

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1316/11-12  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/SS/8/11/1

**Subcommittee on the Six Orders Made under Section 5(1) of the  
Public Bus Services Ordinance and Gazetted on 20 January 2012**

**Minutes of the second meeting  
held on Thursday, 23 February 2012, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS (Chairman)  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tanya CHAN

**Member absent** : Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

**Public officers  
attending** : **For item I**

Transport Department

Mr Don HO  
Assistant Commissioner/New Territories

Ms Irene HO  
Principal Transport Officer/New Territories

Mr Tommy NG  
Chief Transport Officer/Bus & Railway 1

Transport and Housing Bureau

Miss Constance CHOY  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport) 1 (Acting)

Department of Justice

Mr Manuel NG  
Government Counsel

**Attendance by invitation : For item I**

New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited

Mr Peter MOK  
Director

New World First Bus Services Limited/  
Citybus Limited

Mr William CHUNG  
Head of Operations

Mr Newton NG  
Senior Operations Support Manager

The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited/  
Long Win Bus Company Limited

Mr Evan AUYANG  
Deputy Managing Director

Mr Kenrick FOK  
Operations Director

**Clerk in attendance:** Miss Becky YU  
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance :** Miss Carrie WONG  
Assistant Legal Adviser 4

Mrs Mary TANG  
Senior Council Secretary (1)1

Miss Jacqueline CHUNG  
Council Secretary (1)1

---

## **I. Meeting with franchised bus companies and the Administration**

### Meeting with franchised bus companies

At the invitation of the Chairman, representatives of the following franchised bus companies explained the reasons for bus trips not meeting the schedules of services, and the measures taken/to be taken to ensure that bus trips would be on schedule -

- (a) New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited  
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(01))
- (b) New World First Bus Services Limited/Citybus Limited  
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(02))
- (c) The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited/Long Win Bus Company Limited  
(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(03))

### Meeting with the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(04) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 14 February 2012

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(05) — Administration's response to CB(1) 1126/11-12(04))

### Background information on the Orders

Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) Order 2012 (L.N. 4), Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) (North Lantau and Chek Lap Kok Airport) Order 2012 (L.N. 5), Schedule of Routes (Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited) Order 2012 (L.N. 6), Schedule of Routes (Long Win Bus Company Limited) Order 2012 (L.N. 7), Schedule of Routes (New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited) Order 2012 (L.N. 8), and Schedule of Routes (New World First Bus Services Limited) Order 2012 (L.N. 9)

Ref: THB(T)L 2/4/115

— The Legislative Council Brief

LC Paper No. LS25/11-12

— Legal Service Division Report

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached in **Annex**).
3. The Administration was requested to -
  - (a) advise the number of buses and bus captains of each of the franchised bus company and how these compared with their overseas counterparts;
  - (b) include in the Annex to the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(05)) breakdown of bus trips which deviated from the Schedule of Service of each of the franchised bus companies;
  - (c) advise the feasibility of adding a benchmark for deviation from the Schedule of Service in the six Orders. To also advise the measures to be taken by the Administration to ensure compliance with the benchmark by franchised bus companies and the actions (including penalty) to be taken against non-compliance; and
  - (d) consider using public fund to set up an on-line electronic system to gather data of bus departures and arrivals at bus stops.
4. The Subcommittee examined the six Orders and had no particular comments on the six Orders.
5. Mr LEE Wing-tat indicated that he would, on behalf of members of the Democratic Party, move amendments to the six Orders to add a benchmark for deviation from the Schedule of Service. To facilitate a better understanding on the propriety of the proposed amendments, members requested both the Administration and the legal adviser to the Subcommittee to provide legal advice in this respect.
6. The Subcommittee agreed to continue discussion at the next meeting scheduled for Thursday, 8 March 2012, at 10:45 am.

**II. Any other business**

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:20 pm.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
15 March 2012

**Subcommittee on the Six Orders Made under Section 5(1) of the  
Public Bus Services Ordinance and Gazetted on 20 January 2012**

**Minutes of the second meeting  
on Thursday, 23 February 2012, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Meeting with franchised bus companies and the Administration</i>			
000312 - 000411	Chairman	The Chairman invited franchised bus companies to explain the reasons for bus trips not meeting the schedules of service, and the measures taken/to be taken to ensure that bus trips would be on schedule.	
000412 - 000540	Mr Peter MOK, New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited (NLB)	Presentation of views as set out in the submission from NLB (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(01)).	
000541 - 000905	Mr William CHUNG, New World First Bus Services Limited/ Citybus Limited (NWFBS/Citybus)	Presentation of views as set out in the submission from NWFBS/Citybus (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(02)).	
000906 - 001505	Mr Evan AUYANG, The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited/ Long Win Bus Company Limited (KMB/LWB)	Presentation of views as set out in the submission from KMB/LWB (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12(03)).	
001506 - 002359	Chairman Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	Mr KAM Nai-wai's concerns/enquiries -  (a) while the average percentage of 5.6% bus trips which deviated from Schedule of Service in 2011 was already high, the percentage of deviation of 11.1% for the Kowloon City District was particularly alarming;  (b) when was the Administration made aware of the high percentage of deviation, and	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) whether commuters were notified of the deviations.</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) the average deviation of 5.6% from the scheduled trips in 2011 was on the high side as compared with that of previous years, which was about 3% to 4%;</p> <p>(b) in general, the deviation was higher in Kowloon than in Hong Kong Island and New Territories;</p> <p>(c) the Transport Department (TD) monitored the operation of bus services through scrutiny of the operating returns provided by franchised bus companies. TD have noticed the increasing percentage of bus trips which deviated from Schedule of Service since early 2011;</p> <p>(d) according to franchised bus companies, the shortage of bus captains was the main reason for deviation from the Schedule of Service in 2011. TD would closely monitor the situation; and</p> <p>(e) commuters would be notified of special traffic incidents that might affect public transport services through the media.</p>	
002400 - 003313	<p>Mr CHAN Hak-kan Chairman Mr Peter MOK, NLB Mr William CHUNG, NWFBS/ Citybus Mr Evan AUYANG, KMB/LWB</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Hak-kan's enquiry on the feasibility of installing online electronic system, similar to the Global Positioning System (GPS) used by the logistics trades, to gather data of bus trips at bus termini to monitor bus services.</p> <p>Mr Peter MOK, NLB's response -</p> <p>(a) at present, all operating returns</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>on bus routes were based on data manually input by staff of franchised bus companies stationed at the bus terminus;</p> <p>(b) given the small-scale operation of NLB, it might not be cost-effective to install an electronic on-line system to monitor bus trips;</p> <p>(c) GPS was not available in certain parts of outlying islands and roaming charges might be incurred; and</p> <p>(d) passengers would be notified of unforeseen circumstances affecting bus trips through the media.</p> <p>Mr William CHUNG, NWFBS/Citybus's response -</p> <p>(a) trial on provision of online bus service information was conducted in one of the airport bus routes to ascertain its feasibility and cost-effectiveness;</p> <p>(b) the online information system was more useful to infrequent passengers taking low frequency bus services such as airport buses services, but might not be useful nor cost-effective for high frequency bus services and for commuters who were well aware of the schedules of bus trips. Besides, there would be cost implications in applying the electronic on-line system to all bus routes;</p> <p>(c) the Wi-Fi system available in some buses did not have GPS tracking function.</p> <p>Mr Evan AUYANG, KMB/LWB's response -</p>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) high-rise buildings in Hong Kong might render GPS unreliable in providing accurate information on bus services; and</p> <p>(b) studies were necessary to identify a system that could provide more accurate information on bus positions and services.</p>	
003314 - 004836	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN Administration Chairman Mr Peter MOK, NLB Mr William CHUNG, NWFBS/ Citybus Mr Evan AUYANG, KMB/LWB</p>	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN's view/enquiry -</p> <p>(a) information panels should be installed at bus termini to provide more information on bus services, as in the case of London; and</p> <p>(b) whether there was an "ideal bus fleet" with an optimal ratio of buses, bus captains and spare bus captains.</p> <p>Administration's explanation that franchised bus companies were obliged to operate bus services in accordance with the approved schedules. It would be for the franchised bus companies to determine the manpower resources needed to provide the required service level.</p> <p>Mr Peter MOK, NLB's response -</p> <p>(a) as some bus routes operated by NLB were servicing tourist spots, additional bus captains would need to be deployed during festive seasons; and</p> <p>(b) redeployment of manpower resources as well as changes in bus schedules might be required to cope with additional workload and other unforeseen circumstances.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr William CHUNG, NWFBS/ Citybus response -</p> <p>(a) there was no optimal ratio. The number of bus captains required to provide the scheduled bus trips would be worked out taking into account the number of buses deployed and the approved time-table of the bus services. The number of spare bus captains required depended on the absenteeism and leave entitlement of bus captains which were different for different company; and</p> <p>(b) the information system adopted at bus termini in London was fully funded by the Government.</p> <p>Mr Evan AUYANG, KMB/LWB's response -</p> <p>(a) the staffing situation was regularly reviewed to ensure deployment of sufficient manpower resources to meet the demand and standard of bus services; and</p> <p>(b) effort was being made to enhance bus captain hiring and training capability.</p>	
004837 - 010144	Mr WONG Sing-chi Chairman Administration	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi's concern/ enquiry -</p> <p>(a) the high percentage of bus trips which deviated from the Schedule of Service in 2011 was indeed a cause of public concern; and</p> <p>(b) whether any penalty would be imposed on franchised bus companies for deviation from the Schedule of Service.</p>	The Administration to advise the measures to be taken to ensure compliance with performance standards by franchised bus companies and the actions (including penalty) to be taken against non-compliance.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Chairman's enquiries on the effect of the Orders to improve bus services, and the penalties to be imposed for deviation from the Schedule of Service.</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) the Six Orders were meant to formalize the route changes introduced by franchised bus companies and hence might have no direct relationship with the service frequency;</p> <p>(b) the percentage of deviations from the scheduled trips of KMB was higher than the other franchised bus companies, and the reason was mainly due to manpower shortage;</p> <p>(c) joint effort was made by franchised bus companies to identify the causes for deviation and measures to ensure compliance with the Schedule of Service; and</p> <p>(d) TD would closely monitor bus services to ensure compliance with the Schedule of Service. Penalties would be imposed on franchised bus companies in the event of non-compliance.</p>	
010145 - 010505	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Administration	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's view that the Administration should endeavour to identify the causes for the high percentages of deviations from the Schedule of Service in 2011 (particularly for the Kowloon City District), and take measures to improve the situation.</p> <p>Administration's explanation –</p> <p>(a) the main reasons for missing bus trips were traffic congestion, breakdown of vehicles and shortage of bus</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>captains; and</p> <p>(b) would look into these problems with a view to improving the situation.</p>	
010506 - 011245	Mr LEE Wing-tat Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's requests -</p> <p>(a) the number of buses and bus captains of each of the franchised bus company and how these compared with their overseas counterparts;</p> <p>(b) breakdowns of bus trips which deviated from the Schedule of Service by each of the franchised bus company (with analysis on whether lower fare non-cross-harbour bus routes tended to have higher percentages of deviations than higher fare cross-harbour bus routes);</p> <p>(c) a benchmark on the acceptable average percentage of deviation from the Schedule of Service for the franchised bus companies; and</p> <p>(d) more online information on bus services.</p> <p>Chairman's enquiry/request -</p> <p>(a) the lead time for franchised bus companies to improve bus services in order to meet the approved timetable set out in the Schedule of Service;</p> <p>(b) need to refer the subject to the Panel on Transport for necessary follow up.</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) advise the number of buses and bus captains of each of the franchised bus company and how these compared with their overseas counterparts; and</p> <p>(b) include in the Annex to its paper (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1126/11-12 (05) breakdown of bus trips which deviated from the Schedule of Service by each of the franchised bus company.</p>
011246 - 011857	Mr LEE Wing-tat Chairman Administration Mr Peter MOK, NLB Mr William CHUNG,	Mr LEE Wing-tat's enquiry on the feasibility of developing an on-line electronic system to collect real time data of bus departures and arrivals at bus stops by requiring	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	<p>NWFBS/ Citybus Mr Evan AUYANG and Mr Kenrick FOK,KMB/LWB</p>	<p>bus captains to swipe smart cards when commencing bus journeys.</p> <p>Mr Peter MOK, NLB response -</p> <p>(a) the operating returns were based on data input manually by bus regulators;</p> <p>(b) the per vehicle cost of developing an electronic on-line system would be too high for NLB, given its small scale of operation; and</p> <p>(c) commuters might need to pay roaming charges for using GPS.</p> <p>Mr William CHUNG, NWFBS/Citybus' response that it would be more cost-effective to have the bus regulators to manually input data for operating returns.</p> <p>Mr Evan AUYANG and Mr Kenrick FOK,KMB/LWB's response -</p> <p>(a) KMB had developed an electronic "Terminus Management System" (TER) to assist regulators in regulating bus arrival and departure times more effectively in some but not all of their busy termini; and</p> <p>(b) TER provided for a paperless operational mode and reduced the workload of regulators in submitting operating returns.</p>	
011858 - 012203	Mr KAM Nai-wai	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's remarks -</p> <p>(a) there would not be any roaming charges if commuters used the 1-Card-2-Number Prepaid SIM card; and</p> <p>(b) consideration should be given to setting out in the franchise agreements a requirement for</p>	<p>The Administration to consider using public fund to set up an on-line electronic system to gather data of bus departures and arrivals at bus stops.</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		franchised bus companies to develop an electronic on-line system to gather data of bus services, or the Administration should fully subsidize the setting up of these systems	
012113 - 012203	Chairman	<p>Chairman's views -</p> <p>(a) whether the Administration should subsidize measures to improve bus services was a policy issue which should be taken up by the Panel on Transport;</p> <p>(b) need to set a timeframe within which franchised bus companies should meet the target of reducing lost trips; and</p> <p>(c) penalties should be imposed on franchised bus companies in the event of non-compliance.</p>	
012204 - 012733	Chairman Assistant Legal Adviser 4 (ALA4) Mr KAM Nai-wai	Examination of the Six Orders. Members had no particular comments on the Six Orders.	
012734 - 012946	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat ALA4 Administration	Discussion on the legislative timetable.	
012947 - 013304	Mr LEE Wing-tat Chairman Administration ALA4	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's enquiry on the feasibility of adding a benchmark for deviation from Schedule of Service in the six Orders.</p> <p>ALA4's response that members might move amendments to the Orders as long as they complied with section 34 of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1).</p>	
013305 -013348	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration ALA4	Mr LEE Wing-tat's remarks that he would, on behalf of members of the Democratic Party, move amendments to the six Orders to	The Administration to advise the feasibility of adding a benchmark for deviation from

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>add a benchmark for deviation from Schedule of Service.</p> <p>Administration's preliminary view that the six Orders were subsidiary legislation made under section 5(1) of the Public Bus Services Ordinance (Cap. 230) to specify bus routes on which the five franchised bus companies may operate public bus services. It might not be appropriate to introduce amendments which were not consistent with the power to make the Orders under that section 5(1).</p> <p>ALA4's reiteration that members might move amendments to the Orders as long as they complied with section 34 of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1)</p>	<p>Schedule of Service in the six Orders.</p>
013349 - 013437	Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr IP Kwok-him's request for legal advice on the propriety of the proposed amendments.	ALA4 to advise on the propriety of the proposed amendments.
013438 - 013629	Chairman Administration Mr LEE Wing-tat	Chairman's request that both the Administration and the legal adviser to the Subcommittee should provide legal advice to the Subcommittee on or before the next meeting on 8 March 2012.	