

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC43/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 4th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of Legislative Council Complex
on Monday, 9 January 2012, at 2:30 pm**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Members absent:

Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan

Public officers attending:

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP | Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³ |
| Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP | Permanent Secretary for Development (Works) |
| Ms Gracie FOO Siu-wai, JP | Acting Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) |
| Ms Anissa WONG, JP | Permanent Secretary for the Environment |
| Ms Joyce HO Kwok-shan | Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Works) |
| Mr Tony LI Yeuk-yue | Principal Assistant Secretary (Planning and Lands) ² Development Bureau |
| Mr HON Chi-keung, JP | Director of Civil Engineering and Development |
| Mr Edward LEE Yiu-wah | Chief Engineer (Project 1) (New Territories North and West) Civil Engineering and Development Department |

Clerk in attendance:

| | |
|-------------|--|
| Mr Derek LO | Chief Council Secretary (1) ⁶ |
|-------------|--|

Staff in attendance:

| | |
|----------------|---|
| Ms Anita SIT | Assistant Secretary General 1 |
| Mr Ken WOO | Council Secretary (1) ⁶ |
| Mr Frankie WOO | Senior Legislative Assistant (1) ³ |
| Ms Christy YAU | Legislative Assistant (1) ⁸ |

Action

The Chairman advised that the use of the "Request to speak" system in Conference Room 1 had been recommended as a standing arrangement for members to indicate their intention to speak at meetings of the Finance Committee (FC) and its two subcommittees, namely, the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) and the Establishment Subcommittee (ESC). As the present rules in the Procedures of FC, PWSC and ESC specifically required members to raise their hands to speak, FC would consider at its meeting on 13 January 2012 the amendments to the relevant paragraphs in the Procedures to provide for the use of the "Request to speak" system. The Chairman proposed to take the opportunity to try using the "Request to speak" system for indicating intention to speak at the meeting and members agreed.

2. The Chairman reported that a total of 13 capital works projects amounting to \$68,755.3 million had been endorsed by PWSC in the 2011-2012 session so far. Of the total amount endorsed, \$65,262.9 million was related to capital works projects.

Head 707 – New Towns and Urban Area Development

**PWSC(2011-12)43 710CL Hung Shui Kiu development, stage 2 —
widening of Tin Ha Road and Tan
Kwai Tsuen Road**

3. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 710CL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$106 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices for the widening of Tin Ha Road and Tan Kwai Tsuen Road at Hung Shui Kiu. An information paper on the proposed works had been circulated to the Panel on Development on 8 December 2011.

The project proposal

4. Mr CHAN Kam-lam expressed support for the proposal. He asked whether the project would have an impact on the upcoming development of the Hung Shui Kiu new development area.

5. Director of Civil Engineering and Development (DCED) responded that the proposal sought to widen two sections of Tin Ha Road and Tan Kwai Tsuen Road which were sub-standard and posed severe danger to pedestrians. The Consultants engaged for the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Planning and Engineering Study had indicated that the project would not be in conflict with the development of the

Hung Shui Kiu new development area, which was still in its preliminary planning stage.

6. Mr Albert CHAN said that residents living close to the junction between Tin Ha Road and Ping Ha Road were strongly opposed to the original road scheme gazetted in 2008. These residents were concerned that the widened Tin Ha Road would bring about an increase in the traffic flow and that the space between the residential blocks and Tin Ha Road would be almost fully used for the erection of noise barriers. He asked whether the Administration had received any objections on the current proposal and whether these had been resolved.

7. DCED and Chief Engineer (Project 1) (New Territories North and West), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CE/P1 (NTN&W), CEDD) explained that the original road scheme comprised, inter alia, the widening of Tin Ha Road from the sub-standard two-way two-lane single carriageway to standard two-way four-lane single carriageway (14.6 metres in total width) between Ping Ha Road and Ha Tsuen Road (with the provision of noise barriers), and from the sub-standard two-way two-lane single carriageway to standard two-way two-lane single carriageway (10.3 metres in total width) between Ha Tsuen Road and San Lee Uk Tsuen. Since the gazettal of the road scheme on 16 May 2008, a large number of objections were received. In end 2008, the Ha Tsuen Interchange Slip Road was open for articulated vehicles to access Kong Shum Western Highway. The Slip Road served as an additional route for articulated vehicles in the Ha Tsuen area to access Kong Shum Western Highway directly via Ha Tsuen Road. The articulated vehicle traffic problem on the section of Tin Ha Road between Ping Ha Road and Ha Tsuen Road had therefore been relieved. The Transport Department (TD) subsequently advised that there was no imminent need to widen this section of Tin Ha Road and the proposed works were de-gazetted on 2 July 2010. In the light of the above developments, the project scope of the proposal was revised taking into account villagers' views on the original road scheme. No objection was received for the revised road schemes for Tin Ha Road under the project gazetted on 8 July 2011 and the relevant works had been authorized on 23 September 2011.

8. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming expressed support for the proposal. He said that the Ha Tsuen Rural Committee, Ping Shan Rural Committee and Yuen Long District Council also supported the proposal and urged for its early implementation.

Impact of the proposed works on traffic

9. Noting that the project would take about 2.5 years to complete, Mr CHAN Kam-lam was concerned that the proposed works may give rise to traffic congestion because Tin Ha Road was used heavily by articulated vehicles as well as nearby residents. He enquired whether the works would be conducted in sections and whether a temporary road would be provided during the construction stage. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming expressed similar views and asked about the measures on alleviating the possible traffic impact.

10. DCED advised that subsequent to the opening of the Ha Tsuen Interchange Slip Road in end 2008, the traffic flow on the section of Tin Ha Road between Ping Ha Road and Ha Tsuen Road had been reduced. Since both Tin Ha Road and Tan Kwai Tsuen Road were being used within their design traffic flow capacities, it was unlikely that the works would bring serious traffic congestion. Despite these facts, the construction works would be carried out in sections to minimize the traffic impact. CE/DD would also work with TD and the Police on implementing suitable temporary traffic arrangements during the construction stage.

11. Mr Albert CHAN said that Tin Ha Road was heavily used by articulated vehicles and pedestrians and he expressed grave concerns about the pedestrian safety there. DCED advised that Tin Ha Road recorded no fatal accident in the past five years, while the numbers for serious and minor traffic accidents were three and twenty respectively. The safety condition of Tin Ha Road was not particularly worrying. CE/P1 (NTN&W), CE/DD added that, apart from the provision of footpaths of 2 to 2.5 metres in width at Tin Ha Road, zebra-crossings would also be provided at Tin Ha Road near Fu Yee Garden, San Uk Tsuen and Galore Garden. To address the concern on the lack of traffic aids near the Po Kok Branch School, an additional zebra-crossing would be provided in front of the school together with the widening of the existing footpaths to a width of not less than 2.1 metres along Tan Kwai Tsuen Road.

Durability of road surface

12. Mr WONG Kwok-hing pointed out that for roads that were heavily used by articulated vehicles and lorries in the New Territories, both the roads and the associated footpaths were quite often damaged by

these heavy vehicles. He asked whether the roads and the footpaths to be provided under the project would be able to withstand the heavy load. Mr Albert CHAN asked whether vibration-proof materials would be used to minimize disturbance of ground vibrations caused by running vehicles.

13. DCED responded that, in the light of the heavy use of articulated vehicles at Tin Ha Road, due consideration had been given to the design of the road to ensure its endurance of heavy load. CEDD had also been in close liaison with the Highways Department on the paving materials to be used for the friction course to ensure the durability of the road and the associated footpaths. As regards the issue of ground vibrations caused by running vehicles, DCED would explore the feasibility of minimizing the disturbance as far as possible.

14. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2011-12)44 268RS Cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun (detailed design and site investigation (advance and stage 1 works))

15. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade part of 268RS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$28.2 million in MOD prices for engaging consultants to undertake the detailed design and site investigation works for the proposed cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Ting Kau, and conduct a review of the alignment of a proposed cycle track between Ting Kau and Tuen Mun. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 19 December 2011 and Panel members in general supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

16. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that he noted from a Legislative Council case conference held in 2010 that the public was generally supportive of the proposed cycle track. However, he noted that residents of some private residential developments at Sham Tseng and So Kwun Wat objected to the proposed alignment between Ting Kau and Tuen Mun in vicinity of their developments as it might cause public safety problems and adverse impact on the living environment. He welcomed the Administration's way of handling the proposal by first taking forward the works between Tsuen Wan and Ting Kau which received strong local support. While urging the Administration to consult the district councils concerned on the detailed design of the cycle track between Tsuen Wan

and Ting Kau, he requested the Administration to address the concerns of the affected residents at Sham Tseng and So Kwun Wat. Consideration could be given to taking over the management and maintenance responsibilities of the seawall from the affected residential developments as an incentive to the affected residents.

17. DCED advised that the affected residents had expressed various concerns on the proposed cycle track, which included the danger posed to children, danger posed to cyclists from the strong wind, and third-party liability insurance. As part of the cycle track network in the New Territories, the Government was actively pursuing new cycle tracks and making improvements to the existing ones under the Sheung Shui – Ma On Shan Section with a view to demonstrating the technical feasibility and the benefits of cycle tracks to other communities. The Administration noted the concerns on the current proposal and would continue to engage the public in the relevant discussions.

Bicycle parking

18. Mr TAM Yiu-chung pointed out the increasing use of bicycles as a means of transportation in particular to residents in the New Territories. He however was concerned about the lack of parking space for bicycles since the disorderly parking of bicycles on the streets might pose inconvenience or even danger to pedestrians. He urged the Administration to draw reference from Zhongshan which provided all bus stops a cycle park with an electronic toll collection system. The Chairman shared Mr TAM's view and remarked that the similar system had been used satisfactorily in Shunde.

19. DCED advised that double-deck cycle parks had been put on trial in vicinity of MTR Fanling and Sheung Shui Stations. The double-deck design would be effective in saving public space and addressing the parking issue. The experience of other cities would also be considered in the course of providing cycle parks.

Project implementation matters

20. Expressing support for the proposal, Mr Albert CHAN urged the Administration to take forward the proposal expeditiously as it had been dragged on for many years. The delay in the implementation of the project also entailed higher construction costs as a result of price escalation. In view that the project was proposed to be completed in stages, he requested the provision of turning areas at both ends of

different sections of the cycle track so that cyclists could easily take return journeys.

21. DCED explained that the proposal would be implemented in three stages, viz. Tsing Tsuen Bridge to Bayview Garden in Tsuen Wan (i.e. advance works), Bayview Garden to Ting Kau (i.e. stage 1 works), and Ting Kau to Tuen Mun (i.e. stage 2 works). Subject to the funding approval by FC, detailed design and site investigation works for the advance works would proceed in June 2012 for completion in August 2013. The detailed design and site investigation works for the stage 1 works and alignment review for the stage 2 works would be completed in December 2015. DCED further advised that turning areas could be provided at both ends at different stages of works to facilitate return journeys. Entry/exit hubs and resting stations would also be provided as appropriate.

22. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming expressed support for the proposal. However, he considered that the Administration should draw lessons from the cycle track project in Tai Po, in which adverse comments on the project were received during the construction stage. He urged the Administration to properly engage the public for the current proposal, in particular to the Tuen Mun District Council and Tsuen Wan District Council as well as the residential developments concerned.

23. DCED advised that cycle track project in Tai Po involved land resumption which would be avoided as far as practicable in future cycle track projects. The current proposal would be implemented in stages having regard to the views collected from both District Councils, various cyclist groups, area committees and nearby housing estates. The proposal also sought to secure funding for conducting further public consultations when the review of the alignment of the cycle track from Ting Kau to Tuen Mun was completed.

24. The item was voted on and endorsed.

25. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 3:12 pm.