

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 3

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 19 October 2011 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Members absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-yee, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 3 - Occupational Safety and Health Council Annual Report 2010/2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 4 - Report by the Trustee of the Customs and Excise Service Children's Education Trust Fund for the year ended 31 March 2011 together with the Report of the Director of Audit and the audited financial statements (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 5 - Environment and Conservation Fund Trustee Report 2010-2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 6 - The Land Registry Trading Fund Hong Kong Annual Report 2010-11 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 7 - Companies Registry Trading Fund Annual Report 2010-11 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 8 - Fish Marketing Organization
Audited financial statements and the Auditor's report for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 9 - Vegetable Marketing Organization
Audited financial statements and the Auditor's report for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 10 - Marine Fish Scholarship Fund
Audited financial statements, the Trustee's report and the Auditor's report for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 11 - Agricultural Products Scholarship Fund
Audited financial statements, the Trustee's report and the Auditor's report for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 14.10.2011)
- No. 12 - Protection of Wages on Insolvency Fund Board Annual Report 2010-11 (published on 14.10.2011)

- No. 13 - The Government Minute in response to the Report of the Public Accounts Committee No. 56 of July 2011 (published on 18.10.2011)
- No. 14 - West Kowloon Cultural District Authority Annual Report 2010/11 (published on 19.10.2011)
- No. 15 - Electoral Affairs Commission
Report on the Recommended Delineation of Geographical Constituencies for the 2012 Legislative Council Election (published on 19.10.2011)

Report No. 1/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 13.10.2011)

Before the Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council, the President made an opening statement.

Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Report of the Public Accounts Committee No. 56 of July 2011.

Questions

1. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon Alan LEONG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon Andrew CHENG asked a supplementary question.

After Hon Andrew CHENG had spoken, the President reminded Members that in accordance with Rule 25(1)(c) of the Rules of Procedure, a question should not contain arguments, inferences, opinions, imputations or epithets, or tendentious, ironical or offensive expressions.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Three other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

5. Hon Jeffrey LAM asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

A Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah was asking a supplementary question, Hon Alan LEONG sought elucidation of a point raised by Mr LAU in his speech. Hon LAU Kong-wah elucidated and continued to ask his supplementary question. Later, Hon Alan LEONG sought further elucidation of the same point raised by Hon LAU Kong-wah in his speech. Hon LAU Kong-wah said that he would provide the information to Hon Alan LEONG after the meeting.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah continued to ask his supplementary question, Hon Audrey EU raised a point of order stating that in accordance with Rule 41 of the Rules of Procedure, it should be out of order for a Member to use offensive language about another Member, or to impute improper motives to another Member. Ms EU asked the President to rule whether Hon LAU Kong-wah had used offensive language about Hon Alan LEONG in his speech.

The President asked Hon LAU Kong-wah to clarify whether he meant that a Member of this Council had acts of misconduct and improper motives.

Hon LAU Kong-wah clarified that the remarks he had made in his speech were not referring to any Member but the operation as a whole.

Hon Paul TSE raised a point of order to seek clarification as to whether it would be more appropriate to apply Rule 25 of the Rules of Procedure to the issues raised by Hon Audrey EU.

The President stated that the requirements under Rule 25(1) of the Rules of Procedure were even more stringent than those in Rule 41. The President then reminded Hon LAU Kong-wah that he should not include any imputations in his question, nor should he use any ironical expressions or raise any arguments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order that if a Member made an imputation against another Member, particularly when the former was accusing the latter of acts of misconduct, the former should not raise the accusation indirectly. Dr NG asked the President to rule whether Hon LAU Kong-wah's remarks were appropriate or not.

At the invitation of the President, Hon LAU Kong-wah stated that his question was about whether the participation of the Civic Party as a whole in a certain matter involved any conflict of interests, misconduct and infringement on public interests.

The President ruled that Hon LAU Kong-wah's question had not violated the Rules of Procedure.

Hon LAU Kong-wah continued to ask his supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon James TO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Food and Health and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Suspension of Rule 47(1)(c) and (2)(c) and Rule 49(8) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That Rule 47(1)(c) and (2)(c) and Rule 49(8) of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region be suspended with immediate effect until the Council resolves to remove the suspension or to amend the Rules, and that the following arrangements be adopted during the suspension of the Rules:

- (a) if a Member challenges the statement of the President or Chairman made under Rule 47(1)(b) or (2)(b) of the Rules of Procedure by claiming a division, then the President or Chairman shall order the Council or the committee, as the case may be, to proceed to a division; and, subject to Rule 49(4) to (7) of the Rules of Procedure, the division shall be held forthwith immediately after a division bell has been rung for five minutes;
- (b) if the division bell does not function, the President or Chairman shall order the Clerk to arrange for Members within the precincts of the Chamber to be notified of the division; and the division shall be held 10 minutes after the order has been made; and
- (c) the House Committee may recommend to the President that the period specified in paragraph (a) or (b) above, for a Council meeting or in respect of an item of business on the Agenda of a Council meeting, may be shorter or longer; and Members shall be notified of the President's decision on the recommendation prior to that Council meeting.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the—

- (a) Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 111 of 2011; and
- (b) Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 112 of 2011,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 6 July 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) and deemed to be extended under section 34(3) of that Ordinance, be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 9 November 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the Securities and Futures (Contracts Limits and Reportable Positions) (Amendment) Rules 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 117 of 2011, and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 13 July 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) and deemed to be extended under section 34(3) of that Ordinance, be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 9 November 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Appointment of a select committee

Hon Emily LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council appoints a select committee to inquire into whether managerial staff and investors of Asia Television Limited ('ATV') or other persons have acted unduly in the misreporting of the death of Mr JIANG Zemin to interfere with ATV's editorial freedom with an aim to influence ATV's news report; to inquire into whether ATV has added advertisement content into news and information programmes being broadcast which unduly produces 'paid news'; and to inquire into whether the above incidents have violated broadcasting rules or regulations and related laws of Hong Kong, as well as related matters, and based on the results of the above inquiries, to make recommendations on the regulation of domestic free television programme service by the Government and the safeguarding of editorial freedom of the press, and other related matters; and that in the performance of its duties the committee be authorized under section 9(2) of the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) to exercise the powers conferred by section 9(1) of that Ordinance.

While Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion.

Three Members and Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Tommy CHEUNG was speaking, Hon Emily LAU sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Tommy CHEUNG in his speech. Hon Tommy CHEUNG did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

Two other Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

At 3:06 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four more Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Hon Emily LAU replied.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Calling upon persons intending to run in the Chief Executive Election to respond to people's aspirations

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given that the Chief Executive Election is approaching, but only the 1 200 members of the Election Committee have the right to vote, this Council calls upon those persons who intend to run in the next Chief Executive Election to put forward specific propositions on safeguarding Hong Kong people's core values, and actively respond to the aspirations of the seven million people; the relevant propositions must include:

- (a) respecting human rights, improving people's livelihood, defending people's long-term interests and making actual efforts to resolve the deep-rooted conflicts in society;
- (b) persevering in the realization of a democratic political system and abolishing the functional constituency seats as well as the separate voting arrangement in the Legislative Council in 2016;
- (c) protecting freedom of the press and of speech, and undertaking not to enact legislation to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law before the full implementation of genuine universal suffrage; and
- (d) upholding the spirit of the rule of law and defending judicial independence, so as to fully implement Article 35 of the Basic Law.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon TAM Yiu-chung intended to move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon IP Wai-ming intended to move an amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon TAM Yiu-chung and Hon IP Wai-ming, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members and Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:37 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Eleven other Members and Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:03 pm, while Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members and Hon Paul TSE spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Paul TSE was speaking, Hon Audrey EU raised a point of order requesting the President to rule whether Hon Paul TSE had used offensive language about some Members of this Council as he had accused the lawyers and barristers present at this meeting of abetting other people to take the matters to court.

At the invitation of the President, Hon Paul TSE elucidated his remarks and continued to speak.

Hon Alan LEONG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion:

To add "as recently, discussions about candidates in the Chief Executive Election are very heated in society, and" after "That,;" to delete "and" after "core values,;" to add "; reform the long-standing governance philosophy that tilts in favour of tycoons as well as people who are powerful and wealthy, and replace it with the principle of development for all people that gives consideration to all social strata as the basis of governance" after "seven million people"; to add "formulating comprehensive and fair social and economic policies, with a view to" after "long-term interests and"; to add "and alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor" after "conflicts in society"; and to add "; forging a consensus through the formation of a committee dedicated to implementing dual universal suffrage with the participation of the Central People's Government, the SAR Government, various political groups and the community at large, etc., as well as enacting legislation in one go to resolve issues such as dual universal suffrage and the abolition of functional constituencies, etc., so as to realize the implementation of genuine universality and equality for the Chief Executive Election in 2017 and the Legislative Council Election in 2020" after "Council in 2016".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Calling upon persons intending to run in the Chief Executive Election to respond to people’s aspirations” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG’s motion:

To delete “given that the Chief Executive Election is approaching, but only the 1 200 members of the Election Committee have the right to vote” after “That,” and substitute with “as an election will be held next year to select a new Chief Executive”; to delete “calls upon” after “, this Council” and substitute with “opines that”; to delete “to put forward specific propositions on safeguarding Hong Kong people’s core values, and actively respond to the aspirations of the seven million people; the relevant propositions must include” after “the next Chief Executive Election” and substitute with “should proactively consider”; to delete “respecting human rights, improving people’s livelihood, defending people’s long-term interests and making actual efforts to resolve the deep-rooted conflicts in society” after “(a)” and substitute with “directly replacing the ‘Work Incentive Transport Subsidy Scheme’ by a ‘maintenance grant scheme for low-income families’, so as to enable families not eligible to apply for Comprehensive Social Security Assistance but whose incomes are still on the low side to receive monthly grant”; to delete “persevering in the realization of a democratic political system and abolishing the functional constituency seats as well as the separate voting arrangement in the Legislative Council in 2016” after “(b)” and substitute with “reforming Old Age Allowance (commonly known as ‘fruit grant’) into a three-tier ‘retirement protection pension’, so as to provide elderly people with pension according to their financial situations”; to delete “protecting freedom of the press and of speech, and undertaking not to enact legislation to implement Article 23 of the Basic

Law before the full implementation of genuine universal suffrage; and” after “(c)” and substitute with “introducing ‘voluntary long-term care insurance’, with the Government partially subsidizing the contributions made by the public, and providing tax deductions in respect of such contributions;”; and to delete “upholding the spirit of the rule of law and defending judicial independence, so as to fully implement Article 35 of the Basic Law” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “formulating a long-term land and housing policy to ensure the satisfaction of the public’s basic housing needs, and at the same time providing a home acquisition ladder to promote upward social mobility; (e) providing rental assistance to households on the Waiting List for public housing; (f) establishing a ‘quota system for employing people with disabilities’; (g) through the approach of employer-employee negotiations and progressive implementation, including all general holidays other than Sundays as paid statutory holidays, and introducing paternity leave; (h) formulating a five-year plan regarding residential care services for the elderly and community care for the elderly, so as to draw up lead time targets and set down corresponding resource allocation and manpower support, having regard to the waiting queues for residential care homes for the elderly, residential care homes for persons with disabilities and community care; (i) increasing public medical manpower and resources for service improvement; (j) buying back the Western Harbour Crossing, alleviating traffic congestion and relieving the burden of cross-harbour transportation expenses on the public; (k) using the dividends received by the Government from the MTR Corporation Limited to stabilize MTR fares; (l) increasing the subsidies for outlying island ferry routes, so as to reduce fares; (m) developing new towns in border areas and relocating certain government organizations to such areas, so as to facilitate local development; (n) holding negotiations to draw up a 10-year plan on environmental co-operation with the Pearl River Delta Region, in particular focusing on holding negotiations to draw up co-operation schemes and work targets regarding air quality governance, emission reduction targets, the governance of Pearl River Estuary waters and Guangdong-Hong Kong water resources management, etc.; and (o) setting up a nature conservation fund, so as to resolve the conflicts between conservation and private land development in rural areas, etc., and urges the new Chief Executive to defend people’s long-term interests, resolve the deep-rooted conflicts in society, and respond to the aspirations of the seven million people while striving to safeguard Hong Kong people’s core values, respecting human rights, persevering in the realization of a democratic political system, protecting freedom of the press and of speech, upholding the spirit of the rule of law, and defending judicial independence to fully implement the Basic Law”.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion proposed.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment:

To delete "the approach of" after "through"; and to delete "progressive implementation," after "negotiations and" and substitute with "by way of legislation, progressively".

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, five against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Alan LEONG replied.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Opposing foreign domestic helpers' enjoyment of the right of abode in Hong Kong

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the enjoyment of the right of abode in Hong Kong by foreign domestic helpers ('FDHs') will impose a heavy burden on Hong Kong's economy, employment market, education, healthcare, housing and welfare, etc., and have far-reaching consequences, thus giving rise to widespread public concern, this Council opposes FDHs' enjoyment of the right of abode in Hong Kong.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed.

The President stated that four members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Alan LEONG, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Alan LEONG was speaking, Hon WONG Kwok-hing interrupted to elucidate a point that he had made earlier in his speech which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Alan LEONG.

Hon Alan LEONG continued to speak.

Hon James TO and Hon Paul TSE, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six Members and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou had spoken, Hon Cyd HO raised a point of order that Dr PAN had used a term in his speech which could be regarded as offensive and insulting language about a Member of the Council and thus contravening Rule 41 of the Rules of Procedure. Ms HO requested Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to withdraw the term.

The President said that this kind of discourse was often found in the debates of this Council. He ruled that the term was not offensive.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, Dr Hon Margaret NG sought the President's permission for her to elucidate a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon TAM Yiu-chung. The President stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG should clarify the point when she later spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung continued to speak.

Sixteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Ting-Kwong spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion:

To delete "as the" after "That," and substitute with "although currently hundreds of thousands of foreign domestic helpers ('FDHs') are working in Hong Kong, FDHs"; to delete "by foreign domestic helpers ('FDHs')" after "the right of abode in Hong Kong" and substitute with "contravenes the legislative intent of the Basic Law, and"; and to delete ", thus giving rise to" after "far-reaching consequences" and substitute with "; in order to protect local employees' right to priority employment and reduce".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 14 abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Opposing foreign domestic helpers' enjoyment of the right of abode in Hong Kong" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion:

To delete "as the enjoyment of" after "That," and substitute with "under the rule of law, regarding whether foreign domestic helpers ('FDHs') should enjoy"; to delete "by foreign domestic helpers ('FDHs') will impose a heavy burden on Hong Kong's economy, employment market, education, healthcare, housing and welfare, etc., and have far-reaching consequences, thus giving rise to widespread public concern," after "the right of abode in Hong Kong" and substitute with "under the existing system, the community must respect and abide by the ruling of the Court;"; to delete "opposes FDHs' enjoyment of" after "this Council" and substitute with "considers that FDHs do not automatically enjoy"; and to add ", and urges the Government to expeditiously clarify the Immigration Department's criteria and mechanism for approving applications for the right of abode in Hong Kong by persons not of Chinese nationality, so as to allay widespread public concern" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and seven abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion:

To delete “, as the enjoyment” after “That” and substitute with “this Council urges various sectors to respect the rule of law and safeguard people's right to litigation; and given that the enjoyment or otherwise”; to delete “will impose a heavy burden on” after “(‘FDHs’)” and substitute with “involves Hong Kong's population and immigration policies, this Council considers that the SAR Government has the right to formulate relevant policies and planning on its own in response to social circumstances, so as to cater for the future needs of”; to delete “, and have far-reaching consequences, thus giving rise to widespread public concern,” after “welfares, etc.” and substitute with “;”; and to add “, and if necessary, the SAR Government should make a request to the Central Government for an amendment of the Basic Law, so as to resolve the controversy” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 13 abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Paul TSE moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion:

To add "bring about significant changes to and" after " ('FDHs') will"; to add "population structure," after "Hong Kong's"; to delete "opposes" after "this Council" and substitute with "urges that the Government should, apart from the economic and social burden perspectives, explore and formulate an ultimate and most effective solution from the perspective of the impact of"; and to add "on our country's population policy and structure and even sovereignty to avoid FDHs obtaining the right of abode in Hong Kong in contravention of the policy and legislative intent due to inadequacies in the existing legislation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Paul TSE's amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 12 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 10 were against the amendment and 14 abstained (voting record in **Appendix IX**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong replied.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, two against it and 14 abstained (voting record in **Appendix X**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 26 October 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 1:00 am on 20 October 2011.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

16 February 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 19/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:45:28 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 「委任專責委員會」議案
 MOTION ON "APPOINTMENT OF A SELECT COMMITTEE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	4	15	
反對 No	18	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

VOTE: 2
 DATE: 19/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:43:34 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對梁家傑議員的「呼籲有意參選行政長官的人士回應市民訴求」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON "CALLING UPON PERSONS INTENDING TO RUN IN THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION TO RESPOND TO PEOPLE'S ASPIRATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	27	
投票 Vote	21	26	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	16	10	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

頁 VOTE: 3
 E. DATE: 19/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:47:18 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 葉偉明議員就譚耀宗議員對梁家傑議員的「呼籲有意參選行政長官的人士回應市民訴求」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON IP WAI-MING'S AMENDMENT TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON "CALLING UPON PERSONS INTENDING TO RUN IN THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION TO RESPOND TO PEOPLE'S ASPIRATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉偉明 IP Wai-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	27	
投票 Vote	21	26	
贊成 Yes	9	9	
反對 No	5	16	
棄權 Abstain	7	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 19/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:49:21 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員對梁家傑議員的「呼籲有意參選行政長官的人士回應市民訴求」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG TO HON ALAN LEONG'S MOTION ON "CALLING UPON PERSONS INTENDING TO RUN IN THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION TO RESPOND TO PEOPLE'S ASPIRATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	27	
投票 Vote	21	26	
贊成 Yes	10	9	
反對 No	4	16	
棄權 Abstain	7	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 19/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:55:32 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 「呼籲有意參選行政長官的人士回應市民訴求」議案
 MOTION ON "CALLING UPON PERSONS INTENDING TO RUN IN THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION TO RESPOND TO PEOPLE'S ASPIRATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	27	
投票 Vote	21	26	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	16	10	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃百弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Stany LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 20/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 12:48:47 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對黃定光議員的「反對外籍家庭傭工享有香港居留權」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON WONG TING-KWONG'S MOTION ON "OPPOSING FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS' ENJOYMENT OF THE RIGHT OF ABODE IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	16	8	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	14	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO



投票 VOTE: 7
日期 DATE: 20/10/2011
時間 TIME: 12:51:53 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對黃定光議員的「反對外籍家庭傭工享有香港居留權」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON WONG TING-KWONG'S MOTION ON "OPPOSING FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS' ENJOYMENT OF THE RIGHT OF ABODE IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	14	9	
棄權 Abstain	4	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃百弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍德霖 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 8
日期 DATE: 20/10/2011
時間 TIME: 12:53:55 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對黃定光議員的「反對外籍家庭傭工享有香港居留權」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON WONG TING-KWONG'S MOTION ON "OPPOSING FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS' ENJOYMENT OF THE RIGHT OF ABODE IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	23	
贊成 Yes	4	8	
反對 No	8	2	
棄權 Abstain	8	13	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Stary LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	出席 PRESENT

投票 VOTE: 9
日期 DATE: 20/10/2011
時間 TIME: 12:56:06 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 謝偉俊議員對黃定光議員的「反對外籍家庭傭工享有香港居留權」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON PAUL TSE TO HON WONG TING-KWONG'S MOTION ON "OPPOSING FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS' ENJOYMENT OF THE RIGHT OF ABODE IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 謝偉俊 Paul TSE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	25	
投票 Vote	19	24	
贊成 Yes	3	0	
反對 No	4	10	
棄權 Abstain	12	14	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹中 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
崔蔭逵 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHIENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
熊國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉榮 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 10
 日期 DATE: 20/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 12:59:07 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 「反對外籍家庭傭工享有香港居留權」議案
 MOTION ON "OPPOSING FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS' ENJOYMENT OF THE RIGHT OF ABODE IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	16	8	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	14	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Stary LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璅 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

