

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC57/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 6th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 18 April 2012, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Member attending:

Hon WONG Sing-chi

Members absent:

Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment
Ms Joyce HO Kwok-shan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Ms Eva CHENG, GBS, JP	Secretary for Transport and Housing
Ms Maisie CHENG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 1
Mr LAM Sai-hung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 7
Mr LAU Ka-keung, JP	Director of Highways
Mr Henry CHAN, JP	Principal Government Engineer (Railway Development) Highways Department
Mr Michael LEUNG	Chief Engineer (Railway Development) 1-2 Highways Department
Mr Anthony LOO, JP	Assistant Commissioner (Planning) Transport Department
Mr CHEW Tai-chong	Projects Director MTR Corporation Limited
Dr Jacob KAM	Operations Director MTR Corporation Limited
Mr Stephen CHIK	Head of Project Engineering MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Philco WONG	General Manager (SCL) MTR Corporation Limited
Ms Maggie SO	Deputy General Manager (Projects and Property Communications) MTR Corporation Limited
Mr Kenneth CHEN Wei-on, JP	Under Secretary for Education
Mr Wallace LAU Ka-ki	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Higher Education)
Mrs Dorothy MA CHOW Pui- fun	Deputy Secretary-General (1) University Grants Committee
Mr LEUNG Kam-pui	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects) Architectural Services Department
Professor WONG Yuk-shan	Vice-President (Administration and Business) Hong Kong University of Science and Technology
Mr Mike HUDSON	Director of Facilities Management Hong Kong University of Science and Technology
Mr Andy LEE Shiu-chuen	Vice-President (Administration) and Secretary Hong Kong Baptist University
Mr LAM Long-chau	Director of Estates Hong Kong Baptist University
Mrs Sharon YIP	Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 4
Ms Jenny CHAN	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)8
Mr LEUNG Koon-kee, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mrs Prisilla TAM DAI Wai- ming	Project Director (1) Architectural Services Department
Mr Richard WU Chi-kwong	Chief Electronics Engineer (Technical Support) Civil Aviation Department
Mr Abraham CHENG Kwok- hung	Chief Superintendent (Planning and Development) Hong Kong Police Force
Ms Queenie WONG Siu-hing	Deputy District Commander (Airport District) Hong Kong Police Force
Mr Hermes TANG Yi-hoi	Senior Staff Officer (Planning and Development) Customs and Excise Department
Dr LEUNG Kin-ming	Senior Port Health Officer (Acting) Department of Health
Mr CHUI Tak-shing	Senior Principal Immigration Officer (Airport) Immigration Department

Mr CHAN Chi-chiu, JP Miss Amy YUEN Wai-yin	Director of Drainage Services Assistant Director (Water Policy) Environmental Protection Department
Mr TAI Wai-man	Chief Engineer (Consultants Management) Drainage Services Department
Mr LAI Cheuk-ho	Chief Engineer (Sewerage Projects) Drainage Services Department
Mr HON Chi-keung, JP Mr CHAN Yun-cheung, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development Head of Geotechnical Engineering Office Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Joseph YUNG Cho-leung	Chief Engineer (Land Works) Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Ken CHEUNG Kun-sing	Chief Architect (1) Housing Department
Mr MA Lee-tak, JP Mr LEUNG Wing-lim	Director of Water Supplies Assistant Director (New Works) Water Supplies Department

Clerk in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)6
-------------	------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mrs Constance LI Mr Andy LAU	Assistant Secretary General 1 Principal Council Secretary (Administration)
Mr Ken WOO	Council Secretary (1)6
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)8

Action

The Chairman reported that a total of 22 projects amounting to \$72,602.8 million had been endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee in the 2011-2012 session so far. Of the total amount endorsed, \$69,110.4 million was related to capital works projects.

Head 706 – Highways

PWSC(2012-13)1	61TR	Shatin to Central Link — construction of railway works — remaining works
PWSC(2012-13)2	62TR	Shatin to Central Link — construction of non-railway works — remaining works

2. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)1 sought to upgrade the remainder of 61TR to Category A at an estimated cost of \$65,433.3 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices for carrying out the remaining railway works of the Shatin to Central Link (SCL), while PWSC(2012-13)2 sought to upgrade the remainder of 62TR to Category A at an estimated cost of \$5,983.1 million in MOD prices for carrying out the remaining non-railway works of SCL. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways under the Panel of Transport had been consulted on the proposals at its meetings on 2, 23 and 30 March 2012. Subcommittee members had no objection in principle to the proposals. The gist of Subcommittee discussion was tabled at the meeting.

3. The Chairman said that as the proposals in PWSC(2012-13)1 and PWSC(2012-13)2 were related to the SCL project, discussion of the two items would be combined but the items would be voted on separately at the meeting.

4. The Chairman declared that he was an independent non-executive director of an engineering company. Ms Starry LEE declared that she owned properties along the alignment of SCL.

Project estimate

5. Mr IP Kwok-him said that Members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong were supportive of the proposals, as SCL had been long awaited by the community. He urged the Administration to put in place effective cost control measures in view of the huge investment involved.

6. Mr Albert CHAN expressed concern about impact of the upsurge in project estimate on the fare level of SCL. He opined that the approach to financing future railway projects and the setting of fare level should be subject to a public consultation process and the scrutiny of the Legislative Council (LegCo). He criticized that the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) had been expanding its empire and there was little transparency of its operation and profits.

7. Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) advised that construction prices surged rapidly over the past four years. The latest estimate on the construction cost of SCL reflected an overall escalation of the project cost of some 47% between 2007 and 2011, a magnitude in line with the increase of over 50% for general construction works over the same period. The Administration had appointed an independent consultant to scrutinize the estimated construction cost of SCL based on the detailed design to ensure that it was reasonable. STH pointed out that under the service concession approach, the Government would fund the construction of SCL and its ancillary infrastructure, and ultimately owned the railway. MTRCL would be granted a service concession for the operation of SCL and it would pay service concession payment, which was dependent on the fare prices, actual patronage and non-fare revenues after the SCL had come into operation. Based on the current assessment, the total service concession payment would amount to about \$88 billion (in MOD prices) over the service concession period (50 years) of SCL.

8. STH further advised that MTR fare was not affected by the construction cost of railway projects as the adjustment of fare was based upon the established fare adjustment mechanism. The Administration was fully aware of the concerns expressed by the public on the adjustment of MTR fares in 2012 and a review on the mechanism would be conducted in the second half of 2012.

Project management cost

9. Mr WONG Sing-chi noted that the project management cost (PMC) payable to MTRCL was \$6,097.2 million in September 2011 prices. He expressed concern that the amount would be even higher in MOD prices.

10. STH explained that PMC payable to MTRCL was mainly used to meet the salaries of staff deployed for the project. As the whole SCL project would take as long as ten years to complete, the salaries would be paid in different years according to MOD prices. PMC would then be paid in MOD prices.

Interface with other projects

11. Prof Patrick LAU asked whether it was possible to advance the completion date of the project. Director of Highways (DH_y) advised that SCL was a large-scale project with a 17 kilometres railway line with ten stations. While the Tai Wai to Hung Hom section was scheduled to

complete in 2018, the Hung Hom to Admiralty section (a cross harbour section) could only be completed in 2020 due to various technical challenges. These included the coordination required between the project and the works of the Central-Wan Chai Bypass, Wan Chai Development Phase II and Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter currently in progress. Also, works for the railway tunnel could proceed only after the completion of a number of reprovisioning works, such as the relocation of the Wan Chai North Public Transport Interchange and the Wan Chai Sports Ground.

12. In response to Prof Patrick LAU's concern on the impact of the cross harbour section of SCL on Wan Chai's harbourfront planning, DHy explained that funding had been secured in 2011 for the implementation of protection works for the SCL tunnel and other associated works at the Causeway Bay Typhoon Shelter to ensure better interface between SCL and the Central-Wan Chai Bypass tunnel. The impact of SCL on the planning of Wan Chai harbourfront would be minimal.

13. Prof Patrick LAU referred to the Administration's recent proposal to provide an elevated monorail system linking the Kai Tak Development, Kwun Tong and Kowloon Bay with the Kwun Tong Line and SCL. He asked whether the Administration had explored the option of providing a railway extension line connecting the proposed To Kwa Wan Station and Kwun Tong Station to remove the need for the monorail system.

14. Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)1 (DS(T)1) advised that upon the commissioning of SCL, SCL passengers could change at the Diamond Hill Station and Ho Man Tin Station to the Kwun Tong Line. In the long run, the need for railway extensions would be evaluated under the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 currently in progress.

15. Miss Tanya CHAN requested the Administration to pay special attention to the intricate underground utilities during the construction of SCL. She also called on the Administration to implement appropriate traffic arrangements during the construction of the proposed Exhibition Station to minimize the disturbance to the business activities of the Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre. The Administration took note of Miss CHAN's concerns.

Reprovisioning, remedial and improvement works

16. Ms Starry LEE said that the implementation of the SCL project would entail temporary closure or permanent relocation of some existing public facilities in various districts. She requested the Administration to

consult the district councils and the local communities concerned on reprovisioning of these facilities.

17. DS(T)1 responded that the Administration noted the concerns of the public on the closure or relocation of existing facilities and made efforts to identify suitable sites to relocate the facilities concerned. The Administration would continue to consult the stakeholders on the relocation and reprovisioning works.

18. Mr WONG Kwok-kin urged the Administration to take forward SCL expeditiously. Pointing out that a temporary worksite would be provided at the Ma Chai Hang Recreation Ground to facilitate the tunnel works of SCL, he asked about the measures to compensate for the inconvenience posed to the local community.

19. DS(T)1 advised that the size of the worksite at Ma Chai Hang Recreation Ground had been reduced upon extensive consultation with the district council and local community. The Administration would, as far as practicable, maintain the existing facilities in the recreational ground and relocate affected facilities temporarily. The recreation ground would be reprovisioned upon completion of SCL. An indoor games hall was proposed to be provided within the recreation ground in compensation for the part of the recreation ground being occupied permanently for the provision of ventilation facilities and emergency access of SCL. The Administration would consult the stakeholders in planning for the indoor games hall.

Pedestrian connections

20. Mr Fred LI pointed out the difficulty encountered by residents of public housing estates in Tsz Wan Shan in walking up and down the steep hillside every day and urged the Administration to expedite the provision of the pedestrian walkway systems at Tsz Wan Shan to facilitate their access to the Diamond Hill Station.

21. STH advised that the non-railway works under SCL would commence in mid-2012 for completion in tandem with the railway works of the Tai Wai to Hung Hom section in 2018 and the Hung Hom to Admiralty section in 2020. The pedestrian walkway systems at Tsz Wan Shan would be included in the first batch of works to be implemented for early completion between 2014 and 2016 in phases.

22. In response to Ms Starry LEE's request to provide a station exit at To Kwa Wan Road, STH explained that cut and cover method would be used for the construction of the Ma Tau Wai Station and it was necessary to carry out closure of traffic lanes of Ma Tau Wai Road and temporary traffic diversions in phases. Since the construction of a connecting pedestrian subway to To Kwa Wan Road would require partial closure of To Kwa Wan Road and nearby roads, it would pose serious impact to the shops, pedestrian access and road traffic in the district, if the construction of Ma Tau Wai Station and the subway took place at the same time. The Administration, however, subscribed to the proposal on providing a pedestrian subway to To Kwa Wan Road, and would study the options for its alignment and consult stakeholders in due course.

Environmental concerns

23. Referring to the busy works of the West Island Line (WIL) in densely populated districts and the disturbance brought to the local community, Mr IP Kwok-him called on MTRCL to adopt effective mitigation measures during the construction of SCL.

24. STH advised that construction activities of SCL were designed in such a way that disturbance to the local community would be minimized. Examples included the use of bored/mined method instead of cut-and-cover approach to tunnel construction as far as practicable to minimize the scope of road openings, and the delivery of excavated materials by way of sea transport to minimize impact on road transport. DHy added that MTRCL would adopt mitigation measures as recommended in the relevant environmental impact assessment reports as well as setting up community liaison groups in the districts concerned to enhance communication with the local communities.

Impact of underground works on buildings

25. Mr IP Kwok-him said that defects such as concrete cracking and spalling were found on the external walls of some of the buildings along the WIL alignment during construction. The building owners had difficulty proving the cause of the damage. He expressed concern that the same might happen under SCL and asked whether assistance would be provided to the affected building owners. Expressing similar concerns, Ms Starry LEE urged the Administration to conduct condition surveys for the buildings affected by underground strata resumption and explain the relevant findings to allay residents' concerns.

26. DS(T)1 advised that, with the owners' consent, MTRCL would conduct condition surveys for individual units and common areas for the buildings along the SCL alignment prior to the construction stage. MTRCL would conduct investigation into reported cases of damage to the buildings and carry out repair works for damage caused by the project.

Provision of station facilities

27. Mr WONG Sing-chi requested MTRCL to ensure that SCL would be barrier-free to persons with disabilities. Prof Patrick LAU shared Mr WONG's concern and asked whether public toilet facilities would be provided in SCL stations.

28. DHy replied that in planning for the project, the project team had taken into account the barrier-free access design requirements as provided under the existing legislations. All SCL stations would be barrier-free to persons with disabilities. STH advised that public toilet facilities would be provided in all SCL stations according to the latest standard in regard to the proportion of male and female toilet facilities.

Enhancing artistic elements in station design

29. Mr Albert CHAN expressed disappointment that the expenditure for station artistic design work and artistic furnishings under SCL was only estimated to be about \$41 million. He urged the Administration and MTRCL to make reference to some overseas infrastructural projects, in which a certain proportion, say 0.1% or even 1%, of the area of project site was reserved for artworks display. He also suggested making it mandatory for MTRCL to set aside a certain percentage of its advertising revenue for strengthening the artistic and cultural elements at stations. The Chairman shared Mr CHAN's views on enhancing the artistic atmosphere of stations.

30. STH responded that the design of SCL stations was still in its infancy and a specific budget cost would be available after the entire artistic design concept was set out. The proposed expenditure should not confine the extent of art display as MTRCL would partner with local art organizations in displaying artworks at stations. The Administration would make good use of MTR stations as a platform for displaying the achievements of local artists and promoting local art.

31. The Chairman put the items to vote one by one.

Voting on PWSC(2012-13)1

32. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Voting on PWSC(2012-13)2

33. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**Head 708 – Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment
PWSC(2012-13)3 15EL Tseung Kwan O Joint Student Hostel**

34. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)3 sought to upgrade 15EL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$198.3 million in MOD prices for the construction of Tseung Kwan O Joint Student Hostel, which would provide additional hostel places to students of The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology (HKUST) and Hong Kong Baptist University. The Panel on Education had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 13 February 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

35. Ms Starry LEE declared that she was a Council member of HKUST.

36. Ms Cyd HO commented that the existing criteria for calculating the provision of hostel places to students of institutions funded by the University Grants Committee were too stringent since one of them required hostel places be provided to students whose daily travelling time exceeded four hours. She suggested that the Administration should consider renting private housing units in close proximity to the universities for providing hostel places.

37. Under Secretary for Education advised that institutions had flexibility in allocating hostel places taking into account students' individual circumstances. The Administration would consider various options to meet the demand for hostel places, including renting private housing units.

38. Prof Patrick LAU reiterated his view expressed at the relevant meeting of the Panel on Education that each double room should be provided a toilet.

39. Vice-President (Administration and Business), HKUST responded that the design of the joint student hostel had in fact been greatly improved compared with some older student hostels where common toilet was provided on each floor. He undertook to optimize the design of the bathrooms to facilitate the use of students.

40. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 703 – Buildings

PWSC(2012-13)4 401IO Fitting-out works for Government facilities associated with midfield expansion project at Hong Kong International Airport

41. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)4 sought to upgrade 401IO to Category A at an estimated cost of \$256.5 million in MOD prices for the fitting-out works for Government facilities associated with midfield expansion project at the Hong Kong International Airport. The Panel on Economic Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 26 March 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

42. The Chairman declared that he was a member of the Board of the Airport Authority Hong Kong.

43. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 704 – Drainage

PWSC(2012-13)5 339DS North District sewerage, stage 1 phase 2C and stage 2 phase 1

44. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)5 sought to upgrade part of 339DS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$316.8 million in MOD prices for implementing sewerage works in the three unsewered areas in Tai Po. The Panel on Environmental Affairs had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 27 February 2012 and Panel members had no objection in principle to the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

45. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**PWSC(2012-13)6 353DS Outlying Islands sewerage stage 2—
upgrading of Mui Wo village sewerage
phase 2 and Mui Wo sewage treatment
works**

46. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)6 sought to upgrade part of 353DS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$967.2 million in MOD prices for upgrading the existing Mui Wo sewage treatment works (STW) and implementing sewerage works in Mui Wo town centre, Wang Tong and Yue Kwong Chuen. The Panel on Environmental Affairs had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 27 February 2012 and Panel members had no objection in principle to the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Protection of heritage

47. Mr Albert CHAN urged the Administration to protect the heritage in Mui Wo during the construction process and to engage local residents, who were knowledgeable about the local heritage, in undertaking studies to preserve local heritage.

48. Director of Drainage Services (DDS) advised that the Drainage Services Department had maintained close contact with the Antiquities and Monuments Office and the local community in taking forward the project. While the Mang Tong Site of Archaeological Interest would be affected by the proposed works, mitigation measure in the form of an archaeological watching brief would be conducted by a qualified archaeologist during the construction phase. The impact of the project on the Yuen's Mansion would be minimal as the sewers would be laid at a far distance and within a shallow depth. Adequate mitigation measures would be implemented.

Connection of village houses to public sewerage systems

49. Mr Albert CHAN pointed out that many village house owners had refused to carry out connections to public sewers at their own cost, thus undermining the cost effectiveness of most village sewerage projects. He urged the Administration to provide final sewer connections for individual houses as part of the proposal to enhance cost effectiveness. Prof Patrick LAU shared the concern of Mr Albert CHAN and requested the Administration to provide solution to avoid wastage of public resources.

50. DDS advised that under the existing policy, the Administration would provide public sewerage to unsewered village areas through the construction of trunk sewers with branch sewers extending to the lot boundaries of the village houses. The village house owners would have to complete the final sewer connection works from the branch sewers to their houses at their own cost. Assistant Director (Water Policy), Environmental Protection Department explained that Mr Albert CHAN's proposal to providing the final sewer connections to private properties would need careful consideration as it would involve the use of public resources.

Admin

51. Mr Albert CHAN said that the private treatment facility of most village houses was in fact located metres away on Government land. It was inappropriate to continue rolling out village sewerage programmes while ignoring the low house-to-sewerage connection rate. He requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the number (and the percentage) of connections made by private village house owners to the public village sewerage system completed in recent years before the relevant meeting of the Finance Committee (FC). The Administration agreed to provide the information.

52. Permanent Secretary for the Environment responded that an Audit Report on the village sewerage programmes had recently been completed and the Administration had been following up on the recommendations therein. Implementation of the sewerage programmes for unsewered villages had been planned having regard to the current sanitary conditions of the unsewered villages, number of households served and technical feasibility. While some village houses were unable to connect to the public sewerage due to technical difficulties, the majority of village houses served by the public sewerage facilities had made the connections. The Administration had been liaising with the Heung Yee Kuk, district councils and the village representatives concerned in taking forward village sewerage programmes.

53. The item was voted on and endorsed.

54. Mr Albert CHAN requested that this item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

PWSC(2012-13)7 379DS Feasibility study on relocation of Sha Tin sewage treatment works to caverns

55. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)7 sought to upgrade 379DS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$57.9 million in MOD prices for carrying out a feasibility study on relocation of the Sha Tin STW to caverns. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 27 March 2012 and Panel members had no objection in principle to the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Environmental concerns

56. Referring to a submission from the Chevalier Garden Environmental Concern Group on the proposal, Mr TAM Yiu-chung called on the Administration to address the concerns of the residents of Chevalier Garden which was located near the proposed site for the Sha Tin STW. Ms Cyd HO urged the Administration to make available for public display a three-dimensional model explaining the relocation concept and provide residents detailed project information to allay their concerns.

57. DDS advised that the Administration was aware of the concerns of the local communities. Three briefings on the proposed study had been conducted for residents in the vicinity of the proposed relocation site. Information about the proposed study had also been presented to the Sha Tin District Council (STDC) and residents at the briefing sessions. Information leaflets were sent to residents of Chevalier Garden and nearby villages who were unable to attend the briefing sessions.

58. Prof Patrick LAU, Chairman of the Panel on Development, said that the Panel was concerned about the possible odour and noise nuisance to Chevalier Garden after the proposed relocation. Panel members suggested placing the ventilation shaft away from Chevalier Garden and using sea transport to deliver explosives to be used for cavern construction. Panel members also requested visits to the Stanley STW be arranged for residents to understand the operation of sewage treatment facility in caverns.

59. DDS replied that residents of Chevalier Garden had earlier paid a visit to the Stanley STW and could sense neither smell nor noise at the drop-off point with a distance of 100 metres away from the STW. The

impact of the ventilation shaft on Chevalier Garden would be negligible as it would be located 600 metres away from the Garden. The proposed study would include environmental and traffic impact assessments and recommend the mitigation measures required.

Odour problem

60. Ms Cyd HO commented that the odour problem should not be under-estimated even the ventilation shaft was proposed to be located 600 metres away from the Garden since the Sha Tin STW was the largest secondary STW in Hong Kong. Mr CHAN Hak-kan suggested locating the ventilation shaft as far away as possible from the residential developments to minimize the air and noise impacts on the nearby residents. Mr Albert CHAN opined that factors like prevailing wind direction and proximity to residential developments should be considered in locating the ventilation shaft and exit of the relocated Sha Tin STW. He requested the Administration to consult STDC and residents once a preliminary design on the proposed relocation was available.

61. DDS responded that the Administration would conduct public consultation under the proposed study. It would further discuss the outcome of the proposed study with STDC and residents.

62. Mr Albert CHAN pointed out the odour nuisance of the Siu Ho Wan STW and asked about the Administration's measures to prevent the nuisance of odour upon the proposed relocation. Ms Cyd HO requested the Administration to provide supplementary information comparing the deodorization measures currently adopted in the Siu Ho Wan STW, Stanley STW and Sha Tin STW. She also requested for information on the measures to be adopted upon the proposed relocation of the Sha Tin STW.

Admin

63. DDS advised that covers were provided at the Siu Ho Wan STW for the facilities with highest odour emission. While the deodorization measures currently adopted in the Sha Tin STW were able to reduce odour by over 99%, odour could be more effectively controlled upon relocation to caverns.

64. In response to Mr CHAN Hak-kan's enquiry on the impact of the proposal on the Mui Tsz Lam Road, a popular hiking trail adjacent to the Chevalier Garden, DDS advised that the proposed study would recommend necessary mitigation measures should the trail be affected by the proposal.

Land use at the released site

65. Ms Cyd HO requested the Government to set aside a reasonable percentage of the site released after the relocation for the provision of community facilities and housing development affordable to the general public.

66. Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) advised that the scope of the proposal included a planning review with broad technical assessment of the future land use of the released site for establishing justifications for the relocation of the Sha Tin STW to caverns. Proposals on the use of the released site would be subject to the statutory town planning process in which the public would have an opportunity to express their views to the Town Planning Board.

67. Ms Cyd HO suggested introducing a mechanism requiring the Government to consult LegCo and the public in planning the use of the land to ensure that a reasonable ratio of land would be used to provide housing developments affordable to the general public. The Chairman advised that as the suggestion involved policy considerations, it should be pursued at the relevant LegCo Panel.

68. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 705 – Civil Engineering

PWSC(2012-13)8 750CL Study on long-term strategy for cavern development

69. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)8 sought to upgrade 750CL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$40.4 million in MOD prices to engage consultants to undertake a study on the long-term strategy for cavern development in Hong Kong. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 27 March 2012 and Panel members in general supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

70. Mr Albert CHAN expressed support for the proposal. He opined that cavern development should form part of the territory-wide land-use planning strategy and reference should be made to the Hong Kong 2030: Planning Vision and Strategy in the course of the study. He considered interdepartmental coordination important as it helped identify caverns for gainful uses and enhanced the formulation of appropriate policies.

71. Director of Civil Engineering and Development replied that the proposed study sought to formulate a long-term strategy to systematically relocate existing government facilities to rock caverns. The study would provide cavern master plans to reserve strategic areas for cavern development, and relevant bureaux and departments would be involved in the formulation of policy guidelines. The land use of the released sites upon relocation of existing public facilities would be subject to the requisite town planning procedures, during which the public would be consulted.

72. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 707 – New Towns and Urban Area Development
PWSC(2012-13)9 681CL Formation, roads and drains in Area
54, Tuen Mun — phase 2

73. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)9 sought to upgrade part of 681CL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$178.9 million in MOD prices to construct the Tuen Mun Area 54 Sewage Pumping Station and associated sewerage works. An information paper on the proposed works had been circulated to the Panel on Development on 15 February 2012.

74. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 709 – Waterworks
PWSC (2012-13)10 99WC Water supply to Northwestern Tuen
Mun

75. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)10 sought to upgrade part of 99WC to Category A at an estimated cost of \$30.3 million in MOD prices for laying water mains to provide fresh and salt water supplies to the new developments in Area 54, Tuen Mun. An information paper on the proposed works had been circulated to the Panel on Development on 14 March 2012.

76. The item was voted on and endorsed.

77. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:24 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
10 May 2012