

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1772/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 2 March 2012, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** :
- Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
 - Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
 - Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
 - Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
 - Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
 - Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
 - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
 - Hon CHAN Hak-kan
 - Hon WONG Sing-chi
 - Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
 - Hon Tanya CHAN
 - Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Members absent** :
- Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

**Public Officers
attending** : **Agenda item III**

Ms Eva CHENG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Maisie CHENG, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)7

Mr Henry CHAN, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr YEUNG Kong-sang
Chief Engineer/Railway Development 1-3
Highways Department

Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr K M LEUNG
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Mr Ken HUI
Principal Transport Officer/Bus & Railway 2
Transport Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr José YAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing(Transport)4

Mr K M LEUNG
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Mr Ken HUI
Principal Transport Officer/Bus & Railway 2
Transport Department

**Attendance by
invitation** :

Agenda item III

Mr Henry LAM
General Manager – SCL/KTE
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Philco WONG
General Manager – SCL
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Senior Manager – Projects and Property
Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item IV

Mr David LEUNG
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Sammy WONG
Operations Manager – Airport Express, Tung Chung
and Disneyland Resort Lines

Agenda item V

Mr David LEUNG
Chief of Operations Engineering
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jeff LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Sammy WONG
Operations Manager – Airport Express, Tung Chung
and Disneyland Resort Lines

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Franco KWONG
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

- I Information papers issued since last meeting**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)896/11-12(01) - Submission from a member of the public expressing views on the nuisance caused by commercial shops in MTR stations
- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| LC Paper
CB(1)1162/11-12(01) | No. - MTRCL's paper entitled "Occurrences of non-stopping of MTR trains or door opening procedures not |
|---------------------------------|--|

properly followed by MTR train captains")

The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached in **Annex**).

2. Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

II Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 11 May 2012

(LC Paper No.- List of outstanding items for
CB(1)1154/11-12(01) discussion

LC Paper No.- List of follow-up actions)
CB(1)1154/11-12(02)

3. Subcommittee members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Friday, 11 May 2012, at 8:30 am -

(a) Environmental measures for new railway projects; and

(b) Public consultation on the interim study findings of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000

4. At the suggestion of Mr KAM Nai-wai, the Subcommittee also agreed to hold a special meeting to discuss "Mechanism for handling complaints and compensation claims concerning construction of new railway lines".

(Post-meeting note: The special meeting was subsequently arranged to be held on 23 April 2012 at 8:30 am.)

III Shatin to Central Link – Progress report

(LC Paper No. - Administration's paper
CB(1)1154/11-12(03) entitled "Shatin to Central Link – Progress report"

LC Paper No. CB(1)1155/11-12 - Updated background brief
entitled "Shatin to Central Link" prepared by the
Legislative Council
Secretariat

LC CB(1)1154/11-12(04)	Paper	No. - Administration's reply letter dated 20 February 2012 to a letter dated 8 February 2012 from a district executive of New People's Party
LC CB(1)1209/11-12(01)	Paper	No. - Referral memorandum from Complaints Division on requests for enhancing pedestrian facilities in Tsz Wan Shan under the Shatin to Central Link project)

5. Ms Starry LEE declared that she owned properties along the alignment of the Shatin to Central Link (SCL).

6. The Administration and MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) briefed members on the progress of the SCL scheme. The Administration proposed to consult the Subcommittee on the funding proposal of the SCL project on 23 March 2012 at 8:30 am. The Subcommittee agreed.

Admin/
MTRCL 7. At the request of the Subcommittee, the Administration/MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information on the following –

- (a) the updated position on the provision of Park & Ride facilities and an explanation of why such facilities could not be made available at the six interchange stations;
- (b) response to a request for provision of facilities allowing passengers to receive radio broadcasting at SCL stations and the cost implications of providing such facilities;
- (c) the cultural and art programmes planned for SCL stations;
- (d) assessment of the impact of the increase in passenger volume after the commissioning of SCL on the existing railway network;
- (e) the provision of public transport interchange at the Tai Wai station to meet the needs of interchange passengers after the commissioning of SCL;
- (f) timetable of the reprovisioning works for the implementation of the SCL project; and

- (g) numbers of trees to be felled in different districts due to the SCL construction works.

(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(1)1340/11-12(01)] was issued on 19 March 2012.)

- IV Retrofitting of platform screen doors/ automatic platform gates**
(LC Paper No. - MTRCL's paper entitled
CB(1)1154/11-12(05) "Supplementary information
on retrofitting automatic
platform gates along the East
Rail Line and Ma On Shan
Line"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1156/11-12 - Updated background brief
entitled "Installation of
platform screen doors and
automatic platform gates at
railway stations" prepared by
the Legislative Council
Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(03) - MTRCL's paper entitled
"Design of next generation of
railway stations and update on
retrofitting platform screen
doors"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)785/11-12(04) - Referral on retrofitting of
platform screen doors from
the Complaints Division dated
21 December 2011)

8. Subcommittee members noted that the MTRCL had considered and decided not to adopt a suggestion made by members at the last meeting that the MTRCL should retrofit the APGs along the Ma On Shan Line (MOL) first and re-provision the APGs when the construction of SCL began on the following grounds –

- (a) when the SCL came into operation, platform modifications would be required for the MOL;

Action

- (b) if the retrofitting of APGs along the MOL was carried out first, most of the APGs installed would have to be dismantled when construction of the SCL began, as the train door opening positions for 4-car trains would be different from the positions for 8-car trains operating on the extended platform;
- (c) the dismantling process would inevitably cause damage to the APGs, rendering them unfit for installation again, resulting in wastage; and
- (d) dismantling and reinstallation of the APGs along the MOL would also delay completion of the whole retrofitting project.

Therefore, the MTRCL maintained that the APG retrofitting works along MOL should be carried out in tandem with the SCL project.

9. Subcommittee members in general expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time to retrofit APGs along the East Rail Line (EAL)/MOL. Mr Andrew CHENG criticized the MTRCL for failing to provide detailed information on the estimated cost that would be incurred by adopting the above suggestion made by members.

MTRCL

10. The Subcommittee urged the MTRCL to –

- (a) introduce additional safety measures from the present onwards until completion of the retrofitting project to prevent passengers from falling onto the rail track; and
- (b) employ additional Platform Assistants, especially for crowded stations such as Kowloon Tong Station, to maintain platform order and provide assistance to passengers to board and alight at EAL and MOL stations.

V Safety campaign of MTRCL

(LC Paper
CB(1)1154/11-12(06)

No. - MTRCL's paper entitled
"Safety campaigns of
MTRCL")

11. The Subcommittee agreed to defer the discussion of this item to the next regular meeting on 11 May 2012.

Action

(Post-meeting note: The item has been removed from the agenda for meeting on 11 May 2012 in order to allow sufficient time for discussion of the item “Public consultation on the interim study findings of the Review and Update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000”.)

VI Any other business

12. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:35 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
10 May 2012

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 2 March 2012, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Information papers issued since last meeting			
000755 – 000904	Chairman	Briefing on the information papers issued since the last meeting.	
Agenda item II – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 11 May 2012			
000905 – 001904	Chairman Mr KAM Nai-wai Ms LI Fung-ying Ir Dr Raymond HO Mr Jeffery LAM Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Miss Tanya CHAN	Discussion on agenda items for the next regular meeting. The Subcommittee agreed to hold a special meeting to discuss "the mechanism for handling complaints and compensation claims concerning construction of new railway lines".	
Agenda item III – Shatin to Central Link – Progress report			
001905 – 003024	Chairman Administration	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)1154/11-12(03)).	
003025 – 003920	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	Mr Andrew CHENG's concerns – (a) whether there would be an upsurge in the estimated cost of the entire Shatin to Central Link (SCL) project as a result of inflation and increases in construction costs; and (b) whether it was possible to advance the completion of the construction works for the Hung Hom to Admiralty section to 2018. The Administration's response – (a) according to the latest cost estimate, the project cost was expected not to exceed \$70 billion in September 2011 prices; and (b) as the Hung Hom to Admiralty section involved a cross-harbour section, it was more complicated in construction. There was little room for advancing the targeted completion date.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration advised that the delay caused to the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Reports of SCL by the judicial review case regarding the EIA Reports of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge local projects had been mitigated, thus did not affect the cost estimate of SCL project significantly.</p>	
003921 – 004842	Chairman Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr Raymond HO considered that park and ride facilities, toilet facilities, lifts and escalators, as well as radio broadcasting systems should be provided in SCL stations.</p> <p>The Administration and MTRCL's response –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) all new stations would provide public toilets; (b) there would be at least one barrier-free access in each new station and an escalator at each exit; (c) subject to the availability of car parking spaces, it would consider to provide park and ride facilities; and (d) the provision of a system enabling radio reception within the large underground MTR network was technically complicated. <p>The Administration and MTRCL were requested to provide supplementary information on the provision of park and ride facilities and radio broadcasting systems at SCL stations.</p>	The Administration/MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of the minutes)
004843 – 005837	Chairman Ms Starry LEE Administration	<p>Ms Starry LEE's declaration of interest and expression of views –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should speed up the construction of the Hung Hom to Admiralty section; (b) the Administration/MTRCL should take into full consideration the views and demands of local residents as far as possible and a detailed cost breakdown should be provided to LegCo; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the Administration should address the concerns expressed by the Kowloon City District Council (KCDC) on the provision of pedestrian linkage facilities to connect stations entrances with neighbourhood area, reprovisioning of recreational facilities and resumption of underground strata. Unless the concerns of local residents were properly addressed, the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong might not support the funding application.</p> <p>The Administration's response –</p> <p>(a) taking into consideration public views and concerns, two rounds of amendments to the SCL scheme were gazetted. Owing to various constraints, not all the requests from local community could be acceded to;</p> <p>(b) it was discussing with KCDC on the provision of pedestrian linkage facilities and reprovisioning of recreational facilities; and</p> <p>(c) in relation to the underground strata resumption, the community liaison group would be set up to enhance communication with the owners/residents. Moreover, condition surveys would be conducted for buildings and the construction works would be closely monitored.</p>	
005838 – 010422	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's enquiries –</p> <p>(a) the lengths of viaduct and underground tunnel of SCL;</p> <p>(b) whether the result of pre-construction building condition surveys would be given to the affected building owners for lodging claim actions if necessary; and</p> <p>(c) whether the public transport interchange facilities of Tai Wai Station would be upgraded to accommodate the demand of passengers.</p> <p>The Administration advised that prior to commencement of construction, the MTRCL would undertake pre-construction condition surveys for the buildings along the railway alignment to protect the interests of the owners or occupiers concerned,</p>	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of the minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>and to formulate the most appropriate construction methods and protective procedures to be adopted during the construction period. Monitoring points would be established at the buildings and structures adjacent to the works areas. Monitoring would be conducted throughout the construction stage. If any irregularity was detected, the MTRCL would follow-up and conduct inspection. The Administration would also monitor the construction works closely.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that SCL was mainly underground tunnel, except two small sections between Hin Keng and Tai Wai, and in North Hung Hom respectively. It had no plan to carry out large-scale modification works in Tai Wai Station. The MTRCL agreed to provide further information on the utilization of Tai Wai Station after the commissioning of SCL.</p>	
010423 – 011114	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Administration MTRCL	<p>In response to Miss Tanya CHAN's request, the Administration agreed to provide detailed information on the timetable of the reprovisioning, remedial and improvement works of SCL and the numbers of trees to be felled in different districts due to the construction works.</p> <p>In response to Miss Tanya CHAN's enquiry, the MTRCL advised that necessary traffic mitigation measures would be taken to alleviate the traffic congestion caused by reprovisioning works. The MTRCL assured members that the reprovisioning of culverts at Fleming Street would not lead to cross-district traffic congestion.</p>	The Administration/ MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of the minutes)
011115 – 012110	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's views –</p> <p>(a) in designing the alignment, the Administration should consult the local communities to collect views on the provision of public facilities, such as pedestrian linkage facilities; and</p> <p>(b) he criticized the MTRCL for displaying mega advertisements at stations but making little efforts in promoting local art. He urged the Administration to set aside a proportion of public areas in SCL stations for artwork display.</p>	The MTRCL to provide information (para. 7 of the minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration advised that it had conducted extensive public consultation with local communities and relevant district councils on the locations of stations entrances and provision of pedestrian links. As for the artworks in stations, efforts had been made to promote community art and culture.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that preparation work for the art design of SCL stations would involve community participation and a number of local arts groups had been approached to explore the artistic concepts for SCL stations and the possibility of co-operation. The MTRCL agreed to provide further information on the cultural and art programme at SCL stations.</p>	
012111 – 012820	Chairman Mr WONG Sing-chi Administration	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi considered that the construction of SCL should not be undertaken in two phases, resulting in a gap of two years and which might cause bottlenecks to be formed at Hung Hom Station, Tsim Sha Tsui Station and Admiralty Station.</p> <p>The Administration advised that after the opening of SCL, the East West Corridor and SCL stations in Kowloon East would be able to divert passengers, and passengers heading for Hong Kong Island east could cross the harbour via Diamond Hill Station and Yau Tong Station instead of Admiralty Station. The Administration agreed to provide further information on the impact on Tsuen Wan Line prior to the commissioning of the SCL Hung Hom to Admiralty Section.</p>	The Administration to provide information (para. 7 of the minutes)
Agenda item IV – Retrofitting of platform screen doors/ automatic platform gates			
012821 – 014102	Chairman Administration MTRCL Mr WONG Sing-chi	<p>Briefing by the Administration and PowerPoint presentation on the update on retrofitting platform screen doors (PSDs)/ automatic platform gates (APGs) by the MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)1154/11-12(05)).</p> <p>The Subcommittee agreed to defer the discussion of item V on "Safety campaign of MTRCL" to the next Subcommittee meeting.</p>	
014103 – 014529	Chairman Mr CHAN Hak-kan Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr CHAN Hak-kan's enquiries –</p> <p>(a) any safety measures to be taken to avoid accidents involving passengers falling onto rail</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>track; and</p> <p>(b) funding arrangement for the retrofitting works.</p> <p>On the funding arrangement, the Administration advised that it was in the course of discussion with MTRCL and would endeavour to find a solution so that passengers did not need to share the cost of installing APGs along East Rail Line (EAL) and Ma On Shan Line (MOL).</p> <p>On safety measures, the MTRCL advised that apart from the existing safety measures, it would employ more than 200 additional platform assistants in 2011 and 2012 to maintain platform order.</p>	
014530 – 014944	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG expressed dissatisfaction that the MTRCL had put emphasis on cost consideration in retrofitting APGs along MOL. He also queried whether the employment of 200-odd platform assistants was sufficient to maintain platform order.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that as platform modifications would be necessary, it would take at least six years to complete the APG retrofitting works along MOL as a standalone project. Retrofitting of APGs in tandem with SCL project was a logical solution, taking all factors into account. It would consider employing more platform assistants, if necessary.</p>	
014945 – 015355	Chairman Mr WONG Sing-chi Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time for retrofitting of APGs. He urged the MTRCL to install APGs at certain busy stations, such as Kowloon Tong Station, Tai Wai Station and Hung Hom Station.</p> <p>The MTRCL advised that it had awarded a contract to conduct ground investigation on EAL platforms to prepare for APG retrofitting works and also started the pre-qualification process by inviting contractors to express interest to work on the APG retrofitting works along MOL.</p>	
015356 – 015845	Chairman Ms LI Fung-ying MTRCL	<p>Ms LI Fung-ying also expressed strong dissatisfaction with the long lead time for retrofitting of APGs. She urged the MTRCL to put forward more safety measures.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		The MTRCL considered that deployment of platform assistants could effectively enhance platform order. It would consider employing more platform assistants, if necessary.	
015846 – 020420	Chairman Mr IP Wai-ming MTRCL	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming emphasized that passengers should not be required to bear the cost of retrofitting PSDs/APGs.</p> <p>In response to Mr IP's enquiry, the MTRCL further explained the timetable for retrofitting APGs along MOL.</p> <p>Chairman requested the MTRCL to consider introducing more safety measures to prevent passengers from falling onto the rail track.</p>	