立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2581/11-12 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/BC/3/10/2

Bills Committee on Companies Bill

Minutes of the eighteenth meeting held on Friday, 4 November 2011, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 2A of Legislative Council Complex

Members present: Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP (Chairman)

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP (Deputy Chairman) Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

Members absent: Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Public officers attending

: Agenda item I

Mr John LEUNG, JP

Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the

Treasury (Financial Services)

Mr Maurice LOO

Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Financial Services)

Ms Rita HO Registry Solicitor Companies Registry

Mrs Karen HO Deputy Principal Solicitor (Company Law Reform) Companies Registry

Ms Phyllis MCKENNA Deputy Principal Solicitor (Company Law Reform) Companies Registry

Mr CHUNG Wai-tim Solicitor (Company Law Reform) Companies Registry

Mr Edward TYLER Senior Assistant Law Officer (Civil Law) Department of Justice

Ms Natalie WONG Senior Government Counsel Department of Justice

Miss Selina LAU Senior Government Counsel Department of Justice

Mr Ken FUNG Government Counsel Department of Justice

Clerk in attendance: Ms Sharon CHUNG

Senior Council Secretary (1)4

Staff in attendance: Mr KAU Kin-wah

Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3

Mr Timothy TSO

Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Mr Simon CHEUNG

Senior Council Secretary (1)9

Action

I **Meeting with the Administration**

Clause-by-clause examination of the Bill

(LC Paper No. CB(1)34/11-12(05) -- Comparison Table for Part 4 -- Share Capital

-- Administration's response LC Paper No. CB(1)225/11-12(01)

issues raised members at the meeting 11 October 2011 relating to Part 2 and Part

3 of the Companies Bill

LC Paper No. CB(1)225/11-12(02) -- Comparison Table

> Part 5 -- Transactions in relation to Share Capital

LC Paper No. CB(3)412/10-11 -- The Bill (Part 4 and Part

5))

Other relevant papers

(File Ref: CBT/17/2C -- Legislative Council Brief

LC Paper No. LS26/10-11 -- Legal Service Division

Report

LC Paper No. CB(1)1406/10-11(01) -- Paper on Companies Bill

prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Background

brief)

LC Paper No. CB(1)1879/10-11(03) -- Administration's paper on

Part 2 and Part 12 of the

Companies Bill

LC Paper No. CB(1)2756/10-11(03) -- Comparison Table for Part 2 -- Registrar of Companies and Companies Register

LC Paper No. CB(1)2066/10-11(01) -- Administration's paper on Part 4 and Part 5 of the

Companies Bill
LC Paper No. CB(1)2439/10-11(04) -- Administration's response to issues raised by members at the meeting on 19 May 2011 in

relation to Parts 4, 5 and 9

LC Paper No. CB(1)2636/10-11(02) -- Administration's response to issues raised by members at the meetings on 6 May and 17 June 2011 in relation to Parts

5, 6, 9 and 13
LC Paper No. CB(1)2756/10-11(02) -- Administration's response to issues raised by members at the meeting on 8 July 2011 relating to Part 5)

The Bills Committee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at the **Appendix**).

Admin 2. <u>The Bills Committee</u> requested the Administration to provide written responses to the following concerns/requests --

Clause 114 -- Section 112 not to apply to certain cases

(a) to consider limiting the scope of clause 114 to a company which (i) has a licence under clause 98, and (ii) is exempted from tax under section 88 of the Inland Revenue Ordinance;

<u>Clause 135 -- Exercise by directors of power to allot shares or grant rights</u>

(b) to consider stating expressly the *mens rea* of "knowingly" in clause 135(4) to bring it in line with section 549(4) of the United Kingdom Companies Act 2006;

<u>Clause 159 -- Publication requirements</u>

(c) to consider the Law Society of Hong Kong's suggestion that the Hong Kong Exchanges and Clearing Limited ("HKEx") should be required to publish a listed company's notice for issue of a new share certificate to replace a lost certificate on its webpage instead of following the requirements in clause 159(5);

Clause 176 -- Notifying class members of variation

(d) to clarify whether (i) the 14-day notice period and (ii) the means of communication by which notifications under this clause could be effected were consistent with the practices regarding similar matters under the Listing Rules of HKEx;

Clause 191 -- Merger relief

- (e) to provide the reason for setting the 90% threshold under clause 191(1);
- (f) to provide the views expressed by professional bodies in previous consultations on the provisions on merger relief;
- (g) to advise on the remedies available for aggrieved minority shareholders under a merger;

Section 27 of Schedule 10 -- Fee exemption for existing companies that increase their issued share capital

(h) to improve the drafting of section 27(3)(b) so as to clarify the meaning of "any other existing company";

Clause 213 -- Public notice of reduction of share capital Clause 256 -- Public notice of payment of share capital

(i) to review whether the timeframe specified in the clauses for

publishing a relevant notice in the Gazette was adequate;

<u>Clauses 218 and 261 -- Company to deliver copy of order of Court to Registrar</u>

(j) to review the period (14 days) for documents to be delivered to the Registrar for registration under these clauses and other similar provisions in the Companies Bill ("CB") with a view to facilitating business operation and maintaining a consistent requirement throughout the Bill;

<u>Clause 271 -- Prohibition on financial assistance for acquisition of shares or for reducing or discharging liability for acquisition</u>

(k) to review the drafting of clause 271(1) so as to improve clarity of the words "the company".

The use of notes in clauses 155, 175, 205, and section 27(2) of Schedule 10

(l) to review the use of examples in the notes under these clauses taking into account the legal status and application of the examples, and the appropriateness of including these examples in the provisions instead of notes;

The phrase "for this purpose"/"for that purpose"

(m) to consider reviewing the use of "for this purpose"/"for that purpose" in clauses 167(5), 222(3) and 222(5) with a view to achieving clarity and consistency in drafting with similar provisions throughout CB; and

The phrase "any of those names"

(n) to review the meaning of "any of those names" in clauses 240(4), 243(5), 247(5) and 250(5) to improve the clarity of the clauses.

II Any other business

- 3. <u>The Chairman</u> reminded members that the next meeting of the Bills Committee would be held on Friday, 11 November 2011 at 8:30 am to meet with the Administration.
- 4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 14 September 2012

Bills Committee on Companies Bill

Proceedings of the eighteenth meeting on Friday, 4 November 2011, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000502- 000715	Chairman	Opening remarks	
_	p actions for the meeting held Paper No. CB(1)225/11-12(01)	on 11 October 2011 relating to Part 2 and Part 3	3 of the Companies
000716- 001212	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG	Briefing on the paper on supplementary information about clause 43 (Registrar must make Companies Register available for public inspection) (paragraphs 2 and 3 of the paper) Discussion on clause 43	
001213- 002906	Administration	Briefing on the paper (paragraphs 4 to 11 and the Annex) (a) Division 7 of Part 2 of the Companies Bill ("CB")(Materials in Companies Register unavailable for public inspection); (b) Clause 58 Immunity (c) Clause 98 Registrar's licence to dispense with "Limited" etc. (d) Clause 112 Transaction or act binds company despite limitation in articles etc. (e) Clause 113 Transaction or act involving directors or their associates is voidable (f) Clause 114 Section 112 not to apply to certain cases	
002907-	Chairman	Discussion on Division 7 of Part 2 of CB,	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
004556	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3 ("SALA3") Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG Prof Patrick LAU	clauses 98 and 114 Members' concern that the definition of "exempted company" in clause 114(4) might not reflect the Administration's intent for clause 114 to apply only to charitable bodies	
		Request for the Administration to consider limiting the scope of clause 114 to a company which (a) has a licence under clause 98, and (b) is exempted from tax under section 88 of the Inland Revenue Ordinance	The Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(a) of the minutes
_	y-clause examination of the Bil he Bill (LC Paper No. CB(1)3		
004557- 005410	Chairman Assistant Legal Adviser 2 ("ALA2") Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG	Clause 135 Exercise by directors of power to allot shares or grant rights Clause 136 Allotment of shares or grant of rights with company approval Discussion on the clauses Members' concern that the omission of "knowingly" in clause 135(4) would lower the prosecution threshold under this clause Request for the Administration to consider stating expressly the <i>mens rea</i> of "knowingly" in clause 135(4) to bring it in line with section 549(4) of the United Kingdom Companies Act 2006 Mr Andrew LEUNG's remarks that the Administration should provide a paper to compare the penalties for various offences under the Companies Ordinance ("CO") and the Companies Bill ("CB") as requested by members at previous meetings	Administration to take action as in
005411- 010100	Administration Chairman Mr Andrew LEUNG	Clause 137 Return of allotment Clause 196 Statement of capital Clause 138 Registration of allotment Clause 139 Issue of share certificate on allotment Briefing on the above clauses	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Mr Andrew LEUNG's enquiry on the penalties for contravention of clause 196 The Chairman's remarks that the Administration's paper on penalties should provide justifications for the changes to the existing provisions in CO	
010101- 010239	Administration	Clause 140 Order of Court for delivery of share certificate Clause 141 Validation by Court of issue or allotment Clause 142 General prohibition of commissions, discounts and allowances Clause 143 Permitted commissions Briefing on the above clauses	
010240- 010646	Administration SALA3 Chairman Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Clause 144 Capital may be applied in writing off certain expenses and commission Discussion on the transitional arrangements in respect of clause 144	
010647- 010814	Administration	Clause 145 Requirement for instrument of transfer Clause 146 Registration of transfer or refusal of registration Briefing on the above clauses	
010815- 011021	Administration ALA2	Clause 147 Order of Court for registration The Administration's briefing on the clause ALA2 seeking clarification on the liability for a company which contravened the requirement under clause 147(2)	
011022- 011655	Administration ALA2	Clause 148 Transfer by personal representative Clause 149 Certification of transfer Clause 150 Issue of share certificate on transfer Clause 151 Order of Court for delivery of share certificate	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Clause 152 Compensation regarding forged share transfers Clause 153 Registration or refusal of registration Clause 154 Order of Court for registration Clause 155 Pre-emption rights in relation to transmission by law Clause 156 Evidence of grant of probate etc. Briefing on the above clauses ALA2's enquiry on the legal status of the example cited in the note under clause 155(1) The Administration's response that the notes in the context of CB had no legal effect	
011656- 012304	Administration Chairman ALA2	Clause 157 Interpretation Clause 158 Application for new certificate Clause 159 Publication requirements Clause 160 Issue of new certificate The Chairman's request for the Administration to consider the Law Society of Hong Kong's suggestion that the Hong Kong Exchanges and Clearing Ltd ("HKEx") should be required to publish a listed company's notice referred to in this clause on HKEx' webpage instead of following the requirements in clause 159(5)	The Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(c) of the minutes
012305- 012959	Administration	Clause 161 Public notice of issue of new certificate Clause 162 Orders of Court for rectification of the register Clause 163 Liability if rectification cannot be ordered Clause 164 Applicant to pay expenses Clause 165 Permitted alteration of share capital Clause 166 Notice of alteration of share capital Briefing on the above clauses Clause 167 Redenomination of share capital	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013541	ALA2	ALA2's suggestion for the Administration to consider reviewing the use of "for this purpose" in clause 167(5) with a view to achieving clarity and consistency in CB	•
013542- 013853	Administration	Clause 168 Notice of redenomination Clause 169 Reconversion of stock into shares Clause 170 Notice of reconversion Clause 171 Application of Subdivision Clause 172 Rights attached to shares Clause 173 Classes of shares Clause 174 Description of shares of different classes Briefing on the above clauses	
013854- 014208	Administration ALA2 Chairman	Clause 175 Varying class rights ALA2's enquiry on the legal status of the example in the note Request for the Administration to review the use of examples in this clause and clause 155	The Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(1) of the minutes
014209- 014826	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG Chairman Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Clause 176 Notifying class members of variation Members' concerns that (a) the 14-day notice period under the clause and (b) the means of communication by which notifications under this clause could be effected should be consistent with the practices regarding similar matters under the Listing Rules of HKEx Request for the Administration to provide written response to the above concerns	The Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(d) of the minutes

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014827- 014906	Administration	Clause 177 Disallowance or confirmation of variation by Court Briefing on the clause	•
014907- 014948	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG	Clause 178 Delivery of order of Court to Registrar Mr Andrew LEUNG's enquiry about the timeframe of 14 days for a company to deliver a copy of the Court order made under clause 177 to the Registrar of Companies ("the Registrar")	
014949- 015800	Administration ALA 2 Mr WONG Ting-kwong Chairman Mr James TO	Clause 179 Notifying Registrar of variation Discussion on the penalties for offences under the clause The Administration's remarks that it would provide a paper on the details of the exercise conducted to align the penalties for offences under CB, including the rationale for the changes to be introduced, comparison of the penalties for offences with those in CO, and comparison with the penalties for comparable offences in other ordinances	
015801- 020008	Administration	Clause 180 Application of Subdivision Clause 181 Rights of members Clause 182 Classes of members Clause 183 Varying class rights Clause 184 Notifying class members of variation Clause 185 Disallowance or confirmation of variation by Court Clause 186 Delivery of order of Court to Registrar Clause 187 Notifying Registrar of variation Clause 188 Variation includes abrogation Clause 189 Interpretation Briefing on the above clauses	
020009- 021310	Administration Mr James TO Chairman	Clause 190 Group reconstruction relief Clause 191 Merger relief Clause 192 Merger relief: meaning of 90%	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Speaker	Subject(s) equity holding Discussion on the above clauses Members' concerns about whether the requirement of "at least a 90% equity holding" under clause 191(1) was sufficient to protect the interest of minority shareholders Request for the Administration to provide (a) the reason for the 90% threshold under clause 191(1); (b) the views expressed by professional bodies in previous consultations on the provisions on merger relief; and (c) the remedies available for aggrieved minority shareholders under a merger	
021311- 021541	Administration	Clause 193 Relief may be reflected in company's statement of financial position Clause 194 Regulations Clause 195 Provision for different amounts to be paid on shares Clause 196 Statement of capital Clause 197 Notice of paid up capital Briefing on the above clauses	
Break (02)	 1542- 023019)		
	-clause examination of the Bill he Bill (LC Paper No. CB(1)3-		
023020- 023429	Administration	Schedule 10 (Transitional and Saving Arrangements for Part 4) Sections 13-42 Briefing on the above clauses	
023430- 024100	ALA2 Administration Chairman	Schedule 10 Section 27 Fee exemption for existing companies that increase their issued share capital	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Discussion on the use of the note in section 27(2) and the meaning of "any other existing company" in section 27(3)(b)	
		Request for the Administration to (a) improve the drafting of section 27(3)(b) to clarify the meaning of "any other existing company"; and (b) review the appropriateness and application of the note in section 27(2)	
024101- 024616	Administration	Clause 198 Interpretation Clause 199 Application of Division Clause 200 Solvency test Clause 201 Solvency statement Clause 202 Offences regarding solvency statement Clause 203 Power to modify solvency test by regulation Clause 204 Application of Division Clause 205 Permitted reductions of share capital	
		Briefing on the above clauses	
024617- 024827	ALA2 Administration	Clause 205 Permitted reductions of share capital Discussion on the use of a note which contained an example	
		Request for the Administration to review the appropriateness of putting an example in a note vis-à-vis including it in the provision	
024828- 025251	Mr Andrew LEUNG Administration	Clause 200 Solvency test Clause 201 Solvency statement Enquiry about insolvent trading	
025252- 025808	Administration	Clause 206 Procedure for a company to reduce its share capital Clause 207 Offence if share capital is	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		reduced in contravention of Division Clause 208 Liability of members following reduction of share capital Clause 209 Reserves arising from reductions of share capital Clause 210 Special resolution for reduction of share capital Clause 211 Solvency statement for reduction of share capital Clause 212 Special resolution: exercise of voting rights Briefing on the above clauses Discussion on the timeframe of 15 days under clause 211(2) within which a special resolution for reduction of share capital must be passed after the date of the solvency statement	
025809- 030821	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG Chairman Deputy Chairman ALA2	Clause 213 Public notice of reduction of share capital Clause 214 Inspection of special resolution and solvency statement Discussion on clause 213 - the adequacy of the timeframe for publishing a notice of reduction of share capital in the Gazette (before the end of the week after the week in which the special resolution for reduction of share capital is passed) Request for the Administration to review the	The
		above timeframe	Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(i) of the minutes
030822- 031409	Administration ALA2	Clause 215 Application to Court by members or creditors Clause 216 Power of Court to adjourn proceedings Clause 217 Power of Court to confirm or cancel special resolution Clause 218 Company to deliver copy of order of Court to Registrar Clause 219 Registration of return if no	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		application to Court Clause 220 Registration of return if application to Court Clause 221 Special resolution and application to Court for confirmation of reduction of share capital Clause 222 Creditors entitled to object to reduction of share capital Clause 223 Offence in connection with creditors list	
		ALA2's suggestion for the Administration to consider reviewing the use of "for that purpose" in clauses 222(3) and 222(5) with a view to achieving clarify and consistency in CB	Administration to take action as in
031410- 031552	Administration ALA2	Clause 224 Order of Court confirming reduction of share capital Clause 225 Registration of order, minute and return Clause 226 Certification of registration Clause 227 Liability to creditors omitted from list of creditors Briefing on the above clauses ALA2's remarks that in clause 227(3)(b), the word "contributors" would be amended to	
		word "contributors" would be amended to read "contributories" as agreed by the Administration	
031553- 032132	Administration ALA2	Clause 228 Application of Division Clause 229 Issue of redeemable shares Clause 230 Terms, conditions and manner of redemption Clause 231 General power of company to buy back its own shares Clause 232 Retention and inspection of share buy-back contracts Clause 233 Share buy-back under general offer Clause 234 Share buy-back on recognized stock market or approved stock exchange Clause 235 Share buy-back otherwise than under section 233 or 234 Clause 236 Exemptions	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Clause 237 No assignment of right to buy back own shares Clause 238 Release of right to buy back own shares Clause 239 Share buy-Back under contract Clause 240 Resolution authorizing contract: disclosure of contract details Briefing on the above clauses ALA2's suggestion for the Administration to consider reviewing the drafting of clause 240(4) to clarify the meaning of "any of those names" therein; and the same for clauses 243(5), 247(5) and 250(5)	
032133-033028	Administration	Clause 241 Resolution authorizing contract: exercise of voting rights Clause 242 Variation of authorized contract Clause 243 Resolution authorizing variation: disclosure of details of variation Clause 244 Resolution authorizing variation: exercise of voting rights Clause 245 No assignment of right to buy back own shares Clause 246 Release of right to buy back own shares Clause 247 Resolution authorizing release: disclosure of details of release Clause 248 Resolution authorizing release: exercise of voting rights Clause 249 Variation of release of right to buy back own shares Clause 250 Resolution authorizing variation of release: disclosure of details of variation Clause 251 Resolution authorizing variation of release: exercise of voting rights Clause 252 Payment for redemption or buy-back Clause 253 Special resolution for payment out of capital Clause 254 Solvency statement for payment out of capital Clause 255 Special resolution: exercise of voting rights Clause 256 Public notice of payment out of capital	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Clause 257 Inspection of special resolution and solvency statement Clause 258 Application to Court by members or creditors Clause 259 Power of Court to adjourn proceedings Clause 260 Power of Court to confirm or cancel special resolution Briefing on the above clauses	
033029- 033432	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG	Clause 261 Company to deliver copy of order of Court to Registrar Mr Andrew LEUNG's concern about the time limit (14 days), which was one day shorter than that in CO, for a company to deliver an office copy of the Court order made under clause 260 to the Registrar for registration	
		Request for the Administration to review the time limit (14 days) for documents to be delivered to the Registrar for registration under this clause and other similar provisions in CB, e.g. clauses 218 and 285, with a view to facilitating business operation and maintaining a consistent requirement under CB	Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(j) of
033433- 033702	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG Chairman	Clause 262 General prohibition on acquisition of own shares Discussion on the penalties for offences under the clause Request for the Administration to include information in the paper on the review of the offences and penalties under CB on (a) justifications for the changes to penalties introduced in CB; and (b) highlighting the penalties which would remain unchanged in CB	
033703- 033829	Administration	Clause 263 No redemption or buy-back of unpaid or partly-paid shares Clause 264 Effect of redemption or buy-back	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Clause 265 Fresh issue of shares before redemption or buy-back	-
		Briefing on the above clauses	
033830- 034346	Administration ALA2 Mr Andrew LEUNG	Clause 266 Return of share redemption or buy-back	
		Discussion on the penalties for the offences under the clause	
034347- 034926	Administration Mr Andrew LEUNG Chairman	Clause 267 Effect of company's failure to redeem or buy back Clause 268 Effect on winding up of company's failure to redeem or buy back Clause 269 Power to modify by regulation Clause 270 Interpretation Briefing on the above clauses	
		Discussion on the requirement for a solvency statement on the winding up of a company	
034927- 035906	Administration Mr Ronny TONG Chairman	Clause 271 Prohibition on financial assistance for acquisition of shares or for reducing or discharging liability for acquisition	
		Discussion on the definition of "financial assistance" and whether certain restrictions should be retained on financial assistance for acquisition of shares	
		(Examination of clauses 272 to 278 was deferred. Clauses 279 to 285, which are related to the statutory procedures for giving financial assistance, were examined first.)	
035907- 040750	Administration Chairman Mr Ronny TONG ALA2	Clause 279 Financial assistance not exceeding 5% of shareholders funds Clause 280 Financial assistance with approval of all members Clause 281 Financial assistance by ordinary resolution Clause 282 Application to Court for restraining order Clause 283 Power of Court to adjourn application	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Clause 284 Power of Court to confirm or restrain giving of financial assistance Clause 285 Company to deliver copy of order of Court to Registrar Briefing on the above clauses Discussion on the thresholds under clause 282 for members of a company to apply to the Court for restraining the giving of financial assistance	
040751- 041504	ALA 2 Chairman Administration Mr Ronny TONG	Clause 271 Prohibition on financial assistance for acquisition of shares or for reducing or discharging liability for acquisition Clause 272 Consequences of failing to comply with Division	
		The Administration's briefing on the above clauses Discussion on the drafting of clause 271 Request for the Administration to review the drafting of clause 271(1) to clarify the meaning of "the company" therein	The Administration to take action as in paragraph 2(k) of
041505- 041525	Chairman	Date of next meeting	the minutes

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
14 September 2012