

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 7

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 16 November 2011 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Member absent:

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 28 - Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Annual Report, Report of the Directors and Financial Statements 2010/2011 (published on 11.11.2011)
- No. 29 - Hong Kong Productivity Council Annual Report 2010-2011 (published on 11.11.2011)
- No. 30 - Report of changes made to the approved Estimates of Expenditure during the second quarter of 2011-12 Public Finance Ordinance: Section 8 (published on 14.11.2011)
- No. 31 - Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 16.11.2011)
- No. 32 - Report No. 57 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - October 2011 (published on 16.11.2011)
- No. 33 - Accounts of the Government for the year ended 31 March 2011 (published on 16.11.2011)

Report of the Committee on Members' Interests on its consideration of complaints against Hon Timothy FOK, Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon CHIM Pui-chung, Dr Hon Philip WONG and Hon IP Kwok-him (published on 16.11.2011)

Addresses

Hon Emily LAU, Deputy Chairman of the Committee on Members' Interests, addressed the Council on the Report of the Committee on Members' Interests on its consideration of complaints against Hon Timothy FOK, Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon CHIM Pui-chung, Dr Hon Philip WONG and Hon IP Kwok-him.

Questions

1. Hon Albert HO asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

2. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon Ronny TONG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Justice replied.

4. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

5. Hon Mrs Regina IP asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the Companies Ordinance (Exemption of Companies and Prospectuses from Compliance with Provisions) (Amendment) Notice 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 143 of 2011, and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 26 October 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 14 December 2011.

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Comprehensively improving the water quality of the Victoria Harbour

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given that the 'cross harbour swimming race' was resumed on 16 October this year after a suspension of 33 years; the West Kowloon Cultural District project has entered Stage 3 of the consultation process and will soon be finalized and commenced; the first berth of Kai Tak Cruise Terminal will be commissioned in 2013; the Government is also developing continuous waterfront promenades along waterfront areas on both sides of the Victoria Harbour, and such works and projects are all closely related to the Victoria Harbour; and, as the water quality of the Victoria Harbour has all along been criticized by environmentalists, academics and the public, this

Council urges the Government to formulate long-term proposals for improving the water quality of the Victoria Harbour, so as to truly realize the objective of 'returning the harbour to the people'; the relevant improvement proposals should include the following measures:

- (a) to immediately investigate and stop the pollution sources of the Victoria Harbour;
- (b) to identify misconnection of sewers in the urban areas;
- (c) to increase the existing penalties to punish individuals or enterprises who pollute the harbour;
- (d) to rectify the current situation of fragmentation of responsibilities among government departments for managing the water quality of the Victoria Harbour, and to study establishing a higher-level department to co-ordinate and follow up the relevant matters;
- (e) to draw reference from international experience, so as to formulate water quality objectives specifically for the Victoria Harbour;
- (f) to report to the public on the water quality of the various parts of the Victoria Harbour at half-yearly intervals;
- (g) to study removing polluting facilities in the vicinity of the Victoria Harbour, such as typhoon shelters, cargo working areas and polluting industrial plants, etc.; and
- (h) to make the 'cross harbour swimming race' an annual gala in Hong Kong and organize it regularly every year at different locations in the Victoria Harbour, so as to press the relevant departments to seriously improve the water quality of the Victoria Harbour.

While Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:45 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon KAM Nai-wai, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Audrey EU, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five Members and Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:08 pm, while Hon WONG Yung-kan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eight other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion:

To delete “,” after “That” and substitute with “the Victoria Harbour is one of the most precious resources in Hong Kong;”; to add “, and at the same time, to strengthen the relevant publicity and public education, so that the public can better understand the importance and benefits of protecting the harbour environment” after “pollute the harbour”; to add “, such as establishing a harbour management authority to manage, develop and enhance the environment, planning, sites and facilities in harbour areas and waterfront areas, formulate a policy for harbour areas and waterfront areas under the people-based and sustainable development principles, and encourage people to actively express their views, so as to enable the public to share and use the harbour” after “the relevant matters”; and to add “, and at the same time, to enhance both sides of the Victoria Harbour together with the environment and planning of the waterfront promenades to be launched in the next few years, so as to provide better activity space for people who engage in angling and various activities in such areas” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Comprehensively improving the water quality of the Victoria Harbour” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion:

To delete “given that” after “That,” and substitute with “following the efforts made in the harbour area treatment works in recent years,”; to add “however,” after “33 years;”; to delete “;” after “urban areas” and substitute with “, and expeditiously replace aged sewers under the various sewerage rehabilitation and upgrading works programmes, so as to ensure that effluents will not enter the Victoria Harbour through other channels and cause pollution; (c) to expeditiously complete the upgrading works of sewage collection, treatment and disposal facilities on both sides of the Victoria Harbour and in the various districts of Hong Kong, so as to raise the effluent discharge capacity of existing sewers in Hong Kong; (d) to expeditiously finalize the timetable for implementing Harbour Area Treatment Scheme Stage 2B and strive for its commencement at the earliest possible time, so as to further improve the water quality of the Victoria Harbour; (e) to study introducing a more advanced and higher standard effluent treatment process for treating effluents from both sides of the Victoria Harbour, including allocating additional resources to study the development of reclaimed water, so as to achieve the objectives of sustainable development and recycling;”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(f)”;

to delete the original “(d)” and substitute with “(g)”;

to delete the original “(e)” and substitute with “(h)”;

to delete the original “(f)” and substitute with “(i)”;

to delete the original “(g)” and substitute with “(j)”;

to add “the feasibility of” before “removing polluting facilities”; to delete “, such as typhoon shelters,

cargo working areas and polluting industrial plants, etc.” after “vicinity of the Victoria Harbour” and substitute with “while having regard to people’s livelihood needs”; to delete the original “(h)” and substitute with “(k)”; to add “, on the premise of ensuring contestants’ health and safety,” after “gala in Hong Kong and”; and to delete “regularly” after “organize it”.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment had been passed, Hon Audrey EU had withdrawn her amendment.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion as amended by Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou put and agreed to.

Enacting an archives law

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, in order to properly manage and preserve valuable public records, and provide channels for the public to access such records, this Council urges the Government to immediately launch public consultation on the formulation of an archives law and expeditiously proceed with its enactment.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Paul TSE and Hon Cyd HO, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Fourteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke again.

Hon Paul TSE moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion:

To delete "provide channels for the public to access" after "public records, and" and substitute with "facilitate the public to access"; and to delete "immediately launch public consultation on the formulation of an archives law and expeditiously proceed with its enactment" immediately before the full stop and substitute with "expeditiously review the existing management of government records, and having regard to the outcome of the review, to consider adopting appropriate measures to enhance the management of government records and related services for the public".

Question on Hon Paul TSE's amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Enacting an archives law" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Cyd HO moved the following amendment Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion:

To add “, and to: (a) establish a standing committee to review the existing situation of records management and put forward improvement proposals; (b) create a professional grade comprising all records management posts in the Government Records Service, and stipulate professional qualifications in records management as mandatory requirements; and (c) extend the mandatory requirements that are currently applicable only to the Government’s internal records management to all publicly-funded statutory bodies” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Cyd HO’s amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Margaret NG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, one against it and 17 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and eight abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 23 November 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:43 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

12 January 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 16/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:34:02 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 甘乃威議員對梁美芬議員的「全面改善維多利亞港水質」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON KAM NAI-WAI TO DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG'S MOTION ON
 "COMPREHENSIVELY IMPROVING THE WATER QUALITY OF THE VICTORIA HARBOUR"

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	28	否決 Negatived
投票 Vote	24	27	
贊成 Yes	12	18	
反對 No	5	3	
棄權 Abstain	7	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 16/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 07:34:58 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 謝偉俊議員對吳靄儀議員的「訂立檔案法」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON PAUL TSE TO DR HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON "ENACTING AN ARCHIVES LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 謝偉俊 Paul TSE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	25	
投票 Vote	26	24	
贊成 Yes	21	8	
反對 No	5	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 16/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 07:37:51 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 何秀蘭議員對吳靄儀議員的「訂立檔案法」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CYD HO TO DR HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON "ENACTING AN ARCHIVES LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭 Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	25	
投票 Vote	26	24	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	18	7	
棄權 Abstain	3	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 16/11/2011
 時間 TIME: 07:42:25 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 「訂立檔案法」議案
 MOTION ON "ENACTING AN ARCHIVES LAW"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	25	
投票 Vote	26	24	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	17	8	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	棄權	ABSTAIN	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	涂謹申	James TO		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	棄權	ABSTAIN	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	棄權	ABSTAIN	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	李慧琼	Starry LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK