

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC76/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 9th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 30 May 2012, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN

Member attending:

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Members absent:

Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yeet, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Public officers attending:

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment
Ms Joyce HO Kwok-shan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan	Deputy Secretary for Development (Works) ¹ (Acting)
Mr John KWONG Ka-sing	Chief Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) ¹
Miss Vivian KO	Commissioner for Heritage Development Bureau
Mr Kenneth TAM Si-wai	Chief Heritage Manager (Antiquities and Monuments) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr HUI Chiu-kin	Chief Property Services Manager (1) Architectural Services Department
Professor LEE Chack-fan	Chairman The Hong Kong Institute for Promotion of Chinese Culture
Dr WONG King-keung	Vice Chairman The Hong Kong Institute for Promotion of Chinese Culture
Mr Plato TSO	Lead Consultant P&T Architects and Engineers Ltd.

Mr Curry TSE	Heritage Conservation Consultant China Point Consultants Ltd.
Miss Janice TSE, JP Ms Angela LEE	Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Health)1 Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Health)2
Mr LEUNG Kam-pui	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects) Architectural Services Department
Dr Joseph LUI	Cluster Chief Executive (Kowloon East Cluster) Hospital Authority
Mr Donald LI	Chief Manager (Capital Planning) Hospital Authority
Mr LAI Tung-kwok Miss Bella MUI Mr LEUNG Koon-kee Miss Uson CHUNG	Under Secretary for Security Principal Assistant Secretary for Security (B) Director of Architectural Services Project Director (2) Architectural Services Department
Mr Shane LO Siu-hang	Assistant Director (Headquarters) Fire Services Department
Mr YAU Wai-keung	Senior Divisional Officer (Planning Group) Fire Services Department
Ms Priscilla TAM DAI Wai-ming	Project Director (1) Architectural Services Department
Ms NG Sau-wai	Senior Superintendent (Human Resource) Correctional Services Department
Mr Kenneth WONG Hung-keung	Chief Civil Engineer Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr Charles CHOW Chi-ping	Project Director (3) Architectural Services Department
Miss Margrit LI Lai-fan	Assistant Director (Leisure Services)1 Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Ferna SHUM Yuen-wah	Chief Architect (2) (Acting) Housing Department
Mr Harry TSANG Chin-kwong	Chief Executive Officer (Planning)1 Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Miss Petty LAI Chun-yee	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Recreation and Sport)
Mr HON Chi-keung, JP Mr Donald CHOY Chi-mun	Director of Civil Engineering and Development Assistant Director (Leisure Services)3 Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr LI Kam-sang	Chief Engineer (Port Works) Civil Engineering and Development Department
Miss Shirley CHUNG Yuk-fong	Chief Executive Officer (Planning)2 Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr Joseph CHAN Chun-shing	Chief Engineer (Boundary Control Point) Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Sophia CHIANG Chui-wan	District Lands Officer/North (District Lands Office, North) Lands Department
Ms Gracie FOO Siu-wai, JP	Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)1
Ms Brenda AU Kit-ying	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)5

Clerk in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)6
-------------	------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Andy LAU	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Ken WOO	Council Secretary (1)6
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)8

Action

The Chairman reported that a total of 41 projects amounting to \$156,861.7 million had been endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee in the 2011-2012 session so far. Of the total amount endorsed, \$153,369.3 million was related to capital works projects.

2. The Chairman declared that he was an independent non-executive director of an engineering company.

Capital Works Reserve Fund Block Allocations

PWSC(2012-13)19 — Proposal to increase the financial ceiling of delegated authority for Category D items in the Capital Works Programme

3. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to raise the existing limit on the delegation of authority for Category D items in Capital Works Programme from \$21 million to \$30 million in order to maintain the real value of the delegation. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 24 April 2012 and Panel members

supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

4. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 708 – Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment
PWSC(2012-13)20 2QW Revitalisation Scheme —
Revitalisation of the Former Lai Chi
Kok Hospital into Jao Tsung-I
Academy/The Hong Kong Cultural
Heritage

5. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to increase the approved project estimate of 2QW by \$35 million from \$223.5 million to \$258.5 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 22 May 2012 and Panel members generally supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

6. Mr IP Kwok-him noted that additional funding was required to further improve the Chinese roofing and structural conditions of the historic buildings and asked whether it was technically feasible at all to improve the condition of the buildings substantially.

7. Commissioner for Heritage explained that the additional funding sought would help ensure that the roofing repair works and structural strengthening works required for compliance with the heritage conservation requirements of the Antiquities and Monuments Office and the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123) could be completed satisfactorily.

8. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2012-13)21 4MJ Expansion of United Christian
Hospital

9. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade part of 4MJ to Category A at an estimated cost of \$352.3 million in MOD prices for the preparatory works for the expansion of United Christian Hospital. The Panel on Health Services had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 12 March 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

10. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 703 – Buildings

PWSC(2012-13)22 173BF Redevelopment of Fire Services Training School

11. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 173BF to Category A at an estimated cost of \$3,562.5 million in MOD prices for the redevelopment of Fire Services Training School at Pak Shing Kok, Tseung Kwan O. The Panel on Security had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 10 February 2011 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting. At the request of the Panel, the Administration had provided supplementary information on 6 March 2012.

12. The item was voted on and endorsed.

PWSC(2012-13)23 62JA Redevelopment of disciplined services quarters in Fu Tei, Tuen Mun

13. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 62JA to Category A at an estimated cost of \$413.4 million in MOD prices for the redevelopment of disciplined services quarters in Fu Tei, Tuen Mun. The Panel on Security had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 3 April 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

14. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 711 – Housing

PWSC(2012-13)24 437RO District open space adjoining Lower Ngau Tau Kok public housing redevelopment

15. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 437RO to Category A at an estimated cost of \$125 million in MOD prices for the construction of a district open space (DOS) adjoining the Lower Ngau Tau Kok public housing redevelopment. The Panel on Housing had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 17 April 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

16. Pointing out that the proposed DOS and the Mass Transit Railway Kowloon Bay Station was connected by a covered footbridge, Prof Patrick LAU suggested that the Administration should provide covers for the pedestrian access facilities connecting the proposed DOS with the nearby residential developments. Mr Fred LI shared Prof LAU's views. He said that the use of the pedestrian access facilities would be significantly enhanced if they were provided with covers as the residential developments around the proposed DOS, like Tak Po Garden, Amoy Gardens and Upper Ngau Tau Kok Estate were mostly resided by the elderly.

17. Chief Architect (2), Housing Department responded that the sitting-out areas with arbours and about 120 trees under the project would provide comfortable shades for visitors and that the provision of a fitness corner and a jogging track in the proposed DOS would also facilitate the use of the open space by the elderly. Mr Fred LI welcomed the planting of a large number of trees under the project, which in his view would help relieve the dense living environment in Ngau Tau Kok and air quality.

18. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 705 – Civil Engineering

PWSC(2012-13)25 258RS Development of a bathing beach at Lung Mei, Tai Po

19. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 258RS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$208.2 million in MOD prices for the development of a bathing beach at Lung Mei, Tai Po. The Panel on Home Affairs had been consulted on the proposal at its meeting on 20 April 2012 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Environmental concerns

20. Mr IP Kwok-him, Chairman of Panel on Home Affairs, supplemented that Panel members had urged the Administration to take measures to reduce the ecological impact of the proposed project, relocate the three fish species of conservation importance from the proposed worksite, and impose necessary conditions to ensure that the contractors engaged for the project would strictly follow the contractual requirements in order to minimize impact on the environment.

21. Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Recreation and Sport) responded that the Administration would minimize the impact of the project through phasing out the works programme and relocating the three fish species of conservation importance from the worksite under the supervision of a qualified fish specialist.

22. Mr KAM Nai-wai noted that green groups such as the World Wide Fund for Nature Hong Kong and The Conservancy Association were opposed to the proposal. Pointing out that the Administration had conducted additional ecological surveys in the process of consulting the Advisory Council on the Environment on the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report, he asked about the details of the findings of the surveys and whether the Administration had explained to the above green groups these findings and the mitigation measures to be put in place to allay their concerns on the project.

23. Director of Civil Engineering and Development (DCED) responded that the Administration had conducted a number of ecological surveys in 2008, including active searches and quantitative surveys into the type and number of organisms living in areas around Tolo Harbour, which covered Ting Kok East, Shuen Wan, Wu Chau, Yung Shue O North and Lai Chi Chong. The findings revealed that the three fish species of conservation importance in Lung Mei were also found in the other five sites. Furthermore, the total number of species in Lung Mei was not high among the places studied and no benthic organisms were found spawning around Lung Mei. The EIA report thus concluded that Lung Mei was not a place of high ecological value in comparison with the places studied.

24. DCED further advised that the Administration had engaged consultants to carry out further marine ecological surveys and design ecological mitigation work in 2012. The consultants had also designed additional mitigation measures to minimize the impact on the three fish species of conservation importance during construction, including undertaking the rock removal works in the intertidal zone during low tide and confining the area to within ten square metres for each removal, relocating the three fish species captured to Ting Kok East as a suitable reception site within a short period, fencing off the cleared areas immediately after removal of the rocks, engaging a fish specialist to inspect the areas beforehand to avoid trapping any species of concerns inside the enclosed area, and conducting a trial prior to the rock removal. The consultants would also provide training to site supervisory staff on the marine ecological mitigation work. After fine-tuning, the specification of the marine ecological mitigation work would be set out in the relevant works contracts.

25. Mr KAM Nai-wai requested the Administration to set up a working group with the green groups concerned to monitor the implementation of the project. He also expressed concern about the water quality of the future beach for swimming purpose and the long-term measures for protecting the ecology of Lung Mei from activities on the beach.

26. DCED responded that as a long-term measure to improve the water quality of Tolo Harbour and its catchment, the Administration was providing a new sewerage network in Lung Mei and nearby areas. The percentage of connection to the sewerage network was at present 38% and the proposed beach would be suitable for swimming when the connection percentage reached 60%. The Administration would closely monitor the water quality of the proposed beach during the first two years of its commissioning. DCED further advised that the Administration had been in touch with various green groups and would maintain dialogue with them throughout the implementation of the project.

27. In response to Mr KAM Nai-wai's further enquiry on measures on preventing sand loss as in the case of the artificial Golden Beach at Hong Kong Gold Coast, DCED replied that the Administration had conducted wave and sediment modelling for the proposed beach and would construct a groyne at each end of the beach to serve as a wave barrier to protect the beach from sand loss.

28. As a member of the Tai Po District Council, Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming said that he had been striving for the provision of the proposed beach. He commended the Administration for its efforts in addressing the environmental concerns of various stakeholders on the proposal and hoped that the funding proposal would be approved by the Finance Committee (FC) since the project had been under discussion for years.

Traffic impact

29. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming expressed concern about the additional traffic impact of the proposed works on Ting Kok Road which was quite heavily used by a large number of visitors to Tai Mei Tuk for leisure activities.

30. DCED explained that the impact of the proposed works on road traffic would be low as the proposed works area south of Ting Kok Road would provide adequate space for widening of Ting Kok Road and construction of the proposed car park. Appropriate temporary traffic

arrangements would be implemented during the construction stage. An assessment conducted by the Administration revealed that the capacity of Ting Kok Road would be adequate to meet the increased traffic brought about by the proposed beach.

Project design

31. In response to Prof Patrick LAU's suggestion on improving the shoreline and hence the aesthetics of the proposed beach, DCED advised that the design of the beach was subject to the site conditions and the need to provide a groyne at each end. The Administration took note of Prof LAU's suggestion and would optimize the design as far as practicable.

32. Miss Tanya CHAN suggested the planting of trees on the beach to provide shades for swimmers. DCED advised that Lung Mei was a stony beach, however the Administration would review the feasibility of providing more trees there.

33. The item was voted on and endorsed.

34. Mr KAM Nai-wai requested that this item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

PWSC(2012-13)26	13GB	Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point and associated works
PWSC(2012-13)27	36CA	Special ex-gratia payments in relation to the Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point Project

35. The Chairman advised that PWSC(2012-13)26 sought to upgrade part of 13GB to Category A at an estimated cost of \$16,253.2 million in MOD prices for carrying out site formation and infrastructure works for the development of a new Boundary Control Point (BCP) at Heung Yuen Wai in the northeastern New Territories (NENT), while PWSC(2012-13)27 sought to provide special ex-gratia allowance exclusively for eligible households affected by the BCP project at an estimated cost of \$211 million. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposals at its meeting on 24 April 2012 and Panel members supported the proposals. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

36. The Chairman said that as the proposals in PWSC(2012-13)26 and PWSC(2012-13)27 were related to the Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai

BCP project, discussion of the two items would be combined but the items would be voted on separately at the meeting.

Entrustment of the construction of cross boundary bridges

37. Noting the Administration's proposal to entrust the design and construction of the Hong Kong portion of the cross boundary bridges to the Shenzhen Municipal Government (SZMG) to ensure compatibility of design with the Shenzhen portion, Ms Cyd HO was concerned whether the design and construction would meet the established standards of Hong Kong and whether local construction workers would be employed for the project.

38. Chief Engineer (Boundary Control Point), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CE(BCP), CEDD) advised that the Administration had requested SZMG to engage consulting engineers registered in Hong Kong to take part in the design, construction and works supervision. The entrusted works would be subject to overall control and monitoring by a Joint Working Group formed by the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) and SZMG. SZMG would also be requested to deliver the construction contract through an open tender, thus giving a fair chance for contractors and construction workers registered locally to take part in the project.

39. Ms Cyd HO was keen to ensure that any Shenzhen workers deployed for the entrusted works would be bound by the laws of Hong Kong. CE(BCP), CEDD responded that the Administration would discuss with SZMG on the arrangement for deploying Shenzhen workers to work within the Hong Kong boundary. Ms Cyd HO considered the Administration's response inadequate. She requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on whether Shenzhen workers deployed for the entrusted works would be bound by the laws of Hong Kong or Shenzhen, and the details, if any, of the cross-boundary law enforcement by SZMG in the project site. The Administration agreed to provide the information.

Admin

40. In response to Ms Cyd HO's question on the on-cost payable to SZMG for project management and construction supervision of the entrusted works, CE(BCP), CEDD replied that compared with the on-cost rate at 5.6% for similar works entrustment under the Lok Ma Chau/Huanggang Boundary Bridge project, the on-cost for the proposed entrustment was estimated to be 4%, which had been arrived at after detailed discussion between the HKSAR Government and SZMG having regard to the corresponding construction works within the Hong Kong

Admin and Shenzhen boundary. Ms Cyd HO requested the Administration to provide more information detailing the basis and factors to be considered in calculating the proposed on-cost. The Administration agreed to provide the information.

Land resumption and site clearance

41. Ms Cyd HO noted that Chuk Yuen Village, an indigenous village at Ta Kwu Ling, would need to be cleared under the proposed project. She also noted that under the prevailing policy, non-indigenous villagers who did not own any building land were not entitled to the New Territories Village Removal Policy and were only eligible for rehousing to public rental housing upon meeting the comprehensive means test, or interim housing, or an ex-gratia allowance for Permitted Occupiers in lieu of interim housing. Pointing out that there were in fact many non-indigenous villagers who had been living in rented houses in Chuk Yuen Village for more than 20 years, she requested the Administration to give compassionate consideration to their strong wish to continue living together after the village relocation.

42. Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) (PS(PL)) advised that in view of the unique circumstances of Chuk Yuen Village, the special arrangement of "Cottage House Option" would be offered to eligible non-indigenous villagers residing within the village environs of Chuk Yuen Village as well as Chuk Yuen South. They might purchase suitable agricultural land in the Extended Village Area adjoining the Village Resite Area and apply to the Lands Department (Lands D) for building a two-storey domestic structure of 19 feet high with a maximum roofed-over area of 500 square feet on their purchased private agricultural land by way of an in-situ land exchange. The affected non-indigenous villagers residing within the village environs of Chuk Yuen Village had identified a piece of land that they found suitable for building their cottage houses and agreed to vacate their squatter structures to facilitate clearance once the planning aspects of their plan had been confirmed. The villagers of Chuk Yuen Village generally welcomed the special arrangements and the Chuk Yuen Residents Village Removal Committee had also written to the Legislative Council to express its strong support for the proposals. The letter was annexed to the relevant PWSC paper.

43. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming expressed support for the proposals. He noted that Chuk Yuen Village would need to be cleared in 2013 to enable the committed commissioning of the proposed BCP in 2018. While he was pleased to note that most indigenous owners and non-indigenous villagers had both identified resite areas suitable for them, he was

concerned that the non-indigenous villagers' new houses might not be ready if the Administration stuck to its plan to clear the village in 2013. He called on the Administration to draw reference from the experience of village clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen in which temporary structures were built to accommodate affected residents during site clearance.

44. PS(PL) said that the Heung Yee Kuk, particularly Chairman LAU Wong-fat and Vice-Chairman CHEUNG Hok-ming, had provided great assistance in the discussions with Chuk Yuen Villagers. The preparation of the relevant planning application was in full swing for submission to the Town Planning Board for approval. At the Secretary for Development's last meeting with the villagers, they agreed to vacate their squatter structures once the planning aspects of their plan had been confirmed even if their cottage houses would only be completed later on.

45. Noting the proposed provision of a Connecting Road between the proposed BCP and Fanling Highway, Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming relayed the concern of some villagers about the clearance of their ancestral graves/urns within the works area of the proposed road scheme. He asked about the number of graves/urns affected by the proposed road scheme and the measures to handle the cases.

46. District Lands Officer/North, Lands Department advised that the construction of the proposed BCP and associated works entailed the removal of 136 graves/urns despite effort had been made to minimize the number affected. Lands D had been trying to get in touch with the descendants concerned and negotiated with them since February 2010. The descendants of 15 graves/urns had indicated that they would remove the graves/urns voluntarily and 39 graves/urns were unclaimed. The descendants of the remaining 82 graves/urns were unwilling to remove the graves/urns voluntarily. For removal of the human remains from the graves/urns affected, the Administration would offer ex-gratia allowance to the eligible claimants according to the prevailing policy to facilitate the removal and if unavoidable, the Administration would seek appropriate authority in accordance with the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap. 132) for the removal.

Provision of the Connecting Road

47. Prof Patrick LAU, Chairman of Panel on Development, supplemented that the Panel had requested the Administration to make use of the opportunity presented by the provision of the proposed Connecting Road and suitably plan for the areas along the road.

48. DCED advised that the proposed Connecting Road would connect the proposed BCP with Fanling Highway and provide four interchanges at the junctions with Fanling Highway, Sha Tau Kok Road, Ping Yuen Road and Lin Ma Hang Road. Together with the modification works at the relevant roads and junctions, the proposed Connecting Road would enhance the existing road network in NENT to facilitate development of new development areas and meet the future demand of the cross boundary traffic. In response to the public concerns that the dual two-lane Connecting Road might not be sufficient to cater for the future development of NENT, the Administration said that the forecasted vehicle/capacity ratio of the road would only be 0.78 which was sufficient to cater for future developments in the district.

Design of the Boundary Control Point passenger terminal building

49. Prof Patrick LAU asked whether opportunity would be given for the winners of the International Design Ideas Competition for Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point Passenger Terminal Building jointly organized by the HKSAR Government and SZMG to take part in the design of the building. He opined that it would be an encouragement to local designers if the winners of the above competition could take part in project design of the building.

50. DCED advised that the design of the proposed BCP building was in a very preliminary stage. The Architectural Services Department would work out the relevant arrangements on the design of the building in due course.

51. The Chairman put the items to vote one by one.

Voting on PWSC(2012-13)26

52. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Voting on PWSC(2012-13)27

53. The item was voted on and endorsed.

54. Ms Cyd HO requested that the items on PWSC(2012-13)26 and PWSC(2012-13)27 be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

55. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 9:37 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
21 June 2012