APPENDIX 14





香港金鐘道六十六號金鐘道政府合署四十三及四十五樓 43/F & 45/F, Queensway Government Offices, 66 Queensway, Hong Kong

電話 Tel:

傳真 Fax:

2867 5505

2530 1368

本署檔號 Our Ref. No.: FEHD/CFS CON 1/40/6

7 December 2011

(urgent by fax : 2840 0716)

Ms Miranda HON Clerk Public Accounts Committee Legislative Council Complex, 1 Legislative Council Road, Central, Hong Kong.

Dear Ms Hon,

The Director of Audit's Report on the results of value for money audits (Report No. 57)

"Food labelling" and "Nutrition labelling of infant and special dietary foods" (Chapter 3 and 4)

I refer to your letter of 6 December 2011 and would like to provide the requisite information as requested by the Public Accounts Committee in relation to Chapter 3 of the Director of Audit's Report (Audit Report) as follows:-

(a) copy of the assignment report produced by the Independent Commission Against Corruption on "Enforcement of Food Labelling Requirements" (in English only) at **Annex I.** You may note that we have accepted all but two of the recommendations made in the assignment report. For the two recommendations (i.e. to take into account the residence of the Health Inspectors when assigning districts to them for routine inspection and to move the Chief Health Inspector's office to the Food Labelling Unit (FLU) office to enable the exercise of direct supervision over the FLU), the ICAC has agreed with us not to take on the recommendations having noted our explanations on the inherent

operational difficulties;

- (b) information on the dates and attendees for the meetings to discuss the tolerance limits in the CFS Technical Guidance Notes are given in **Annex II**; and
- (c) an account for the drop in the number of prosecutions and convictions in 2011 is given in **Annex III**.

Yours sincerely,

(Leonard LAW)

for Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

c.c. Secretary for Food and Health (fax no. 2526 3753)
Director of Health (fax no. 2893 9613)
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (fax no. 2147 5239)
Director of Audit (fax no. 2583 9063)

*Note by Clerk, PAC: Annex I not attached.

Annex II

Dates and attendees of the technical meetings in which the issue of tolerance limits has been discussed

| Round 1st round | Date 6 August 2004 15 September 2004 11 January 2005 | Attendees Importers/Suppliers Food Retailers Laboratory Service Providers |
|--------------------|--|--|
| 2nd round | 6 April 2005 7 April 2005 11 April 2005 13 April 2005 | Manufacturers Importers/Suppliers Food Retailers Laboratory Service Providers |
| 3rd round | 8 June 2005 9 June 2005 21 June 2005 22 June 2005 | Laboratory Service Providers Manufacturers Importers/Suppliers Food Retailers |
| 5th round | 28 September 2007 8 October 2007 10 October 2007 11 October 2007 9 November 2007 | Manufacturers Laboratory Service Providers Importers/Suppliers Food Retailers Traders for ethnic minority food |
| 7th round | 9 January 2008 10 January 2008 11 January 2008 | Importers/Suppliers Food Retailer Manufacturers |
| 8th round | 19 March 2008 20 March 2008 | Food traders Laboratory Service Providers |
| 9th round | 22 April 2008 7 May 2008 | Food traders Food traders |
| 10th round | 18 June 2008 20 June 2008 | Food traders Laboratory Service Providers |

Dates and attendees of the workshops/ seminars in which the issue of tolerance limits has been explained to traders

1. Workshops on Nutrition Labelling Scheme (Basic)

| Date | Attendees |
|------------|--|
| 25.7.2008 | Traders in small and medium enterprises trading organic or |
| | health foods |
| 1.8.2008 | Food traders |
| 12.8.2008 | Laboratory service providers |
| 2.9.2008 | Traders in small and medium enterprises trading foods |
| 23.9.2008 | Food manufacturers, food importers/ suppliers |
| 24.9.2008 | Food retailers |
| 16.10.2008 | Traders of bakery foods |
| 30.12.2008 | Food traders |
| 19.3.2009 | Food traders (including health food) |
| 22.6.2009 | Food traders |
| 5.8.2009 | Traders of Japanese foods |
| 28.10.2009 | Food traders |
| 9.12.2009 | Food traders |
| 31.3.2010 | Food traders |
| 26.4.2010 | Food traders |
| 2.6.2010 | Food traders |
| 21.7.2010 | Food traders |
| 22.9.2010 | Food traders |
| 20.1.2011 | Food traders |
| 27.6.2011 | Food traders |
| | |

2. Workshop on Nutrition Labelling Scheme (Advanced)

| Date | Attendees |
|------------|---|
| 23.1.2009 | Food traders |
| 28.4.2009 | Food traders |
| 29.7.2009 | Food traders |
| 8.10.2009 | Food traders, especially those for Japanese foods |
| 29.12.2009 | Food traders |
| 21.4.2010 | Food traders |

3. Experience sharing session on Nutrition Label Calculator

| Date | Attendees |
|-----------|---|
| 12.6.2009 | Food traders, especially small-medium entrepreneurs |

<u>Note</u>

The documents of the technical meetings and the draft Technical Guidance Notes were available on Food and Health Bureau and CFS websites for reference and comment by members of the public

Annex III

The reasons for the drop in the number of prosecutions and convictions for food labelling non-compliant cases in the first 6 months of 2011 as compared with the corresponding figures in 2010 are as follows:-

- The chained supermarkets/stores have over the years come to know better the general labelling requirements, particularly after the implementation of the nutrition labelling scheme in July 2010. Accordingly, the compliance rate on general labelling has improved, resulting in the smaller number of prosecutions being made in 2011; and
- Routine inspections and blitz operations to check the compliance of the trade with the food labelling and nutrition labelling requirements were temporarily suspended from April to June 2011 in order to release staff to help deal with the outbreak of food incidents arising from the Japanese nuclear accident and plasticizer incident in Taiwan.

Inspections were resumed to normal in July 2011. CFS will endeavour to check a comparable number of samples as in 2010.