

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2801/11-12
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/1/10

Panel on Welfare Services

Subcommittee on Retirement Protection

Minutes of the 10th meeting
held on Saturday, 21 April 2012, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Member absent : Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Public officers attending : Item I

Mrs Polly CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare
(Welfare) 4

Mr Simpson LO
Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare (Welfare) 4B

Miss Emmy WONG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services
and the Treasury (Financial Services) 3

**Attendance by : Item I
invitation**

Cleaning Workers' Union

Mr SZE Ching-wee
Organizer

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Mr CHOW Ho-ding
Chairman of Young DAB

Hong Kong Women Workers' Association

Miss CHENG Yee-ying
Organizer

Elderly Council of Tsuen Kwai Tsing District

Mr LAM Tsz-chung
Secretary

Alliance for Universal Pension

Mr AU YEUNG Kwun-tung
Organizer

Hong Kong Catholic Commission for Labour Affairs

Ms LAW Pui-shan
Policy Research Officer

The Grassrooteer

Ms LEE Choi-kwan
Chairlady

Lee Wah House MAC

Mr TSANG Lui-keung
Chairman

Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group

Mr CHUNG Hou-ping
Member

Labour Rights Commune

Mr WONG Chi-Kwan
Member

Care-takers' Concern

Ms CHU Moon-chun
Organizing Secretary

Chinese Grey Power

Ms LO Siu-lan
Chairlady

Kwai Chung Estate Residents' Rights Concern Group

Ms LEUNG Shu-mui
Committee Member

Grassroots Development Centre

Mr NG Kin-wing
Organizer

Hong Kong Federation of the Blind

Mr CHEUNG Kai-fu
Member

Mr TSANG Chun-yuk
Organizer

The Professional Commons

Mr CHAN Kai-ming
Research Manager

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr CHUA Hoi-wai
Business Director, Policy Research and Advocacy

Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (New Territories)

Mr CHAN Yan-kam
Assistant Program Officer

Women Workers' Cooperative

Ms PONG Lai-hing

Hong Kong Homemakers' Alliance

Ms NG Yin-yung
Representative

零散工權益關注組

Miss CHENG Ping-ping
Representative

Hong Kong Social Security Society

Miss H T CHOW
Executive Committee Member

葵芳邨零散工權益關注組

Miss WONG Sze-man
Representative

Civic Party

Miss Bonnie LEUNG
Research team member of universal retirement
protection scheme

Mr WONG Yun-tat, Member of Kwai Tsing
District Council

葵涌邨勞工權益關注組

Mr Simon LEUNG Kam-wai
Representative

New Arrival Women League

Miss LAM Hiu-fan
Organizer

Hong Kong Domestic Workers' Union

Ms CHUNG Pik-mui

Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres

Mr NGAI Chi-tat
Advocacy and Training Officer

Hong Kong Christian Industrial Committee

Mr Frankie PANG King-man
Executive Secretary

全民退保關注組

Mr CHIU See-poon

關注長者權益大聯盟

Mr OR Jee-king
Member

爭取基層生活保障聯盟

Ms LAM Lai-ling

Industrial Relation Institute

Miss LAI Yuen-mei
Organizer

中產關注退休保障陣綫

Ms YIM Pik-fan

North District Employment Concern Group

Ms Venny KWOK
Convener

New Territories Evangelical Ambassador

Mr CHOW King
Group Member

Academic for Universal Pension

Mr Nicholas CHAN Hok-fung
Chairperson

HK No MPF

Mr CHAN Tsz-ting
Member

Government Mod 1 Staff General Union

Mr TSUI Yat-keung
Vice Chairperson

耆樂融融關注組

Mr FAN Ping-kay
Representative

Sham Shui Po Community Association

Mr LAU Cheuk-kei
Director

Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood

Mr YUM Kwok-tung
Representative

Social Policy Committee of the Hong Kong Federation
of Trade Unions

Mr LUK Chung-hung
Deputy director

Clerk in attendance : Miss Betty MA
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in attendance : Ms Maisie LAM
Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1903/10-11(01), CB(2)2350/10-11(01), CB(2)2511/10-11(01) to (02), CB(2)149/11-12(01), CB(2)367/11-12(01), CB(2)822/11-12(01), CB(2)1081/11-12(01), CB(2)1371/11-12(01), CB(2)1685/11-12(01) to (03), CB(2)1773/11-12(01) to (13), CB(2)1795/11-12(01) and CB(2)1807/11-12(01) to (08)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 44 deputations on the retirement protection regime in Hong Kong. The majority of the deputations held the view that given the shortcomings of the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection, the piecemeal approach adopted by the Administration in improving the operation of the existing retirement protection system would not help effectively respond to the challenges of an ageing population. There was a general consensus of the community for the introduction of a universal retirement protection scheme in the light of the inefficacy of the existing three-pillar retirement model. They were in support of a non-means-tested retirement protection system, and expressed great reservations about the introduction of a means-tested mechanism. To help alleviate old-age poverty, it was incumbent upon the next Government to establish a dedicated task force so as to promulgate a concrete timetable for conducting public consultation on the implementation

Action

details of a universal retirement protection scheme.

3. Members shared the view of many deputations on the need to address the problem of old-age poverty so as to ensure that all elders can lead a dignified and financially secured life in their old age. They stressed that as population ageing was taking place, the coming five years would be the last golden opportunity for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme in order to make the scheme sustainable. Members strongly requested the next Government to kick start the study on the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme, with a view to launching an extensive public consultation on the options and implementation details, and putting into place a non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme before it was too late. They took the view that the issue should be followed up with the next Government in the next legislative term.

4. The Administration said that as the latest population projections indicated that the number of elders aged 65 or above would surge, the burden on public finance resulting from a non-means-tested pension scheme would increase drastically over time. It was necessary to direct the Government's resources to those genuinely in need and ensure long-term fiscal sustainability. In any event, it was not an opportune time for the Administration to make fundamental changes to the retirement protection system in Hong Kong when the Central Policy Unit ("CPU") was refining its studies on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong in the light of the latest developments and the results of the territory-wide household survey on the latest economic situation of the elderly and their retirement plans which were expected to be available by the end of 2012. Upon completion of its work on refining the studies, CPU would submit the overall study findings and recommendations to the Administration for review and consideration of the way forward. Members urged CPU to make public the findings of the household survey and its overall study on retirement protection. The Administration responded that CPU would consider whether to release the findings of its studies on a case-by-case basis.

II. Date of next meeting

5. The Chairman reminded members that the next meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on 4 May 2012. The Administration was requested to provide, prior to the next meeting of the Subcommittee, its written response to issues raised by members at previous meetings, and the statistical data relating to retirement protection requested by the deputations

Action

which had put forward their retirement protection models for the consideration of the Subcommittee. The Chairman also requested the attendance of the relevant Principal Officials and the Head of CPU at the next Subcommittee meeting.

(Post-meeting note : The next meeting of the Subcommittee originally scheduled for 4 May 2012 was rescheduled to 8 May 2012.)

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:05 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 September 2012

**Proceedings of the 10th meeting of the
Subcommittee on Retirement Protection
on Saturday, 21 April 2012, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Meeting with deputation and the Administration</i>			
000608 - 001046	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001047 - 001406	Cleaning Workers' Union Chairman	Presentation of views Supported the implementation of universal retirement protection, as the existing arrangement to allow employers to use the Mandatory Provident Fund ("MPF") accrued benefits to offset the severance payments or long service payments ("the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement") had resulted in the remaining balances far from adequate to support the retirement life of the low-income earners under contract employment.	
001407 - 001720	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong ("DAB") Chairman	Presentation of views Its proposed non-contributory yet sustainable Three-tier Retirement Protection Old Age Pension Scheme, which comprised a non-means-tested first tier scheme, and the means-tested second and third tier schemes for which the tests could be as simple as making a self-declaration, would provide retirement benefits for all elders aged 65 or above, with those vulnerable elders who were most in need of assistance entitled to a higher level of pension payment. The proposed Scheme would complement the existing old age Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") cases and the MPF system.	
001721 - 001956	Hong Kong Women Workers' Association Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(01)] (a) the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection, in particular the MPF system, was inadequate for protecting the retirement life for low-income female earners and housewives not in workforce; and (b) it was incumbent upon the Administration to expedite the implementation of a universal retirement protection system to ensure that all elders could lead to a financially-secured life in their twilight years.	
001957 - 002315	Elderly Council of Tsuen Kwai Tsing District Chairman	Presentation of views Given its huge fiscal reserve, it was financially viable for the Administration to introduce a universal	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		retirement protection system to enable all elders aged 65 or above to entitle to a monthly pension payment of \$3,000 without the need to undergo any means tests, so as to recognise their contribution to the development of Hong Kong when they were young.	
002316 - 002629	Alliance for Universal Pension Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(01)]</p> <p>(a) expressed disappointment at the lack of responses by the Administration to the various retirement protection models proposed by the deputations for the consideration of the Subcommittee, and the non-attendance of Principal Officials at the meetings of the Subcommittee; and</p> <p>(b) the next term of Government should look squarely the challenges to be brought about by an ageing population and set up a dedicated task force to implement a universal retirement protection scheme without further delay.</p>	
002630 - 002947	Mr WONG Yun-tat Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>The Administration should implement a universal retirement protection system as early as practicable, as the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection, in particular the MPF system which had the shortcomings of low return, high management fees of funds and the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement, was ineffective to safeguard the retirement life of employees not being employed under a continuous contract, the low-income earners and persons not participating in the workforce.</p>	
002948 - 003259	Hong Kong Catholic Commission for Labour Affairs Chairman	<p>Presentation of views -</p> <p>(a) the MPF system was not entirely satisfactory as it did not cover persons not in employment and allowed the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement. Its performance also fluctuated considerably according to the economic conditions and the accrued benefits for the current generation of older working population were limited; and</p> <p>(b) given the shortcomings of the MPF system, the difficulty for the low-income earners in young age to accumulate adequate savings for their twilight years and the social stigma of the CSSA Scheme, the next term of Government should expeditiously implement a universal retirement protection system.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
003300 - 003531	The Grassrooteer Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>It was incumbent upon the Administration to kick start the public consultation on a non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme to provide adequate retirement protection for all elders, in particular the housemakers.</p>	
003532 - 003849	Lee Wah House MAC Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(02)]</p> <p>(a) the private savings and the accrued benefits derived under the MPF system could, in most cases, support the life of low-income earners for only a few years after retirement; and</p> <p>(b) given the need for elders to possess meagre savings so as to give them a sense of financial security at their old age, elders should be eligible to receive retirement benefits funded by general revenue without the need to undergo any means test.</p>	
003850 - 004203	Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(03)]</p> <p>(a) the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection, in particular the CSSA Scheme which many poor elders did not apply for various reasons, was inadequate for protecting the retirement life for all elders;</p> <p>(b) the Central Policy Unit should make public the findings of its studies on retirement protection system in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(c) given that the findings of the survey conducted by the Hong Kong Polytechnic University in 2010 revealed that about 80% of the respondents expressed support for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme in Hong Kong, the next term of Government should set up a dedicated task force to take forward the implementation of the scheme and conduct an extensive public consultation on the implementation details.</p>	
004204 - 004427	Labour Rights Commons Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(04)]</p> <p>The next term of Government should launch an extensive public consultation on its universal retirement protection model and the implementation details. The SP/LSP offsetting arrangement should be scrapped before the introduction of the scheme.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
004428 - 004741	Care-takers' Concerns Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(05)]</p> <p>Supported the expeditious implementation of a non-means-tested Universal Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by the Alliance for Universal Pension, which would benefit not only the grassroot elders, but also the elderly parents of the middle-income young generation, in particular those families who might have difficulty to support their parents.</p>	
004742 - 005108	Chinese Grey Power Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(06)]</p> <p>It was incumbent upon the Administration to implement a non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme, as the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection was ineffective to protect the retirement life for all elders.</p>	
005109 - 005318	Kwai Chung Estate Residents' Rights Concern Gorup Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(07)]</p> <p>The Administration should abolish the requirement that elders had to apply for CSSA on a household, rather than an individual, basis. Given that there was a broad consensus in the community to implement a non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme, the next term of Government should take forward the matter in an expeditious manner.</p>	
005319 - 005631	Grassroots Development Centre Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(08)]</p> <p>Universal retirement protection system should be implemented in a just society to afford elders of all financial status an equal opportunity to receive retirement benefits.</p>	
005632 - 005958	Hong Kong Federation of the Blind Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(09)]</p> <p>(a) many persons with disabilities were not covered by the MPF system as they hardly had the opportunity to enter the workforce and secure stable employment. The Administration should require large corporations to employ a specified quota of employees with disabilities;</p> <p>(b) persons with disabilities should be allowed to apply for CSSA on an individual, rather than a household, basis; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) there was an imminent need to implement a universal retirement protection system to provide a monthly pension payment of \$3,000 to all elders.	
005959 - 010313	The Professional Commons Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(10)]</p> <p>(a) the Administration should take heed of the general consensus of the community for the introduction of a universal retirement protection system; and</p> <p>(b) its proposed Universal Old Age Pension Scheme which required tripartite contributions from Government, employers and employees would provide all elders aged 65 or above a monthly pension payment of \$3,000 and was still sustainable in 2060. The Administration should provide sufficient statistical data to facilitate the community to verify and assess the assumptions and projections adopted in individual retirement protection models.</p>	
010314 - 010632	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(02)]</p> <p>(a) there was a broad consensus in the community to implement a universal retirement protection scheme. The Administration should study the Universal Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by the Alliance for Universal Pension and conduct an extensive public consultation on the subject with a view to forging a consensus and implementing the scheme within three years; and</p> <p>(b) the introduction of a special monthly Old Age Allowance ("OAA") of \$2,200 for elderly who were in need after a simple declaration of income and assets as pledged in the Chief Executive-elect's Election Manifesto should be considered as an interim measure to assist the elders pending the introduction of universal retirement protection. The next Government should also review the MPF system and expeditiously abolish the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement.</p>	
010633 - 010939	Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (New Territories) Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>In line with the principle underlying the existing Government policies of providing all local children with 12-year free education and all local residents highly subsidised public healthcare services, a</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme should be implemented to provide adequate retirement protection for all elders.	
010940 - 011257	Women Workers' Cooperative Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Given the shortcomings of the MPF system, which included the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement, high management fees of funds and fluctuation in return, as well as the difficulty for grassroot female workers to save up for retirement purpose, a universal retirement protection system was deemed necessary.</p>	
011258 - 011600	Hong Kong Homemakers' Alliance Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(11)]</p> <p>(a) the existing MPF system and the CSSA Scheme which required applicants to apply for CSSA on a household basis could not protect the retirement life for the economically inactive housemakers;</p> <p>(b) the Three-tier Retirement Protection Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by DAB could not afford elders of all financial status an equal opportunity to entitle to retirement benefits and would create a labelling effect on recipients under the second and third tier schemes; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration should expeditiously implement a sustainable non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme to enable all elders to live with dignity. Other complementary measures to subsidise the daily living, housing and healthcare expenses of the elderly should also be put in place.</p>	
011601 - 011843	零散工權益關注組 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Given that employees not being employed under a continuous contract would not be covered by the MPF system and they had limited savings to support their retirement life, there was a need for the Administration to set up an inter-departmental task force to implement a non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme.</p>	
011844 - 012203	Hong Kong Social Security Society Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Retirement protection was a right to which all elderly should be entitled. The Administration should study the various retirement protection models proposed in the community, including the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Universal Retirement Protection Scheme proposed by the Society, with a view to setting an appropriate level of retirement benefits for the implementation of a sustainable non-means-tested universal retirement protection scheme.</p>	
012204 - 012517	<p>葵芳邨零散工權益關注組 Chairman</p>	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(03)]</p> <p>(a) the CSSA Scheme was ineffective to safeguard the retirement life of all needy elders, as many vulnerable elders did not apply for CSSA for reasons such as its labelling effect and the requirement to apply on a household basis; and</p> <p>(b) the MPF system had the shortcoming of not covering persons not in the workforce or could not secure a stable employment, and the current generation of retired elderly. In addition, the MPF system could only provide very limited retirement protection to low-income earners.</p>	
012518 - 012836	<p>Civic Party Chairman</p>	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(04)]</p> <p>(a) in the light of the inefficacy of the existing three-pillar mode for retirement protection to protect the retirement life of all elders and the trend of an ageing population with a growing elderly dependency ratio, the Administration should not continue to rely on the CSSA Scheme which was funded by general reserve to meet the increasing demand for assistance brought about by an ageing population; and</p> <p>(b) the Universal Retirement Protection Fund proposed by the Civic Party suggested no increase in taxation, and no increase in the contributions of employers and employees as compared with the existing MPF contributions. Yet it was still sustainable in 2060 to provide a retirement benefit of \$3,000 per month (in real terms) to all elders aged over 65.</p>	
012837 - 013200	<p>葵涌邨勞工權益關注組 Chairman</p>	<p>Presentation of views -</p> <p>(a) given the non-provision of coverage under the MPF system for employees not being employed under a continuous contract and the difficulty for the low-income earners to save up for retirement purpose, the Administration should immediately conduct an extensive</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>public consultation on universal retirement protection scheme with a view to forging a consensus in the community; and</p> <p>(b) a retirement protection scheme should be premised on the principle that it should be non-means-tested so that all elders aged 65 or above would be eligible to entitle to retirement benefits under the scheme and live with dignity in their twilight years.</p>	
013201 - 013522	New Arrival Women League Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(05)]</p> <p>A universal retirement protection system was deemed necessary, as the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection could not protect the retirement life of the new arrival women who, in most cases, had difficulty to secure an employment in Hong Kong and were low-income earners or housemakers.</p>	
013523 - 013846	Hong Kong Domestic Workers' Union Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>The next Government should implement a universal retirement protection system to safeguard the retirement life of the domestic workers, as they were not employed under a continuous contract and did not enjoy any employment benefits, were not covered by the MPF system and had meagre savings.</p>	
013847 - 014158	Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres Chairman	<p>Presentation of views -</p> <p>(a) supported the implementation of a contributory and non-means-tested universal retirement protection system as the imposition of a means test, such as the pension system proposed by DAB, would create a labelling effect and could not enable all elders to live with dignity; and</p> <p>(b) a universal retirement protection system which required tripartite contributions from the Government, employers and employees would also had a wealth redistribution effect. Given that the higher-income group had also made contributions to the system, they should be entitled to retirement benefits regardless of their financial status.</p>	
014159 - 014426	Hong Kong Christian Industrial Committee Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Given the growing trend of working and old-age poverty, the Administration should implement a universal retirement protection system.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
014427 - 014755	全民退保關注組 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>A universal retirement protection system was viable and should be implemented without further delay so as to ensure that all elders could lead to a financially-secured life in their old age.</p>	
014756 - 015112	關注長者權益大聯盟 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1795/11-12(01)]</p> <p>In view of the lack of retirement protection, the social stigma associated with the CSSA Scheme and the reduction of financial support from adult children, some elders aged over 60 who could not accumulate adequate savings for their twilight years at their young age still had to be engaged in low-income work after retirement in order to meet their living expenses.</p>	
015113 - 015425	爭取基層生活保障聯盟 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views -</p> <p>(a) the existing three-pillar model of retirement protection was far from adequate to safeguard the well-being of the low-income earners, as the CSSA Scheme which required application on a household basis had a labelling effect on the recipients, the consolidation of the scattered MPF accounts would result in a reduction in the accrued benefits, and they had difficulty to save up for their retirement; and</p> <p>(b) the introduction of a special monthly OAA of \$2,200 for needy elderly as pledged in the Chief Executive-elect's Election Manifesto could not effectively address the problem of old-age poverty. The next Government should put forward a universal retirement protection proposal for an extensive public consultation with a view to implementing the scheme at the earliest possible time.</p>	
015426 - 015746	Industrial Relation Institute Chairman	<p>Presentation of views -</p> <p>(a) the Three-tier Retirement Protection Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by DAB and the special OAA for needy elders as pledged in the Chief Executive-elect's Election Manifesto could not provide effective retirement protection to all elders;</p> <p>(b) supported the implementation of a universal retirement protection system as it was the responsibility of the Administration to take care of the retirement life of the elders. In addition, it was considered unfair to require</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the working population to bear the investment risk under the MPF system; and</p> <p>(c) the contributory non-means-test universal retirement protection models proposed by the deputations were sustainable, as they were not financed on a pay-as-you-go basis, but were partially funded with Government contributions.</p>	
015747 - 020102	中產關注退休保障陣綫 Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Supported the early implementation of a universal retirement protection system as the statistical data compiled by the Census and Statistics Department showed that in the past decade, there was a decline in the labour participation rate for persons aged 25 to 49 and the birth rate, and inflation outpaced the growth in household income.</p>	
020103 - 020345	North District Employment Concern Group Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>Given that the existing MPF system did not cover the current generation of elders, it was necessary to implement a universal retirement protection system to recognise the contribution made by the elders in their young age to the development of Hong Kong.</p>	
020346 - 020530	New Territories Evangelical Embassador Chairman	<p>Presentation of views</p> <p>The Administration had the responsibility to safeguard the retirement life of the elders aged over 60 so that they could meet their living expenses in their twilight years.</p>	
020531 - 020848	Academic for Universal Pension Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(12)]</p> <p>(a) the research report entitled "Retirement Protection System in Selected Places" prepared by the Research Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat should incorporate statistical information relating to the income poverty rate of the elderly for comparison; and</p> <p>(b) given the serious problem of old-age poverty in Hong Kong, the Administration should expeditiously implement a non-means-tested universal retirement protection system.</p>	
020849 - 021200	HK No MPF Chairman	<p>Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1685/11-12(02)]</p> <p>Given its shortcoming of high management fees of funds, the Administration should immediately scrap</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		the MPF system and conduct an extensive public consultation on universal retirement protection scheme, with a view to implementing the scheme as early as possible.	
021201 - 021322	Government Mod 1 Staff General Union Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1773/11-12(13)] Opposed to the Three-tier Retirement Protection Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by DAB. Supported the Universal Old Age Pension Scheme proposed by the Alliance for Universal Pension which was in its view sustainable, and would explore the feasibility of other non-means-tested universal retirement protection models proposed by other deputations.	
021323 - 021645	耆樂融融關注組 Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(06)] Given that there had been a broad consensus in the community for the implementation of a universal retirement protection system, the Administration should immediately implement a non-means-tested scheme to safeguard the retirement life of all retired elders aged 60 or above. Elders with disabilities and frail elders should be entitled to the Disability Allowance and other supplements currently payable to them under the CSSA Scheme.	
021646 - 022007	Sham Shui Po Community Association Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(07)] The existing CSSA and Social Security Allowance Schemes were ineffective to ensure that elders could lead to a dignified and financially-secured life at their old age. Given the huge fiscal surplus and high per capita Gross Domestic Product of Hong Kong, the next Government should implement a universal retirement protection system, rather than introducing a special OAA which required a declaration of income and assets.	
022008 - 022326	Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1807/11-12(08)] Given the shortcomings of the MPF system which included the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement and the large number of default contribution cases; the requirement of CSSA to apply on a household basis, and the inadequacy of the CSSA and OAA payments, the Administration should expeditiously implement a non-means-tested universal retirement protection system.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
022327 - 022700	Social policy Committee of the Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions Chairman	Presentation of views In view of the inefficacy of the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection, the Administration should implement the following measures: abolishing the requirement of subjecting the applicants for Normal OAA to a income and assets test; increasing the amount of the CSSA and OAA payments and the Elderly Healthcare Voucher; scrapping the SP/LSP offsetting arrangement under the MPF system, in the short-term, and implementing a universal retirement protection scheme in the long run.	
022701 - 023037	Administration Chairman	The Administration's response to deputations' views - (a) efforts had been made to promote active and healthy ageing as an integral part of the elderly policy to enhance the elders' quality of life and enable them to live with dignity; and (b) the imposition of a means test on various assistance programmes funded by the general reserve would not necessarily create a labelling effect on the beneficiaries, and was necessary for identifying families/persons in need of the respective forms of assistance.	
023038 - 023430	Ms LI Fung-ying Chairman Administration	Ms LI Fung-ying's expression of disappointment at the lack of response of the Administration to the concerns raised by members and deputations on the shortcomings of the existing three-pillar model for retirement protection. The Panel on Welfare Services should follow up on the issue in the next term.	
023431 - 023843	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Chairman	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan's view that to recognise the contribution made by the elders to the community in their young age and to reduce old-age poverty, it was of paramount importance for the Administration to introduce a non-means-tested universal pension system.	
023844 - 024303	Mr Alan LEONG Chairman	Mr Alan LEONG's remarks that the Panel would follow up the issue on retirement protection in the next term, as the coming five years would be the last golden opportunity for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme.	
024304 - 024722	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's view that the introduction of a special OAA of \$2,200 as pledge by the Chief Executive-elect could not address the problem of old-age poverty. He called on the deputations to continue to fight for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme within the next term of Government.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
024723 - 025132	Mr IP Wai-ming Chairman Administration	Mr IP Wai-ming's concurrence of Mr Alan LEONG's view that the coming five years would be the last golden opportunity for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme; his expression of disappointment at the non-attendance of the Principal Officials at the meetings of the Subcommittee; and his request for making public the findings of the studies conducted by the Central Policy Unit ("CPU") on the retirement protection system in Hong Kong.	
025133 - 025632	Administration Chairman Mr IP Wai-ming Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>The Administration's response that -</p> <p>(a) as the latest population projections indicated that the number of elders aged 65 or above would surge, the burden on public finance resulting from a non-means-tested pension scheme would increase drastically over time. It was necessary to direct the Government's resources to those genuinely in need and ensure long-term fiscal sustainability; and</p> <p>(b) CPU was refining its studies on retirement protection taking into account the latest developments, and the findings of the territory-wide household survey on retirement planning and the financial situation of the elderly to be available by the end of 2012 the earliest. CPU would decide whether to make public the findings of its studies on a case-by-case basis.</p> <p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's request for the next Government to make public the findings of CPU's territory-wide household survey, and its refined studies on retirement protection.</p>	
025633 - 025702	Chairman	Extension of the meeting	
025703 - 025752	Academic for Universal Pension Chairman	Updates on the research report entitled "Retirement Protection System in Selected Places" prepared by the Research Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat.	
025753 - 025817	Elderly Council of Tsuen Kwai Tsing District Chairman	The deputation's request for the next Government to implement a universal retirement protection scheme within the first two years of tenure.	
025818 - 025939	Alliance for Universal Pension Chairman	The deputation's view that the next Government should expeditiously set up a dedicated task force and conduct a public consultation exercise with a view to implementing the universal retirement protection scheme within the next five years.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
025940 - 030038	耆樂融融關注組 Chairman	The deputation's remarks that there had been a broad consensus within the community for the implementation of a universal retirement protection scheme.	
030039 - 030536	Chairman Administration	The Administration was requested to co-ordinate the attendance of the relevant Principal Officials and the Head of CPU for the next Subcommittee meeting; and provide a written response to issues raised by members at previous meetings, and statistical data relating to retirement protection requested by the deputations which had put forward their retirement protection models for the consideration of the Subcommittee.	Admin
<i>Agenda item II – Any other business</i>			
030537 - 030546	Chairman	Concluding remarks	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 19 September 2012