政府總部
運輸及房屋局
運輸科
香港花園道美利大廈

Transport and
Housing Bureau
Government Secretariat
Transport Branch
Murray Building, Garden Road,
Hong Kong

Our Ref. THB(T)L2/1/44, L2/1/47, L2/1/60
Your Ref. CB1/PS/1/08

Tel: 2189 2111
Fax: 2537 5246

18 August 2011

Ms Joanne Mak
Clerk to Subcommittee
Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways
Panel on Transport
Legislative Council Secretariat
Legislative Council Building
8 Jackson Road, Central
(Fax：2121 0420)

Dear Ms Mak,

Panel on Transport
Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Follow up issues for the meetings on
4 November 2010 and 21 January 2011

At the meetings of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways on 4 November 2010 and 21 January 2011, Members requested the Administration and MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) to provide supplementary information. Supplementary information for the meeting on 4 November 2010 is at **Annex I**; supplementary information for the meeting on 21 January 2011 is at **Annex II**.

I would be grateful if you could distribute the enclosures to Members for information.

Yours sincerely,

(Miss Annie Yu)
for Secretary for Transport and Housing

c.c.

Transport Department	(Attn: Ms LUI Ying)	Fax: 2824 0433
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department	(Attn: Mr KM LEUNG)	Fax: 3579 2016
MTRCL	(Attn: Mr Jeff LEUNG)	Fax: 2795 9991

Annex I

Panel on Transport
Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways
Supplementary information for follow-up items for
Meeting on 4 November 2010

Radio Reception at MTR Stations

The MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) communicates with passengers through a number of ways, and among them public announcements at stations are the most direct way to provide instant information to passengers. In case there is a railway incident, different stations will implement appropriate contingency measures according to their individual needs. Hence, in any specific moment, passengers at different locations within the MTR network will receive information most relevant to their specific locations through public announcements at stations.

2. Concerning radio broadcasting technology, it is a highly complex task to provide coverage for radio signals or the future Digital Audio Broadcasting (DAB) services inside railway tunnels and stations. As regards the provision of radio coverage inside rail tunnels for passengers, it is necessary to consider the impact of the crowded environment inside a train compartment and the structure of the compartments on the signals. Most underground railway stations are multi-levelled structures, and may also consist of many long passages and exits connecting to the concourses and platforms. For radio signals to reach every corner of a station, the source signals will have to be split many times for onward transmission to all levels and various parts of stations and passages, resulting in substantial signal attenuation during the process. Therefore, to provide adequate coverage of radio broadcasts or future DAB signals to all levels and various parts of the connecting passages inside a station involves a complicated signal transmission system.

3. As the frequency channels allocated for radio broadcasts and future DAB services has not been used in the MTR network, further investigations and on-site tests are required to understand and master the technology involved. At this stage, MTRCL has been exploring with relevant service operators and through on-site testing the technical feasibility of providing the relevant radio coverage. Preliminary tests have shown that the performance of the existing signal distribution system is less than satisfactory. Technically speaking, it might be necessary to install a separate signal distribution system specifically for broadcasting digital signals to improve

reception quality. MTRCL will continue to discuss with the relevant service operators in this regard. Therefore, the MTRCL is currently not able to estimate on the cost issues.

The Motion Passed at the Meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways on 4 November 2010

Service Performance of the MTR

4. MTRCL places great emphasis on providing safe and reliable service for its passengers. In benchmarking studies of major railways around the world by the CoMET group, the Corporation's performance is consistently amongst the best in safety, reliability and passenger journeys on time. Since the Rail Merger on 2 December 2007, the performance of MTR train service has been maintained at a high standard, with 99.9% of passengers reaching their destinations within five minutes of their scheduled arrival times.

5. MTRCL takes each and every incident causing delay seriously. Other than conducting technical investigations to determine the cause of incidents and to prevent recurrence, the Corporation also reviews contingency arrangements to identify areas for improvements with a view to seeking continuous improvements on providing a highly-reliable railway service.

Determination of Remuneration for the Management

6. MTRCL has an established mechanism to formulate its remuneration policy as well as the remuneration of its directors and senior management. MTRCL's remuneration policy aims to ensure that the remuneration level is appropriate and consistent with the established goals and business performance. Therefore, MTRCL will consider a number of factors, including the overall performance of the Corporation; personal responsibilities, job scope and performance; market practice; and remuneration offered by similar companies, etc.

7. A Remuneration Committee has been set up under the Board of MTRCL. The Remuneration Committee is responsible for scrutinising the remuneration policy and making recommendations to the Board. It is also authorised to determine and review the remuneration packages of the Chief Executive Officer and other Members of the Executive Directorate.

MTR Corporation
August 2011

Annex II

Panel on Transport
Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways
Supplementary information for follow-up items for Meeting on 21 January 2011

Additional cost implication if the automatic platform gate (APG) project on East Rail Line (ERL) and the Shatin to Central Link (SCL) project were implemented separately and the motion on "Retrofitting of Automatic Platform Gates on the ERL"

According to MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL), before retrofitting of APGs at EAL stations can be done, the following are required to ensure passenger safety, reliable train service and maintenance of current service levels :

(i) development of a highly-reliable Mechanical Gap Filler system which is suitable for use under Hong Kong's adverse weather conditions, or other solutions that can solve the platform gap problem to effectively address the safety risk caused by wider platform gaps;

(ii) installation of a new signalling system;

(iii) a train fleet equipped with motoring and braking systems suitable for use with APGs; and

(iv) modifications to station platform structure and ventilation systems.

2. Under the North-South Line (NSL) of the SCL, MTRCL has proposed a new signalling system and new trains for the operation of the NSL. As both retrofitting of APGs on EAL and SCL projects require substantial work to be done on EAL platforms, MTRCL is of the view that the two projects should be carried out in tandem to achieve synergy. However, if APGs are to be retrofitted as a standalone project, work will overlap at sites, causing delay to one project or the other; or once one has finished work on a particular platform, the other will commence and may go in to dismantle what has just been installed, incurring wastage.

3. According to MTRCL's assessment, even if the timeframe or time clash of the two projects are not taken into account, the following

wastage would be incurred during the construction of the SCL if retrofitting of APGs at EAL stations is to be implemented as a standalone project:

- EAL is currently operated with 12-car trains. The future NSL of the SCL project will be operated with 9-car trains. 9-car trains have to be operated on the whole NSL because the NSL of SCL will extend the rail line through the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre to Admiralty where platforms for 12-car trains cannot be accommodated due to space constraints. When SCL is in service, trains will stop at the straighter part of the platforms to help narrow the platform gap. As the train door positions may have to re-align with the straighter part of the platforms, all the relevant APGs will have to be dismantled and reinstalled, resulting in wastage.

- If retrofitting of APGs on EAL platforms is to be implemented as a standalone project, the MTRCL will need to first procure 12-car new trains to maintain its current service level. When SCL is completed, due to the above technical reason, 9-car trains will be used. As the combinations of motor cars and trailer cars of 9-car trains and 12-car trains are different, a certain number of trailer cars will be wasted when converting 12-car trains into 9-car trains. More motor cars will need to be procured and driving-cabs will have to be modified and all previous work done will be wasted. At the same time, enhancements will have to be made to the current EAL signalling system with a view to increasing train frequency and total capacity.

4. Regarding the time required for the project, according to MTRCL's assessment, it is expected that the retrofitting of APGs as a standalone project at EAL stations will take about ten years to complete. About eight-and-a-half years will be needed to procure and replace the signalling system and the train fleet with the first APGs being operational at the same time, and then the retrofitting of APGs at all the stations will take about one-and-a-half years. Once the SCL Project is given the go-ahead, the NSL is expected to be completed in 2020, similar to that of implementing the APG project as a standalone one. Therefore, it does not justify the abortive works.

5. Besides, work will continuously be carried out on EAL platforms if both projects are undertaken separately, causing extensive inconvenience to passengers.

6. MTRCL has also studied the retrofitting of APG on Ma On Shan Line when exploring the retrofitting of APG for EAL. Currently Ma On Shan Line is operated with 4-car trains. After the commencement of SCL, Ma On Shan Line will be changed to operate with 8-car trains, the platform design will be modified accordingly. In order to achieve synergy and minimize the inconvenience to passengers due to the works, MTRCL would consider retrofitting APGs at Ma On Shan Line in tandem with the construction of SCL.

Motion on "Female-only Compartment"

7. Hong Kong is one of the world's safest cities. The security of passengers travelling on the MTR network is looked after by the Railway District of the Hong Kong Police Force (the Police) and MTR staff. The number of crimes that happened in the railway premises accounts for about 1.7% of the total number of crimes in Hong Kong in 2010, which is low taking into account that an average of about four million passengers ride on the MTR each day.

8. MTR staff are trained to be on the alert for crime and they provide support and cooperation to the Police. Furthermore, MTRCL and the Police regularly hold joint anti-crime campaigns to raise passenger awareness on looking after their own safety as well as taking care of their belongings. MTRCL also puts up posters at MTR stations to encourage passengers not to remain silent and report incidents of indecent assault immediately to station staff or the Police should they encounter such occurrence.

9. MTRCL has looked into the suggestion of introducing female-only compartments. Drawing reference to overseas experiences, MTRCL noted that female-only train compartments are not a feature in most of the world's major railways. Only a few jurisdictions in the world such as Japan, Indonesia and Dubai offer them. Even then, female-only compartments are provided only during weekdays or during rush hours. Besides, provision of female-only compartments will alter the male to female ratio of other compartments, causing an increase in the ratio of male passengers, female passengers entering these compartments may feel disturbed as such.

10. As most MTR trains are of an open design, introducing female-only compartments would reduce the flexibility of passenger movement between train compartments. Staff will also have practical difficulties in controlling passengers from passing through train compartments. Furthermore, with trains calling in at platforms every two minutes or so during peak periods, it would be difficult for staff to physically stop male passengers from entering female-only compartments. Strict enforcement would also inevitably cause delay to train service.

11. Introducing female-only compartments on trains is not a practicable solution in Hong Kong's MTR system, which is one of the busiest railways in the world. MTRCL has no current plans to introduce female-only compartments on its railway lines. Nevertheless, the Corporation would continue to work closely with the Police to take all reasonable measures to prevent crime within the railway premises for the security of passengers.

MTR Corporation
August 2011