

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(4)55/13-14  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PS/1/12

**Panel on Education**

**Subcommittee on Integrated Education**

**Minutes of the Sixth meeting**  
**held on Monday, 8 July 2013, at 4:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon Claudia MO  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending** : Item I

**Education Bureau**

Mr Kevin YEUNG  
Under Secretary for Education

Ms Sophia WONG  
Principal Education Officer  
(Special Education & Kindergarten Education)

Mr Godwin LAI  
Principal Inspector (Special Education Support 2)

**Social Welfare Department**

Ms Michelle LAM Wai-yip  
Chief Social Work Officer  
(Rehabilitation and Medical Social Services)1

**Department of Health**

Dr Florence LEE Mun-yau  
Senior Medical and Health Officer  
(Child Assessment Service)

**Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority**

Ms Sharon LO  
Senior Manager – Examinations Administration

Ms TAM Mo-yee  
Senior Manager – Assessment Development

**Attendance by Invitation** : 1st Step Association

Mr YIP Kin-keung  
Organizer

**SAHK**

Mrs Louisa LAW  
Deputy Chief Executive Officer

Hong Kong Red Cross John F. Kennedy Centre  
Alumni Association

Mr TAM Chi-ho  
Deputy Chairman

Mr KWONG Chung-on

Labour Party

Mr Michael CHENG  
Representative

Civic Party

Mr Joshua LI  
District Developer

Dr Robert HANSON

Hong Kong Federation of Handicapped Youth

Mr Allen CHAN  
Chairperson

The Hong Kong Society for the Blind

Ms Kitty CHUNG  
Director (Rehabilitation Services)

Hong Kong Federation of the Blind

Mr SHING Li-lim  
Executive Director

Hong Kong Blind Union Trailwalker Vocational  
and Educational Resource Centre

---

Mr HO Ka-leung  
President

視障生融合教育關注組

Miss WONG Tsz-sin  
Spokesperson

Hong Kong Blind Union

Mr CHONG Chan-yau  
President

視障中學生關注融合教育聯盟

Mr CHAN Kin-ling  
Convenor

Mr Billy YAU

Hong Kong Occupational Therapy Association

Miss Sanne FONG  
Specialty Group in Paediatrics

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (4) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Miss Elly CHAN  
Administrative Assistant (4)2

Ms Jennifer LEUNG  
Clerical Assistant (4)3

Action

---

- I. Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with –**  
**(a) Physical disabilities;**  
**(b) Visual impairment**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(01) — Paper provided by the Administration)

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(06) — Submission from Hong Kong Association for

Parents of Persons with  
Physical Disabilities

LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(07) — Submission from Hong  
Kong Professional  
Teachers' Union

LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(08) — Submission from a  
member of the public)

Meeting with deputations and the Administration

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at  
**Annex**).

2. The Administration was requested to provide information on -
  - (a) the number of primary schools, secondary schools and post-secondary institutions that had duly provided barrier free access and facilities at their premises;
  - (b) the number of primary schools, secondary schools and post-secondary institutions where barrier free access and facilities, or alterations for the provision of such facilities, had not been provided at their premises; and
  - (c) the timetable, if any, for the schools in (b) above to carry out the necessary works for the provision of barrier free access and facilities at their premises.

*(Post-meeting note:* The Administration's written response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1006/12-13(01) on 2 October 2013.)

3. The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the views/concerns raised at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note:* On the subsequent instruction of the Chairman, a "consolidated summary" of the views/concerns raised at this meeting and the meeting held on 18 June 2013 had been prepared and issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)945/12-13(01).

The Administration's written response to the consolidated summary of views/concerns was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1007/12-13(01) on 2 October 2013.)

**II. Any other business**

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:45 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
21 October 2013

**Proceedings of the meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Integrated Education  
on Monday, 8 July 2013, at 4:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I – Issues related to the difficulties in implementing integrated education with respect to students with – (a) Physical disabilities, and (b) Visual impairment</i>			
001018 - 001130	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001131 - 001519	Administration Chairman	Briefing by the Administration on its information paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(01)].	
001520 - 001906	1st Step Association Chairman	Presentation of views	
001907 - 002254	SAHK Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(02)]	
002255 - 002610	Hong Kong Red Cross John F. Kennedy Centre Alumni Association Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(01)]	
002611 - 002915	Mr KWONG Chung-on Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(03)]	
002916 - 003242	Labour Party Chairman	Presentation of views	
003243 - 003600	Civic Party Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)897/12-13(01)]	
003601 - 003943	Dr Robert HANSON Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in his submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)874/12-13(01)]	
003944 - 004311	Hong Kong Federation of Handicapped Youth Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(04)]	
004312 - 004646	The Hong Kong Society for the Blind Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(05)]	
004647 - 005020	Hong Kong Federation of the Blind Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)857/12-13(06)]	
005021 - 005339	Hong Kong Blind Union Trailwalker Vocational and Educational Resource Centre Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(02)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
005340 - 005654	視障生融合教育關注組 Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(03)]	
005655 - 010035	Hong Kong Blind Union Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(04)]	
010036 - 010351	視障中學生關注融合 教育聯盟 Chairman	Presentation of views as detailed in its submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)880/12-13(05)]	
010352 - 010712	Mr Billy YAU Chairman	Presentation of views	
010713 - 011328	Hong Kong Occupational Therapy Association Chairman	Presentation of views	
011329 - 012040	Administration Chairman	<p>The Administration gave the following initial response –</p> <p>(a) The special arrangements and support measures provided to students with special educational needs ("SEN students") might vary among post-secondary institutions as each of them operated with a high degree of autonomy. The Administration was in the course of collecting information from the University Grants Committee("UGC")-funded institutions regarding their provision of special arrangements and support measures to SEN students.</p> <p>(b) UGC-funded institutions admitted students at their own discretion. The reasons for the relatively low number of SEN students pursuing post-secondary education in Hong Kong were to be ascertained.</p> <p>(c) Regarding the production of braille textbooks for students with visual impairment ("VI"), the Administration had regular meetings with the Centralized Braille Production Centre of the Hong Kong Society for the Blind and Ebenezer School on ways to expedite the production process.</p> <p>(d) The Administration would take into consideration the need of SEN students, including those with VI, for electronic assistive tools when developing e-textbooks.</p> <p>(e) On the suggestion of amending the copyright legislation to facilitate the access by VI students to printed works, since the subject matter was under the policy purview of the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau ("CEDB"), the</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Education Bureau ("EDB") would provide input to CEDB where necessary.</p> <p>(f) EDB was mindful of the need to strengthen professional training on special education for teachers to enhance their capacity in catering for the needs of SEN students. Local teacher education institutions had also incorporated supporting SEN students or relevant topics in their pre-service teacher education programmes.</p> <p>(g) Additional resources would be deployed to enhance public education so that the community could better understand the needs of students with VI and physical disabilities ("PD").</p>	
012041 - 012935	Ms Claudia MO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms MO's comments that –</p> <p>(a) she regretted to note that the Administration was still at the stage of collecting information from post-secondary institutions rather than taking concrete action to enhance the implementation of integrated education ("IE") in these institutions; and</p> <p>(b) as some students with VI had not been provided with assistive tools in learning and were discouraged to take certain subjects under the New Senior Secondary ("NSS") curriculum by their schools, EDB should step up its regulation over schools' use of the additional resources allocated to them for implementing IE.</p> <p>Ms MO's enquiry whether EDB would set up a dedicated channel of communication with SEN students and their parents so that they might lodge their complaints directly with the Administration.</p> <p>The Administration responded that –</p> <p>(a) under the integrated education policy, all ordinary schools should adopt the Whole School Approach to cater for SEN students. Schools were in the best position to understand the specific needs of individual SEN students and provide appropriate support to them;</p> <p>(b) various additional resources including the Top-up Fund were available for all ordinary schools for purchasing assistive tools for students with PD and VI;</p> <p>(c) the Administration would visit schools at least twice a year to monitor how resources were used in the implementation of IE;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) parents of SEN students were encouraged to communicate with the schools concerned regarding the specific needs of their children. They could also approach EDB if they considered that their enquiries or complaints had not been resolved to their satisfaction; and</p> <p>(e) EDB held meetings from time to time with various parent organizations. In addition, the Task Force on IE in Mainstream Schools comprised representatives of different stakeholders, including members representing different parent groups. The minutes of meetings of the Task Force were uploaded onto the EDB webpage.</p> <p>The Chairman's remarks that the meetings organized by the Administration, such as those of the Task Force, were held behind closed doors. There was very little exchange of views as the Administration often made use of these meetings to promulgate its decisions rather than to collect views.</p>	
012936 - 013715	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Administration Chairman	<p>Mr CHEUNG was concerned that –</p> <p>(a) there was a lack of barrier-free access and facilities at some post-secondary institutions for students with VI and PD, as the case revealed by a deputation in which a student had been deterred from enrolling with the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA") for this reason; and</p> <p>(b) students with VI received braille textbooks at a belated stage of the school term, such as only shortly before examination.</p> <p>Mr CHEUNG suggested that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration should take measures to enlist the cooperation of post-secondary institutions in providing the necessary support to SEN students;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should consider setting up a body comprising representatives from different stakeholders to handle complaints related to the implementation of IE, instead of entrusting individual schools to handle such complaints; and</p> <p>(c) a special learning support fund should be set up for direct application by SEN students to acquire the necessary support services/items.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The Administration took note of the situations as depicted by the deputations.</li> <li>(b) The existing school-based complaint-handling mechanism had worked effectively in resolving complaints at source and expeditiously.</li> <li>(c) The setting up of a special fund for application by SEN students as proposed might duplicate the existing arrangements and increase the complexity in the administration and provision of support services.</li> </ul>	
013716-014428	Deputy Chairman Administration Chairman	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired whether UGC had put in place a mechanism to identify the needs of SEN students pursuing post-secondary study, to formulate policies on the provision of support services to these students, and to monitor the provision of such services.</p> <p>The Administration informed the meeting that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) The Administration maintained ongoing communication with post-secondary institutions in respect of the provision of support services to SEN students. The Administration was in the course of collecting relevant information from post-secondary institutions with a view to ascertaining the overall situation.</li> <li>(b) Resource requirements for supporting SEN students had been taken into account in the allocation of triennial funding to UGC-funded institutions. It was for individual institutions to decide on the deployment of resources in the light of the specific needs of their SEN students.</li> </ul> <p>The Chairman's suggestion that the Subcommittee might consider following up with the Administration and UGC on issues related to the admission of SEN students to post-secondary institutions and the provision of support measures to these students.</p>	
014429 - 015236	Dr Helena WONG Administration Chairman	<p>Dr WONG enquired –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) whether all the schools which had admitted students with VI had provided assistive tools and equipment for these students; and</li> <li>(b) whether all primary and secondary schools and post-secondary institutions had complied with the requirements on the provision of barrier-free access and facilities in their school premises for students with PD.</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration provided the following information –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Schools which had admitted students with VI could apply for Top-up Fund for purchase of suitable equipment or assistive tools.</li> <li>(b) Over 200 new schools built after May 1997 had complied with relevant requirements on provision of barrier-free access facilities for persons with PD, including lifts, ramps, signage etc. For schools built before May 1997, conversion or improvement works would be carried out where practicable to install additional facilities so as to provide a barrier-free learning environment.</li> <li>(c) Special measures such as arranging classrooms accessible by students with PD and arranging for schoolmates to provide necessary assistance were also adopted by individual schools.</li> </ul> <p>Dr WONG's concern that those schools that had not carried out conversion or improvement works to provide barrier-free access and facilities to students with PD would be in breach of the Disability Discrimination Ordinance (Cap.487) ("DDO"). The Administration should ensure that all schools would comply with the requirements within a specified timeframe.</p> <p>The Chairman's remark that EDB should ensure the provision of barrier-free access and facilities in schools for students with PD.</p> <p>The Administration was requested to provide information on –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the number of primary schools, secondary schools and post-secondary institutions that had duly provided barrier-free access and facilities at their premises;</li> <li>(b) the number of primary schools, secondary schools and post-secondary institutions where barrier-free access and facilities, or alterations for the provision of such facilities, had not been provided at their premises; and</li> <li>(c) the timetable, if any, for the schools in (b) above to carry out the necessary works for the provision of barrier-free access and facilities at their premises.</li> </ul>	<p>The Administration was requested to provide the information as stated in paragraph 2 of the minutes.</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
015237 - 015809	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>With reference to some deputations' views, Ms HO's suggestions that –</p> <p>(a) EDB should follow up with CEDB on introducing necessary amendments to the existing copyright legislation so as to give effect to the Marrakesh Treaty to Facilitate Access to Published Works for Persons who are Blind, Visually Impaired, or otherwise Print Disabled adopted by the World Intellectual Property Organization in June 2013; and</p> <p>(b) as far as practicable, the reading materials available at public libraries for ordinary readers should also be made in a format accessible by persons with VI.</p> <p>With reference to the motion on special education policy moved by her and amended by other Members which was passed in 2009, Ms HO's remark that the Government had been urged, among others, to deploy resources to commission academics to conduct research on the local needs for special education so as to serve as the basis for re-formulating the special education policy, and to review the facilities of special education schools and upgrade them according to the latest service needs and actual operation of such schools. However, she was not aware of much follow-up action taken by the Administration in the aforementioned aspects. She was of the view that EDB should include in its annual Estimates of Expenditure the necessary resources to implement the measures as set out in the motion.</p> <p>The Administration responded that –</p> <p>(a) EDB would follow up with CEDB regarding the suggestion to amend the relevant copyright legislation; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration noted the views/suggestions on allocating resources for implementing various initiatives.</p>	
015810 - 020450	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman's concern that some students with VI and PD had been asked by their schools not to take certain subjects, such as Physical Education, Home Economics and Science; and some were even not allowed to take part in certain outdoor activities for safety or other reasons. His enquiries –</p> <p>(a) whether the Administration would take measures to prohibit schools from adopting such practices which were discriminatory in nature; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) whether any redress mechanism was in place for handling grievance/complaints of students with VI and PD and their parents.</p> <p>The Administration explained that –</p> <p>(a) Under the prevailing policy to provide equal learning opportunities, there was no restriction on the subjects or school activities which could be taken by SEN students.</p> <p>(b) Individual schools were in the best position to understand the needs and circumstances of their SEN students. Where the school considered that any subject or school activity might not be suitable for certain SEN students, the school should explain the underlying reasons to the students and their parents clearly to achieve mutual understanding.</p> <p>(c) There were cases in which schools had made special arrangements to facilitate the participation of SEN students in extra-curricular activities. For example, audio description service was arranged for students with VI during a visit to a museum.</p> <p>(d) EDB was prepared to look into cases raised by the deputations/members if more details to substantiate their complaints were provided.</p> <p>Extension of the meeting for 15 minutes beyond the appointed meeting time by the Chairman.</p>	
020451 - 020827	Dr Helena WONG Administration Chairman	<p>Dr WONG's views that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration should ensure the compliance of DDO and the Code of Practice on Education by schools so that SEN students could enjoy equal opportunities in education; and</p> <p>(b) where necessary, the Administration should work in collaboration with the Equal Opportunities Commission to promulgate codes of practice in relation to race discrimination and sex discrimination.</p>	
020828 - 021222	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms HO's remarks that –</p> <p>(a) the Hong Kong Society for the Blind had launched an audio description project which provided audio description training for volunteers and arranged trained volunteers to provide audio description services to persons with VI; and</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>(b) the provision of audio description training and services would be useful for schools which had admitted students with VI.</p> <p>Summing up, the Chairman's remarks that –</p> <p>(a) EDB should ensure that SEN students were provided with reasonable choices of elective subjects under the NSS curriculum.</p> <p>(b) The Subcommittee should consider inviting UGC and post-secondary institutions to discuss issues related to the provision of support for SEN students.</p> <p>(c) EDB should explore with CEDB on introducing amendments to copyright legislation with a view to facilitating the production and provision of braille reading materials and e-textbooks for VI students.</p> <p>(d) The Administration should consider the suggestion of setting up a dedicated learning support fund for direct application by SEN students for purchasing necessary assistive tools.</p>	<p>The Secretariat to prepare a summary of views/concerns.</p> <p>The Administration to provide a written response as stated in paragraph 3 of the minutes.</p>
<i>Agenda Item II – Any other business</i>			
021223 - 021513	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
 21 October 2013