

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2) 230/12-13

Ref : CB2/H/5/12

House Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 7th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
at 2:30 pm on Friday, 16 November 2012**

Members present:

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members absent:

Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

Clerk in attendance :

Miss Flora TAI Clerk to the House Committee

Staff in attendance :

Mr Kenneth CHEN, SBS	Secretary General
Mr Jimmy MA, JP	Legal Adviser
Mrs Justina LAM	Deputy Secretary General
Mr Andy LAU	Assistant Secretary General 1
Miss Odelia LEUNG	Assistant Secretary General 3
Mrs Percy MA	Assistant Secretary General 4
Ms Connie FUNG	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1
Mr Arthur CHEUNG	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Mr KAU Kin-wah	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3
Miss Erin TSANG	Acting Principal Council Secretary (Complaints)
Mr Simon WONG	Chief Public Information Officer
Ms Amy YU	Chief Council Secretary (2)6
Mr Bonny LOO	Assistant Legal Adviser 3
Ms Clara TAM	Assistant Legal Adviser 9
Miss Josephine SO	Senior Council Secretary (2)2
Ms Judy TING	Council Secretary (2)6
Mr Ringo LEE	Senior Legislative Assistant (2)1
Ms Anna CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (2)3
Mr Arthur KAN	Legislative Assistant (2)7

Action

I. Confirmation of the minutes of the 6th meeting held on 9 November 2012

(LC Paper No. CB(2) 198/12-13)

The minutes were confirmed.

II. Matters arising

Report by the Chairman on his meeting with the Chief Secretary for Administration ("CS")

2. The Chairman said that there was nothing special to report in respect of his meeting with CS.

Meeting-related systems in Conference Room 1

3. The Chairman said that during the House Committee ("HC") meeting on 2 November 2012, several meeting-related systems in Conference Room 1 failed to operate, and that immediately after the HC meeting on 9 November 2012, a Member informed the Secretariat that the record shown in the Electronic Voting System ("EVS") did not reflect accurately her voting intention. The Chairman further said that following these system-related incidents, the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat had taken some follow-up actions.

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary General ("SG") said that on 2 November 2012, all the microphones, the quorum and voting bells, as well as EVS in Conference Room 1 broke down during the HC meeting. An investigation into the incident revealed that the failure of the various systems had been caused by the malfunctioning of a network router that controlled the transfer of signals among the systems. The faulty router had been replaced, and a standby replacement for the router had also been procured to enable speedy resumption of normal operation of the network should a similar problem occur in the future.

5. SG further said that immediately after the HC meeting on 9 November 2012 and during the Finance Committee ("FC") meeting held on the same day, two Members informed the Secretariat respectively that their votes cast in a voting had not been correctly recorded by EVS. Following the 9 November incidents, the Secretariat and contractors had tested EVS extensively but could not replicate the problems reported by the two Members. This notwithstanding, the voting panel circuit boards at the desks of the two Members had been replaced as a precautionary measure. To facilitate system diagnosis should a similar problem occur in the future, a data logger had been installed to capture a copy of the electronic data that originated from Members' voting panel. If necessary, such data could be compared with the corresponding EVS record to confirm whether a Member's vote had been correctly recorded.

6. SG informed the meeting that there was a suggestion that the voting button pressed by Members should remain lighted for a while after the voting process had completed, so as to facilitate Members to verify their votes cast. A preliminary study showed that substantial modification to the hardware would be required to take forward this suggestion. As the Council was in session, the Secretariat was of the view that any substantial modification to the existing systems should only be carried out at a time that would not disrupt the Council's operation. In the meantime, the Secretariat would continue to explore other means of providing additional confirmatory record of Members' votes.

Action

7. SG added that after the vote count results were displayed on the plasma screens in the conference room, Members could verify their votes once again. Should Members find that EVS had misrepresented their votes, they should immediately raise the matter with the chairman and the voting record could be adjusted accordingly so long as the chairman had not yet announced the voting results.

8. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern whether EVS could cope with the many rounds of voting at the forthcoming FC meetings. He also sought information on the fall back measures should EVS fail to operate again.

9. At the invitation of the Chairman, SG said that the Secretariat and contractors tested all the meeting-related systems in Conference Room 1 before every meeting to ensure their normal operation. The recent system-related incidents in Conference Room 1 did not indicate any direct correlation between system failure and the number of rounds of voting. He assured Members that there would be technical staff on duty at the meeting venue to expeditiously tackle any technical problem that might arise. SG further said that in the event that EVS broke down and its operation could not be resumed within a short time, voting would be conducted by a show of hands with Members' names recorded manually, but the voting process would take longer to complete.

10. Ms Emily LAU considered that the most desirable arrangement was for the voting button pressed by each Member to remain lighted for a while after each vote. Noting that a data logger had been installed to capture the electronic data that originated from Members' voting panels, she hoped that confirmatory records of Members' votes would be made available immediately to enable verification of whether a Member's vote had been correctly recorded should a dispute arise in the future. She further requested that voting results be uploaded onto the LegCo Website as soon as possible to facilitate public access.

11. At the invitation of the Chairman, SG said that for Council meetings, the voting results were all along available on the LegCo Website. There was no technical difficulty in doing the same for HC and FC meetings. The Clerk added that on the day before the HC meeting, the Secretariat had already uploaded onto the LegCo Website the voting results of the relevant HC meetings in the current term and the information was available on the webpage of HC.

Action

12. Ms Cyd HO said that while Members had the responsibility to verify the votes they had cast, the chairman of the committee concerned should allow more time for Members to check their votes and report any irregularities before announcing the voting results. Citing the incident at the FC meeting on 9 November 2012, she said that Dr Kenneth CHAN had raised his hand in an attempt to report the problem before the Chairman announced the results but in vain. She enquired about the feasibility of displaying the votes cast by Members on the Information Display System ("IDS") at Members' desks to facilitate Members' verification of their voting.

13. The Chairman said that there were two junctures at which Members could verify their votes: the first juncture was when the chairman reminded Members to check their votes before announcing the end of the voting procedure; and second, when the vote count results were displayed on the plasma screens. At that point, any Member who spotted any irregularities should immediately raise the matter with the chairman who would then adjust the vote count accordingly so long as the voting results had not yet been announced. If, however, the irregularity was raised after the voting results had been declared, no adjustment could be made to the voting results. The only thing that could be done was to record the Member's voting intention in the minutes of meeting.

14. Regarding Ms Cyd HO's enquiry on the feasibility of displaying Members' votes on IDS at Members' desks, SG said that it was among the options being considered. The Secretariat would explore the technical feasibility and modification cost of different options before deciding which of them should be adopted. He stressed that substantial modification to the existing systems should not be carried out while the Council was in session to avoid affecting the Council's operation.

15. At the invitation of the Chairman, Assistant Secretary General 1, who was the Clerk to FC, said that the voting results of FC meetings would be uploaded onto the LegCo Website as soon as possible after each meeting. In cases where many rounds of voting had been conducted at several FC meetings held successively on the same day, the Secretariat would make its best efforts to upload the voting results onto the LegCo Website within the same day.

16. Dr Helena WONG thanked the Secretariat for the follow-up actions taken following the recent system-related incidents. She hoped that such unfortunate incidents would not happen again, and shared the view that the chairman concerned should allow Members reasonable

Action

time to verify their votes before announcing the voting results. She requested the Secretariat to explore the feasibility of displaying Members' names on the seating plan when their votes cast were shown on the plasma screens in Conference Room 1, so as to facilitate Members' verification of their votes.

17. Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Chairman of FC, said that he would also ensure that sufficient time be given to Members to verify their votes before announcing the voting results. Referring to the incident which occurred during the FC meeting on 9 November 2012, he recalled that before announcing the voting results he had looked around the conference room and had not seen any Members raising their hands. He reminded Members that they should verify their votes when the vote count results were displayed on the plasma screens and report any irregularities immediately. He sought clarification from Ms Emily LAU on whether her request for the Secretariat to upload voting results onto the LegCo Website included those relating to the large number of motions relating to the proposed amendments to paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure.

18. Ms Emily LAU said that what she had in mind was that the voting results of financial proposals or other important decisions of FC should be uploaded onto the LegCo Website as early as possible. Ms LAU sought confirmation from SG on whether a confirmatory record of a Member's vote could be made available immediately should a dispute arise, given that a data logger had already been installed.

19. At the invitation of the Chairman, SG explained that as a data logger had been installed, the system had already started to capture the electronic data of Members' votes originating from their respective voting panels. The Secretariat was in the process of developing a software for the instantaneous translation of such electronic data into readable data, which would take about two weeks to complete. He stressed that it was best for Members to verify their votes and raise any irregularities before the voting results were announced.

20. Mr CHAN Han-pan considered it important to ensure the stability and reliability of the meeting-related systems. He thanked the Secretariat for the prompt follow-up actions taken. In his view, it should also be ascertained whether the Members who claimed that EVS had misrepresented their votes were at the material time under the influence of alcohol or drugs as this might have impaired their judgment.

Action

21. Mr Jeffrey LAM suggested that to avoid future disputes, the Secretariat should consider installing a surveillance system in the conference room to tape-record the voting process, including the voting button pressed by each Member.

22. In response to Mr Frederick FUNG's enquiry, the Chairman said that during the HC and FC meetings on 9 November 2012, there was no system log in place to capture the electronic data that came out of Members' voting panels. As such, it could not be verified whether EVS had misrepresented the votes cast by the two Members concerned.

23. Mr Charles MOK believed that the Secretariat had taken all the feasible steps to follow up the incidents. He cautioned that problems could arise even after the installation of the data logger as the electronic data it captured could be erroneous. In his view, the best way to prevent recurrence of similar incidents was to allow Members sufficient time, say 30 seconds, to verify their votes before the voting results were announced.

24. Mr WONG Yuk-man considered it unfair to lay the blame on the Secretariat or the technical staff concerned. He said that it was not uncommon for Members to have pressed the wrong button during voting. In his view, the chance that EVS had misrepresented the votes cast by Members was very slim, and Members should be more careful in casting their votes.

25. Mr Albert CHAN said that so far there was no evidence to suggest that the incidents on 9 November 2012 were caused by the malfunctioning of EVS. He considered it grossly unfair to put the blame on the Secretariat or the technical staff concerned.

26. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan and Mr WONG Ting-kwong queried whether Dr Kenneth CHAN was under the influence of alcohol when he cast his vote at the FC meeting on 9 November 2012. Dr CHIANG said that somebody who had come near Dr CHAN that evening found that he smelled of alcohol.

27. The Chairman reminded Members to focus the discussions on the meeting-related systems.

28. Ms Claudia MO said that she was shocked to hear that the discussions on the technical issues of the systems had turned into personal attacks on the Members concerned. She considered it a waste of public money for Members to continue the discussion. She would walk out from the meeting as a protest.

Action

29. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that Members should focus their discussions on the meeting-related systems. He stressed that Members who raised concern about EVS were not putting the blame on the Secretariat. Their intention was to find out the causes of the problems.

30. Dr Kenneth CHAN categorically denied that he had consumed any drinks with alcoholic content or taken any drugs before the voting was conducted at the FC meeting on 9 November 2012. He stressed that the meeting should focus on the issues under discussion.

31. The Chairman requested the Secretariat to continue to follow up the matter.

III. Business arising from previous Council meetings

Legal Service Division report on subsidiary legislation gazetted on 9 November 2012 and tabled in Council on 14 November 2012 *(LC Paper No. LS 9/12-13)*

32. At the invitation of the Chairman, Legal Adviser ("LA") said that a total of two items of subsidiary legislation, i.e. the Allowances to Jurors (Amendment) Order 2012 (L.N. 170) and the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cemeteries) (Amendment of Fifth Schedule) Order 2012 (L.N. 171), were gazetted on 9 November 2012 and tabled in the Council on 14 November 2012.

33. Regarding the Allowances to Jurors (Amendment) Order 2012, LA said that it increased the rate of allowance and the maximum rate of additional allowance payable to jurors from \$360 to \$410 a day. The current rates of allowances payable to jurors were the same as those payable to ordinary witnesses in criminal proceedings and coroners' inquests. The rates were last revised in 2009. CS had given notice to move two proposed resolutions at the Council meeting of 28 November 2012 to seek a corresponding increase. The two proposed resolutions would be considered under agenda item V(c) below.

34. LA further said that the Legal Service Division had sought clarification from the Administration on a drafting inconsistency between the Chinese text of a provision in the Amendment Order and another provision in the existing Order. The Administration had replied that if it was decided that any amendment to the Chinese text was required, the amendment would be effected by an omnibus bill.

Action

35. LA added that an information paper on the proposed increase of allowances was issued to the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services on 10 July 2012. No comments were received on that paper.

36. Members did not raise any queries on the two items of subsidiary legislation.

37. The Chairman reminded Members that the deadline for amending the subsidiary legislation was 12 December 2012.

IV. Further business for the Council meeting of 21 November 2012

Tabling of papers

Report No. 4/12-13 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments

(LC Paper No. CB(2) 200/12-13 issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3) 145/12-13 dated 15 November 2012)

38. The Chairman said that the Report covered seven items of subsidiary legislation/other instrument, including the Third Technical Memorandum for Allocation of Emission Allowances in Respect of Specified Licences (S.S. No. 5 to Gazette No. 42/2012) ("Third TM"), the period for amendment of which would expire on 21 November 2012. As the Chairman of the relevant subcommittee had indicated intention to speak on the Third TM, he would move a motion in his capacity as Chairman of HC to take note of the Report in relation to the Third TM at the Council meeting.

V. Business for the Council meeting of 28 November 2012

(a) Questions
(LC Paper No. CB(3) 139/12-13)

39. The Chairman said that 20 questions (six oral and 14 written) had been scheduled for the meeting.

(b) Bills - First Reading and moving of Second Reading

40. The Chairman said that no notice had been received yet.

(c) **Government motions**

- (i) **Proposed resolution to be moved by the Chief Secretary for Administration under section 9B of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap. 221)**

(Wording of the proposed resolution issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3) 129/12-13 dated 9 November 2012.)

(LC Paper No. LS 8/12-13)

- (ii) **Proposed resolution to be moved by the Chief Secretary for Administration under section 54 of the Coroners Ordinance (Cap. 504)**

(Wording of the proposed resolution issued vide LC Paper No. CB(3) 130/12-13 dated 9 November 2012.)

(LC Paper No. LS 8/12-13)

41. At the invitation of the Chairman, LA said that the two proposed resolutions were for seeking the Council's approval of the Criminal Procedure (Witnesses' Allowances) (Amendment) Rules 2012 and the Coroners (Witnesses' Allowances) (Amendment) Rules 2012 to revise upwards the maximum rates of allowances payable to witnesses in criminal proceedings and coroners' inquests. The proposed rates for ordinary witnesses and expert/professional witnesses were \$410 and \$2,355 a day respectively.

42. Members raised no objection to CS moving the above two proposed resolutions at the Council meeting.

(d) **Members' motions**

- (i) **Motion to be moved by Hon CHAN Hak-kan**

43. The Chairman said that the subject of the motion to be moved by Mr CHAN Hak-kan was "Caring about the education, employment, housing, home acquisition and business start-up problems faced by young people". The wording of the motion had been issued to Members.

- (ii) **Motion to be moved by Hon Claudia MO**

44. The Chairman said that the subject of the motion to be moved by Ms Claudia MO was "Domestic free television programme service licence applications". The wording of the motion had been issued to Members.

Action

45. The Chairman reminded Members that the deadline for giving notice of amendments, if any, to the motions was Wednesday, 21 November 2012.

Report on study of subsidiary legislation

46. The Chairman invited Members to note the list containing three items of subsidiary legislation tabled at the meeting, the period for amendment of which would expire on 28 November 2012. Members who wished to speak on the subsidiary legislation should indicate their intention by 5:00 pm on Tuesday, 20 November 2012.

VI. Report of Bills Committees and subcommittees

Report of the Subcommittee on Legal Aid (Amendment) Regulation 2012, Legal Aid (Assessment of Resources and Contributions) (Amendment) Regulation 2012 and Legal Aid Ordinance – Resolution of the Legislative Council (Commencement) Notice
(LC Paper No. CB(4) 150/12-13)

47. Mr Dennis KWOK, Chairman of the Subcommittee, said that the Subcommittee had completed its work and had not proposed any amendment to the two Amendment Regulations and the Commencement Notice. The two Amendment Regulations would come into operation on 30 November 2012, while the Commencement Notice was to appoint 30 November 2012 as the date on which the resolution passed by LegCo in July 2012 to expand the scope of the legal aid schemes would come into operation. He referred Members to the Subcommittee's report for details of its deliberations.

48. Mr Dennis KWOK further said that the Subcommittee considered that the proposed final contribution rates for the existing and new types of professional negligence cases as well as claims against insurers or their intermediaries and vendors of first-hand residential properties under the Supplementary Legal Aid Scheme ("SLAS") were too high. On the request of the Subcommittee, the Administration would conduct a formal review of these rates and adjust them, where appropriate, in light of operational experience. Mr KWOK added that the Subcommittee also considered that the scope of SLAS needed to be further expanded to cover more middle-class citizens, and agreed to refer the matter to the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services for follow-up.

49. The Chairman reminded Members that as the deadline for amending these three items of subsidiary legislation was 28 November 2012, the deadline for giving notice of amendments, if any, was Wednesday, 21 November 2012.

VII. Position on Bills Committees and subcommittees

(LC Paper No. CB(2) 199/12-13)

50. The Chairman said that as at 15 November 2012, there were eight subcommittees under HC (i.e. five subcommittees on subsidiary legislation, one subcommittee on policy issues and two subcommittees on other Council business) in action.

VIII. Proposal from Hon Alan LEONG for moving a motion for adjournment under Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure at the Council meeting of 28 November 2012 for the purpose of debating the following issue: the arrangement for Mr Franklin LAM Fan-keung, Member of the Executive Council, to take a leave of absence

(Letter dated 12 November 2012 from Hon Alan LEONG (LC Paper No. CB(2) 203/12-13(01)))

51. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Alan LEONG said that he gathered from the discussions at the last HC meeting that Members were generally of the view that the arrangement for Mr Franklin LAM Fan-keung, Member of the Executive Council, to take a leave of absence was a matter of public concern and was worthy of discussion by LegCo. As some Members had expressed concern at the last meeting about his request for waiver of the requisite notice for moving the proposed adjournment motion, he had amended his proposal to comply with the notice requirement. He appealed to Members to support his proposal.

52. The Chairman put to vote the proposal from Mr Alan LEONG for moving a motion for adjournment under Rule 16(4) of the Rules of Procedure at the Council meeting of 28 November 2012 for the purpose of debating the following issue: the arrangement for Mr Franklin LAM Fan-keung, Member of the Executive Council, to take a leave of absence. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung requested a division.

The following Members voted in favour of the proposal:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Mr James TO, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Ms Emily LAU, Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Mr Frederick FUNG, Mr Vincent FANG, Dr Joseph LEE, Mr Ronny TONG, Ms Cyd HO, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che, Mr Paul TSE, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr Albert CHAN, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Ms Claudia MO, Mr James TIEN, Mr Frankie YICK, Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr Gary FAN, Mr Charles MOK, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Dr Kenneth CHAN, Mr Kenneth LEUNG, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr Dennis KWOK, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr SIN Chung-kai, Dr Helena WONG, Mr IP Kin-yuen and Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan.

(32 Members)

Action

The following Members voted against the proposal:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Mr TAM Yiu-chung, Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr Jeffrey LAM, Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Ms Starry LEE, Dr LAM Tai-fai, Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Priscilla LEUNG, Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Mr IP Kwok-him, Mr NG Leung-sing, Mr Steven HO, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Miss CHAN Yuen-han, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Miss Alice MAK, Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Mr POON Siu-ping, Mr TANG Ka-piu, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok and Mr Christopher CHUNG.

(26 Members)

The following Members abstained:

Mrs Regina IP, Mr Michael TIEN, Mr MA Fung-kwok and Mr Martin LIAO.

(4 Members)

53. The Chairman declared that 32 Members voted for the proposal and 26 Members voted against it, and four Members abstained. The proposal was supported.

IX. Any other business

54. There being no other business, the meeting ended 3:18 pm.