

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(3) 830/12-13

Ref : CB(3)/M/MM

Tel : 3919 3300

Date : 12 July 2013

From : Clerk to the Legislative Council

To : All Members of the Legislative Council

Council meeting of 17 July 2013

**Amendments to motion on
“Dissolving the Hospital Authority”**

Further to LC Paper No. CB(3) 771/12-13 issued on 4 July 2013, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon Albert HO have respectively given notices of their intention to move separate amendments to Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau’s motion on “Dissolving the Hospital Authority” scheduled for the Council meeting of 17 July 2013. As directed by the President, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG’s and Hon Albert HO’s amendments will be printed in the terms in which they were handed in on the Agenda of the Council.

2. The President will order a joint debate on the above motion and the two amendments. To assist Members in debating the motion and amendments, I set out below the procedure to be followed during the debate:

- (a) the President calls upon Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau to speak and move his motion;
- (b) the President proposes the question on Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau’s motion;
- (c) the President calls upon the two Members who wish to move amendments to speak in the following order, but no amendment is to be moved at this stage:
 - (i) Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG; and
 - (ii) Hon Albert HO;

- (d) the President calls upon the public officer(s) to speak;
- (e) the President invites other Members to speak;
- (f) the President gives leave to Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau to speak for the second time on the two amendments;
- (g) the President calls upon the public officer(s) to speak again;
- (h) in accordance with Rule 34(5) of the Rules of Procedure, the President has decided that he will call upon the two Members to move their respective amendments in the order set out in paragraph (c) above. The President invites Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG to move his amendment to the motion, and forthwith proposes and puts to vote the question on the amendment;
- (i) after Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment has been voted upon, the President deals with Hon Albert HO's amendment to the motion; and
- (j) after Hon Albert HO's amendment has been dealt with, the President calls upon Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau to reply. Thereafter, the President puts to vote the question on Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau's motion, or his motion as amended, as the case may be.

3. For Members' reference, the terms of the original motion and of the motion, if amended, are set out in the **Appendix**.

(Odelia LEUNG)
for Clerk to the Legislative Council

Encl.

(Translation)

**Motion debate on
“Dissolving the Hospital Authority”
to be held at the Council meeting of 17 July 2013**

1. Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau’s original motion

That the Hospital Authority (‘HA’) was established in 1990 with the aim of effectively utilizing resources to establish and manage public hospitals and improve healthcare service quality; however, HA is both the buyer and the vendor of healthcare services with a conflict of roles, which on the one hand procures the relevant services for the public and on the other hand must take care of its own interests as the service provider, thus resulting in its inability to allocate resources in full accordance with patient needs; although the Government has kept increasing funding for HA, HA’s uneven allocation has rendered the resources for some of its clusters or departments insufficient for a long time and the problem of varying service quality unresolved, thus giving rise to public pressure of demanding the Government to keep increasing funding, with HA being rewarded for its misgovernance instead; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to dissolve HA, and under the principle of ‘money follows patient’ and in accordance with the population size of and number of patients in various districts, directly purchase services from public and private healthcare organizations, and allow patients to choose hospitals for treatment, with resource utilization and allocation put under the monitoring by the Legislative Council, so as to respond to patient needs.

2. Motion as amended by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG

That, *as* the Hospital Authority (‘HA’) was established in 1990 with the aim of effectively utilizing resources to establish and manage public hospitals and improve healthcare service quality; however, HA is both the buyer and the vendor of healthcare services with a conflict of roles, which on the one hand procures the relevant services for the public and on the other hand must take care of its own interests as the service provider, thus resulting in its inability to allocate resources in full accordance with patient needs; although the Government has kept increasing funding for HA, HA’s uneven allocation has rendered the resources for some of its clusters or departments insufficient for a long time, *with patients having to purchase at their own expense drugs which are of significant efficacy but expensive* and the problem of varying service quality unresolved, thus giving rise to public pressure of demanding the

Government to keep increasing funding, with HA being rewarded for its misgovernance instead; ~~in this connection,~~ this Council urges the Government to dissolve HA, and under the principle of ‘money follows patient’ *review the operation of HA and put forward a reform plan*, and in accordance with the population size of and number of patients in various districts, ~~directly purchase services from public and private healthcare organizations,~~ and allow patients to choose hospitals for treatment, with resource utilization and allocation put under the monitoring by the Legislative Council, so as to respond to patient needs; *the relevant reform plan should include:*

- (1) *to promote democratization of the management of public hospitals and clinics, and encourage more local and civic organizations to participate in such management;*
- (2) *in accordance with the needs of individual communities, to allocate additional resources to increase healthcare services, and comprehensively implement the cross-cluster patient referral scheme to shorten the waiting time for specialist services;*
- (3) *to increase the transparency of HA’s use of resources, and enhance the monitoring of HA’s creation of high-salaried posts, so as to prevent the occurrence of the situation of ‘fattening the top and thinning the bottom’; and*
- (4) *to allocate additional resources to expand the Drug Formulary, and include all drugs which are of significant efficacy and have marginal benefits but are expensive as General Drugs and Special Drugs, so that medical practitioners can prescribe drugs with greater flexibility and more patients can use such drugs at standard fees and charges, and to put in place a discretionary mechanism for medical practitioners to exercise their professional judgment to provide patients with drugs not in the Drug Formulary.*

Note: Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG’s amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

3. Motion as amended by Hon Albert HO

That, *given that* the Hospital Authority (‘HA’) was established in 1990 with the aim of effectively utilizing resources to establish and manage public hospitals and improve healthcare service quality; however, ~~HA is both the buyer and the vendor of healthcare services with a conflict of roles, which on the one hand procures the relevant services for the public and on the other hand must take care of its own interests as the service provider, thus resulting in its inability to~~

HA has now been established for 23 years and still cannot allocate resources in full accordance with patient needs; although the Government has kept increasing funding for HA, HA's uneven allocation has rendered the resources for some of its clusters or departments insufficient for a long time and the problem of varying service quality unresolved, thus giving rise to public pressure of demanding the Government to keep increasing funding, with HA being rewarded for its misgovernance instead; ~~in this connection, this Council urges the Government to dissolve HA, and under the principle of 'money follows patient' and in accordance with the population size of and number of patients in various districts, directly purchase services from public and private healthcare organizations, and allow patients to choose hospitals for treatment,~~ *on the premise of maintaining the public sector-led healthcare services and making them an important social security system in Hong Kong, reform HA,* with resource utilization and allocation put under the monitoring by the Legislative Council, so as to respond to patient needs; *the relevant measures should include:*

- (1) *to increase HA's representativeness, transparency and accountability, including appointing more elected public opinion representatives to HA and the Hospital Governing Committees of district hospitals to improve governance, and to clarify the powers and duties of Hospital Governing Committees to enable them to fulfill the governance function;*
- (2) *to make public HA's existing manpower establishment and planning, and streamline its administrative structure and review its remuneration and employment systems, so as to make reasonable use of public money and avoid the occurrence of the situation of 'fattening the top and thinning the bottom';*
- (3) *to formulate a fair and reasonable funding system, and allocate funding to respective districts and hospitals in accordance with the population sizes of and numbers of patients and types of diseases in various districts;*
- (4) *on the premise of protecting patients' well-being, to study whether it is necessary to retain or reform the cluster system; and*
- (5) *to expeditiously establish an HA review committee to comprehensively review HA's functions, and appoint non-HA members and persons who are not officials of the Department of Health as committee members to ensure the committee's independence and objectivity.*

Note: Hon Albert HO's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.