## 立法會 Legislative Council

Ref: CB2/BC/2/11 <u>LC Paper No. CB(2)1469/11-12</u>

(These minutes have been seen

by the Administration)

#### **Bills Committee on Mediation Bill**

Minutes of the third meeting held on Friday, 13 January 2012, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

**Members**: Dr Hon Margaret NG (Chairman)

**present** Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

**Members**: Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

**absent** Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

**Public Officers:** Department of Justice

attending

Mr Simon LEE

Deputy Law Officer (Civil Law)

Ms Sou CHIAM

**Deputy Principal Government Counsel** 

Miss Shandy LIU

Senior Government Counsel (Law Drafting Division)

Miss Venus CHEUNG Government Counsel

**Attendance by :**  <u>CEDR Asia Pacific</u>

**Invitation** 

Mr Danny McFadden Managing Director - 2 -

#### **RICS Hong Kong**

Mr Gilbert KWOK Chairman of Dispute Resolution Professional Group Committee

#### Professional Mediation Consultancy Centre

Miss Annita MAU Director

### Methodist Centre

Ms LEE Koon-mei Service Co-ordinator

## Centre for Restoration of Human Relationships

Miss PAU Choi-chun Senior Project Officer

## Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

Mr Daniel CHOW Convener of Mediation Group

## **Hong Kong Society of Accredited Mediators**

Mr Vincent CHAN Spokesman

## The Democratic Party

Mr Andrew CHIU Ka-yin Convenor of Community Mediation Task Force

## Rainbow Consultancy Limited

Miss Angel HO Wai-yuk Director

## **Hong Kong Family Welfare Society**

Ms Amarantha YIP Yun-wan Head of Service

- 3 -

#### **Hong Kong Construction Association**

Mr Dean Lewis Legal Advisor

## The Council of Social Development

Mr Nelson LEUNG Consultant

#### The Council of Mediation Development

Mr Henry CHIU Secretary

#### Li & Partners

Mr Edward CHEUNG Consultant

#### **Construction Industry Council**

Mr Ivan WONG Senior Manager – Council Services

## Tru-Tight & Associates Limited

Mr WU Chi-cheung Managing Director

## **Hong Kong Construction Arbitration Centre**

Miss CHI Man-ho Senior Manager

## Faculty of Law of the Chinese University of Hong Kong

Prof Martin Doris Assistant Professor

## Joint Mediation Helpline Office

Mr Alex LAI Alternate Director

## **Hong Kong Institute of Construction Managers**

Mr Honby CHAN Siu-hong Honorary Secretary - 4 -

### Hong Kong Catholic Marriage Advisory Council

Ms CHOW Siu-ling Mediation Service Supervisor

#### K M Lai & Li

Mr MA Siu-lam Partner Solicitor

## **Hong Kong Mediation Centre**

Mr TANG Chi-wang President

## Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong

Ms Anna KOO Assistant Professor

# The Chartered Institute of Arbitrators (East Asia Branch)

Mr YEUNG Man-sing Vice Chairman / Secretary

#### EC Harris (HK) Ltd

Mr Ivan CHEUNG Partner

## Society of Certified Mediators and Negotiators, Ltd

Mr Charles CHAN
Founding & Present Chairman

## School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong

Dr YANG Fan Assistant Professor

## Hong Kong Bar Association

Mr Robin Egerton

#### **Hong Kong Mediation Council**

Mr CHAN Bing-woon Committee Chairman

#### The Law Society of Hong Kong

Mr Norris YANG Member of the Mediation Committee

Dr James CHIU Shing-ping Accredited Mediator

Clerk in attendance

Miss Flora TAI

Chief Council Secretary (2)3

Staff in attendance

Mr YICK Wing-kin

Assistant Legal Adviser 8

Ms Wendy LO

Council Secretary (2)3

Mrs Fonny TSANG

Legislative Assistant (2)3

Ms Avil MA

Clerical Assistant (2)3

Action

## I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)645/11-12(03), CB(2)802/11-12(01) to (14), CB(2)809/11-12(01) to (06) and CB(2)819/11-12(01) to (04)]

<u>The Bills Committee</u> received views from a total of 32 individuals and organizations (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

2. <u>The Administration</u> was requested to provide a written response to the views received by the Bills Committee on the Bill.

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

(*Post-meeting note*: The next meeting with the Administration was scheduled for 1 February 2012 at 8:30 am)

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
21 March 2012

## Proceedings of the third meeting of the Bills Committee on Mediation Bill on Friday, 13 January 2012, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
000328 - 000541	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000542 - 000949	Chairman CEDR Asia Pacific	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)819/11-12(01)]	
000950 - 001028	Chairman RICS Hong Kong	Presentation of the view that a simple mechanism similar to the enforcement of an arbitration award should be included in the Bill.	
001029 - 001315	Chairman Professional Mediation Consultancy Centre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(01)]	
001316 - 001544	Chairman Methodist Centre	Summary of views presented by Methodist Centre –  (a) the Bill was supported;  (b) elements of mediation between offender and victims of crime, in particular the provision	
		for sanctions for breaching the rule of confidentially to protect the interests of the parties, should be included in the Bill; and  (c) the content of "reasonable grounds" under Clause 8(d) should be clarified.	
001545 - 001612	Chairman Centre for Restoration of Human Relationships	Expression of the view that the Centre for Restoration of Human Relationships would keep in view whether the current practice of mediation conducted at school level would be affected by the enactment of the Bill.	
001613 - 001854	Chairman Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Summary of views presented by Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong –  (a) the early enactment of the Bill was supported;  (b) the single non-statutory industry-led	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		should be established in a transparent, fair and open manner;	required
		(c) the definition of "agreement to mediate" in Clause 2 shall prevail in case of any divergence of interpretation of the term in other parts of the Bill;	
		(d) the definition of "meaning of mediation" in Clause 4 should be further clarified to avoid any inadvertent breach of law by untrained mediators in the community;	
		(e) provisions for liability of mediators for dishonest acts should be included in the Bill with reference to section 104 of the Arbitration Ordinance;	
		(f) provisions for immunity for mediators from civil liability should be provided in the Bill;	
		(g) Clause 7 of the Bill might create conflict of interests between mediators and solicitors; and	
		(h) Clause 8 of the Bill was supported.	
001855 - 002208	Chairman Hong Kong Society of Accredited Mediators	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(02)]	
002209 - 002607	Chairman The Democratic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(03)]	
002608 - 002730	Chairman Rainbow Consultancy	Summary of views presented by Rainbow Consultancy Limited –	
	Limited	(a) the Bill was supported; and	
		(b) the Bill should cover the promotional work of mediation in order to encourage the public to resolve disputes by mediation.	
002731 - 003047	Chairman Hong Kong Family Welfare Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)819/11-12(02)]	
003048 - 003347	Chairman Hong Kong Construction Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)645/11-12(03)]	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
003348 - 003438	Chairman The Council of Social Development	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)802/11-12(04) and 809/11-12(01)]	•
003439 - 003729	Chairman The Council of Mediation Development	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)802/11-12(05) and 809/11-12(02)]	
003730 - 004124	Chairman Li & Partners	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)850/11-12(01)]	
004125 - 004329	Chairman Construction Industry Council	Summary of views presented by Construction Industry Council –  (a) the Bill was supported;  (b) provisions for immunity for mediators from civil liability should be provided in the Bill as some experienced part-time mediators might not be able to take out professional indemnity insurance due to the high cost incurred; and  (c) a single independent mediation accreditation body should be established for the development of the accreditation system for mediators.	
004330 - 004725	Chairman Tru-Tight & Associates Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(06)]	
004726 - 004749	Chairman Hong Kong Construction Arbitration Centre	Presentation of the view that the Bill was fully supported by the Hong Kong Construction Arbitration Centre.	
004750 - 005111	Chairman Professor Martin Doris Faculty of Law of the Chinese University of Hong Kong	Summary of views of Professor Martin Doris –  (a) consideration should be given to extending the scope of the Bill to cover conciliation with a view to clarifying the differences between mediation and conciliation and enhancing the development of codes of conduct of mediators and conciliators; and  (b) the increasing trend of the conduct of mediation and conciliation by electronic means should be taken into account in drafting the Bill.	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
005112 - 005235	Chairman Joint Mediation Helpline Office	Summary of views presented by Joint Mediation Helpline Office —  (a) the early enactment of the Bill was supported; and  (b) provisions dealing with civil liability and sanctions for breaching the rules of confidentiality and privilege should be included in the Bill.	
005236 - 005511	Chairman Hong Kong Institute of Construction Managers	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(07)]	
005512 - 005815	Chairman Hong Kong Catholic Marriage Advisory Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)809/11-12(05)]	
005816 - 010002	Chairman K M Lai & Li	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(08)]	
010003 - 010223	Chairman Hong Kong Mediation Centre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(09)]	
010224 - 010542	Chairman Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong	Summary of views presented by Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong —  (a) the Bill was strongly supported as it provided an essential framework for the conduct of mediation without hampering its flexibility;  (b) the definition of "agreement to mediate" in Clause 2 should be extended to include agreement made orally or by conduct;  (c) whether the impartial mediator should be accredited or not should be specified in the definition of "meaning of mediation" in Clause 4;  (d) the essence that a genuine attempt was made by the parties concerned to reach an agreement to resolve a dispute should also be included in the definition of "meaning of mediation" in Clause 4;	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul> <li>(e) the implication of Clause 8(2) on the common practice of including a contractual provision in an agreement to mediate that required the parties to a dispute to comply with the rule of confidentiality should be clarified; and</li> <li>(f) it was odd that the consent of a person other than a party to the mediation or the mediator should be obtained for the disclosure of a mediation communication given that the rule of confidentiality should be applied to the parties to a dispute only.</li> </ul>	
010543 - 010614	Chairman The Chartered Institute of Arbitrators (East Asia Branch)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)809/11-12(03)]	
010615 - 010941	Chairman EC Harris (HK) Ltd	Summary of views presented by EC Harris (HK)  Ltd —  (a) the need to enact a mediation legislation was queried given that there were very few complaints relating to mediation; and  (b) the inclusion of the provision for immunity to mediators in the Bill was worth consideration.	
010942 - 011342	Chairman Society of Certified Mediators and Negotiators, Ltd	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(10)]	
011343 - 011654	Chairman School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong	Summary of views presented by School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong –  (a) the Bill was supported as it had dealt with the confidentiality and admissibility of mediation communication in depth; and  (b) Hong Kong should adopt a mechanism similar to the procedure under the People's Mediation Law of the People Republic of China whereby parties might jointly apply to the People's Court for judicial confirmation of a mediation agreement reached by a people's mediation commission.	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
011655 - 011723	Chairman Hong Kong Bar Association	Presentation of the view that the Bill had provided a proper framework for the conduct and development of mediation in Hong Kong and was supported by the Hong Kong Bar Association.	•
011724 - 011833	Chairman Hong Kong Mediation Council	Presentation of the view that the Bill was fully supported by the Hong Kong Mediation Council.	
011834 - 012242	Chairman The Law Society of Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)819/11-12(03)]	
012243 - 012840	Chairman Dr James CHIU Shing-ping	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)802/11-12(11)]	
012841 - 013433	Chairman Administration	The Administration's preliminary response to views of deputations as follow —  (a) the views expressed by the deputations on the draft Mediation Bill during the public consultation exercise in June 2011 had been carefully considered and incorporated into the Bill as far as practicable by the Administration;  (b) the Bill was drafted in a concise manner with a view to providing a statutory framework for the conduct of mediation in Hong Kong without hampering the flexibility of the mediation process as recommended by the Working Group on Mediation chaired by the Secretary for Justice;  (c) as the platform for the further development of mediation, the Bill had set out key definitions of various terms concerning mediation and differentiated mediation from conciliation;  (d) the Administration recognized the importance of the accreditation and training of the mediators and was working with stakeholders to facilitate the establishment of a single non-statutory industry-led accreditation body for mediators;	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(e) regarding the views on the provisions for confidentiality and admissibility of mediation communication in evidence, the Administration considered that it had struck an appropriate balance between the need to keep mediation communications confidential and the need for disclosure in individual cases;	
		(f) the Administration was confident that a specified court or tribunal would act as an gatekeeper in exercising sound judgment in granting leave for disclosure or admission of mediation communications in evidence; and	
		(g) on the recommendation that a separate accreditation body should be put in place for family mediation, the Administration considered it more appropriate to establish a single accreditation body to standardize the accreditation system for mediators rather than to set up different regulatory systems for mediation in specific industries.	
		The Administration undertook to provide a written response to the views received by the Bills Committee on the Bill.	Admin (para 3 of minutes)
013434 - 014628	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah Professional Mediation Consultancy Centre Society of Certified Mediators and Negotiators, Ltd Dr James CHIU Shing-ping	Elaboration of views by Professional Mediation Consultancy Centre on the need to enhance the enforceability of mediated settlement agreement and to promote wider use of mediation to resolve disputes in the community.  Elaboration of views by Society of Certified Mediators and Negotiators, Ltd on the need to address the issues of accreditation and declaration of interests by mediators.  Suggestions of Dr James CHIU Shing-ping on the definition of "mediator" in the Bill.	
014629 - 015042	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kok-che Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong Hong Kong Bar Association	Reiteration of views by Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong that the single non-statutory industry-led mediation accreditation body for mediators should be established as soon as possible in a transparent and open manner.	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		Elaboration of views by the Hong Kong Bar Association that the early enactment of the Bill could enhance the development of mediation in Hong Kong.	
015043 - 015419	Chairman	The Chairman summarized the main discussions of the Bills Committee on the Bill and proposed the way forward for the scrutiny of the Bill.	
015420 - 015822	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration	Mr LAU Kong-wah's enquiries about —  (a) whether the Administration would define the term "professional misconduct" in Clause 8 (3) (b) in the Bill; and  (b) whether consideration would be given to establishing a local mediation body at community level to promote mediation.  The Administration responded that —  (a) complaints about the misconduct of mediators could be made to the relevant mediation service providers as mediators were usually required to observe the professional code of conduct prescribed by the mediation service providers to which they belonged; and  (b) there was no proposal on the establishment of a local mediation body at the community level as it would involve complex issues that required careful consideration such as the prudent use of public fund and the structure of such body.	
015823 - 20033	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 21 March 2012