

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 13

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 19 December 2012 at 11:00 am
and Thursday 20 December 2012 at 9:00 am**

Attendance

The attendance of Members, public officers and Clerks is in the Official Record of Proceedings.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u> | <u>L.N. No.</u> |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. Minimum Wage Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Notice 2012 (gazetted on 14.12.2012) | 186/2012 |
| 2. Employment Ordinance (Amendment of Ninth Schedule) Notice 2012 (gazetted on 14.12.2012) | 187/2012 |
| 3. Telecommunications (Carrier Licences) (Amendment) Regulation 2012 (gazetted on 14.12.2012) | 188/2012 |
| 4. Clubs (Safety of Premises) (Exclusion) (Amendment) Order 2012 (gazetted on 14.12.2012) | 189/2012 |

Other Papers

1. No. 39 - Queen Elizabeth Foundation for the Mentally Handicapped
Report and Accounts 2011-2012
(published on 12.12.2012)
2. No. 40 - Equal Opportunities Commission
Annual Report 2011/12
(published on 12.12.2012)
3. No. 41 - The Accounts of the Lotteries Fund 2011-12
(published on 12.12.2012)
4. No. 42 - Social Work Training Fund
Fifty-first Annual Report by the Trustee
for the year ending on 31 March 2012
(published on 13.12.2012)
5. No. 43 - Broadcasting Authority
Annual Report 2010-2012
(1 September 2010 — 31 March 2012)
(published on 13.12.2012)
6. No. 44 - The Legislative Council Commission
Annual Report 2011-2012
(published on 17.12.2012)
7. No. 45 - Fish Marketing Organization
Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2012
(published on 18.12.2012)
8. No. 46 - Vegetable Marketing Organization
Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2012
(published on 18.12.2012)
9. No. 47 - Marine Fish Scholarship Fund
Report for the period from 1 April 2011 to 31 March 2012
(published on 18.12.2012)
10. No. 48 - Report of the Independent Police Complaints Council
2011/12
(published on 18.12.2012)

11. No. 49 - Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, Hong Kong
2011-12 Annual Report
(published on 19.12.2012)
12. No. 50 - Grantham Scholarships Fund
Report of the Grantham Scholarships Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 August 2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
13. No. 51 - Brewin Trust Fund
Report of the Brewin Trust Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 30 June 2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
14. No. 52 - The Sir Murray MacLehose Trust Fund
Trustee's Report for the period of 1 April 2011 to 31 March 2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
15. No. 53 - Chinese Temples Fund
Report of the Chinese Temples Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
16. No. 54 - General Chinese Charities Fund
Report of the Chinese Temples Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
17. No. 55 - Police Welfare Fund
Annual Report 2011/2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
18. No. 56 - Annual Report on the Police Children's Education Trust and the Police Education and Welfare Trust 2011/2012
(published on 19.12.2012)
19. Report No. 8/12-13 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments
(published on 13.12.2012)

Address

Dr Hon Joseph LEE addressed the Council on the Report of the Independent Police Complaints Council 2011/12.

Questions

Six oral questions as set out on the Agenda (i.e. Questions 1 to 6) were put by Members and oral replies were given by the public officers.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 as set out on the Agenda were tabled.

Motion

Proposed resolution under the Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation Ordinance

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development moved the motion as set out on the Agenda. The President proposed and put the question on the motion. The question was agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under section 34(4) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Andrew LEUNG moved the motion as set out on the Agenda. The President proposed and put the question on the motion. The question was agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the motion as set out on the Agenda. The President's Deputy proposed the question on the motion. After Members and the public officers had respectively spoken, question on the motion was put. The motion was negatived (details of division in **Appendix 1**).

Motion on “Small and Medium Enterprises Financing Guarantee Scheme”

(During the debate on this motion, the meeting was suspended at 9:57 pm on 19 December 2012 and resumed at 9:00 am on 20 December 2012.)

Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan moved the motion as set out on the Agenda. The President proposed the question on the motion and ordered a joint debate on the motion and the amendments. After movers of amendments, Members and the public officer had respectively spoken, the President put the following questions:

| <u>Order of questions put</u> | <u>Decision taken</u> <u>(details of division,</u> <u>if any)</u> |
|---|---|
| — Hon Dennis KWOK’s amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM’s amendment as set out on the Agenda | Passed |
| — Hon Jeffrey LAM’s amendment as amended by Hon Dennis KWOK as set out on the Agenda | Passed |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon TANG Ka-piu as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Passed |
| — Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan’s motion as amended | Passed |

Motion on “Reviving the quality of local education and stopping the blind industrialization of education”

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the motion as set out on the Agenda. The President proposed the question on the motion and ordered a joint debate on the motion and the amendments. After movers of amendments, Members and the public officer had respectively spoken, the President put the following questions:

| <u>Order of questions put</u> | <u>Decision taken</u> <u>(details of division,</u> <u>if any)</u> |
|--|---|
| — Amendment moved by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG as set out on the Agenda | Negated (Appendix 2) |

| <u>Order of questions put</u> | <u>Decision taken (details of division, if any)</u> |
|--|---|
| — Motion moved without notice by Hon Andrew LEUNG to shorten the duration of the division bell for further divisions in relation to this motion and its amendments | Passed |
| — Amendment moved by Hon Claudia MO as set out on the Agenda | Passed (Appendix 3) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon Starry LEE as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Negatived (Appendix 4) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon Gary FAN as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Negatived (Appendix 5) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Dr Hon Helena WONG as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Passed (Appendix 6) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon IP Kin-yuen as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Passed (Appendix 7) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon MA Fung-kwok as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Passed |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon Charles Peter MOK as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Negatived (Appendix 8) |
| — Revised amendment moved by Hon Paul TSE as set out in the Official Record of Proceedings | Passed (Appendix 9) |
| — Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion as amended | Passed |

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 9 January 2013 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 2:16 pm on 20 December 2012.



(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

7 March 2013

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 19/12/2012
時間 TIME: 07:57:24 下午 PM

附錄 1
Appendix 1

動議 MOTION: 根據《立法會（權力及特權）條例》動議的擬議決議案
PROPOSED RESOLUTION UNDER THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (POWERS AND PRIVILEGES) ORDINANCE

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 32 | 31 | |
| 投票 Vote | 32 | 30 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 9 | 15 | |
| 反對 No | 23 | 15 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 反對 NO |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 反對 NO | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | 反對 NO |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | 反對 NO | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 反對 NO | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 反對 NO |
| 梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 反對 NO | Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | 反對 NO | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 反對 NO | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 反對 NO | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | 反對 NO | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 反對 NO | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | 贊成 YES |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 反對 NO | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鎭 CHAN Han-pan | 反對 NO |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 反對 NO | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | 反對 NO |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 反對 NO | Alice MAK | 反對 NO |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 反對 NO | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 反對 NO | SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 反對 NO | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 反對 NO | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | 反對 NO |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | 反對 NO | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 反對 NO |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | 反對 NO | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 反對 NO |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 01:56:54 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE
QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 18 | 否決 Negated |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 17 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 7 | 10 | |
| 反對 No | 11 | 5 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 5 | 2 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negated | 通過 Passed | |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 反對 NO |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 反對 NO | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 反對 NO | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 反對 NO | Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 反對 NO | Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 反對 NO | Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 棄權 ABSTAIN | SIN Chung-kai | |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 反對 NO | Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 反對 NO |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 01:59:49 下午 PM

附錄 3
Appendix 3

動議 MOTION: 毛孟靜議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CLAUDIA MO TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 毛孟靜 Claudia MO

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 13 | 14 | |
| 反對 No | 4 | 1 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 6 | 5 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 贊成 YES |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 贊成 YES | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 贊成 YES | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鎮 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 麥美娟 Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 贊成 YES | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 贊成 YES | 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 反對 NO | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:02:20 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 李慧琼議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經毛孟靜議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON STARRY LEE TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY HON CLAUDIA MO

動議人 MOVED BY: 李慧琼 Starry LEE

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 21 | 否決 Negatived |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 14 | 10 | |
| 反對 No | 1 | 5 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 8 | 5 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived | |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 NO |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | Ronny TONG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 反對 NO |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 贊成 YES |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 贊成 YES | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 贊成 YES |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 贊成 YES | Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 反對 NO | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 贊成 YES | Albert CHAN | 反對 NO |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 贊成 YES | Claudia MO | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 贊成 YES | WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | CHAN Chi-chuen | 反對 NO |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 贊成 YES | Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 棄權 ABSTAIN | LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 贊成 YES | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 贊成 YES | SIN Chung-kai | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 贊成 YES | Dr Helena WONG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 贊成 YES |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | | Christopher CHUNG | 贊成 YES |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:04:39 下午 PM

附錄 5
Appendix 5

動議 MOTION: 范國威議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經張超雄議員／毛孟靜議員／李慧琼議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON GARY FAN TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY ~~DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG / HON CLAUDIA MO / HON STARRY LEE~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 范國威 Gary FAN

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 6 | 10 | |
| 反對 No | 7 | 5 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 10 | 5 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 反對 NO |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 反對 NO | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 反對 NO | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 反對 NO | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬達國 MA Fung-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鎮 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 麥美娟 Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 反對 NO | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 反對 NO |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 反對 NO |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:06:58 下午 PM

附錄 6
Appendix 6

動議 MOTION: 黃碧雲議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經張超雄議員／毛孟靜議員／李慧琼議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY DR HON HELENA WONG TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY ~~DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG / HON CLAUDIA MO / HON STARRY LEE~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 21 | 通過 Passed |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 18 | 20 | |
| 反對 No | 0 | 0 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 5 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 YES |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 贊成 YES |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 YES | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 贊成 YES | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 贊成 YES |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 贊成 YES | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 贊成 YES | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 贊成 YES | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鎮 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 贊成 YES | Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 贊成 YES | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 贊成 YES | SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 贊成 YES | Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 贊成 YES |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | | Christopher CHUNG | 贊成 YES |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:09:23 下午 PM

附錄 7
Appendix 7

動議 MOTION: 葉建源議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經張超雄議員／毛孟靜議員／李慧琼議員／黃碧雲議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON IP KIN-YUEN TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY ~~DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG~~ / HON CLAUDIA MO / ~~HON STARRY LEE~~ / DR HON HELENA WONG

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 24 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 24 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 13 | 14 | |
| 反對 No | 4 | 1 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 7 | 5 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 贊成 YES | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 贊成 YES | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鏞 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 麥美娟 Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 贊成 YES | 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 反對 NO | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | 贊成 YES | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:12:47 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 莫乃光議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經張超雄議員／毛孟靜議員／李慧琼議員／范國威議員／黃碧雲議員／葉建源議員／馬逢國議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CHARLES PETER MOK TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY ~~DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG / HON CLAUDIA MO / HON STARRY LEE / HON GARY FAN /~~ DR HON HELENA WONG / HON IP KIN-YUEN / HON MA FUNG-KWOK

動議人 MOVED BY: 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 11 | 13 | |
| 反對 No | 0 | 2 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 14 | 5 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 反對 NO |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 反對 NO |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鏞 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 麥美娟 Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 贊成 YES | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | 贊成 YES | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9
日期 DATE: 20/12/2012
時間 TIME: 02:15:11 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 謝偉俊議員對葉劉淑儀議員就「重振本地教育質素，停止教育盲目產業化」所提，經張超雄議員／毛孟靜議員／李慧琼議員／范國威議員／黃碧雲議員／葉建源議員／馬逢國議員／葉乃光議員修正的議案，作出的修正案

AMENDMENT BY HON PAUL TSE TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIVING THE QUALITY OF LOCAL EDUCATION AND STOPPING THE BLIND INDUSTRIALIZATION OF EDUCATION" AS AMENDED BY ~~DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG~~ HON CLAUDIA MO / ~~HON STARRY LEE~~ HON GARY FAN / DR HON HELENA WONG / HON IP KIN-YUEN / HON MA FUNG-KWOK / ~~HON CHARLES PETER MOK~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 謝偉俊 Paul TSE

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 25 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 25 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 17 | 16 | |
| 反對 No | 0 | 0 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 8 | 4 | |
| 結果 Result | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed | 通過 Passed |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 出席 PRESENT |
| 涂謹申 James TO | | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 Dr LAU Wong-fat | | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | | 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 何秀蘭 Cyd HO | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 李慧琼 Starry LEE | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin | |
| 林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai | | 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP | 贊成 YES |
| 陳健波 CHAN Kin-por | 贊成 YES | 謝偉俊 Paul TSE | 贊成 YES |
| 梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau | 贊成 YES | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che | 贊成 YES | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | 贊成 YES |
| 吳亮星 NG Leung-sing | | 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man | |
| 何俊賢 Steven HO | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 毛孟靜 Claudia MO | 贊成 YES |
| 易志明 Frankie YICK | 贊成 YES | 田北辰 Michael TIEN | |
| 姚思榮 YIU Si-wing | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 馬逢國 MA Fung-kwok | 贊成 YES | 胡志偉 WU Chi-wai | |
| 莫乃光 Charles Peter MOK | 贊成 YES | 范國威 Gary FAN | 贊成 YES |
| 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | | 陳志全 CHAN Chi-chuen | 贊成 YES |
| 梁繼昌 Kenneth LEUNG | 贊成 YES | 陳恒鏞 CHAN Han-pan | |
| 郭偉強 KWOK Wai-keung | 贊成 YES | 陳家洛 Dr Kenneth CHAN | |
| 郭榮鏗 Dennis KWOK | 贊成 YES | 梁志祥 LEUNG Che-cheung | |
| 張華峰 Christopher CHEUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 麥美娟 Alice MAK | |
| 葉建源 IP Kin-yuen | 贊成 YES | 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES |
| 廖長江 Martin LIAO | 贊成 YES | 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 潘兆平 POON Siu-ping | 贊成 YES | 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | 贊成 YES |
| 鄧家彪 TANG Ka-piu | 贊成 YES | 黃碧雲 Dr Helena WONG | 贊成 YES |
| 盧偉國 Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 葛珮帆 Dr Elizabeth QUAT | |
| 鍾國斌 CHUNG Kwok-pan | 贊成 YES | 蔣麗芸 Dr CHIANG Lai-wan | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 謝偉銓 Tony TSE | 贊成 YES | 鍾樹根 Christopher CHUNG | 棄權 ABSTAIN |