

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 13 January 2012, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

**Public Officers
attending** : **Agenda item IV**

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr CHOW Chun-wah
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)7

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr Eric FUNG
Government Engineer/Railway Development
Highways Department

Mr K M LEUNG
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr K M LEUNG
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Mr Ken HUI
Principal Transport Officer/Bus & Railway 2
Transport Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item IV**

Mr David LEUNG
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Stephen CHIK
Head of Project Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Senior Manager – Projects & Property
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Anthony WONG
Architectural Manager – Design
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item V

Mr David LEUNG
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Franco KWONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

I Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(1)783/11-12 - Minutes of meeting on 4 November 2011)

The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The minutes of the meeting held on 4 November 2011 were confirmed.

II Information papers issued since last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)362/11-12(01) - Referral from Members' meeting-cum-luncheon with Sha Tin District Council members on 2 June 2011 on the retrofitting of platform screen doors at all stations of the East Rail Line and the Ma On Shan Rail Line

LC Paper No. CB(1)447/11-12(01) - Submission from the Conservancy Association on the construction works of ventilation shaft of the Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link at Pat Heung

LC Paper No. CB(1)469/11-12(01) - Submission from a member of the public on MTR's Student Travel Scheme

LC Paper No. CB(1)485/11-12(01) - Submission from South Tokwawan Concern Group on Shatin to Central Link

LC Paper No. CB(1)626/11-12(01) - Submission from a member of the public on new MTR trains

LC Paper No. CB(1)626/11-12(02) and CB(1)726/11-12(01) - Submissions from a member of the public on nuisance caused by commercial shops in MTR stations

Action

LC Paper No. CB(1)642/11-12(01) - Submission from a member of the public on Shatin to Central Link)

3. Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

III Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 March 2012
(LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion
LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(02) - List of follow-up actions)

4. Members agreed to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration at the next regular meeting on Friday, 2 March 2012, at 8:30 am -

- (a) Shatin to Central Link – Progress Report; and
- (b) Safety Campaign of the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL).

5. The Subcommittee was concerned about recent incidents involving station-skipping and failures of trains to stop at proper position for alighting/boarding, and agreed to include "Recent railway incidents" on the list of outstanding items for discussion. The Subcommittee requested MTRCL to provide a paper on such incidents that had occurred in the past three months and measures to prevent recurrence.

MTRCL

(Post-meeting note: The requested information paper was provided by MTRCL and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1162/11-12(01) on 27 February 2012.)

IV Design of next generation of railway stations and update on retrofitting platform screen doors
(LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(03) - MTRCL's paper entitled "Design of next generation of railway stations and update on retrofitting platform screen doors"
LC Paper No. CB(1)772/11-12 - Updated background brief entitled "Installation of platform screen doors and

automatic platform gates at railway stations" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(04) - Referral on retrofitting of platform screen doors from the Complaints Division dated 21 December 2011)

6. With the aid of powerpoint presentation, MTRCL briefed the Subcommittee on the design of next generation of railway stations and an update on the retrofitting of automatic platform gates (APGs). Subcommittee members in general expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time required to retrofit APGs at the stations along the East Rail Line (EAL) and the Ma On Shan Line (MOL). Subcommittee members also considered that MTRCL should provide fundamental facilities including public toilets, breast-feeding rooms, lifts and escalators as well as facilities enabling passengers to receive radio broadcasting at MTR stations as far as possible.

Admin/
MTRCL

7. At the request of the Subcommittee, the Administration/MTRCL agreed to provide information on the following –

- (a) a list of MTR stations with and without public toilets, a timetable for providing public toilets at all stations, and the reasons for not being able to provide public toilets at any MTR stations;
- (b) the number of seats for passengers at each station and whether MTRCL planned to install seats at all station platforms and concourses;
- (c) whether the new trains purchased by MTRCL could be used for the railway lines which had often been complained about their high noise level;
- (d) the updated position of the provision of a system enabling radio reception on MTR train compartments and at MTR stations;
- (e) whether the stations of new railway lines, in particular the West Rail Line, would provide clearer station name signage at station platforms;

Action

- (f) the time and additional cost required if the retrofitting of APGs along EAL was to be carried out as a standalone project;
- (g) response to some members' suggestion of retrofitting APGs at those EAL/MOL stations which did not have wide platform gaps first; and
- (h) response to Mr LAU Kong-wah's suggestion of retrofitting of APGs at MOL stations first and reprovisioning the APGs when the platforms concerned underwent reconstruction works.

(Post-meeting note: Information on items (f), (g) and (h) was provided to the Subcommittee for its discussion on "Retrofitting of platform screen doors/automatic platform gates" at the meeting of 2 March 2012.)

V New trains for MTRCL

(LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(05) - MTRCL's paper entitled "New trains for MTRCL")

LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(06) - Relevant press cuttings)

8. The Subcommittee was briefed by MTRCL on the procurement and testing procedures for the commissioning of new trains by MTRCL and the features of the ten trains newly purchased. The Subcommittee noted that the first of the ten trains had arrived in Hong Kong in April 2011. By the end of 2011, a total of seven trains had been delivered. The remaining three trains were expected to arrive within 2012.

9. Some members expressed concern about the media reports on the uneven leveling of train floor of the new trains and the need to operate the emergency stop manually by the MTR train captains of the new trains. The Subcommittee expressed concern about the safety of the new trains and asked why such technical problems had not been detected during the testing stages. MTRCL explained that the incidents in question did not pose safety problems to passengers. The difference between the train floor level and platform level was within the normal range and only simple adjustments were required to fix the minor irregularity for better passenger comfort. As for the incident involving manual operation of emergency stop, MTRCL explained that it had only occurred once and was in the course of a dynamic train test with no passengers. MTRCL stressed that the new trains were designed and built to

Action

high stringent specifications in line with the current MTR system.

Admin/
MTRCL

10. Subcommittee members urged MTRCL to ensure good integration of the different systems and facilities of the new trains, which were purchased from suppliers of different countries. At the request of the Subcommittee, MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information on measures taken to prevent recurrence of incidents involving electrical short-circuit in traction motors and problems of application of the emergency brake.

VI Any other business

11. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
15 August 2012

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 13 January 2012, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes			
000615 – 000722	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 4 November 2011.	
Agenda item II – Information papers issued since last meeting			
000723 – 000845	Chairman	Briefing on the information papers issued since the last meeting.	
Agenda item III – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 March 2012			
000846 – 001131	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	<p>Agenda items for discussion at the next regular meeting.</p> <p>The Subcommittee agreed that recent railway incidents, including non-stoppage of MTR trains and failures to stop the trains at the proper position, should be included in the list of outstanding items for discussion.</p> <p>The Subcommittee requested the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) to provide written response on the relevant railway incidents in the past three months.</p>	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 5 of minutes)
Agenda item IV – Design of next generation of railway stations and update on retrofitting platform screen doors			
001132 – 002444	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing by the Administration and PowerPoint presentation on the update on retrofitting platform screen doors (PSDs) by MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(03)).	
002445 – 003240	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration Mr Ronny TONG Mr Jeffery LAM	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed dissatisfaction with the inadequate provision of public toilet facilities at existing MTR stations; high noise level inside train compartments; lack of radio reception system; seating configuration of new train compartments; and unclear guidance /information signs at station platforms, particularly for the stations of West Rail Line (WRL).</p> <p>Mr WONG also expressed strong dissatisfaction with the serious delay in retrofitting automatic platform gates (APGs) on East Rail Line (EAL). He</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>remained unconvinced that the MTRCL could not resolve the technical limitations if the retrofitting project was carried out separately. He also queried whether the train capacity could cope with the demand after the replacement of 12-car trains with nine-car trains.</p> <p>Subcommittee members suggested that the Administration and MTRCL should brief them on the design of next generation of railway stations before further discussion.</p>	
003241 – 004014	Chairman MTRCL	PowerPoint presentation on the design of next generation of railway stations by the MTRCL.	
004015 – 004645	Chairman Ir Dr Raymond HO MTRCL	<p>In respect of station facilities, Ir Dr Raymond HO suggested that public toilets, lifts and escalators should be provided at all MTR stations. Moreover, display of artworks, broadcast of music and greening in stations could enhance the travelling environment.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that public toilets would be provided at new stations. There would be at least one barrier-free access at each entrance of new stations. Meanwhile, MTRCL planned to install passenger lifts at three existing stations this year.</p>	
004646 – 005209	Chairman Mr Jeffery LAM MTRCL	<p>Mr Jeffery LAM was concerned about the progress of retrofitting APGs along EAL and Ma On Shan Line (MOL). He considered that APGs could prevent passengers from falling off platform edge onto rail tracks, in particular at the stations with wide platform gaps.</p> <p>The MTRCL responded that –</p> <p>(a) various safety facilities and measures had been put in place, such as making public announcements on platforms and in train compartments to remind passengers to mind the platform gaps; and</p> <p>(b) additional station assistants were employed to help maintain platform order.</p>	
005210 – 005920	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL	Mr Albert CHAN expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time for retrofitting of APGs on EAL and MOL. He also expressed concerns on the cultural and art programmes planned for stations. He suggested that MTRCL should set up an art fund	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>to promote art and cultural development.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that it had brought into its stations live performance and display of artworks. The "art in mtr" initiative would be continued with a long term goal of installing one art piece at each MTR station. MTRCL had no plan to set up an art fund, but its art policy would be reviewed regularly.</p>	
005921 – 010355	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN considered that more musical performances should be held at MTR stations, similar to the railway stations in other countries. She also suggested that breast-feeding rooms should be provided at stations. MTRCL would give thought to the suggestion of providing breast-feeding rooms.</p> <p>In response to Miss Tanya CHAN's further enquiry, the MTRCL advised that the new ticket machine had been designed to combine the basic functions of the existing single journey ticket issuing machine and add value machine. The new ticket machine would allow the payment of single journey tickets by cash or Octopus Card.</p>	
010356 – 010936	Chairman Mr Ronny TONG MTRCL	<p>Noting that platform modification works would be carried out at MOL stations to facilitate the operation of eight-car trains, Mr Ronny TONG considered that MTRCL should take this opportunity to retrofit APGs at MOL stations first, and the technical limitation of existing signalling system could be resolved by manual operation of APGs.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that to carry out the retrofitting works of APGs in tandem with modifications of platform would achieve synergy. Manual operation of APGs might affect passenger safety and train frequency.</p>	
010937 – 011647	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time for retrofitting APGs along EAL and MOL.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that –</p> <p>(a) it had awarded a contract to conduct ground investigation on EAL platforms to prepare for APG retrofitting works and also started the pre-qualification process by inviting contractors to express interest to the APG retrofitting works</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>along MOL; and</p> <p>(b) the replacement of the signalling system was needed before retrofitting of APGs and it would require about seven years to complete. The time required for retrofitting APGs on EAL separately or in tandem with construction of Shatin-to-Central Link was the same.</p>	
011648 – 012339	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL	Mr LAU Kong-wah suggested retrofitting APGs at MOL stations first and reprovisioning the APGs when the platforms concerned underwent reconstruction works. MTRCL agreed to consider the suggestion of Mr LAU.	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of minutes)
012340 – 012705	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested MTRCL to provide the following supplementary information –</p> <p>(a) a list of MTR stations with and without public toilets, a timetable for providing public toilets at all stations, and the reasons for not being able to provide public toilets at any MTR stations;</p> <p>(b) the number of seats for passengers at each station and whether MTRCL planned to install seats at all station platforms and concourses;</p> <p>(c) whether the new trains purchased by MTRCL could be used on the railway lines which had often been complained about their high noise level;</p> <p>(d) the updated situation of the provision of a system enabling radio reception on MTR train compartments and at MTR stations; and</p> <p>(e) whether the stations of new railway lines, in particular the WRL, would provide clearer guidance/information signs at station platforms.</p>	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of minutes)
012706 – 013023	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG requested MTRCL to provide a written response to his enquiries –</p> <p>(a) the time and additional cost required if the retrofitting of APGs along EAL was to be carried out as a standalone project; and</p> <p>(b) response to some members' suggestion of first retrofitting APGs at those EAL/MOL stations which did not have wide platform gaps.</p>	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013024 – 013647	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	Regarding the suggestion raised by Mr LAU Kong-wah on retrofitting APGs at MOL stations first and reprovisioning the APGs when the platforms concerned underwent reconstruction works, the Subcommittee agreed to include this subject into the agenda of the next regular meeting in March 2012.	
Agenda item V – New trains for MTRCL			
013648 – 014921	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing by the Administration and PowerPoint presentation on new trains by MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(05)).	
014922 – 015242	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiries –</p> <p>(a) the effectiveness of the noise reduction features retrofitted in new trains; and</p> <p>(b) the details of the incident involving uneven levelling between train floor and platform floor in December 2011.</p> <p>The MTRCL responded that –</p> <p>(a) the noise level of new train compartments was reduced by 5 dB as a result of the installation of noise reduction features; and</p> <p>(b) the incident was caused by uneven levelling of train floor which would only affect passenger comfort. The train safety would not be affected. Subsequent adjustment was made and the train concerned resumed operation on the following day.</p>	
015243 – 015855	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG enquired why MTRCL could not detect the problem of uneven levelling of train floor at an earlier stage, i.e. in the course of testing process.</p> <p>The Administration and MTRCL advised that in normal circumstances, when a number of passengers boarded/alighted the train, the train suspension system would automatically activate to regulate the level of train floor to align with the platform level. In this incident, there was a difference between the train floor level and platform level, but the difference was within the normal range. MTRCL assured members that the train safety was not affected.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015856 – 020309	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Albert CHAN expressed concern about the safety performance of new trains and enquired about the details of the incident involving application of emergency brake to stop a train.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the safety performance of these new trains was similar to the previous batches manufactured by other suppliers. Regarding the incident involving emergency stop, MTRCL advised that it had occurred once and was in the course of dynamic train test which was carried out to adjust the operations between the existing signalling system and new trains. As the train failed to stop at the pre-designated platform position, the train captain followed the established procedures to stop the train immediately. Investigation showed that when the train captain applied the emergency brake, the automatic stopping device of the train had been activated. There was no safety implication.</p>	
020310 – 020815	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL Administration	<p>In response to Mr LAU Kong-wah's enquiry, the Administration and MTRCL advised that many systems and facilities of the new trains came from suppliers in different countries, such as France, Germany and Japan. Good integration of these systems/facilities would be ensured.</p> <p>At the request of Mr LAU, MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information on the newly installed devices to avoid the re-occurrence of similar railway incidents, such as electrical short-circuit in traction motors and problems of application of the emergency brake.</p>	The Admin/MTRCL to provide information (para. 10 of minutes)