

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 34

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 20 June 2012 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 21 June 2012 at 9:00 am, Friday 22 June 2012 at 9:00 am
and Monday 25 June 2012 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

(absent on 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

(absent on 22.6.2012)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

(absent on 22.6.2012)

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
(absent on 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
(absent on 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
(absent on 21.6.2012 and 22.6.2012)

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
(absent on 25.6.2012)

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
(absent on 25.6.2012)

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
(absent on 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
(absent on 22.6.2012)

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
(absent on 25.6.2012)

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
(absent on 21.6.2012, 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
(absent on 25.6.2012)

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP
(absent on 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012)

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
(absent on 25.6.2012)

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

On 20.6.2012

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

On 20.6.2012 and 21.6.2012

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

On 20.6.2012, 21.6.2012 and 22.6.2012

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

On 21.6.2012

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

On 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

On 20.6.2012

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

On 20.6.2012 and 21.6.2012

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

On 20.6.2012, 21.6.2012 and 22.6.2012

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

On 20.6.2012, 21.6.2012 and 25.6.2012

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 21.6.2012, 22.6.2012 and 25.6.2012

Mr Andy LAU Kwok-cheong, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Declaration of Increase in Pensions Notice 2012 (gazetted on 15.6.2012)	105/2012
2. Widows and Orphans Pension (Increase) Notice 2012 (gazetted on 15.6.2012)	106/2012

Other Paper

Report No. 23/11-12 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 13.6.2012)

Questions

1. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

2. Hon Alan LEONG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

5. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

The President suspended the meeting at 1:22 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 2:20 pm.

The President stated that the Chief Secretary for Administration had made a request to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure, so that the Council could deal with the resolution to be proposed by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs on the reorganization of the Government Secretariat before dealing with other Government Bills.

In deciding whether or not the request made by the Chief Secretary for Administration for moving the aforesaid motion was allowed, the President considered the grounds put forward by the Chief Secretary for Administration and the question of whether the amount of time given to Members was sufficient for them to prepare for the resolution proposed by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs if this resolution was to be dealt with at today's meeting.

The President stated that he noted that Members had been informed by writing on 10 May 2012 that the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs would propose the relevant resolution at today's meeting, and the deliberations made in the relevant subcommittee as well as the handling of many amendments from Members were based on the date of today's Council meeting at which this resolution was to be dealt with. As the Agenda for today's meeting had clearly set out the resolution as part of the Agenda, the President said that he was convinced that Members were aware of the fact that this resolution proposed by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs would be dealt with at today's meeting.

The President further stated that as a number of items remained outstanding from the several meetings held recently, which included a number of Government bills, this state of affairs had led to a need to suspend Rule 18 of the Rules of Procedure to enable the Council to deal with the resolution from the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs at today's meeting as scheduled. Because of the above considerations, the President gave consent to the Chief Secretary for Administration to move the aforesaid motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure.

Hon KAM Nai-wai drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Motions

Motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That Rule 18(1) of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region be suspended at the Council meeting of 20 June 2012.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion.

After Hon Albert HO had spoken, the President reiterated the grounds on which he gave his consent to the Chief Secretary for Administration to move the aforesaid motion.

Two other Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for two times as his attention was drawn to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

Hon Frederick FUNG continued to speak on the motion.

After Hon Frederick FUNG had spoken, the President stated that he would not debate his ruling with Members in the Chamber. Yet, as it seemed that Hon Frederick FUNG was not clear about the contents of the motion, the President restated the grounds on which he gave consent to the Chief Secretary for Administration to move this motion.

With the President's permission, Hon Frederick FUNG elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by the President.

Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President reminded Members that since he had made his ruling, Members should not raise objection to his ruling in their speech at the meeting.

Seven Members spoke on the motion.

By the time the meeting was suspended for a break, the President had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for five times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

The President suspended the meeting at 6:36 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 7:40 pm.

Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

While Hon Cyd HO was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Three Members and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou spoke on the motion.

While Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou was speaking, Hon Audrey EU raised a point of order on whether Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's speech had deviated from the question under debate.

The President reminded Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou that his speech should be relevant to the motion.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou continued to speak on the motion.

A Member and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President said that Mr LEUNG should not debate his ruling at the meeting and repeatedly reminded him that his speech should be relevant to the motion.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak on the motion.

Three Members spoke on the motion.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:04 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 21 June 2012.

Nine Members spoke on the motion.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that 54 Members were present, 27 were in favour of the motion, 25 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

By the time the Council went into committee, the President had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for four times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

Bills

Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill 2011

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and continued to consider the original provisions of clauses 7 to 12, 15, 16, 19, 22 and 27 of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill 2011, as well as the amendments thereto.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 11:50 am.

* * * * *

The committee resumed at 1:30 pm.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that 40 Members were present, 37 were in favour of the amendments and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the amendments were passed.

Question that clauses 7 to 12, 15, 16, 19, 22 and 27 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 13 and 21 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury had given notice to move amendments to clauses 13 and 21. Hon WONG Sing-chi had also given notice to move amendments to clause 13.

The Chairman further stated that irrespective of whether or not the amendments moved by the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury were passed, Hon WONG Sing-chi might move his amendments to clause 13.

The Chairman ordered that clauses 13 and 21 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to clauses 13 and 21, and spoke on the amendments.

Four Members spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that 41 Members were present, 37 were in favour of the amendments and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the amendments were passed.

Question that clause 21 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that 42 Members were present, 38 were in favour of the motion and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved a further amendment to clause 13.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, five were in favour of the amendments, 15 against them and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendments, four against them and five abstained (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negated.

Question that clause 13 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that 40 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the motion, one against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Question that clause 20 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Hon KAM Nai-wai had given notice to move two amendments to clause 20. The Committee would first put to vote Hon KAM Nai-wai's first amendment. If that amendment was passed, Hon KAM Nai-wai might not move his second amendment. The Chairman ordered that the original provisions of clause 20, as well as the two amendments moved by Hon KAM Nai-wai, be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved his first amendment to clause 20 and spoke on the two amendments.

A Member and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke again.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's first amendment put.

Hon KAM Nai-wai claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved his second amendment to clause 20.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's second amendment put.

Hon KAM Nai-wai claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, four were in favour of the amendments, 14 against them and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments, four against them and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clause 20 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

New clause 23A read the first time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading of new clause 23A and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 23A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 23A read the second time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the addition of new clause 23A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

By the time the Council resumed, the Chairman had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for two times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) (No. 2)
Bill 2011

had passed through the Committee stage with amendments. The Bill was ordered to be set down for Third Reading under Rule 59 of the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Three Members and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President repeatedly reminded Mr WONG that his speech should not deviate from the contents of the Bill and if he continued to do so, the President would stop him from speaking.

Despite the President's reminders, Hon WONG Kwok-hing continued to speak on the subject which the President considered to be deviated from the contents of the Bill. The President then ordered him to stop speaking.

Another Member and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion.

While Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President reminded Mr LEE that his speech should not deviate from the contents of the Bill.

Three Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President repeatedly reminded Mr LEUNG that his speech should not deviate from the contents of the Bill.

A Member, Hon Albert CHAN and Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the motion. While Hon Albert CHAN and Hon WONG Yuk-man were speaking, the President repeatedly reminded them that their speeches should not deviate from the contents of the Bill.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that 39 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the motion and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix IX**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

By the time the meeting was suspended for a break, the President had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for four times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

The President suspended the meeting at 6:58 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 8:00 pm.

Construction Industry Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2012

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 29 February 2012 resumed.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Construction Industry Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2012, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Twelve Members spoke on the Bill.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:59 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 22 June 2012.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Construction Industry Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2012.

Question that clauses 2 to 7, 9 to 17, 20 to 26, 30 to 41, 43 to 57, 59 to 63 and 65 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 8, 18, 19, 27, 28, 29, 42, 58 and 64 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Development moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 8, 18, 19, 27, 28, 29, 42, 58 and 64 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Development reported that

the Construction Industry Legislation (Miscellaneous
Amendments) Bill 2012

had passed through the Committee stage with amendments. The Bill was ordered to be set down for Third Reading under Rule 59 of the Rules of Procedure.

The Secretary for Development moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Personal Data (Privacy) (Amendment) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 July 2011 resumed.

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Personal Data (Privacy) (Amendment) Bill 2011, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

Eight Members spoke on the Bill.

By the time the meeting was suspended, the President had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for four times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

The President suspended the meeting at 12:48 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 25 June 2012.

Seven Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

The President announced that 36 Members were present and 35 were in favour of the motion (voting record in **Appendix X**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Personal Data (Privacy) (Amendment) Bill 2011.

Question that clauses 2, 5, 6, 10, 12, 14 to 20, 22, 23, 25, 26, 29, 30, 31, 37 and 40 to 43 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Four Members and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

By the time the meeting was suspended for a break, the Chairman had directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting for four times as Members had drawn his attention to the absence of a quorum. Each time a quorum was then present.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 12:26 pm.

* * * * *

The committee resumed at 1:30 pm.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO requested to take out clause 12 from other clauses, which also stood part of the Bill, and put it to vote separately.

Questions that clauses 2, 5, 6, 10, 14 to 20, 22, 23, 25, 26, 29, 30, 31, 37 and 40 to 43 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Questions that clause 12 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Questions that clauses 1, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 11, 13, 24, 27, 28, 32 to 36, 38 and 39 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon James TO drew the attention of the Chairman to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

Next meeting

The Council resumed. As a quorum was not present 15 minutes after Members had been summoned, the President adjourned the Council in accordance with Rule 17(3) of the Rules of Procedure until 11:00 am on 27 June 2012.

The Council was adjourned at 1:50 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

28 September 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 11:48:16 上午 AM

Appendix I

動議 MOTION: 暫停執行《議事規則》第18(1)條的議案
MOTION TO SUSPEND RULE 18(1) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE

動議人 MOVED BY: 政務司司長 The Chief Secretary for Administration

出席 Present : 54
投票 Vote : 53
贊成 Yes : 27
反對 No : 25
棄權 Abstain : 1
結果 Result : 否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家騮	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 01:43:06 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》－全體委員會審議階段－修正
第7至12、15、16、19、22及27條
MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 7 TO 12, 15, 16, 19, 22 AND 27

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 40
投票 Vote : 39
贊成 Yes : 37
反對 No : 0
棄權 Abstain : 2
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah			梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 02:57:39 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》－全體委員會審議階段－修正第13及21條
MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 13 AND 21

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 41
投票 Vote : 40
贊成 Yes : 37
反對 No : 0
棄權 Abstain : 3
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG			譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	棄權	ABSTAIN

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 03:03:31 下午 PM

Appendix IV

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》— 全體委員會審議階段— 經修正的第21條納入條例草案

MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
CLAUSE 21 AS AMENDED STAND PART OF THE BILL

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 42
投票 Vote : 41
贊成 Yes : 38
反對 No : 0
棄權 Abstain : 3
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG			譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
李永達	LEE Wing-tat			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	棄權	ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
 時間 TIME: 03:09:32 下午 PM

Appendix V

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》— 全體委員會審議階段 — 進一步修正第13條
 MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE - FURTHER AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 13

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	20	
投票 Vote	21	19	
贊成 Yes	5	10	
反對 No	15	4	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 03:15:47 下午 PM

Appendix VI

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》－全體委員會審議階段－經修正的第13條納入條例草案
MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
CLAUSE 13 AS AMENDED STAND PART OF THE BILL


動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 40
投票 Vote : 39
贊成 Yes : 35
反對 No : 1
棄權 Abstain : 3
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG			譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
李永達	LEE Wing-tat			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	棄權	ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
 時間 TIME: 04:19:08 下午 PM

Appendix VII

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》— 全體委員會審議階段— 第20條的第一項修正案
 MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE - 1ST AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 20

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	18	
投票 Vote	18	17	
贊成 Yes	2	9	
反對 No	14	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騶 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
 日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
 時間 TIME: 04:25:14 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》— 全體委員會審議階段 — 第20條的第二項修正案
 MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE - 2ND AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 20

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	20	
投票 Vote	20	19	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	14	4	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9
日期 DATE: 21/06/2012
時間 TIME: 06:57:07 下午 PM

Appendix IX

動議 MOTION: 《2011年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）（第2號）條例草案》－三讀
MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2011 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present : 39
投票 Vote : 38
贊成 Yes : 35
反對 No : 0
棄權 Abstain : 3
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO			甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			梁家騮	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG			譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	棄權	ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10
日期 DATE: 25/06/2012
時間 TIME: 11:18:12 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 《2011年個人資料(私隱)(修訂)條例草案》— 二讀
PERSONAL DATA (PRIVACY)(AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present : 36
投票 Vote : 35
贊成 Yes : 35
反對 No : 0
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁鑑柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi		
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG			譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK

