

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)927/12-13
(The minutes have been seen by the
Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/ED

Panel on Education

Minutes of special meeting
held on Friday, 2 November 2012, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** :
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
 - Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
 - Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
 - Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
 - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
 - Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
 - Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
 - Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon WONG Yuk-man
 - Hon Claudia MO
 - Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
 - Hon Charles Peter MOK
 - Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
 - Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
 - Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
 - Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Members absent** :
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

**Public Officers : Agenda item I
attending**

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP
Secretary for Education

Ms Jessie WONG
Deputy Secretary for Education (2)

**Attendance by : Session 1 (9:00 am - 10:40 am)
invitation**

The Association of Heads of Secondary Schools of
Tsuen Wan, Kwai Chung and Tsing Yi

Mr HO Moon-tim
Chairman

Mr CHIK Pun-shing

Ms Florence MAN Ching-fan

HHCKLA Buddhist Ching Kok Secondary School

Ms YAU Mei-sze
Principal

Ho Yu College and Primary School (Sponsored by Sik
Sik Yuen)

Ms LEE Suet-ying
Principal

Fanling Kau Yan College

Ms Veronica YAU Kit-ying
Principal

China Holiness Church Living Spirit College

Mr FUNG Sui-hing
Principal

Mr LAW Chan-fai

Sha Tin District Secondary School Heads Association

Mr CHAU Hau-fung
Vice-chairman

Yuen Long District Secondary School Heads Association

Mr Teddy TANG Chun-keung
Chairman

Association of the Heads of Secondary School

Mr YUEN Pong-yiu
Chairman

Ng Yuk Secondary School

Mr LIN Chun-pong
Principal

Wong Tai Sin District Secondary School Heads Association

Ms LAU Yiu-hung
Chairlady

Mr Calepodius POON Shing-kai

Caput Schools Council

Mr CHAN Yau-chi
Chairman

Pui Ying Secondary School

Mr LEUNG Kwok-kay
Principal

Association of School Heads of Islands District

Mr AU-YEUNG Sung-fan
Principal

中學議會及十八區中學校長會聯席會議

Mr LIU Ah-chuen
Convenor

Mr LAU Chi-kuen

Mr YUEN Tze-lam

The Association of Secondary School Heads, Tai Po District

Mr KWOK Wing-keung
Chairman

New Territories School Heads Association

Mr POON Hing-fai

Mr NG Chun-hung

S.K.H. Holy Trinity Church Secondary School

Mr LEE Poon-shing
Principal

Yuen Long Catholic Secondary School

Mr LAU Kwong-yip
Principal

North District Secondary School Principals' Association

Mr YIM Chi-shing
Principal

Miss Van Wai-yee

Mr LEE Chi-shing

黃大仙中學校長會中學學位協調專責小組

Dr HO Sai-mun
Convenor

Aberdeen Baptist Lui Ming Choi College

Ms YEUNG Mei-lun
Principal

Miss Christina CHEUNG Suk-yuen

Tang King Po School

Mr LEE Kam-hung
Principal

Mr LEUNG Ping-ki

Session 2 (10:50 am – 1:05 pm)

CNEC Lee I Yao Memorial Secondary School

Mr TANG Kam-ming
Principal

Mr WA Kwai-lun

Ms WONG Sheung-Kam

Mr LI Chi-lam

Ma On Shan Tsung Tsin Secondary School

Dr KWOK Kai-ming

St. Joan of Arc Secondary School

Ms Janet WONG Wai-chun
Principal

Shatin Tsung Tsin Secondary School

Mr CHEUNG Man-wai
Principal

Wa Ying College

Mr TSANG Kai-man
Principal

Buddhist Tai Hung College

Miss HO Yuen-ying
Principal

Hong Kong True Light College

Ms Theresa TAO Chee-ying
Principal

Hong Kong Subsidized Secondary School Council

Mr James LAM Yat-fung
Vice-chairman

教育議會及全港十八區校長會聯席代表(深水埗區)

Mr CHAN Shiu-choy

St. Peter's Secondary School

Mr TONG Hing-keung
Principal

Ms CHIK Mei-ling

Ms YEUNG Mei-hay

Hong Kong Teachers' Association

Mr KWOK Man-leung
President

Ling Liang Church E Wun Secondary School

Mr WONG Wai-tung
Principal

Newman Catholic College

Mr LAM Chi-kong
Principal

HKWMA Chu Shek Lun Secondary School

Ms Winnie WAI Yee-kwan
Principal

The Committee on Home-School Cooperation

Dr Gordon TSUI
Chairman

Ms Annie CHAN Kit-ching

Civic Party

Ms Annie KI
Exco of Community and Social Development Policy Branch

Mr Jonathan LAI

D-DONG

Mr Charles C K CHONG
Head of Policy Research Department

Miss TO Yuk-yin

New Asia Middle School

Ms WONG Wai-ting
Principal

Grant Schools Council

Mr Geroge TAM Siu-ping
Chairman

Caritas Chong Yuet Ming Secondary School

Mr LEUNG Wing-sun
Vice Principal

PAOC Ka Chi Secondary School

Mr WONG Wai-keung
Principal

Mr HUI Wing-ho

The Joint Council of Parent-Teacher Associations of the
Shatin District

Ms Lucia LEUNG Mei-ling
Chairperson

Hong Kong Taoist Association Tang Hin Memorial
Secondary School

Mr LAU Chi-yuen
Principal

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Mr WONG Hak-lim
Vice-president

Clerk in attendance : Ms Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (4)4

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Esther CHEUNG
Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Action

I. Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration
- LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(02) -- Background brief entitled "Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

Action

Written submissions from deputations / individuals not attending the meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(07) -- Submission from Eastern District Council Member
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(08) -- Submission from A member of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(09) -- Submission from Sheng Kung Hui Chi Fu Chi Nam Primary School
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(10) -- Submission from Mr Eric TSUI
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(11) -- Submission from Sheng Kung Hui Tin Wan Chi Nam Primary School
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(12) -- Submission from Hong Kong Laboratory Technicians' Association
- LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(13) -- Submission from Mr Tommy YIU
- LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(10) -- Submission from Chinese YMCA College
- LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(13) -- Submission from Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers
- LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(14) -- Submission from Democratic Party
- LC Paper No. CB(4)107/12-13(10) -- Submission from Ho Lap College (Sponsored by the Sik Sik Yuen))

Members noted the background brief prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(02)] and the submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting.

Briefing by the Administration

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Education ("SED") briefed members on the relief measures put forward by EDB to address the temporary decline in the number of Secondary One (S1) students in the coming few years as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)74/12-13(01)]. He said that the decline of S1 population in the coming few years would be temporary and the number of S1 students

Action

would rebound steadily starting from 2017-2018 school year. Hence, instead of making long-term structural changes to the education system, the relief measures were timely, proportionate and targeted at the present situation. He emphasized that the overall objectives were to preserve the stability and strength of the schools and the teaching force.

Session 1

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

3. After receiving views from the first two deputations which were given two minutes each for presenting their views, the Chairman agreed with members' suggestion to cancel the discussion session so as to allow more time for deputations/individuals to present their views. Thereafter, each deputation/individual had up to three minutes to present their views.

4. A total of 33 deputations/individuals presented their views in the first session. Their major concerns were summarized in the **Appendix**.

Initial response by the Administration

5. SED thanked the deputations for their views. He reiterated the Administration's objectives of preserving the stability and strength of the schools and the teaching force. He advised members that the student-to-teacher ratio in local secondary schools was 15.3:1 which was comparable to the ratios of other developed economies in Asia, namely Taiwan, Singapore, Korea and Japan, which were 15.0:1, 16.1:1, 18.2:1 and 13.2:1 respectively. The average number of students per class in local secondary schools was 33.4 whereas the figures of the aforementioned economies were 32.7, 36.6, 35.3 and 32.9 respectively.

Session 2

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

6. A total of 33 deputations/individuals presented their views in the second session. Their major concerns were summarized in the **Appendix**.

7. To allow sufficient time for discussion and with the consent of all members present, the Chairman extended the meeting for 35 minutes beyond the appointed ending time.

Action

Discussions

8. SED thanked the deputations for their views. He said that the Administration and the education sector shared common objectives. He explained that the purpose of the Early Retirement Scheme for Aided Secondary School Teachers ("ERS") was not to encourage or force teachers to quit their jobs. Instead, it was an option for teachers' consideration. He took note of the need for the Administration to maintain dialogue with stakeholders, in particular on measures to sustain the stability of the teaching force.

Consultation with stakeholders

9. Ms Cyd HO questioned the need for the Administration to issue a full-page newspaper advertisement today stating its stance, instead of engaging the stakeholders in direct discussion. Ms Claudia MO expressed regret that SED had not communicated directly with the stakeholders but had chosen to issue a full-page newspaper advertisement. Ms Starry LEE urged SED to strengthen communication with the stakeholders.

10. In response, SED advised that the full-page advertisement was in response to the concern of many stakeholders that the Administration should inform the public clearly its stance and proposed measures to address the temporary decline in the number of S1 students. SED reiterated that the Administration had engaged key stakeholders in intensive discussion and this would continue in the next few weeks.

11. The Deputy Chairman considered that to achieve effective consultation with stakeholders, the Administration should disclose more relevant information and statistics to facilitate the discussion. Ms Claudia MO noted from some school principals that communication with parents should be strengthened because some parents might not have fully understood and opposed the stance taken by the schools to reduce the number of S1 students allocated to each class.

12. SED said that the Administration would spare no effort to enhance consultation with stakeholders in a focused matter. Regarding the measures to address the impact arising from the decline in S1 student population, the Administration had held in-depth discussion with various stakeholders and arranged consultation with schools at district level. SED reiterated that he would continue the dialogue with stakeholders in the coming two weeks.

Action

"3-2-1 proposal"

13. Dr Fernando CHEUNG noted that most of the deputations attending the meeting supported the "3-2-1 proposal" in the allocation of S1 places, which meant the progressive reduction of class size by three, two and one places in each of the coming three school years respectively. Dr CHEUNG asked whether the Administration would accept this "3-2-1 proposal".

14. Ms Starry LEE said that since the decline of S1 population was a short-term problem, the Administration should adopt a flexible mechanism which would allow the upward and downward adjustment to the number of students allocated to each S1 class to cater for changes in S1 student population.

15. Mr CHEUNG Man-wai of Shatin Tsung Tsin Secondary School and Mr James LAM Yat-fung of Hong Kong Subsidized Secondary School Council reiterated their stance that the Administration should consider the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by school principals.

16. In response, SED re-affirmed that the Administration had taken note of the views of deputations and members, and would carefully study all proposals received.

Small class teaching

17. Dr Kenneth CHAN recalled that in his reply to an oral question at the Council meeting on 17 October 2012, SED had stated that while small class teaching ("SCT") was useful in primary schools, its effectiveness in secondary schools was yet to be proved. Dr CHAN remarked that after listening to the deputations, SED should have reckoned the urgent and genuine need to implement SCT in secondary schools. He urged the Administration to pursue with stakeholders the necessary arrangements to implement SCT in secondary schools.

18. Dr Helena WONG said that Members of the Democratic Party supported the implementation of SCT in primary and secondary schools. Regarding the student-to-teacher ratio in secondary schools as mentioned by SED, Dr WONG was of the view that Hong Kong should make reference to the student-to-teacher ratios in other advanced economies instead of confining the comparison to the prevailing ratios in Asian countries only.

Action

19. In response, SED said that SCT was a method of teaching. Implementing SCT in secondary schools would require thorough study. It was imprudent to come to any conclusion in a hasty manner and take the implementation of SCT as a means of solving the problem of temporary decline in S1 student population. Regarding the readiness of Hong Kong in implementing SCT, SED advised that the Administration would need to consolidate the experience of implementing SCT in primary schools and take into consideration relevant factors including the existing conditions of secondary schools, as well as relevant overseas experience.

20. Ms Claudia MO requested the Administration to provide information on the student-to-teacher ratio and the average class size of secondary schools in European countries, the United States, Australia and New Zealand. In reply, SED agreed to look up the relevant information, if available, for members' reference.

21. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung declared that he was a secondary school teacher. Based on his experience, implementation of SCT would be conducive to maintaining the quality of education, in particular for schools which had admitted students with special educational needs. He was disappointed to note the stance of the Administration that it was necessary to study overseas experience before making any decision to implement SCT in Hong Kong. He was concerned that in the absence of SCT under the existing policy, schools with relatively low student enrolment would be jeopardized and might eventually be closed.

22. In this connection, SED pointed out that SCT had already been implemented in primary schools. On whether SCT should be implemented in secondary schools, he reiterated that the Administration would consolidate the experience gained in primary schools and take into careful consideration relevant factors including the existing conditions of secondary schools and overseas experience.

Measures to sustain existing secondary schools

23. Ms Starry LEE expressed her concern that according to media report, an estimated 100 secondary schools or so would eventually close down due to the decline of secondary student population. Ms Cyd HO sought the Administration's view on the impact which would result if certain "Band 3" secondary schools that had enabled students to deliver better performance were to be closed due to the decline in secondary student population. The Deputy Chairman was of the view that schools with fewer students were not necessarily under-performing schools and

Action

hence, under-enrolment of students arising from the decline of S1 student population schools should not be a reason to require closure of these schools.

24. In response, SED stated that it was not a government policy that secondary schools with under-enrolment of students would need to be closed. According to the Administration's initial estimate, under the relaxed criterion for approving S1 classes and the "not less than three classes requirement", there would be about five schools that might operate two S1 classes with an intake of 26 students.

Measures to sustain the stability of the teaching force

25. Given the drop in secondary student population, Ms Cyd HO considered that the Administration should provide more opportunities for serving teachers to receive professional training, especially on catering for students with special educational needs.

26. Ms Starry LEE was concerned whether EDB had any plan to retain serving teachers during the transitional drop in secondary student population. Ms Claudia MO was of the view that the Administration should examine the possibility of engaging the early-retired teachers in the preparation of teaching resources on account of their rich experience. The members also urged the Administration to consider reducing the number of teaching sessions for teachers.

27. Dr Helena WONG noted with concern that on one hand, the graduates of Hong Kong Institute of Education ("HKIEd") had found it difficult to join the teaching force; while on the other hand, serving teachers might apply for retirement under ERS. She questioned whether there was a need to adjust the number of places at HKIEd.

28. Ms Cyd HO was concerned about the measures, if any, to deal with the succession gap arising from the departure of experienced teachers under ERS; and whether EDB had assessed the possible impact of the teachers' departure on the feeling of students.

29. SED took note of the members' views for further consideration.

Quality of education

30. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that for the first time, over 200 school principals had attended a Panel meeting at the Legislative Council to

Action

express their views. This unprecedented action itself was ample proof of the importance of the subject. Dr CHEUNG considered that the crux of the matter was maintaining the quality of education. However, the Administration had missed the essential issue by shifting the focus to retaining existing secondary schools or sustaining the stability of the teaching force. The Deputy Chairman pointed out that the issues of concerns raised by deputations and members had been long-standing, but had never been properly addressed by the Administration. He stressed the need for proper long-term planning for education on the part of the Administration.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, a list of issues arising from the meeting had been drawn up and the Administration's written responses thereto were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)247/12-13(01) on 17 December 2012.)

31. Ms Cyd HO considered that the Permanent Secretary for Education ("PS(Ed)") played an important role in assisting SED, given her experience and involvement in dealing with the matter in the last term of Government. Ms HO was of the view that PS(Ed) should attend the special meeting to be held tomorrow to answer members' questions. Dr Kenneth CHAN shared Ms HO's view. He noted from some school principals that they had held meetings with PS(Ed) in the past few days. The attendance of PS(Ed) at the Panel meeting would enable members to better understand the communication between EDB and the schools or parents.

II. Any other business

32. The Chairman reminded members that the Panel would continue to receive deputations' views at the special meeting to be held at 9:00 am, Saturday, 3 November 2012. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:05 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
26 July 2013

Panel on Education

Special meeting on Friday, 2 November 2012, at 9:00 am

Measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
1.	The Association of Heads of Secondary Schools of Tsuen Wan, Kwai Chung and Tsing Yi [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(01)]	In addition to the written queries raised in its submission, the deputation was deeply concerned about the departure of experienced teachers as a result of the proposed extension of the Early Retirement Scheme for Aided Secondary School Teachers ("ERS") targeting at teachers with some 10 to 20 years' experience. The deputation urged the Education Bureau ("EDB") to re-open dialogue with the school sector to work out a flexible mechanism to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each Secondary One ("S1") class in the next three school years.
2.	Mr CHIK Pun-shing [LC Paper No CB(4)107/12-13(02)]	The decline in secondary student population provided a prime opportunity for implementing small class teaching. In calculating the teaching staff establishment of secondary schools, EDB had overlooked the wide range of responsibilities of teachers on top of their teaching duties, and the additional workload on teachers arising from catering for learning diversity among students, especially students with special educational needs ("SEN").
3.	Ms Florence MAN Ching-fan	EDB was asked - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● to advise on the number of schools in different districts which would be required to reduce the number of their S1 classes in the next three years notwithstanding the implementation of targeted measures such as relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes; ● to seriously consider the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by the education sector to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class in the next three years; and ● instead of extending ERS, to examine ways to retain experienced teachers so as to avoid any succession gap in the teaching force to the detriment of students' interest.
4.	HHCKLA Buddhist Ching Kok Secondary School	The school highlighted the onerous workload and responsibilities on teachers under the New Senior Secondary ("NSS") curriculum, including catering for learning diversity among students. EDB was urged to seize the opportunity of the decline in secondary student population to enhance teaching/learning and the quality of education by lowering the teacher-to-student ratio.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
5.	Ho Yu College and Primary School (Sponsored by Sik Sik Yuen)	The school doubted the effectiveness of the targeted measures introduced by EDB in preserving the strength and stability of the school sector and teaching force. The existing arrangement of employing teachers on contract terms instead of on permanent establishment created uncertainty and instability in the teaching profession. EDB should examine measures to ensure that there would be sufficient trained and experienced teachers to cope with the anticipated rebound in secondary student population in a few years' time.
6.	Fanling Kau Yan College	The school expressed disagreement with EDB's views on small class teaching ("SCT") as published in its newspaper advertisement, and highlighted that while smaller group teaching was practiced for some elective subjects under the NSS curriculum, the teaching of core subjects was conducted in large classes often comprising 38 students. EDB should seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to seriously consider implementing SCT in secondary schools. The school strongly supported the "3-2-1 proposal".
7.	China Holiness Church Living Spirit College	The school expressed support for the "3-2-1 proposal", complemented by a mechanism to allow for upward adjustment in the number of students allocated to each S1 class when there was a rebound in S1 student population. It agreed with the relaxation of the criterion for approving S1 classes. However, there was serious concern that the existing class size under the New Academic Structure ("NAS") was not conducive to effective teaching and learning under the NSS curriculum, and compared less favourably to that under the old system. The school called for implementation of SCT in secondary schools, and drew the Administration's attention to the need to retain experienced teachers in the teaching profession.
8.	Mr LAW Chan-fai [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(01)]	EDB should accept the deputations' "3-2-1 proposal". It was a very humble request to ask EDB to consider capping the class size of senior secondary levels to 30 students, which was similar to the class size of Forms 6 and 7 under the old system. The Government was asked not to use fiscal reasons as the excuse of not considering "3-2-1 proposal".
9.	Sha Tin District Secondary School Heads Association	The deputation said that due to poor planning on the part of the Administration over the past decade or so and its decision to continue to build new schools despite the apparent drop in student population, there had been closure of secondary schools in Shatin due to under-enrolment. It was unfair that the school sector had to suffer the consequence of the Government's planning mistakes. The deputation considered that the only right steps taken by the Administration was the progressive reduction in the number of students allocated to each S1 class starting from the 2008-2009 school year to the prevailing 34 and the launch of the Voluntary Optimization of Class Structure Scheme ("VOCS Scheme"). The Administration was urged not to repeat its past mistakes in handling the current decline in S1 student population.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
10.	Yuen Long District Secondary School Heads Association [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(02)]	The deputation was disappointed that according to EDB's advertisement, the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by the education sector had not been accepted. Referring to students in Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai, the deputation hoped for an opportunity to provide them with quality education. Whilst it would not insist on implementation of SCT, the deputation called on the Administration to progressively reduce the class size in secondary schools starting from 2013-2014 school year for four consecutive years. It was pointed out that secondary schools in Yuen Long and Tin Shui Wai would be prepared to increase the intake of S1 students when the student population rebounded.
11.	Association of the Heads of Secondary School	The deputation considered that the targeted measures of reducing the number of students to each S1 class and relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes would only have limited effect in sustaining the strength of schools. It pointed out that the downsizing would result in redundancy of teachers and create instability in the teaching force, which were in no way conducive to quality education. EDB was urged to take into serious consideration the common view put forward by over 150 school principals when devising measures to address issues arising from the drop in secondary student population.
12.	Ng Yuk Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)107/12-13(03)]	The school had implemented school-based SCT since 2008 and it was well-received by students as well as teachers. The school supported the "3-2-1 proposal", and urged the Administration to seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to reduce the class size to 30 students and seriously consider implementing SCT in secondary schools.
13.	Wong Tai Sin District Secondary School Heads Association [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(03)]	The deputation expressed concern about the demand and supply of secondary school places in different districts and considered that EDB should play a more prominent and active role in overall planning. The deputation was of the view that greater flexibility should be exercised in reducing the number of students to be allocated to each S1 class in the light of individual schools' circumstances.
14.	Mr Calepodius POON Shing-kai	He explained the difficulties and challenges confronting frontline teachers in secondary schools, particularly in handling SEN students and those with specific learning difficulties. He considered that the remuneration package of teachers should be reviewed in order to sustain a quality teaching force and provide sufficient incentive for young and outstanding teachers to join/remain in the profession.
15.	Caput Schools Council	The deputation referred to past experience of interacting with students who came from other primary schools which been closed due to the drop in students, shared its concern that these students always had a bad feeling of being abandoned. The deputation was concerned that some secondary students facing school closure would need to experience the same predicament. The

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		Administration was urged to take appropriate measures to avert such a situation.
16.	Pui Ying Secondary School	The school said that while it had taken the initiative to implement school-based SCT, and teachers were willing to accept heavier teaching responsibilities, the school had not received any support from EDB to facilitate its work in enhancing teaching quality. The Administration was urged to improve the quality of education by taking the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to implement SCT in secondary schools.
17.	Association of School Heads of Islands District	The deputation agreed with the targeted measures of reducing the class size and allowing secondary schools to reduce the number of classes on a voluntary basis in the coming few years. However, the deputation drew the Administration's attention to the many new subject requirements under the NSS curriculum, greater learning diversity among students and the heavy workload on teachers and students. It strongly requested EDB to take the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class so as to cap the class size of secondary schools to 30 students. This would enable teachers to give more attention and provide greater support to individual students in the class.
18.	中學議會及十八區中學校長會聯席會議 [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(04)]	Pursuant to the deputations' proposal put forward to the former Secretary for Education in June 2011, the Administration should introduce, as the main measure, a mechanism to allow for the flexible adjustment in the number of students allocated to each S1 class in order to sustain the stability of the macro-education sector, supplemented by the ancillary measure of relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes. Merely adopting the ancillary measure was insufficient in dealing with the impact of the decline in S1 student population. According to the deputation, over 100 secondary schools would face closure due to under-enrolment. Some schools might need to enrol students whose performance fell short of the requirements of the schools, thus resulting in wide learning diversity among students. An unstable education sector could hardly attract quality individuals to join the teaching profession. The deputation urged EDB to maintain dialogue with the education sector to work out appropriate measures to address the impact arising from the drop in S1 student population in the next few years.
19.	Mr LAU Chi-kuen	He agreed with the views put forward by many deputations. He considered that there had been insufficient planning on the part of EDB in handling issues arising from the drop in secondary student population. Notwithstanding that his school had joined the VOCS Scheme, a few experienced teachers in the school would still have to leave their service due to the drop in the total number of classes. He urged EDB to allow secondary schools to decide on and make adjustment to their intake of S1 students based on their respective circumstances and needs.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
20.	Mr YUEN Tze-lam [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(02)]	He supported the "3-2-1 proposal". The Administration was asked to seriously consider the proposal put forward by the education sector, given that the proposal of progressively reducing the number of students allocated to each S1 class was cost-neutral. Regarding concerns that parents might oppose the "3-2-1 proposal", he opined that EDB should strengthen communication with parents to explain to them the underlying rationale for the proposal.
21.	The Association of Secondary School Heads, Tai Po District [LC Paper No CB(4)107/12-13(04)]	The deputation referred to the experience of secondary schools in Tai Po which had also been hard hit by the drop in student population. It supported the proposal of the secondary school sector to implement a mechanism whereby the number of students to be allocated to each S1 class could be flexibly adjusted in the light of the decline or increase in S1 student population. On relaxing the criterion of approving S1 classes, the deputation expressed doubt on whether all schools could enrol sufficient students to operate four S1 classes (i.e. 76 students or more to be enrolled by each school).
22.	New Territories School Heads Association [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(03)]	The deputation doubted the effectiveness of the targeted measures in preserving the stability of the secondary school sector and the teaching force. It urged EDB to seriously re-consider the "3-2-1 proposal" put forward by the school sector, failing which EDB should at least consider reducing the class size of S1 to 31 or 32 students in the coming school year to provide immediate relief to schools. Its other key proposals included mandating schools to reserve the repeaters' places in each S1 class for repeaters only, and where resources permitted, implementing SCT in secondary schools in order to upgrade the quality of education.
23.	Mr NG Chun-hung	To address issues arising from the drop in S1 student population, he supported the adoption of a mechanism under which the number of students allocated to each S1 class could be flexibly adjusted in the light of the decline or increase in student population. As regards the worry expressed by some parents that the "3-2-1 proposal" would reduce the chance of their children to get admitted to schools of their choice, he referred to the scenario where students from Band 3 schools were admitted to Band 1 or Band 2 schools to make up for sufficient enrolment. A mismatch between the students' abilities and the requirements of the school would arise which was detrimental to both the students and the school concerned.
24.	S.K.H. Holy Trinity Church Secondary School	The school supported the "3-2-1 proposal" as it was in line with what the Chief Executive ("CE") had highlighted in his Election Manifesto. As CE had considered that education was a form of investment, EDB should honour CE's undertaking and provide adequate resources to enhance the quality of education.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
25.	Yuen Long Catholic Secondary School	The school said that under Hong Kong's diversified education sector, schools had their respective vision and mission, catering for students of different abilities and needs. It considered that schools should be allowed to adjust their intake for S1 students.
26.	North District Secondary School Principals' Association [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(04)]	The deputation stressed that education was not a commercial activity. Different types of schools had their respective value and contribution. To avert the disastrous impact arising from the decline in S1 student population and to maintain the quality of education, the deputation reiterated its support for the main measure of introducing a mechanism under which the number of students allocated to each S1 class could be flexibly adjusted in the light of the decline or increase in student population, and the ancillary measure of relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes.
27.	Miss Van Wai-yee	The decline in S1 student population provided a golden opportunity for EDB to reduce the class size and improve the teacher-to-student ratio for secondary schools in order that teaching and learning effectiveness could be improved. Regarding concern that if the number of students allocated to each S1 class would be reduced across the board, students would have a lower chance of gaining admission to schools of their choice, she pointed out that with the drop in secondary student population in the coming few years and if the number of schools could be maintained, the chance for students to get admitted to their favourite schools should not be lower than before.
28.	Mr LEE Chi-shing [LC Paper No. CB(4)107/12-13(05)]	Referring to his own experience as a teacher, he was disappointed that many experienced teachers had left the teaching profession following the drop in student population. He considered that given the general drop in student population, the chance for students to get admitted to their favourite schools would not be diminished. He urged the Administration to review the inadequacies of the current education policy, and rectify the shortcomings.
29.	黃大仙中學校長會中學學位協調專責小組	The deputation was deeply concerned about the closure of many primary schools due to the drop in primary student population a few years ago. It was in full support of the "3-2-1 proposal" which was the consensus among the secondary school sector. The mere relaxation of the criterion for approving S1 classes was insufficient. It was anticipated that if the Administration would not implement the "3-2-1 proposal" to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class, quite a number of secondary schools would face closure due to insufficient enrolment in the next few years. It urged EDB to give due consideration to the concerted call of over 200 school principals.
30.	Aberdeen Baptist Lui Ming Choi College	The school was of the view that many schools had suffered the consequences of poor planning and implementation of education policies. It urged EDB to re-consider the "3-2-1 proposal" to relieve the pressure of under-enrolment on schools. The school considered that schools should focus on

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		its core education-related duties instead of having to undertake various activities in order to enrol sufficient number of students.
31.	Miss Christina CHEUNG Suk-yuen	<p>She presented her views as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Administration should put students' interest and learning needs as the top priority in its policy and planning. ● The challenges faced by education workers in dealing with learning diversity and integrated education should be recognized by the Administration and appropriate support should be provided. ● Reducing the number of students to be allocated to each S1 class and relaxing the criterion for approving S1 classes were essential. The Administration should work in collaboration with the school sector in devising suitable measures to address issues arising from the decline in S1 student population.
32.	Tang King Po School	The school was concerned that the closure of primary schools would not be repeated in the secondary school sector due to the decline in S1 student population. In its view, the mechanism that the number of students allocated to each S1 class could be flexibly adjusted in the light of the decrease or increase in S1 student population would be most effective. The school also highlighted that a large class size was not conducive to catering for learning diversity and the individual needs of students.
33.	Mr LEUNG Ping-ki	Based on his past experience, he pointed out that it was very difficult to anticipate the number of S1 students to be admitted by each school and the ultimate number of S1 classes. Given that education was a form of investment in human capital, he would not agree that the "3-2-1 proposal" and SCT should not be implemented due to cost considerations.
34.	CNEC Lee I Yao Memorial Secondary School	The school pointed out that with the general decline in S1 student population, the chance for students to get admitted to schools of their choice would not be diminished. It urged the Administration to provide additional resources for secondary schools admitting a large number of students with relatively weak academic performance in order that they could strengthen their support to these students. EDB was asked to review the resource allocation for secondary education and work closely with the school sector.
35.	Mr WA Kwai-lun	Whilst hoping that the targeted measures put forward by EDB could fulfil the objectives of preserving the strength of the schools and the teaching force, he referred to his experience in handling school closure, and considered that the Administration should take all necessary measures to prevent schools from closure. School closure could result in the wastage of a lot of material and

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		manpower resources, as well as leaving the students with unhappy memories which would probably have an adverse effect on their future development.
36.	Ms WONG Sheung-Kam	She drew the Administration's attention to challenges under the NSS curriculum such as the insufficiency of lesson time and the need for School-based Assessment ("SBA") on certain subjects etc. In addition to their teaching duties, frontline teachers were also required to handle the emotional and personal problems of individual students. The existing class size should be reduced to enable teachers to give more attention to individual students. She queried EDB's issuance of a newspaper advertisement announcing its stance instead of engaging the education sector in direct dialogue.
37.	Mr LI Chi-lam	He supported the "3-2-1 proposal" in order to maintain stability in the secondary school sector, and cautioned the possibility of mismatch between the abilities of the students and the requirements of the schools in case Band 3 students were allocated to places in Band 2 and Band 1 schools. He deplored the labeling effect on Band 3 schools and stressed that such schools were in no way weak schools. Many teachers serving in Band 3 schools were dedicated and professional, as well as working hard to implement integrated education to cater for SEN students. He urged for better two-way communication between EDB and the school sector.
38.	Ma On Shan Tsung Tsin Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)107/12-13(06)]	To enhance the quality of teaching and learning, the school had, on its own resources, split the class into smaller groups for teaching various subjects in order to better prepare students for the NSS curriculum. To ensure sufficient enrolment, teachers were often required to undertake non-teaching work to assist the school in enrolling sufficient students. The school stressed the need for maintaining a stable teaching force, and urged the Administration to seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to implement the "3-2-1 proposal".
39.	St. Joan of Arc Secondary School	The school highlighted that different schools had their respective missions to cater for the needs of different categories of students. It was necessary for the Administration to take concrete measures to relieve the pressure of insufficient enrolment on schools in order that teachers would not be required to take up non-teaching duties to assist in enrolling students, at the expense of providing the necessary support and attention to students. There was also concern that parents would have fewer choice if some schools had to be closed due to under-enrolment.
40.	Shatin Tsung Tsin Secondary School	According to the school, teachers serving in Band 1 schools also faced a lot of difficulties and many had health problems as a result. The personal and emotional problems of individual students and the education reforms under NAS posed challenges to teachers. Given the general decline in S1 student population, the chance of students to get admitted to schools of their choice would not

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		diminish upon implementation of the "3-2-1 proposal".
41.	Wa Ying College	The school urged the Administration to seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to improve the quality of teaching and learning. At the time of the launch of the VOCS Scheme in 2010, it had been envisaged that EDB would need to put forward practicable measures to deal with the decline in S1 student population after 2012-2013. The school supported the rationale of the "3-2-1 proposal" and urged for an orderly and progressive reduction in the class size.
42.	Buddhist Tai Hung College	Arising from the closure of some schools admitting Band 3 students due to insufficient enrolment, students from schools of a lower Band would be allocated in places in Band 1 or Band 2 schools. This would result in a mismatch between the performance of the students and the requirements of the schools, to the detriment of both the schools and the students concerned. The school also drew the Administration's attention to the fact that some Band 1 schools might no longer be able to use English as the medium of instruction ("MoI") for all classes due to learning differences among the students. As Chinese was used as MoI for some classes, teachers had to prepare bilingual teaching materials, adding to their heavy workload. The shortage and the high turnover rate of teachers adversely affected the learning outcome of students.
43.	Hong Kong True Light College [LC Paper No. CB(4)107/12-13(07)]	The school considered that it was the Administration's responsibility to make effective policies and planning and provide necessary resources to support quality education. It was indeed unfair that individual schools had to arrange small-group teaching by using its own limited resources. The Administration was urged to seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to reduce the class size of senior secondary levels to 30 students per class, which was the class size of Forms 6 and 7 under the old system, to enhance effective teaching and learning.
44.	Hong Kong Subsidized Secondary School Council [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(05)]	The deputation urged EDB to critically re-consider the extension of ERS as the arrangement was meant to provide for early retirement of teachers with over 10 years teaching experience. Given that this group of teachers was in possession of the requisite experience and expertise, their quitting the teaching profession was a big loss to the education sector. According to the deputation, some 100 secondary schools would face reduction in classes or school closure in the next few years. EDB was requested to accept the "3-2-1 proposal" with a view to lowering the class size to 28 in 2015-2016 school year. Together with the two repeater places, the class size of 30 students would be comparable to the class size of Forms 6 and 7 under the old system.
45.	教育議會及全港十八區校長會聯席代表(深水埗區) [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(05)]	The deputation considered the introduction of the VOCS Scheme in 2010 a right step to take. It expressed grave concern on the possible closure of secondary schools in the next few years due to insufficient enrolment. The deputation said that it did not insist strictly on the "3-2-1 proposal",

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		but was advocating for a flexible mechanism to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class in the next three years. EDB was urged to discuss with the education sector for practicable solutions instead of promulgating its stance through newspaper advertisement.
46.	St. Peter's Secondary School	According to the school, the Administration might have under-estimated the number of schools facing closure in the next few years. The school reflected that schools operating one or two S1 classes would not be able to provide a full range of different learning experiences for students. In the overall interest of students, the Administration should seriously consider implementing the "3-2-1 proposal".
47.	Ms CHIK Mei-ling [LC Paper No CB(4)107/12-13(08)]	Under the old system, students admitted to Form 6 were in possession of better academic performance and motivation to learn. Under NAS, however, all S1 students would be able to progress to S6. It was apparent that there would be wider learning diversity among students and greater need for teachers to devote more time and attention to students. Reducing the class size to 30 students per class was a reasonable request. The Administration was urged to give serious consideration before closing any school as it would take a long time to develop the system and teaching support of a school.
48.	Ms YEUNG Mei-hay [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(06)]	She said that on one hand, EDB emphasized the need to stabilize the teaching force; but on the other hand, offered 700 places under ERS to provide for early retirement of eligible experienced teachers. She highlighted the adverse consequences resulting from students from schools in a lower banding being allocated to schools of a higher banding, which included the frustration faced by students who found themselves lagging behind, the onerous workload on teachers etc.
49.	Hong Kong Teachers' Association [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(07)]	The deputation was gravely concerned about the instability facing the secondary school sector arising from the continual decline in S1 student population, which would deter aspiring young people from joining the teaching profession. It urged the Administration to seriously consider implementing the proposal put forward by some 200 school principals, accounting for about 50% of all school principals.
50.	Ling Liang Church E Wun Secondary School	The Administration was reminded not to ignore the views of the education sector, in particular the fact that nearly half of the secondary school principals in Hong Kong had come forward and expressed their strong view to progressively reduce the class size to a reasonable level following the decline in S1 student population. Parents were advised that it was inappropriate to try all means to seek admission of their children to Band 1 schools, regardless of their children's ability and individual learning needs. The mismatch as a consequence would not be beneficial to these students.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
51.	Newman Catholic College	The relaxation of the criterion of approving S1 classes was far from insufficient in addressing the impact arising from the decline in S1 student population. In the view of the school, reducing the number of students allocated to each S1 class and the VOCS Scheme were more effective measures. The Administration would take heed of the possibility that some 100 secondary schools would face possible closure due to insufficient enrolment.
52.	HKWMA Chu Shek Lun Secondary School	The Administration should seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population to enhance the quality of education. The school considered it unreasonable that the class size of Forms 6 was 30 students under the old system; whereas under the NSS curriculum, the class size had been enlarged to 36 students despite greater learning diversity among students. Instead of merely comparing the teacher-to-student ratio in Hong Kong with Asian countries, the Administration should provide information on the comparison with advanced economies such as European countries, the United States, Australia and New Zealand.
53.	The Committee on Home-School Cooperation	The deputation noted that the decline in S1 student population was temporary and that EDB should take targeted measures to avoid school closure. On account of the difficulty of some Band 3 schools in recruiting sufficient students, the deputation agreed that EDB should consider providing additional resources specifically for these schools to ensure their continued operation. Given parents' concern about the across-the-board reduction in the number of students allocated to each S1 class, the deputation considered that EDB should adopt a district-based approach to fine-tune any such proposal with regard the circumstances prevailing in the district. The deputation supported ERS but suggested that a mechanism should be put in place to permit certain experienced retired teachers to re-join the teaching force where necessary.
54.	Ms Annie CHAN Kit-ching [LC Paper No CB(4)107/12-13(09)]	To enable teachers to provide the necessary support to students under the NSS curriculum, the class size should be reduced. She was deeply concerned about the adoption of a market-driven direction in the provision of education, and stressed the need to take a student-based approach.
55.	Civic Party [LC Paper No. CB(4)132/12-13(01)]	The deputation urged the Administration to seize the opportunity of the decline in S1 student population examine the feasibility of implementing SCT in secondary schools. SCT would enable teachers to give more attention and support to individual students in the class under the NSS curriculum, and was conducive to the effective implementation of integrated education where the special educational needs of students had to be catered for. As CE had highlighted in his Election Manifesto the need for planning in education in the light of changes in population, EDB should formulate its policy on SCT without further delay.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
56.	Mr Jonathan LAI	He pointed out that the class size of 36 students under the NSS curriculum was a 20% increase over the class size of 30 students in Forms 6 and 7 under the old system. Given that secondary students under NAS were not required to be assessed in any public examination until completion of S6, he explained that the students were less mature and self-reliant than their predecessors, thus requiring more attention and support by teachers in schools. The prevailing large class was not conducive to quality teaching and learning and the implementation of initiatives such as integrated education. He also asked EDB to make reference to the secondary school class structure in Japan and Finland in considering the appropriate teacher-to-student ratio for Hong Kong.
57.	D-DONG [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(08)]	The deputation considered that school closure was not a good policy, and would have a negative impact on the students affected. The deputation also queried the Administration's stance that the drop in secondary student population was transitional. It asked the Administration to assess the need for education arising from the children born in Hong Kong whose parents were not Hong Kong residents.
58.	Miss TO Yuk-yin [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(09)]	She considered it opportune for the Administration to implement SCT in secondary schools in the light of the decline in S1 student population. She also highlighted the adverse consequences of the mismatch when students from schools of a lower banding were allocated to schools of a higher banding.
59.	New Asia Middle School	It was pointed out that as a result of the possible closure of some Band 3 schools due to insufficient enrolment, some students would be allocated to Band 2 or Band 1 schools, giving rise to a problem of mismatch. The school also stressed schools operating only one or two S1 classes would not be capable of offering a full or diversified range of learning experiences to their students. The schools urged the Administration to consider the "3-2-1 proposal" or similar proposal to progressively reduce the number of students allocated to each S1 class.
60.	Grant Schools Council [LC Paper No. CB(4)88/12-13(06)]	The deputation declared that although their member schools did not have enrolment problem, it supported the proposal of reducing class size during the transitional drop in the student population. It further suggested that for those through-train schools, they should be given the option to either maintain the status quo (class size: 34 plus two repeater places) or go along with the other schools to reduce the class size according to be number approved by EDB subsequently. The deputation urged for direct dialogue between EDB and the school sector instead of promulgating positions through newspaper advertisements.
61.	Caritas Chong Yuet Ming Secondary School	The deputation did not make any oral presentation of views.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
62.	PAOC Ka Chi Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(11)]	According to the school, back in 2008-2009, it had a very difficult time carrying out various activities in order to recruit sufficient number of students to avoid school closure. In its view, EDB should educate parents how to choose schools suitable for their children. It supported the "3-2-1 proposal" and a mechanism to increase the student intake when the student population rebounded.
63.	Mr HUI Wing-ho	He drew the Administration's attention to the onerous workload and heavy responsibilities of school principals and teachers under the current education system where a lot of education reforms had been carried out and initiatives such as integrated education had been implemented in recent years. He considered that the main solution to improve the quality of education was to reduce the number of students in each class.
64.	The Joint Council of Parent-Teacher Associations of the Shatin District	The deputation stated that it supported the "3-2-1 proposal", as it was the consensus reached by the secondary school sector which was in the best position to understand what was best for the students. The deputation agreed that the proposal could bring about a better learning environment and enhance the quality of education. It could also avoid the closure of some Band 3 schools due to insufficient enrolment. Given the contribution of many Band 3 schools in catering for the needs of some students, the deputation considered it necessary to sustain these schools.
65.	Hong Kong Taoist Association Tang Hin Memorial Secondary School [LC Paper No. CB(4)95/12-13(12)]	Although the school did not have enrolment problems, it would support the immediate reduction of the class size to 30 students to enhance teaching and learning. When the student population rebounded, arrangements could be made for individual schools to adjust their class size upwards according to the needs of the respective districts. The effectiveness of SCT was proven and the Administration should make reference to the experience in Finland.
66.	Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union	The deputation criticized EDB's lack of long-term planning for the development of education. As EDB would not take forward SCT in secondary schools, Hong Kong would lag behind most advanced economies where SCT was practised. The deputation queried EDB's basis for estimating that only about five schools might be closed in the coming school year. It was also doubtful whether a school operating only two S1 classes with 26 students could sustain. The deputation also deplored the proposed extension of ERS as it was tantamount to depleting the secondary school sector of the most experienced and valued teachers.