose an obstacle to the eventual abolition of FCs. All FCs should be abolished by 2012. 	• Strongly criticises the Consultation Document for it being retrogressive.
7.	City University of Hong Kong Students' Union [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(04)]	 Strongly urges the Administration to implement genuine universal suffrage for the two elections in 2012. All FCs which have narrow electorate base and represent the vested interests of individual sectors should be abolished by 2012. 	
8.	The Student Union of the Hong Kong Baptist University	 Dual universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. Objects to the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of FC seats as FCs do not comply with the principles of universal and equal suffrage and the proposal will make it more difficult to abolish all the FC seats. All FCs should be abolished by 2012. 	
9.	Lingnan University Students' Union [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(05)]	 The Administration should implement dual universal suffrage in 2012. Objects to the Administration's proposal of expanding FC seats in LegCo as the FC system contravenes the principles of universal and equal suffrage and should be abolished in its entirety. 	• Criticises the Consultation Document for not providing any concrete timetable and roadmap for implementing universal suffrage.

-	utation/ ividual	MethodsforselectingtheChiefMethodsforformingtheLegislativeExecutive ("CE") in 2012Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
10. The Hong	Student Union of g Kong Shue Yan versity	 Urges the Administration to - (a) implement dual universal suffrage in 2012; (b) abolish all FCs as soon as practicable; and (c) ensure that CE candidates are not required to go through a preliminary selection process. 	 The Consultation Document is retrogressive, as evidenced in the proposal of increasing the number of FC seats. The proposal to increase the number of EC seats to 1 200 is also a step backward as compared with the 2005 proposed package which proposed that the membership size of EC be increased to 1 600. Expresses disappointment at the Consultation Document for its lack of a clear roadmap for attaining genuine universal suffrage. The undemocratic political system has created many problems such as the growing wealth gap, collusion between the Government and big businesses, and failure of the Administration to take account of public views in the policy-making process.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
11.	惠妍芳婦女會 [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(02)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the proportion of DC members in EC and having all such representatives elected from among elected DC members. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the existing requirement that CE should not have any political affiliation. 		
12.	Miss SHEK Mei-po [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(06)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. All the new seats in the fourth EC sector should be allocated to DC members. Supports the Administration's proposal of electing all the DC representatives in EC from among elected DC members. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. Supports the Administration's proposal of returning all the five new FC seats and the existing DC seat through election by elected DC members from among themselves. 	

No.	Deputation/ Individual	 Executive ("CE") in 2012 Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current nomination threshold of one-eighth of the total 	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
	ion Two	membership of EC.		
13.	Mr Rock CHEN Chung-nin [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(07)]	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200 to enhance the representativeness of EC and lay the foundation for the nominating committee for the 2017 CE election. Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of members of the four existing EC sectors by the same proportion to maintain the principle of balanced participation. Supports the Administration's proposal that the new seats to DCs in the fourth sector of EC should be returned by elected DC members from among themselves. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current nomination threshold of one-eighth of the total membership of EC. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70 to meet the operational requirements of LegCo and provide more room for political participation. The new GC seats should be allocated to the existing GCs in accordance with the population ratio. Supports the Administration's proposal of returning all the five new FC seats through election by elected DC members from among themselves to enhance the electorate base of FCs. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the existing arrangement of allowing Hong Kong permanent residents who are not of Chinese nationality or who have right of abode in foreign countries to stand in the election of 12 FC seats. 	

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
14.	The Singapore & Malaysia & Thai Overseas Returned Chinese [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(03)]	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200. The 2012 EC can be transformed into the nominating committee when universal suffrage for CE is implemented in 2017. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the requirement that CE should not have any political affiliation. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. The ratio of the number of FC seats for which Hong Kong permanent residents who are not of Chinese nationality or who have right of abode in foreign countries are allowed to stand in election should be reduced gradually and the arrangement should be abolished in the long run. 	• Constitutional development in Hong Kong must abide by BL and the 2007 NPCSC Decision.
15.	Hong Kong Youth Think-Tank	• To better pave the way for the implementation of universal suffrage for CE in 2017, the Administration should put forward more progressive proposals for the 2012 CE election. Consideration should be given to including representatives of the elderly, women, students, ethnic minorities and persons with disabilities in EC.		
16.	Mr SZE Wine-him [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(08)]	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200. Suggests creating more subsectors under the existing four EC sectors, e.g. a subsector for youths. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current nomination 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70 to enable more people of different backgrounds, experience and stance to participate in politics. Supports the Administration's proposal that five of the new LegCo seats should be returned by GCs through direct elections, and the other five by FCs. 	

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting Executive ("CE") in 2012the ChiefMethods for forming the Council ("LegCo") in 2012LegislativeOther issues raised
		 threshold of one-eighth of the total membership of EC. Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to FCs.
17.	The Student Union of the Chinese University of Hong Kong [LC Paper No. CB(2)457/09-10(42)]	 Objects to the Consultation Document which fails to bring Hong Kong people any closer to the goal of universal suffrage. Equal and universal voting right is the basic right of all Hong Kong people, who have been fighting for the implementation of universal suffrage for more than 20 years. The FC system is an unfair system which serves to protect the vested interests of the privileged minorities and should be abolished as soon as possible. Urges the Administration to adopt the following proposals - (a) implementation of universal suffrage for CE in 2017 and LegCo in 2020; (b) abolition of all FCs by 2020; (c) EC and the nominating committee for CE to be comprised of representatives returned through direct elections; and (d) abolition of all appointed DC seats.
18.	善為扶貧助學會 [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(09)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of increasing the proportion of elected DC members in EC and returning all the five new FC seats in LegCo through election by elected DC members from among themselves to enhance the representativeness of the two elections. FCs should be retained and its abolition will turn Hong Kong into a welfare society.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	ũ	Methods for forming the Legislative	Other issues raised
19.	Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(04)]	Executive ("CE") in 2012	 Council ("LegCo") in 2012 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70 to meet the operational requirements of LegCo and provide more room for political participation. Supports the Administration's proposal that five of the new LegCo seats should be returned by GCs through direct elections, and the other five by FCs. Suggests allocating three of the new FC seats to DCs and having all the DC FC seats returned through election by elected DC members from among themselves. The remaining two new FC seats should be allocated to the Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations and Hong Kong Federation of Guangdong Associations respectively. 	
20.	Mr NG Hi-on [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(10)]	including the proposals of increasing	Is for the two electoral methods in 2012, the numbers of EC members to 1 200 and e participation of elected DC members in EC.	 Supports the Consultation Document which accords with the 2007 NPCSC Decision and is consistent with the principles under BL, including meeting the interests of different sectors of society, facilitating the development of the capitalist economy, gradual and orderly

No.	Deputation/ Individual	MethodsforselectingtheChiefMethodsforformingtheLegislativeExecutive ("CE") in 2012Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
			 progress, and being appropriate to the actual situation in Hong Kong. In accordance with the 2007 NPCSC Decision, the HKSAR Government can only deal with the two electoral methods for 2012 in the Consultation Document but not the universal suffrage arrangements for 2017/2020.
21.	Mr FONG Chi-fai [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(11)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals for the two electoral methods. Proposes to lower the nomination threshold for CE candidates from one-eighth to one-tenth of the total membership of EC to further democratise the election. 	• Hong Kong should strive to forge consensus on the two electoral methods for 2012 on the basis of BL and the 2007 NPCSC Decision to ensure that Hong Kong's political system can progress towards the goal of universal suffrage.
22.	Ms TAM Miu-fan [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(12)]	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200. Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. FCs should be retained at the present stage to ensure balanced participation and meeting the interests of different sectors of society. 	• Constitutional development must be in compliance with BL and the 2007 NPCSC Decision.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
Sessi	on Three			
23.	The Fukienese Association Ltd. [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(05)]	• Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to not more than 1 200. As EC may be transformed into the nominating committee when universal suffrage for CE is implemented, the number of EC members should not increase beyond 1 200 to prevent the nominating committee from having too large a membership.		
		• Objects to the Administration's proposal of allocating most of the 100 new seats in the fourth EC sector to DC members as this is not conducive to upholding the principle of balanced participation. The new EC seats should be allocated in accordance with principles adopted in the past.		
24.	逸東社區網絡協會 [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)457/09-10(46), CB(2)721/09-10(06) and CB(2)951/09-10(01) to (02)]	• Proposes to include all elected DC members into the fourth sector of EC.	• Objects to the Administration's proposal of returning the five new FC seats and the existing DC seat through election by elected DC members from among themselves. The proposal will not enhance the electorate base of FCs, as an elected DC member has an average of only about 2 000 votes. Moreover, electing DC members and LegCo Members are very different. The fact that a person votes for a certain DC member does not mean that he will also	Document is disappointing and it does not contain progressive proposals nor any timetable and roadmap for universal suffrage.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
			 support that DC member's choice of LegCo Members. Proposes to increase LegCo seats from 60 to 80, with 10 seats to be returned by GCs through direct elections and 10 seats to the DC FC. All the 10 new FC seats and the existing DC seat should be returned through one-person-one-vote by all registered voters in Hong Kong from among candidates nominated by elected DC members from among themselves. 	• Proposes to reform the DC system before the 2011 DC election by abolishing appointed DC membership, adopting the "multiple seats, single vote" election method, reviewing the remuneration system for DC members, and lowering the seat-to-population ratio to 1:10 000, among others.
25.	Ms LEUNG Yuk-fung, Member of Kwai Tsing District Council	unacceptable. The Administration shoupave the way for implementation of univ	be abolished as soon as possible. CE and	• All appointed DC seats should be abolished as soon as possible.
26.	Ms CHAU Chuen-heung, Member of Islands District Council [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(07)]	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. Supports the Administration's proposal of retaining "corporate votes" in the EC election. Supports the Administration's proposal of maintaining the current nomination 	of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70.	Constitutional development should accord with the 2007 NPCSC Decision and complies with the principles under BL, including meeting the interests of different sectors of society, facilitating the development of the capitalist economy, gradual and orderly

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
		threshold of one-eighth of the total membership of EC.		progress, and being appropriate to the actual situation in Hong Kong.
27.	Ms YUNG Wing-sheung, Member of Islands District Council [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(08)]	 The number of EC members should be increased to at least 1 600 to enhance the representativeness of EC. Consideration should be given to adding all elected DC members to EC. Objects to the Administration's proposal of allocating most of the 100 new seats in the fourth sector to elected DC members if a block-voting system is used for electing the EC representatives. All "corporate votes" should be replaced with "director's /executive's / association's /individual votes". The nomination threshold should be lowered. A person should be eligible to become a CE candidate once the support of 50 EC members is obtained. 	 Objects to the Administration's proposal of returning the five new FC seats through election by elected DC members from among themselves. The proposal will not enhance the electorate base of FCs, as an elected DC member has only about 1 000 to 2 000 votes. Consideration could be given to returning the five new FC seats by one-person-one-vote. All "corporate votes" should be replaced with "director's /executive's / association's /individual votes". The Administration should provide a clear timetable for the abolition of FCs. 	 Expressed grave dissatisfaction with the Consultation Document. The Administration should provide a clear roadmap for the implementation of universal suffrage and confirm the timetable for universal suffrage as soon as possible. The Administration should also provide a clear definition for "universal and equal suffrage". All the appointed and ex-officio seats of DCs should be abolished as soon as possible.
28.	Civil Human Rights Front [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(09)]	principles of universal and equal suffrage the International Covenant on Civil and I	plemented in 2012 in accordance with the ge provided in paragraph (b) of Article 25 of Political Rights. s in the Consultation Document and urges the	• All appointed DC seats should be abolished.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Executive ("CE") in 2012 Chief Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
		 (a) request NPCSC to review its decision on ruling out the implementation of dual universal suffrage in 2012; (b) incorporate Hong Kong people's demand for implementation of dual universal suffrage in 2012 into the Consultation Document; (c) abolish all FCs; and (d) lower significantly the nomination threshold for the CE election. 	
29.	Ms LAM Yau-han, Member of Islands District Council [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(10)]	 CE should be elected by universal suffrage by all registered voters on one-person-one-vote basis. The FC system is unfair and should be abolished as soon as possible. All the 10 new LegCo seats should be returned by GCs through direct election. However, to comply with the 2007 NPCSC Decision while maximising democratic progress, consideration could be given to returning the proposed five new FC seats by all registered voters on one-person-one-vote basis from among candidates nominated by elected DC members. 	• All appointed DC seats should be abolished.
30.	自由論壇	 CE and LegCo should be elected by universal suffrage. Members of the public should have the right to nominate CE candidates. The FC system should be abolished. 	
31.	Mr LUM Kei-po [LC Paper No. CB(2)721/09-10(11)]	 Corporate votes in the EC election should be abolished. The nomination threshold should be set at one-tenth of all the members of EC, and an upper limit on the number of subscribers should be set at 20% of all the members of EC. Corporate votes" should be replaced with "director's/ individual votes". The five new FC seats should be replaced with "director's/ individual votes". 	 CE should be returned by one-person-one-vote in 2017. Universal suffrage for LegCo should be implemented in 2020. All FCs should be

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
				 abolished by then. The "single seat, single vote" election system should be adopted for all LegCo seats. All appointed DC seats should be abolished.
32.	Mr LAU Chun-yip [LC Paper No. CB(2)432/09-10(28)]	 The extent of increase in the membership size of EC proposed by Administration is too small. The nomination threshold for the CE election should be lowered from one-eighth to one-tenth of all the members of EC. Apart from the support of EC members, a CE candidate should also be required obtain the support of 10 000 members of the public. 	 The five new FC seats and the existing FC DC seat should be returned through direct elections by all registered voters. Only elected DC members can be nominated as candidates for these seats. All "corporate votes" in FC elections should be replaced with "individual votes". 	 The Administration should convey once again to NPCSC the Hong Kong community's aspiration for implementation of universal suffrage in 2012 All appointed DC seats should be abolished in the 2011 DC election.
33.	Mr CHOY Chak-man [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(13)]		for the two electoral methods which comply on and help advance Hong Kong's political suffrage in a gradual and orderly manner.	
34.	Mr CHAN Chung-kit			• Constitutional development should be in line with the principles of balanced participation and gradual and orderly progress, and facilitate the economic development of Hong Kong.

No.	Deputation/ Individual	Methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") in 2012	Methods for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012	Other issues raised
35.	Mr WONG Wa-pan [LC Paper No. CB(2)770/09-10(14)]	• Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200.	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. Supports the Administration's proposal of allocating all the five new FC seats to DC members and returning these seats through election by elected DC members from among themselves. 	• Supports the Consultation Document which accords with the principles of gradual and orderly progress and balanced participation, and facilitates the long-term development of Hong Kong.
36.	Ms CHENG So-ngor	• Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of EC members to 1 200.	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. The five new GC seats should be allocated to the existing five GCs in accordance with the population ratio. Supports the Administration's proposal of allocating all the five new FC seats to DC members. 	
37.	Ms CHIU Fung-yi	 Supports the Administration's proposals of expanding the membership size of EC to 1 200 and increasing the number of members of the four EC sectors by the same proportion. All the new seats in the fourth EC sector should be allocated to DC members. 	 Supports the Administration's proposal of increasing the number of LegCo seats to 70. The five new GC seats should be allocated to the existing five GCs in accordance with the population ratio. Proposes allocating four of the five new FC seats to DC members and the remaining FC seat to a new subsector for women. 	• The Consultation Document is consistent with BL, the 2007 NPCSC Decision and facilitates the advancement of democratic development in Hong Kong.

No.	Deputation/	Methods for selecting the Chief Methods for forming the Legislative Other issues raised	
	Individual	Executive ("CE") in 2012Council ("LegCo") in 2012	
		• Supports the Administration's proposal that appointed DC members will not vote or stand as candidates in the election to return representatives of DCs to EC.	

Council Business Division 2 Legislative Council Secretariat 8 June 2010