

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2731/11-12
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 23 April 2012, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Tanya CHAN

Members absent : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
Hon WONG Sing-chi

Public Officers attending : Agenda items II and III

Home Affairs Bureau

Mrs Avia LAI
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr WAN Man-leung
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Elizabeth TAI
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael Lynch
Chief Executive Officer

Dr Lars Nittve
Executive Director, M+

Mr Louis YU
Executive Director, Performing Arts

Clerk in attendance : Mr Thomas WONG
Principal Council Secretary (SC)(2)

Staff in attendance : Ms Alice LEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (2)1

Mr Ian CHOW
Council Secretary (2)1

Miss Emma CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (SC)(2)

Action

I. Items for discussion at the next meeting

LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/11-12(01) -- List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/11-12(02) -- List of follow-up actions

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

2. Members noted that the Administration proposed to discuss the issues of "Development of cultural software in preparation for the commissioning of the first batch of facilities" and "Progress update on design competitions" at the next meeting. Members also noted that the Administration proposed to defer the discussion on the item of "Co-operation among government departments in the development of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD")", which was originally scheduled for discussion at the next meeting.

3. Pointing out that the Joint Subcommittee had the responsibility to monitor the financial arrangements of the WKCD project, Miss Tanya CHAN considered that the Joint Subcommittee should discuss the financial arrangements of the WKCD project. The Chairman informed members that Miss Tanya CHAN's letter dated 29 March 2012 requesting the Joint Subcommittee to discuss the financial arrangements for the WKCD project and the Administration's written response to issues raised in Miss CHAN's letter had been issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1793/11-12(01) and (02) respectively.

4. Mr James TO, Mr Alan LEONG and Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che supported the view expressed by Miss Tanya CHAN. Mr LEONG requested that the Joint Subcommittee should discuss the subject matter before the end of the current term of the Legislative Council. To facilitate members' understanding of the financial arrangements of the WKCD project, he reiterated his earlier request for information on the financial assessments of the project prepared by the three selected Conceptual Plan ("CP") Consultants based on their proposed CPs.

5. After discussion, members agreed to discuss the following three items at the meeting scheduled for 18 June 2012 -

- (a) Development of cultural software in preparation for the commissioning of the first batch of facilities;

Action

- (b) Progress update on design competitions; and
- (c) Financial arrangements for the WKCD project.

(Post-meeting note: The meeting was subsequently rescheduled for 27 June 2012 at 8:30 am.)

II. Planning and development of M+

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1727/11-12(03) and (04)]

6. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) ("DSHA(3)), Chief Executive Officer of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("CEO/WKCDA") and Executive Director, M+ of WKCDA ("ED, M+/WKCDA") briefed members on the planning and development of M+, details of which were set out in the relevant paper.

M+ collections and acquisitions

7. Ms Cyd HO noted from the paper that though the vantage-point was different, M+'s strategy for collections was not that different from any other leading museum in the West. She enquired how the vantage-point of M+ was different from the leading museums in the West.

8. ED, M+/WKCDA advised that as the Museum Advisory Group expressed in its report of 23 November 2006 to the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities ("CACF") of WKCD, M+ would be a single cultural institution with its mission to focus on the 20th and 21st century visual culture, broadly defined, from a Hong Kong perspective, the perspective of now, and with a global vision. M+ would set for itself the highest international standards comparable with those of other world-leading museums. Citing the Centre Pompidou in Paris which was one of the world's most important museums of modern art as an example, M+ would be a museum for Hong Kong people and would create a friendly and open environment for the public, rather than standing aloof and inaccessible. M+ would be a hub for visual culture in WKCD, providing spaces for exchanges, not only within different fields of visual culture but also between performing arts ("PA") and visual arts. M+ would reflect this interdisciplinary exchange by exploring the interface among visual art, design, architecture, film and various aspects of popular culture. While integration and cross-fertilization would be the main theme of M+, it was also vital that the specificities of particular art disciplines could be presented. For example, ink art had a long history that spanned over thousand years in China and was an integral and unique genre in contemporary

Action

art. ED, M+/WKCDA added that there were a number of local artists who had started to gain international recognition and M+ would be a place to display their modern and contemporary artworks.

9. Ms Cyd HO was concerned how modern life could be presented through ink art, a traditional Chinese artistic medium. ED, M+/WKCDA advised that WKCDA had been discussing with the Hong Kong Museum of Art and the Ink Society on collaboration in fostering a broader understanding and appreciation of modern and contemporary art that was based on or inspired by ink art, and promoting ink art within a contemporary context.

10. Mrs Sophie LEUNG said that she had visited an exhibition organized by the Asia Society Hong Kong Centre and was greatly impressed by one of the exhibits "Bodhi Obfuscatus" (Space-Baby) by Mr Michael JOO, which was a Gandharan Buddha surrounded by fiber optic cables, mirrors, live surveillance cameras and monitors. She enquired whether M+ would display art installations and artworks that bridged the culture and contemporary life through art and technology. ED, M+/WKCDA replied in the affirmative, saying that the collection and exhibitions of M+ would present rich cultural and deep historical roots in a contemporary way.

11. Mr Alan LEONG raised concern whether curators had enough room of freedom to decide on the artworks that they would purchase/display. He also enquired whether an artistic accountability system would be implemented in M+ where curators would be fully accountable for their decisions on acquisitions and the arrangement of exhibitions. CEO/WKCDA assured members that WKCDA would implement a management mechanism under which the curators could perform their work most effectively. ED, M+/WKCDA advised that the curators had different specialties and were responsible for acquisition of collections and solicitation of donations in their particular art disciplines. An acquisition policy would be worked out to outline the direction and the principles that M+ would take into account when acquiring collections. Guidelines would also be drawn up to avoid any possible conflict of interest of curators in purchasing artworks.

12. Miss Tanya CHAN enquired about the terms of reference and membership of the interim acquisition committee of M+. ED, M+/WKCDA responded that the interim acquisition committee was composed of members of the Museum Committee and would comprise not less than four members and not more than six members. The interim acquisition committee would be chaired by the Chairman of the Museum Committee. In response to Miss Tanya CHAN's further enquiry, ED, M+/WKCDA said that the permanent

Action

acquisition committee would comprise Hong Kong based experts outside the Museum Committee and one or two international experts might be invited to join the committee.

Training and recruitment of curators

13. The Deputy Chairman was concerned about the training and recruitment of curators and enquired about the progress in this respect. Expressing similar concern, Ms Cyd HO said that as pointed out in the paper, the main challenge in capacity building in the museum field was related to specialized roles such as exhibition-registrars, master packers, and conservators because there was no formal training or formal training was not sufficient.

14. ED, M+/WKCDA assured members that he did not envisage great difficulties in recruiting curatorial staff. He advised that the M+ team had grown from a headcount of three in 2011 to 10 full-time staff plus three short-term contract staff, with seven more full-time posts being advertised. With the clearer understanding of the mission and vision of M+, the new recruitment announcements had garnered extraordinary interest on all fronts. Many of the more recent recruits were world-class curators. While the majority of the curatorial team had a Hong Kong background, there were also members from other parts of the world who had rich experiences working in major museums in Europe and the United States. ED, M+/WKCDA further advised that M+ had three main routes in capacity building, including internship programmes, in-house training in collaboration with major overseas museums, and hiring of overseas experts for expertise transfer.

15. Mr Alan LEONG raised concern about the nurturing of artists/arts professionals and whether arts education could measure up to and complement the hardware development in WKCD. He asked whether WKCDA had any communication with the Education Bureau ("EB") on how schools could help nurture arts professionals. CEO/WKCDA responded that WKCDA had been communicating with EB, the advisory body for the curriculum development and local tertiary institutions on how WKCDA could collaborate with them to nurture arts professionals in Hong Kong.

Audience building and programme development

16. Referring to paragraph 10 of the information paper for the meeting, the Chairman sought information on the collaboration between WKCDA and artists to build up audiences to support the development of WKCD. ED, M+/WKCDA advised that the main strategy for building audiences was to

Action

organize pre-opening exhibition programmes on the WKCD site and in different parts of Hong Kong in the coming years, and after 2014, in the first of a series of Arts Pavilions that would be built in WKCD. The first public project was the M+ Bamboo Theatre Exhibition and Bamboo Cinema held during the Chinese New Year in 2012, which had attracted 4 000 visitors in one day. The latest initiative to bring arts closer to the public and to bring life to the WKCD project was the Mobile M+: Yau Ma Tei during the period from 14 May to 10 June 2012. The exhibitions of the Mobile M+: Yau Ma Tei would be held at six different sites in Yau Ma Tei including shops, offices, a park and an empty lot under a flyover. There were other projects under planning which also had a strong education component to instill knowledge about contemporary visual culture among the public.

17. Prof Patrick LAU enquired whether the Arts Pavilions were permanent or temporary venues for exhibitions. ED, M+/WKCDA responded that in addition to CACF, a number of Arts Pavilions would be built in WKCD. WKCDA would use these pavilions as the temporary platform for realizing visual art and culture events before Phase I of M+ was completed in 2017. In 2014, the first of the five proposed permanent Arts Pavilions, each with a size of about 600 square metres, would be built in WKCD for smaller exhibitions and arts performances.

18. In response to the Deputy Chairman's concern about how M+ could encourage audience participation, ED, M+/WKCDA said that M+ would create a welcoming environment and strive to create the highest quality experience possible for the audience. He was confident that convenient access would help increase public exposure to arts and culture.

The architectural design competition for M+

19. In response to Prof Patrick LAU's enquiry about the architectural design competition for M+, CEO/WKCDA advised that WKCDA planned to launch the competition in July or August 2012. As to whether it was an open competition or an Expression of Interest ("EOI") exercise for pre-qualification, WKCDA would make the decision in the light of the experience of the design competition for the Xiqu Centre, for which participants would be shortlisted through the EOI selection process.

20. Ms Emily LAU said that it was Hong Kong people's expectation that landmark facilities would be built in WKCD, given its prime location at the waterfront. While it was important to contain the project cost within the budget, she hoped that WKCDA would ensure that the design competitions for the

Action

major CACF would allow sufficient room for creativity. CEO/WKCDA took note of Ms LAU's views.

21. Pointing out that the leading overseas museums such as the Guggenheim Museum Bilbao had provided enormous storage space for collections, Mr Alan LEONG enquired about the museum storage facility in M+. ED, M+/WKCDA responded that in planning for M+, the need for providing sufficient spaces for exhibition, storage, conservation, and workshop facilities had been taken into account. The Phase I of M+ was scheduled for completion in the end of 2017 and there would be Phase II of M+ to cater for further development of the museum.

III. Communication and co-operation with the arts community

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1727/11-12(05) and (06)]

22. DSHA(3) and CEO/WKCDA updated members on WKCDA's communication and co-operation with the arts community in the development of WKCD, details of which were set out in the relevant paper.

23. Noting that WKCDA had maintained regular communication with local arts community through various channels such as engagement meetings over the past years, Mr Alan LEONG asked what were the main concerns of local arts groups. Pointing out that the small and medium-sized arts groups and non-main stream art groups also formed an integral part in the development of arts in Hong Kong, he was concerned about the distribution of funding resources amongst arts groups.

24. Executive Director, Performing Arts of WKCDA ("ED, PA/WKCDA") responded that engaging and building partnerships with the local arts community and gauging views from the arts groups were his main work in his first year at WKCDA. The arts community in general expressed the view that the WKCD project was long-awaited and was concerned about whether the vision of the WKCD project would be realized and how WKCDA would collaborate with the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD"), and the Hong Kong Arts Development Council ("HKADC"). However, their concerns in this respect had been eased after the Development Plan ("DP") of the WKCD had been finalized. Over the past year, WKCDA had been organizing and supporting different interim programmes such as bamboo theatre, music events, community cultural projects, forums and workshops in co-operation with PA community to build talents and audiences, and to develop cultural software for the benefit of WKCD. WKCDA would continue

Action

dedicating its efforts to maintaining effective communication with stakeholders, the relevant government departments and HKADC to tie in with the commissioning of the first batch of PA facilities starting from 2015/2016. ED, PA/WKCDA further advised that Phase 1 PA facilities would be completed starting from 2015/2016 while Mega Performance Venue and Musical Theatre would be subject to alternative financing arrangement. Situated inside the Park, Freespace would be a venue for contemporary music performances and cross-boundary performances. The Phase 1 PA facilities would cater for the needs of arts groups of different scales.

25. Ms Cyd HO suggested that the Joint Subcommittee should consider inviting the arts groups to give their views on the development of WKCD, the needs of the arts community, and the collaboration between WKCDA, LCSD, HKADC and the arts community. Expressing support for Ms HO's suggestion, Mr Alan LEONG said that the arts groups should also be invited to give their views on the distribution of funding resources amongst arts groups.

Clerk

26. At the suggestion of the Chairman, members agreed that stakeholders in the arts sector should be invited to give written views on the work of WKCDA and the latest development of the WKCD project. Mr Alan LEONG requested that the written submissions received should be forwarded to members for consideration before the next meeting scheduled for June 2012.

27. The Deputy Chairman expressed concern whether the works of the Phase 1 facilities in WKCD could be completed on schedule in 2015/2016. CEO/WKCDA responded that WKCDA had submitted DP to the Town Planning Board ("TPB") on 30 December 2011. TPB had agreed to DP on 9 March 2012 and DP was being exhibited for public inspection starting from 30 March 2012 for a period of two months under the Town Planning Ordinance. According to its work plan, WKCDA would implement the WKCD project in two phases and the construction works would be commenced gradually in 2013, with the aim of completing the Arts Pavilion and part of the Great Park around 2014-2015, followed by the Xiqu Centre around the end of 2015. He added that WKCDA's work for the architectural design competitions for the Xiqu Centre and M+ was underway, and the deadline for submissions of EOI in respect of the Xiqu Centre had been 10 April 2012.

Action

IV. Any other business

28. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 September 2012

**Proceedings of the meeting of
the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of
the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Monday, 23 April 2012, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
000303 - 001723	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Mr James TO Mr Alan LEONG Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che	Members' discussion about the proposed items for discussion at the next meeting in June 2012.	
001724 - 002808	Chairman Admin WKCDA	<u>Item II – Planning and development of M+</u> Briefing by the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") on the planning and development of M+ [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/11-12(03)].	
002809 - 003459	Chairman Ms Cyd HO WKCDA	Ms Cyd HO's enquiry about how the vantage-point of M+ was different from the leading museums in the world.	
003500 - 004333	Mr Alan LEONG WKCDA	Mr Alan LEONG's concern whether curators had enough room of freedom to decide on the artworks that they would purchase/display and enquiry whether an artistic accountability system would be implemented in M+.	
004334 - 005010	Chairman WKCDA	WKCDA's elaboration on the vantage-point of M+ and the collaboration between M+ and artists in projects on different sites in Hong Kong to reach out to the public.	
005011 - 005338	Miss Tanya CHAN WKCDA	Miss Tanya CHAN's concern about the composition and the terms of reference of the interim acquisition committee of M+.	
005339 - 010036	Deputy Chairman WKCDA	The Deputy Chairman's concern about training and recruitment of curators and how M+ could encourage audience participation.	
010037 - 010617	Ms Cyd HO WKCDA	Ms Cyd HO's concern about how ink art could be promoted in a contemporary context and the lack of formal training for practitioners in the museum field.	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
010618 - 011255	Mr Alan LEONG WKCDA	Mr Alan LEONG's concern about audience building programmes organized by WKCDA and the nurturing of art professionals.	
011256 - 011923	Prof Patrick LAU WKCDA Chairman	Prof Patrick LAU's enquiry about whether the Arts Pavilions were permanent or temporary venues for exhibitions and the design competition for M+.	
011924 - 012545	Chairman Admin WKCDA	<u>Item III – Communication and Co-operation with the Arts Community</u> Briefing by the Administration and WKCDA on communication and co-operation with the arts community [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/11-12(05)].	
012546 - 013256	Mr Alan LEONG WKCDA	Mr Alan LEONG's enquiry about the main concerns raised by the arts groups at stakeholder engagement meetings.	
013257 - 014156	Ms Cyd HO Chairman WKCDA	Ms Cyd HO's suggestion that the Joint Subcommittee should consider inviting the arts community to give views on the development of WKCD, the genuine needs of the arts community, and the collaboration between WKCDA, the Leisure and Cultural Services Department, the Hong Kong Arts Development Council and the arts community. Members' agreement to the Chairman's suggestion that stakeholders in the arts sector should be invited to give written views on the work of WKCDA and the latest development of the WKCD project.	Clerk to follow up (para 26 of the minutes)
014157 - 014533	Deputy Chairman WKCDA	The Deputy Chairman's concern whether the works of the arts and cultural facilities of Phase 1 of WKCD project could be completed on schedule in 2015/2016.	
014534 - 015255	Ms Emily LAU Chairman WKCDA	Ms Emily LAU's view that sufficient room for creativity should be allowed for the design competitions for the major arts and cultural facilities.	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
015256 - 015559	Chairman Mrs Sophie LEUNG WKCDA	Mrs Sophie LEUNG's enquiry about whether M+ would display art installations and artworks that bridged the culture and contemporary life through art and technology like the "Bodhi Obfuscatus" (Space Baby) created by Mr Michael JOO.	
015600 - 020135	Mr Alan LEONG Chairman WKCDA	Mr Alan LEONG's requests that written submissions received should be forwarded to members for consideration before the next meeting scheduled for June 2012 and that WKCDA should provide information on the financial assessments of the project prepared by the three selected Conceptual Plan ("CP") Consultants based on their proposed CPs.	Clerk to follow up (para 26 of the minutes) WKCDA to provide the required information (para 4 of the minutes)
020136 - 020235	Chairman	Date of next meeting	