

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2172/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/SE

Panel on Security

Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 7 February 2012, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon James TO Kun-sun (Chairman)
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Dr Hon Margaret NG
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon WONG Yuk-man
- Member attending** : Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
- Members absent** : Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

**Public Officers : Item IV
attending**

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Under Secretary for Security

Miss Bella MUI Bun-ngai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Security B

Mr LAI Man-hin, FSDSM
Deputy Director of Fire Services

Mr NG Wai-keung
Assistant Director (Headquarters) (Acting)
Fire Services Department

Mr MAK Kwok-sum
Senior Divisional Officer (ITMU)
Fire Services Department

Mr YUK Wai-fung
Assistant Director, Efficiency Unit (2)

Item V

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Under Secretary for Security

Mrs Erika HUI LAM Yin-ming, JP
Commissioner for Narcotics
Security Bureau

Mr Eric LEE Ka-chun
Principal Assistant Secretary (Narcotics) 2
Security Bureau

Mr Tony TANG Fat-yuen
Principal Assistant Secretary (Support Services)
Education Bureau

Policy 21 Limited

Mr YIP Hak-kwong
Director

Item VI

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Under Secretary for Security

Mrs Millie NG KIANG Mei-nei
Principal Assistant Secretary for Security

Mr Paul HUNG Hak-wai
Director of Operations
Hong Kong Police Force

Ms Winnie CHIU Wai-yin
Assistant Commissioner of Police (Support)
Hong Kong Police Force

Attendance : Item VI
by invitation

Hong Kong Journalists Association

Ms MAK Yin-ting
Chairperson

Clerk in : Mrs Sharon TONG
attendance Principal Council Secretary (2)

Staff in : Ms Connie FUNG
attendance Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Ms Rita LAI
Senior Council Secretary (2) 1

Mr Ian CHOW
Council Secretary (2) 1

Miss Lulu YEUNG
Clerical Assistant (2) 1

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting
(LC Paper No. CB(2)844/11-12)

The minutes of the special meeting held on 5 December 2011 were confirmed.

II. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting

2. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since the last meeting.

III. Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)921/11-12(01) and (02))

Regular meeting in March 2012

3. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for 13 March 2012 at 4:30 pm -

- (a) Security of Automated Passenger Clearance System (e-Channel);
- (b) Amendments to the Schedules to the Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Cap. 134); and
- (c) Latest development of rehabilitative services provided for persons in custody and Review on the "Risks and Needs Assessment and Management Protocol for Offenders".

4. Members noted that the item referred to in paragraph 3(a) above was proposed by the Deputy Chairman.

Special meeting

5. Ms Audrey EU suggested that the problem of pregnant Mainland women giving birth in Hong Kong with focus on immigration control be discussed by the Panel. Members agreed that the item "Measures to tackle the problem of pregnant Mainland women giving birth in Hong Kong" be discussed at a special meeting to be held prior to the Panel meeting on 13 March 2012.

IV. Development of asset management and maintenance system in the Fire Services Department

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)921/11-12(03) and (04))

6. Under Secretary for Security ("US for S"), Assistant Director, Efficiency Unit (2) ("AD of EU") and Deputy Director of Fire Services ("DD of FS") briefed members on the proposal to develop the Asset Management and Maintenance System ("AMMS") in the Fire Services

Action

Department ("FSD"), details of which were set out in the Administration's paper.

7. The Chairman asked about the cost in terms of manpower that would be saved by the implementation of the proposed AMMS.

8. DD of FS responded that the estimated costs saved in terms of manpower with respect to the rank structure of FSD's operational staff were -

- (a) firemen, 14.06 man-months;
- (b) senior firemen, 16.38 man-months;
- (c) principal firemen, 17.79 man-months;
- (d) station officers and senior station officers, 31.89 man-months; and
- (e) assistant divisional officers, 9.62 man-months.

The estimated staff cost equivalent to a total of 89.74 man-months of frontline operational staff could be saved by the implementation of the proposed AMMS.

9. Referring to the second point in item (3) of Annex A of the Administration's paper, the Chairman enquired about the existing and future maintenance programmes for FSD's vehicles and equipment.

10. DD of FS explained that at present, FSD had regular maintenance programmes for its vehicles and equipment. With the implementation of the proposed AMMS, the quantity of spare parts required for future maintenance work basing on the existing types and quantity of vehicles and the requirement of each time of maintenance would be more accurately forecasted. Hence, the maintenance programmes would be more appropriately arranged.

11. The Chairman asked whether any other government departments had implemented systems similar to the proposed AMMS. Mr WONG Yuk-man requested the Administration to provide details of the expenditures of such systems.

Admin

12. AD of EU responded that the proposed AMMS would provide an integrated database that would centrally and systematically record all asset-related data of FSD. It would be the most advanced and all-rounded

Action

programme of its kind. The Efficiency Unit ("EU") would recommend that other government departments develop programmes similar to the proposed AMMS.

13. Noting from paragraph 7 of the Administration's paper that the proposed AMMS would be developed on the basis of an off-the-shelf enterprise resource planning system, and be suitably modified to meet the needs of FSD, Mr WONG Yuk-man enquired about the breakdown in terms of the cost for the original and the modified systems.

14. AD of EU informed members of a rough breakdown of the development cost of the proposed AMMS as follows -

- (a) software cost at around \$20 million;
- (b) system development cost at around \$20 million; and
- (c) hardware cost at around \$10 million.

AD of EU explained that since quite a large number of FSD personnel would be using the proposed AMMS, entailing a large number of individual licences for the use of the software, the software cost was therefore high.

15. Mr WONG Yuk-man enquired about the details of the annual notional savings of about 117 man-months.

16. DD of FS explained that the notional savings would be achieved through productivity gains by automating some clerical work of various units in planning, procurement, inventory control, maintenance and disposal of old equipment after implementation of AMMS. FSD would redeploy the manpower savings to further enhance its service quality, including -

- (a) allowing operational staff to concentrate on their frontline work;
- (b) enhancing the service quality of the maintenance work;
- (c) coping with new vehicles and equipment maintenance work;
- (d) strengthening the testing on and inspections of existing equipment; and
- (e) enhancing efforts in keeping up with new development and

new technologies of fire-fighting equipment, and introducing them to FSD for use by frontline staff as necessary.

17. Noting from paragraph 11 of the Administration's paper that the proposed AMMS could bring about reductions of 1% of FSD's stock and 2% of the depreciation rate in machinery, vehicles and equipment, Mr WONG Yuk-man commented that the same reductions could be achieved by enhancing FSD's existing asset management and procurement systems alone. Mr WONG also noted with concern that it would take up to 15 years for the actual annual savings of around \$3.14 million brought about by implementing the proposed AMMS to even out its estimated non-recurrent expenditure of \$49.83 million. Mr WONG commented that such a computer system might become obsolete in less than 10 years. The Chairman asked whether the expenditure to be incurred by the proposed AMMS was worthwhile for the efficiency that would be brought about as claimed by the Administration.

18. US for S responded that a steady supply of FSD's assets and the safety and reliability of their functions and conditions were vital to the discharge of fire-fighting and rescue duties by frontline staff and the operations of FSD. The demand of FSD staff for a better asset management and procurement system and the study on FSD's procurement and asset management issues by EU both warranted the development of the proposed AMMS. The enhanced efficiency brought about by the proposed AMMS was of paramount importance for the discharge of duties by FSD staff.

19. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung said that he had the impression that FSD was the most resource-stricken department among the Government's disciplined forces. He queried whether the non-recurrent expenditure of \$49.83 million for the development of the proposed AMMS was sufficient. He also requested the Administration to provide information on the expenditure that the Hong Kong Police Force spent on improving its operational efficiency over the past two years for members' reference.

20. US for S stressed that FSD was an important disciplined force and adequate resources would be provided whenever necessary, as was the case for the development of the proposed AMMS.

21. Ms Cyd HO said that enhancing the safety of frontline fire officers should be the objective in developing the proposed AMMS. A steady supply of fire-fighting equipment should be provided to them. She queried whether the proposed AMMS would enhance the protection for safety of frontline fire officers.

Action

22. DD of FS advised that providing frontline fire officers with a safe operational environment was FSD's top priority. In view of the fact that much of FSD's existing asset management and procurement work was carried out manually, EU had recommended that FSD should develop an integrated computer system, that is, the proposed AMMS, to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of its asset management and procurement work. The proposed AMMS would automate existing manual operations as far as possible. For instance, the system would automatically issue reminder for stock replenishment and prepare purchase order when the quantity of a stock item fell below a pre-defined level.

23. Referring to system analysis and design of the implementation programme of the proposed AMMS, Ms Cyd HO enquired whether the Administration had consulted frontline staff of FSD regarding the needs and difficulties aroused in the course of the procurement work.

24. DD of FS responded that EU had visited about 160 units of FSD and discussed with them how the proposed AMMS could assist them in carrying out procurement work.

25. Ms Audrey EU expressed support for the development of the proposed AMMS. The Chairman concluded that members supported in principle the submission by the Administration of its proposal to the Finance Committee.

V. Report of the evaluation research on trial scheme on school drug testing in Tai Po district (School Year 2010-2011)
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)921/11-12(05) and (06))

26. US for S briefed members on the background on the evaluation research on the Trial Scheme on School Drug Testing in Tai Po District ("the Scheme") (School Year 2010-2011) as given in the Administration's paper. Mr YIP Hak-kwong, Director of Policy 21 Limited, presented the findings and recommendations of the Report of the Evaluation Research ("the Report") on the Scheme with the aid of powerpoint presentation.

27. Mr CHAN Hak-kan held the view that the Scheme was able to achieve positive results. According to the Report, there was no problem about teacher-student and parent-child relationships and labelling effects on students. Given the desirable results of the Scheme and the fact that schools in other districts had indicated interest in participating in the Scheme, Mr CHAN asked the Administration whether consideration would be given to allocating resources to some other districts for launching the anti-drug work there.

Action

28. Commissioner for Narcotics ("C for N") said that the objective of the Healthy School Programme with a drug testing component ("HSP(DT)") was to extend the Scheme to other schools. Discussion with schools in other districts in respect of their participation in the HSP(DT) had commenced and so far, some 40 schools had joined.

29. Regarding one of the recommendations that resources should be provided to enhance the support services to parents, Mr CHAN Hak-kan asked about the plan for the provision of such support services and the relevant policy.

30. C for N responded that resources had been provided by the Home Affairs Department to the 18 districts in the past years for organizing anti-drug activities. Resources for assistance to parents had been included in the HSP(DT), including organization of seminars and activities for parents. In addition, an enquiry hotline had been set up to provide relevant information and assistance to parents as necessary. Also, some district organizations would help approach the working parents and provide assistance to them as appropriate.

31. Mr CHAN Hak-kan sought information on the number of students who had been identified as taking drugs and the plan for the provision of assistance to these students. C for N said that under the Scheme, no students had been identified as taking drugs. While students taking drugs could choose not to participate in the Scheme which was not compulsory, schools and social workers helped students not participating in the Scheme via other channels, including making referrals to the services provided by the Counselling Centres for Psychotropic Substance Abusers and residential services provided by the relevant drug treatment and rehabilitation centres.

32. Mr WONG Yuk-man held the view that the Scheme was not successful in terms of the participation rate, and it was necessary to provide assistance to students who had not participated in the Scheme. Some students were still at risk and parents needed to be provided with assistance. Referring to paragraphs 6, 9 and 10 of the Administration's paper, Mr WONG pointed out the contradictions in the findings. He said that while most of the participating students believed that the Scheme was effective in establishing a drug-free campus and a higher proportion of students in Tai Po were aware of the adverse impact of drugs after the completion of the Scheme, the pre-survey revealed that the percentage of Tai Po students who had taken drugs was 1.9% before the launch of the Scheme and this had slightly increased to 2.5 % in June 2011 after the survey. Students outside Tai Po who had taken drugs had increased from 1.6% in October 2010 to 4.0% in June 2011. He further quoted the crime

Action

statistics of 2011 and queried the effectiveness of the Scheme. According to the statistics, there was an unusual increase in serious drug offences committed by juveniles (aged 10 to 15) in December of 2011 and the usual increase in serious drug offences committed by young persons (aged 16 to 20) during the summer in July and August of 2011.

33. Mr WONG Yuk-man considered that the Scheme was not able to provide assistance to students and it was more important to combat the source of drugs. He pointed out that the situation in the North District was especially worrying. Noting that the participation rate of students in the Scheme had dropped from 61% in 2009-2010 to 55% in 2010-2011, he found it unconvincing to claim that the Scheme was supported by parents and students. He remarked that there was a lack of common understanding among teachers, parents and students about the usefulness and effectiveness of the Scheme. He considered that a review on the Scheme should be conducted.

34. US for S responded that the law enforcement agencies had been committed to tackling the drug problem. Given rapid changes in the drug scene with the emergence of precursor chemicals and occasional new synthetic drugs from both overseas and in Hong Kong, the anti-drug efforts would be carried out on a long-term and continuous basis. Cooperation and support from different parties in the community were also required. Even though there was a significant improvement in the drug scene in the past few years and the launch of the community-wide anti-drug campaign had helped to arrest the deteriorating drug abuse situation, the problem was still far from under full control. Although the issue was receiving less public attention in the past months, he emphasized that there remained a need to sustain the anti-drug momentum in the community.

35. C for N said that different measures had been adopted by the Government to tackle the drug problem on various fronts, including law enforcement. She explained that the objective of the Scheme was not to identify and penalize students who were taking drugs but to arouse students' awareness and understanding of the harmful effects of drugs in order to help them develop positive values. Prevention through programmes such as the HSP(DT) was better than remedial work through treatment and rehabilitation after the young people had started to abuse drugs. She added that the implementation of the Scheme on a voluntary basis was a response to the common understanding among teachers, parents and students. The comparatively lower student participation rate in the Scheme for the 2010-2011 school year was because of some of the students having participated in the Scheme in the previous year already.

Action

The Government was committed to sustaining anti-drug initiatives in combating the youth drug abuse problem on different fronts.

36. Referring to paragraph 35 of the Report, Dr PAN Pey-chyou expressed concern about the increase in the percentage of both Tai Po students and non-Tai Po students who admitted abusing drugs in the 2010-2011 post-survey as compared with the figures in 2010-2011 before the survey. He sought explanation for such increase in figures.

37. US for S responded that even though there was an increase in the percentage of students who admitted abusing drugs, it was the first time that the percentage of Tai Po students was lower than that of non-Tai Po students as indicated in the 2008-2009 survey. Mr YIP Hak-kwong said that the hidden nature of psychotropic substances abuse was a challenge for social workers to identify drug-taking students and sustained anti-drug efforts were needed.

38. Referring to paragraph 36 of the Report and the comparison between Tai Po students and non-Tai Po students admitted that they had started taking drugs during the six months before June 2011, Dr PAN Pey-chyou enquired about the statistical significance of the difference in percentages.

39. Mr YIP Hak-kwong responded that the 1% of students who started to take drugs in Tai Po was revealed from the information collected from the self-reports of all students in Tai Po, whereas the percentage of 2.4% was derived from sample information from non-Tai Po students. In the case of Tai Po students, there was no sampling error. However, the case of non-Tai Po students was subject to sampling error, which was very small as the sample size for non-Tai Po students was quite large. The difference between 1% and 2.4% was statistically significant. The success in Tai Po district was a result of efforts made by different parties in the community in addition to those on the campus of the 23 participating schools. These included 10 non-governmental organizations providing school social work services, outreach social workers and parent-teacher associations. Different events and activities had been organized to help students build up their confidence to resist drug.

40. Referring to paragraph 37 of the Report, Dr PAN Pey-chyou enquired about the great difference of support for school drug testing in 2010-2011 after the survey between the Tai Po principals and non-Tai Po principals as compared with that of other respondents. Mr YIP Hak-kwong explained that the non-Tai Po principals had harbored much concerns about participating in school drug testing, including queries from parents and school councils, and the labelling effects on students. In

Action

particular, there was concern that not all schools in their own districts would participate in the Scheme.

41. The Chairman sought clarification on whether there was no intention to change the policy of implementing the Scheme on a voluntary basis to a compulsory one. US for S reaffirmed that compulsory drug testing was one of the recommendations of the Task Force on Youth Drug Abuse led by the Secretary for Justice and it was being studied separately by the Narcotics Division of the Security Bureau.

(Members agreed to extend the meeting to 5:00 pm.)

VI. Review of security arrangements during visits of political dignitaries to Hong Kong

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)958/11-12(01), CB(2)921/11-12(07) to (08) and CB(2)1063/11-12(01))

42. Noting the release of the Report of the Review Panel on the Centenary Ceremony held on 18 August 2011 ("the Report") to the Council of the University of Hong Kong ("HKU"), members agreed that a special meeting be held to discuss in detail the review of security arrangements during visits of political dignitaries in Hong Kong. Deputations/individuals who had attended the special meeting of the Panel on 12 September 2011, in particular representatives of HKU, should be invited to join the discussion.

43. US for S and Director of Operations of the Hong Kong Police Force ("D/Ops") briefed members on the Police's review of policing arrangements during visits of political dignitaries to Hong Kong ("the Review") as detailed in the Administration's paper.

Views of deputation

*Hong Kong Journalists Association
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1063/11-12(01)]*

44. Ms MAK Yin-ting presented the views of Hong Kong Journalists Association ("HKJA") as detailed in the submission.

(Post-meeting note: The HKJA's submission was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1063/11-12(01) on 14 February 2012.)

Discussion

45. Dr Margaret NG referred to paragraph 5.60 of the Report regarding the past practice of G4 (VIP Protection Unit) of the Police directly approaching the Vice-Chancellor of HKU with regard to the parameters and protocols of the Police operation on the campus of the University when there were visits of dignitaries to HKU involving substantial security arrangements, as expressed by the former Vice-Chancellor, Professor CHENG Yiu-chung. Dr NG asked the Administration to confirm whether such practice had been followed and, if not, the reasons for not following such practice.

46. D/Ops said that the Police had checked with the Head of G4 and there was no record of communication between the Vice-Chancellor of HKU and senior members of G4 in similar operations in the past.

47. Dr Margaret NG queried the absence of the relevant records of communication between the Vice-Chancellor of HKU and senior members of G4. She considered it a matter of courtesy for the Police to firstly approach the head of an institution for liaison of security arrangement for important events. She expressed grave concern about the absence of such records and enquired about the Administration's response to the recommendation of HKU in this respect. D/Ops responded that the recommendation would be considered, which was in line with the Police's review to enhance the liaison with external stakeholders.

48. The Chairman sought information on the first contact point of HKU when the Police liaised with the University with regard to the security arrangement on the campus. D/Ops replied that it was a Mr NGAI.

49. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan asked the Administration whether it would withdraw the Review in view of the absence of a critical review of the incidents involved during the visit of Vice Premier LI Keqiang to Hong Kong, including complaints lodged by HKJA, removal of a member of public wearing June-4th T-shirt at Laguna City, false imprisonment of three students by the Police and setting-up of designated protest areas at remote locations. Referring to paragraph 98 of the Review report, Mr LEE questioned the security concerns of the Vice Premier's visit overriding the Hong Kong people's right on expression and expressed strong dissatisfaction about the Review's conclusion on expectation management. He remarked that the Review only focussed on strategies of communicating with the media and public by expectation management rather than a review on the balance between the right of expression and security concerns.

Action

50. US for S said that he did not agree with the view of Mr LEE Cheuk-yan. Regarding expectation management, he pointed out the importance of communication between the Police and the public as highlighted in the Review report. It was the Police's duty to protect personal safety of political dignitaries visiting Hong Kong and the maintenance of public order while safeguarding the freedom of speech and press.

51. Regarding the protective security operation for the Vice Premier, D/Ops advised that it was drawn up based on the risk assessment to ensure personal safety of the Vice Premier and it was different from the ordinary circumstances under which public meetings and procession could have been allowed closer to the intended object of the demonstration. It was expected that the experience in the protective security operation for the Vice Premier could serve as a reference for better arrangement in future.

52. Regarding the issues not covered in the Review, D/Ops explained that relevant complaints had already been received by the Complaints Against Police Office ("CAPO") which operated independently from other units of the Police, and CAPO's investigations of complaints against Police officers had to be submitted to the Independent Police Complaints Council ("IPCC") for scrutiny. As stated by the Chairman of IPCC after the IPCC meeting on 1 September 2011, IPCC would follow up relevant complaints to see whether there were inadequacies in the overall approach and deployment to the protective security operation and the handling of the incidents by the Police. Given that IPCC was an independent statutory body, it was believed that its review on CAPO's investigation into the complaints would be credible and acceptable to members of the public.

53. While agreeing to the security concerns for ensuring the personal safety of visiting dignitaries, Ms Audrey EU pointed out that the personal safety of the Vice-Premier was not threatened in the incidents involved, including the removal of a member of public wearing June-4th T-shirt at Laguna City, the three students in the stairwell, the setting-up of remote designated press areas and the security checking of the reporters. Noting that investigations into the CAPO complaints were still underway, Ms EU expressed strong dissatisfaction that the Review only focussed on the communication with the public and the press which only related to public relations but not the major principles involved. The Review had not addressed the core issues, including whether the Police had used excessive force, whether due regard had been given to the right of press coverage and whether the setting up of the designated press area was appropriate. She considered it important to ensure that demonstrations

Action

were at least heard and seen by political dignitaries. She urged the Administration to revise the Review report.

54. D/Ops said that the overall review of the operations of the Police would be subject to the release of IPCC's report on its review on CAPO's investigations into the relevant complaints. Regarding HKU's incident, it would not be appropriate to make further comments as the students involved intended to initiate legal proceedings.

55. Mr WONG Yuk-man queried about the claim by the Commissioner of Police in response to the Report that there was an agreement between the Police and HKU about the use of minimum force on HKU's campus as necessary. He pointed out that this issue had not been mentioned in the Review and both parties should respond and provide explanation.

56. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung was of the view that the Administration should at least be able to clarify its stance in respect of the policy on the protection of rights and freedom, regardless of whether CAPO's investigations of complaints on relevant incidents were being reviewed by IPCC. He expressed concern whether consideration had been given to human rights under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and whether there would be penalty for non-compliance with the Covenant. He queried whether the Police had firstly approached the security company employed by HKU rather than the Vice-Chancellor of HKU. He requested the Police to provide the non-confidential information on the communication with both internal and external parties with regard to the security arrangements on HKU's campus.

57. D/Ops responded that it would not be appropriate for the Police to provide operational information as they were confidential in nature and had been classified as confidential. The disclosure of such information would affect similar operations in future and would threaten the personal safety of political dignitaries. D/OPS further said that the Police approached members of the HKU Security Team, including Mr Frankie LAW, Mr Walter NGAI and Ms Katherine MA for the security arrangements. D/Ops reiterated that IPCC was reviewing the handling and investigation of relevant complaints by CAPO. He was not in a position to make further comments.

58. Mr Paul TSE complained about the Chairman's time management in conducting the meeting, pointing that members who had indicated to speak were not given the opportunity to do so at the meeting. Dr PAN Pey-chyou echoed the view.

Action

59. Mr Abraham SHEK declared that he was one of the Vice-chairmen of IPCC.

60. The meeting ended at 5:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 May 2012