

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC84/12-13

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 12th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Monday, 24 June 2013, at 2:30 pm**

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Member attending:

Hon IP Kin-yuen

Members absent:

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Public officers attending:

Mr YEUNG Tak-keung	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment
Ms Jasmine CHOI Suet-yung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works) (Acting)
Mr MA Lee-tak, JP	Director of Water Supplies
Mr LEUNG Wing-lim	Assistant Director (New Works) Water Supplies Department
Ms Michelle LI Mei-sheung, JP	Deputy Secretary for Education (1)
Ms Pecvin YONG Pui-Wan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Further Education)
Mr LEUNG Kam-pui	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects) Architectural Services Department
Mr Gary AU	Senior Assistant Executive Director (Corporate Governance) Vocational Training Council
Dr LEE Kin-wang	Head (Estates, Health and Safety Division) Vocational Training Council

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Annette LAM

Chief Council Secretary (1)3

Staff in attendance:

Mr Andy LAU

Assistant Secretary General 1

Mr Ken WOO

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Ms Christy YAU

Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

The Chairman reported that a total of forty-three capital works projects amounting to \$104,015.9 million had been endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) in the 2012-2013 session so far. He further advised that two items were on the agenda for the meeting which, if endorsed, would involve a total amount of \$820.2 million.

2. The Chairman then reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure (RoP) of the Legislative Council (LegCo), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to any items under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the items. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on not voting or withdrawal in case of direct pecuniary interest.

Head 709 – Waterworks

**PWSC(2013-14)24 96WC Water supply to Pak Shek Kok
reclamation area, Tai Po — stage 2**

3. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 96 WC to Category A at an estimated cost of \$162.7 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices for laying water mains to provide adequate fresh water supply to the developments in the Pak Shek Kok reclamation area. The Panel on Development had been consulted on the proposal on 28 May 2013 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

4. The item was voted on and endorsed.

Head 708 – Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment
PWSC(2013-14)17 20EM Development of the Vocational Training
Council International Culinary College

5. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 20EM to Category A at an estimated cost of \$657.5 million in MOD prices for the development of the Vocational Training Council International Culinary College at Pokfulam. The Panel on Education had been consulted on the proposal on 14 January 2013 and Panel members supported the proposal. The gist of Panel discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Heritage conservation

6. Mr WONG Kwok-hing indicated his support for the proposed development of the International Culinary College (ICC) and enquired if the project could help revitalize the nearby historic buildings, including the Bethanie (Grade 1) and a group of old Dairy Farm buildings, namely the Senior Staff Quarters (Grade 1), the Main Office (Grade 2) and the Cowshed (Grade 2). Deputy Secretary for Education (1) (DS(Ed)(1)) responded that the Vocational Training Council (VTC) had appointed a heritage consultant to conduct a heritage impact assessment and devise mitigation measures to reduce any adverse impacts that the project would cause to the historic buildings in the vicinity. The design of the project and the recommended mitigation measures were accepted by the Antiquities and Monuments Office of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and generally supported by Antiquities Advisory Board at its meeting held in February 2013. Senior Assistant Executive Director (Corporate Governance), VTC (SAED(CG),VTC) added that various features such as reduced site coverage and building footprint as well as restricted building height would be incorporated in the design of the campus so as to better blend in with the surrounding environment. An interpretation area, in the form of a heritage trail with display facilities, would be included in the project to facilitate the public to appreciate the history and the bygone operation of the Dairy Farm in the Pokfulam area. A historic observation point would also be included in the ICC campus to allow the public to appreciate all the major surrounding heritage buildings at the same time. Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested that proper signage be installed at the respective historic scenic spots upon completion of the project.

7. Dr Kenneth CHAN indicated that members belonging to the Civic Party supported the proposed project. While appreciating that the interpretation area and the historic observation point with a construction cost of \$6.2 million under the project would be opened to the public free of charge, Dr CHAN was concerned about the operation and management of the

interpretation area and asked if any legacy characteristics would be built into the displays of these historical sites. Mr Frankie YICK proposed incorporating animation into the displays of the proposed heritage trail, taking reference from those presented at the Hong Kong Maritime Museum. SAED(CG),VTC advised that design of the interpretation area would make reference to the Dr SUN Yat-sen Historical Trail in the Central and Western District and that multi-media technology might be adopted to provide an interactive visitor experience at the displays. He added that the operation and maintenance of the interpretation area as well as the facilities provided therein would be undertaken by the VTC and the VTC would take note of Dr CHAN's and Mr YICK's views in formulating the detailed design of the interpretation area.

8. Mr MA Fung-kwok said that he had suggested at the meeting of the Panel on Education held on 14 January 2013 that instead of developing ICC as a stand-alone entity which might cause an impact on the nearby historic buildings, VTC should consider the feasibility of collaborating with occupants of some of these historic buildings to promote Hong Kong's diverse dining culture by operating restaurants offering a variety of cuisines. Mr MA suggested that the proposed restaurants could be run by other caterers as the VTC might have difficulties in maintaining the operation of the restaurants by its students. He said that the VTC should proactively seek to take on the management of these historic buildings so that a holistic implementation plan could be drawn up, including the provision of the related support facilities such as parking spaces. In response, SAED(CG),VTC said that the Bethanie and the group of old Dairy Farm buildings were currently used by the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts (HKAPA) for teaching and related purposes. The VTC would explore opportunities for collaboration with the HKAPA in the light of Mr MA's suggestion.

9. Addressing Mr Tony TSE's and Mr IP Kwok-him's concerns regarding the accessibility of the ICC and its nearby historic buildings, SAED(CG),VTC responded that the ICC could be accessed via public transport routes. He said that arrangements had been made with the Transport Department for re-relocating some of the bus stops along the Pokfulam Road near the ICC to avoid holding up traffic during passengers' pick-up and drop-off. There would also be pedestrian walkway connecting the public transport pick-up and drop-off points at the Pokfulam Road and various historic buildings along the proposed heritage trail in the interpretation area.

Design of ICC

10. Ms Emily LAU indicated her support for the project and enquired if the design of the ICC building as presented in Appendix 2 of the discussion paper was the final one. While indicating support for the project, Mr WU Chi-wai opined that the proposed modern design of the ICC building was incongruent with the historic buildings in the surrounding environment. He suggested that the VTC should consider adopting a design that would bring out the charm of the bygone era.

11. SAED(CG),VTC responded that to suit the image of an international culinary college, the design approach was to maintain a modern and distinct individual character while giving due respect to the features of the neighbouring historic buildings. The design concept of the proposed ICC was centred around the concept of a "Salt Crystal" – a key element for cuisine all over the world. The proposed design had been supported by various stakeholders during the consultation process. He added that the choice of colour and building materials for the façade of the ICC complex would make reference to those of the nearby historic buildings so as to achieve harmony with the surrounding environment. Miss CHAN Yuen-han and Mr IP Kwok-him expressed their support for the proposed design. They were keen to ensure that the development of the ICC would be compatible with the surrounding historic buildings.

12. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that as he had pointed out at the meeting of the Panel on Education held on 14 January 2013, the glittery external wall of the ICC complex might cause a visual nuisance to the neighbouring Pokfulam Village. He asked if other materials would be used for the façade instead. SAED(CG),VTC informed members that the Southern District Council, when being consulted, had expressed a similar concern, and accordingly non-reflective materials would be used for the façade of the building to avoid causing nuisance to the neighbourhood.

13. Mr IP Kwok-him asked if the proposed underground linkage between the ICC and the existing VTC Pokfulam Complex could be replaced by a footbridge for users to enjoy a more open vista. SAED(CG),VTC responded that the underground linkage was proposed to be built between the ICC and the existing VTC Pokfulam Complex so as to bring about synergy and enhance operational efficiency. The linkage would help ensure food hygiene and safety when food items were being transported between the two premises, and would also enhance the safety and security for students travelling between the two premises. The VTC had considered building a footbridge to connect the two buildings but in view of the presence of graded historic buildings in the vicinity, the VTC proposed to go for an underground

linkage instead so as to match the campus with the surrounding environment. He added that apart from the underground linkage, there would also be pedestrian walkway connecting the two buildings at the ground level.

Training for the disabled and students with special educational needs (SEN)

14. Dr Fernando CHEUNG indicated his support for the proposal as it would provide additional career progression for the youth. Pointing out that the Chinese Cuisine Training Institute (CCTI) had become a high-end cuisine training institute that was hardly accessible to SEN students because they lacked the requisite academic results, Dr CHEUNG opined that the VTC should design appropriate courses at CCTI and ICC for students with different learning abilities and potential so that they would have the opportunities to enroll. SAED(CG),VTC responded that the various institutions of VTC, including the CCTI and the Hospitality Industry Training and Development Centre (HITDC), had admitted SEN students and would continue to do so. He assured members that SEN students with a passion for culinary would not be deprived of the opportunity to receive training at the ICC and the CCTI should they meet the pre-requisites for admission.

15. Ms Emily LAU said that with proper training, some disabled persons were capable of taking up chef posts in the catering industry. She enquired about the training rendered by the VTC to students with disabilities. SAED(CG),VTC responded that at present, there were three Skills Centres run by VTC offering a range of vocational training courses and services, including culinary-related training programmes, for persons with disabilities to enhance their employment prospects and facilitate their integration into society. The feasibility for ICC to provide relevant training for the disabled would also be explored. Ms Emily LAU requested the VTC to proactively demonstrate the ability of the disabled trainees to potential employers in the catering and hospitality industries, such as the Ocean Park and the Hong Kong Disneyland, emphasizing on corporate social responsibilities with a view to securing more employment opportunities for them.

Career development of ICC graduates

16. Mr Michael TIEN expressed concern on the career development of ICC graduates. He enquired if the Administration would put in place any policies to commercialize the results of the vocational education provided by ICC to drive the further development of the catering industry. For example, the Administration could consider setting up a large-scale public food court as a testing ground for the graduates to run a trial business prior to their transition to setting up their own eatery in the open market. Mr TIEN said that joint efforts of the Education Bureau (EDB) and the Commerce and

Economic Development Bureau (CEDB) would be required to bring this idea to fruition. The Chairman remarked that Mr TIEN's suggestion would more appropriately be followed up by the Panel on Education and the Panel on Economic Development in a joint Panel meeting.

17. Miss CHAN Yuen-han declared that she was a former member of VTC Council. Sharing Mr TIEN's views, she said that cross-policy-area collaboration in the Administration was required for the provision of comprehensive post-training support for young graduates of the ICC to ultimately set up their own business. In the light of the soaring market rental, Miss CHAN suggested setting aside space at the future redeveloped Central Piers Nos 4 to 6 for these trained young chefs to set up their own catering operation. The Chairman said that the EDB should relay Miss CHAN's suggestion to the relevant bureau(x) for consideration.

18. DS(Ed)(1) advised that the CEDB had been supportive of the development of the ICC, as ICC would help nurture talent in support of the development of Hong Kong as a wine hub. On the integration of training with employment, students of higher diploma programme of the ICC would be required to undertake an internship programme in various catering outlets prior to their graduation. A training restaurant at the ICC also provided students with practical training opportunities. Training Boards set up under the auspices of VTC, comprising representatives from the industries and professional bodies, would also advise on ICC's curriculum design, manpower trends and industry development needs. She assured members that the EDB would continue to collaborate with the CEDB in respect of the development of ICC. Addressing the concern of Miss CHAN Yuen-han and Mr Michael TIEN, the Administration was requested to co-ordinate a reply from the relevant bureau(x) on the overall policies and measures to improve the employment opportunities for graduates of the ICC, particularly in assisting them to set up their own business prior to the relevant Finance Committee (FC) meeting. Mr Michael TIEN criticized the Administration for its lack of an overall planning on promoting the commercialization of the output from vocational education. He said that he might vote against all funding proposals for the provision of vocational training submitted to the Legislative Council in future should the Administration be unable to present a comprehensive plan to assist these trained talents to seek employment or establish their own business in the market.

Admin

Internal facilities of ICC

19. Noting that the ICC would help attract renowned chefs and other talents of the culinary profession from around the world, Dr Kenneth CHAN asked if simultaneous interpretation facilities need to be provided to facilitate

exchanges with overseas institutions and experts on culinary apart from the provision of a language laboratory. SAED(CG),VTC responded that the language laboratory would be used to provide language training for ICC students to enhance their language proficiency which was considered essential in the industry. At present, simultaneous interpreters would be hired to provide interpretation services for various exchange programmes and also for master class demonstrations held at the CCTI and the HITDC, both of which were located adjacent to the ICC. He said that as the activities would be held at different venues within the ICC and its nearby institutions, the setting up of simultaneous interpretation facilities at a fixed location at the ICC would not be the best solution to meet the operational needs.

20. Dr Fernando CHEUNG suggested that VTC should adopt a more open approach in the management of the ICC campus. Dr CHEUNG, Mr WU Chi-wai and Mr CHAN Han-pan enquired if the training restaurant at ICC could be opened for business to the public to provide real life training experience for the trainees. SAED(CG),VTC responded that as the core function of the training restaurant was for training and bearing in mind the concern over food safety and environmental hygiene in the training process, the VTC considered it not feasible to provide unrestricted public access to the training restaurant. Nevertheless, the ICC would provide support for special activities of the Southern District Council. He assured members that the trainees could practise what they had learnt at the training restaurant.

Energy conservation, green and recycled features

21. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok indicated his support for the project as it would help brand Hong Kong as a Gourmet's Paradise and provide training opportunities for young people who aspired for a career in the culinary profession. Pointing out that a substantial provision of \$4.8 million was proposed for energy conservation, green and recycled features under the project, Ir Dr LO enquired how the kitchen waste and greasy emissions would be treated by the ICC to make it an outstanding example for the rest of the catering industry. Mr CHAN Han-pan, too, expressed his concern over the impact of the greasy fumes discharged by the ICC on the nearby historic buildings. DS(Ed)(1) responded that kitchen waste would be treated on-site by in-vessel composter, while grease trap and electrostatic precipitators in the kitchen exhaust system would be installed to address the air quality impact arising from the greasy fumes. Mr Frankie YICK considered that training on the separation of kitchen waste at source and the related treatment was essential for the trainees of ICC.

22. Mr NG Leung-sing enquired if solar panels would be installed to provide green energy for the hot water supply system at ICC and also about

the function of the rainwater collection. Head (Estates, Health and Safety Division), VTC responded that energy for hot water supply for the ICC would be generated by gas or electricity while rainwater collection would be adopted for irrigation of the campus greenery.

Project cost

Admin

23. Mr Albert CHAN noted with concern that the Administration had not presented in the discussion paper any assessment made on the manpower training needs of the catering industry in the light of its future development to justify the establishment of the ICC with a huge project cost of \$657.5 million. He indicated that he would not support the project and requested the Administration to provide more information on the outlook for the development of the hospitality and catering industries, particularly the market demand for and supply of related manpower, to justify the funding proposal prior to the relevant FC meeting.

24. Mr Alan LEONG enquired about the method for calculating the provisions for contingency and price adjustment for projects submitted to this Subcommittee. He said that according to his observation, the provision for contingency was usually capped at about 7 % to 8% of the estimated project cost while that for price adjustment could vary. Taking the two projects with a comparable phased expenditure period from 2013-2014 to 2018-2019 discussed at this meeting as examples, he queried why the provision for price adjustment for project under PWSC(2013-14)²⁴ was about 20% while that for the project under discussion was just 14%. Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects), Architectural Services Department advised that the provision for contingency would normally account for about 10% of the estimated project cost to meet unexpected expenses arising from unforeseeable circumstances, such as underground conditions. The provision for price adjustment was to cater for increase in project cost arising from inflation and thus it would vary according to the construction period of individual projects. The provision for price adjustment was calculated in accordance with the Government's forecast of price adjustment factor based on the phased expenditure in each financial year. The Chairman said that a special meeting could be convened for the Administration to explain in detail to Subcommittee members the calculation of the capital cost of a project, including the provision for price adjustment and contingency.

25. The item was voted on and endorsed.

26. The Chairman consulted members whether any of the items under discussion today would require separate discussion and voting at the relevant FC meeting. Members did not raise any specific request.

Any other business

27. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 3:46 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
11 July 2013