

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)971/12-13
(The minutes have been seen by the
Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/ED

Panel on Education

Minutes of special meeting
held on Friday, 11 January 2013, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** :
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
 - Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
 - Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
 - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
 - Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
 - Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
 - Hon Charles Peter MOK
 - Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
 - Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
 - Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
 - Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Members attending** :
- Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
 - Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, JP
- Members absent** :
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
 - Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
 - Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
 - Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
 - Hon WONG Yuk-man
 - Hon Claudia MO

Public Officers : Agenda item I
attending

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP
Secretary for Education

Mr Kevin YEUNG
Under Secretary for Education

Ms Michelle LI, JP
Deputy Secretary for Education (1)

Ms Pecvin YONG
Principal Assistant Secretary (Further Education)

Attendance by : Session 1
invitation

Pui Ching Academy

Dr SHUM Kam-hong
Director

YMCA College of Careers

Dr Simon LAW Wai-on
Principal

Hong Kong Association of Careers Masters and
Guidance Masters

Dr HO Yuk-fan
Chairperson

Hong Kong Buddhist College

Professor Edwin WONG King-por
President

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Dr FUNG Wai-wah
President

HKU SPACE Po Leung Kuk Community College

Dr Keith P C LAM
College Deputy Principal

The University of Hong Kong School of Professional
and Continuing Education

Professor T M WONG
Principal

Hong Kong Association of the Heads of Secondary
Schools

Dr Samuel CHENG Kin-tak
Principal

Hong Kong Institute of Technology

Dr Joy SHI
President

City University of Hong Kong

Professor Paul K S LAM
Vice – President (Student Affairs)

Hong Kong Baptist University

Dr Simon C H WONG
Dean of Continuing Education

Hong Kong Association of Squint and Double Vision
Sufferers

Ms CHU Yim-chun
Chairperson

The Open University of Hong Kong

Professor Danny WONG Shek-nam
Vice – President (Academic)

Hong Kong Federation of Students

Mr LI Shing-hong
Secretary General

The Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students'
Union

Mr Andy CHAN Man-fai
President

大專行動 – 立即雙普選部

Mr CHAN Tak-wan
Chief Commander

Lingnan University Students' Union

Mr CHAN Shu-fai
President

Miss HO Kit-wang

The Student Union of Hong Kong Shue Yan University

Mr NG Chung-tat
President

副學士苦主大聯盟

Mr Oscar LO
Member

Mr Gil LEE

恒生管理學院本科部學生會

Mr SIT Ka-ming
President

Mr Benny CHONG

恒管事務關注組

Mr Johnny NGAI
Committee Member

Session 2

The Community College at Lingnan University /
Lingnan Institute of Further Education

Ms Cindy SIU Sau-yin
Associate Director

陳宗佑社區服務處

Mr CHAN Chung-yau
Social Officer

Kaplan Business and Accountancy School

Dr LAU Shek-lam
Head of Academics

Labour Party

Mr SIU Chiu-kit
Representative

The Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Professor Peter YUEN
Dean of College of Professional and Continuing
Education

Dr CHANG Chung-nan

Mr Marcus TSE
District Councillor (Eastern)

Hang Seng Management College

Professor Gilbert C F FONG
Acting President

Mr Conrad KARAGEORGE

Tung Wah College

Professor Thomas WONG Kwok-shing
President

Yew Chung Community College

Dr Sultana TUPURKOVKSA-POPOSKA
College Secretary

The Hong Kong Institute of Education

Mr Chris MONG
Vice President (Administration) cum Director, School
of Continuing and Professional Education

Alliance for the Concern of Sub-degree Education

Mr TAM Lok-kei
Representative

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Mr Vincent CHENG
Deputy Spokesperson for Education Affairs

Education Union of Knowledge and Practice

Mr WONG Yeung-ling
Chairman

Civic Party

Mr Justin CHIN
Member of Civic Party

Miss Cecilia CHANG

SCAD Hong Kong

Mr Grant PREISSER
Associate VP

Joint Quality Review Committee

Ms W S WONG
Executive Director

D-DONG

Mr Charles C K CHONG
Policy Research Department Head

Mr CHEUNG Chi-wai

Hong Kong College of Technology

Mr CHAN Cheuk-hay
President & Principal

守護城大社工副學士兼讀課程關注組

Miss LEUNG Chun-fong

Hong Kong Federation of Social Work Students

Mr CHAN Pak-hang

Clerk in attendance : Miss Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (4)4

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Esther CHEUNG
Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU
Legislative Assistant (4)3

Action

I. Self-financing post-secondary education

(LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(02) -- Background brief on issues related to self-financing post-secondary education in Hong Kong prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

Written submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(11) -- Submission from Hong Kong Subsidized Secondary Schools Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(12) -- Submission from Centennial College

LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(13) -- Submission from a member of the public

LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(14) -- Submission from Preparatory Team for the proposed Jesuit Liberal Arts College Hong Kong, Society of Jesus)

Members noted the background brief prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(02)] and the submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting.

Briefing by the Administration

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Education ("SED") briefed members on the latest position on the development of the self-financing post-secondary education sector as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(01)]. He highlighted that it was the Government's policy to support the parallel development of the publicly-funded and self-financing post-secondary education sectors, which would broaden the opportunities and choices for further education and

Action

provide diversified and flexible pathways with multiple entry and multiple exit points for secondary school leavers. Since 2012 was a double-cohort year, publicly-funded and self-financing undergraduate places had been increased for the 2012-2013 academic year to meet the needs of eligible secondary school leavers. Moreover, he stressed that the Administration had all along attached great importance to the quality of post-secondary education. On the recommendation of establishing a single quality assurance body put forward by the University Grants Committee ("UGC") in its report entitled "Aspirations for the Higher Education System in Hong Kong" ("Review Report") published in 2010, the Administration had been implementing incremental steps to enhance the quality assurance mechanism and would explore the possibility of eventually setting up a single quality assurance body. Regarding the recent incident of over-enrolment by the Community College of Lingnan University ("CCLU") and Lingnan Institute of Further Education ("LIFE"), SED said that he had received the Inquiry Panel's Report submitted by Lingnan University in the afternoon of 10 January 2013, and would study the Report carefully.

Session 1

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

3. A total of 24 deputations/individuals presented their views in the first session. Their major concerns were summarized in the **Appendix Ia**.

Initial response by the Administration

4. SED thanked the deputations for presenting their views. On the deployment of public resources, he advised that the Government had all along invested heavily in education and the recurrent expenditure on education accounted for about one-fifth of the total recurrent government expenditure in 2013-2014. Since 2012 was a double-cohort year, to meet the needs of some 100 000 secondary school leavers, about 38 000 undergraduate places were provided in the 2012-2013 academic year, among which 30 300 were publicly-funded places. As advised by SED, including some 39 500 sub-degree places, over 70 000 post-secondary places were available in the 2012-2013 academic year for secondary school leavers.

5. On measures to support the development of the self-financing post-secondary education sector, SED informed members that a basket of support measures, including the Start-up Loan Scheme, had been implemented. Needy students pursuing self-financing post-secondary education could apply to the Student Financial Assistance Agency for

Action

means-tested and/or non-means-tested financial assistance. Some 30% of students had obtained grants while about 13% and 12% respectively had been granted means-tested and non-means-tested loans. On average, the grant disbursed per student was about \$42,000.

6. SED said that while post-secondary institutions enjoyed a high degree of autonomy in academic activities and day-to-day management, the Administration attached great importance to the governance and quality assurance of the post-secondary education sector. He recapitulated that the Administration had taken incremental steps to enhance the quality assurance mechanism and would explore the possibility of establishing a single quality assurance body as recommended by UGC.

Discussion

7. The Chairman drew members' attention to Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure which provided that a Member shall not move any motion or amendment relating to a matter in which he had a pecuniary interest, whether direct or indirect, or speak on any such matter, except where he disclosed the nature of that interest. He reminded members to declare interests, if any, in the matter under discussion.

Provision of post-secondary education

8. Ms Starry LEE noted the grievances of students and the operating difficulties faced by individual institutions. She considered that currently, the post-secondary education sector was highly polarized in terms of subsidy because on one hand, students admitted to UGC-funded programmes were fully subsidized; while on the other hand, students pursuing self-financing programmes had to pay high tuition fees which might have embodied other expenditures incurred by the institutions.

9. In this connection, SED advised that the post-secondary education sector in Hong Kong was rather unique as it was predominantly publicly-funded; whereas in other jurisdictions, post-secondary education was mainly provided by private universities/institutions.

10. Dr Fernando CHEUNG declared that he was a lecturer at the Hong Kong Polytechnic University ("HKPolyU"). Given the recent over-enrolment of some self-financing post-secondary programmes, Dr CHEUNG asked whether the Administration would increase the number of publicly-funded undergraduate places to meet the demand for post-secondary education. In response, SED said that in the 2012-2013 academic year, the

Action

number of publicly-funded first-year-first-degree places had been increased from 14 500 to 15 000. In addition, another 8 000 publicly-funded senior year places (i.e. 4 000 intake places) would be available by phases starting from the 2012-2013 academic year for articulation of sub-degree holders.

11. Dr Kenneth CHAN declared that he was an associate professor of the Department of Government and International Studies at the Hong Kong Baptist University ("HKBU"), but had not participated in any self-financing post-secondary programmes. Dr CHAN considered that the Administration had been too anxious to achieve its target of boosting the post-secondary education participation rate to 60%. Various institutions had responded by delivering self-financing post-secondary programmes in a "Great Leap Forward" manner, often at the expense of quality and the well-being of students. The proliferation of self-financing programmes and recent incidents of over-enrolment were the consequences of the market-driven approach adopted by many institutions to meet the demand for post-secondary education.

12. Mr MA Fung-kwok remarked that the over-enrolment for sub-degree programmes had demonstrated the need and aspiration of students in pursuing post-secondary education. He opined that the Administration should take steps to promote the recognition of the sub-degree qualification. In the light of the over-enrolment and other problems as depicted by the deputations, Mr MA considered that the Administration should conduct a comprehensive review on its policy for sub-degree education and its regulation of the self-financing post-secondary sector.

13. Mr Paul TSE declared that he was a Court member of the University of Hong Kong ("HKU"). Mr TSE remarked that the Administration should have forward planning and vision in devising its education policy. In addition to allocating resources for the provision of undergraduate and sub-degree programmes, he considered that the Administration should also strengthen the provision of vocational training as another option for secondary school leavers who did not wish to pursue academic study.

Support measures and financial aspects

14. Dr Helena WONG declared that she was a lecturer of the General Education Centre at HKPolyU but she had not participated in any teaching at the Hong Kong Community College, the self-financing arm of HKPolyU. Dr WONG asked whether the Administration would consider providing funding to non-UGC-funded institutions offering sub-degree programmes on the basis of \$30,000 per student per annum as suggested by Hong Kong

Action

Professional Teachers' Union. The Deputy Chairman enquired about the guiding principle for providing subvention and financial assistance to institutions and students respectively, and whether the capital development projects of the post-secondary institutions concerned would be funded by the Government.

15. In response, SED said that the Administration had noted the suggestions put forward by deputations for consideration. He reiterated that it was the Government's policy to support the parallel development of the publicly-funded and self-financing post-secondary education sectors. A basket of measures had been implemented to support the development of the self-financing post-secondary sector, such as the allocation of land or vacant school premises at nominal premium or rent to individual institutions and the provision of start-up loans. The provision of land for campus development such as academic facilities and hostels was made in accordance with the established policy. On financial assistance to students, SED said that the Administration would see to it that no student would be deprived of the opportunity of pursuing post-secondary education because of financial difficulties.

16. Dr Fernando CHEUNG was concerned about the collection of enrolment deposits by institutions offering self-financing post-secondary programmes and the difficulties faced by students from needy families, in particular those receiving Comprehensive Social Security Assistance, in paying the deposits. Dr Kenneth CHAN and Mr MA Fung-kwok were concerned about the use of the forfeited enrolment deposits by individual institutions. Mr MA considered it necessary for the institutions to enhance the transparency of their operation.

17. SED remarked that the UGC-funded institutions and self-financing post-secondary institutions were non-profit-making. The enrolment deposits paid by students who had taken up the places offered would become part of the tuition fees. Any enrolment deposits forfeited would not form part of an institution's profits, but would generally be used by the institution centrally for operation and development, such as using some of the funds for setting up scholarships and defraying the costs of certain capital works.

18. Regarding comments that the collection of enrolment deposits by institutions was an act of profiteering, Professor T M WONG of the University of Hong Kong School of Professional and Continuing Education considered such criticism unfair because it had been agreed among institutions and EDB that the collection of enrolment deposits was to minimize the wastage of places to the detriment of applicants on the waiting

Action

lists as some students might have been offered a place for more than one programme. Referring to his school, he said that the enrolment deposits collected were almost entirely utilized in setting up scholarships through the school's endowment fund and providing facilities for the benefit of students.

Issues related to quality assurance and governance

19. Noting the views submitted by some deputations, the Deputy Chairman was concerned about the regulation of the self-financing post-secondary education sector. In response, SED stressed that the Administration attached great importance to quality assurance and governance of the self-financing post-secondary sector. He highlighted the incremental steps taken by the Administration to enhance the quality assurance mechanism. In addition to the existing quality assurance mechanism administered by the three bodies, namely the Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications ("HKCAAVQ"), Quality Assurance Council ("QAC") and Joint Quality Review Committee ("JQRC"), the Government also considered that periodic external audits and reviews should be conducted on community colleges or the self-financing sub-degree operations under the aegis of UGC-funded institutions. To this end, the UGC-funded institutions were required under the Sixth Matching Grant Scheme to undertake that their sub-degree operations benefiting from the scheme should be subject to external quality audits.

20. Referring to the recommendation of UGC's Review Report, Dr Helena WONG enquired about the timetable and difficulties, if any, for establishing a single quality assurance body for the whole post-secondary education sector. SED informed members that a working group would be set up to study how to take forward the conduct of external quality audits mentioned above.

21. Dr Fernando CHEUNG commented that both the Administration and individual institutions were inclined to provide post-secondary education under a business model which focused on financial returns. He said that the problems in the governance of post-secondary institutions had existed for a long time. Dr Kenneth CHAN expressed his concern about the indiscriminate admission of students by individual institutions following a market-driven approach. He considered that the over-enrolment by CCLU/LIFE was only the tip of an iceberg. Dr CHAN sought information on the existing regulatory and quality assurance mechanism applicable to self-financing post-secondary institutions.

Action

22. Regarding the incident of over-enrolment, SED said that the Administration would study the Inquiry Panel's Report from Lingnan University with a view to considering how the regulation of the self-financing post-secondary sector could be enhanced.

Session 2

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

23. A total of 24 deputations/individuals presented their views in the second session. Their major concerns were summarized in the **Appendix Ib**.

Discussions

24. Under Secretary for Education ("US(Ed)") thanked the deputations for their views and said that the Administration would study the views carefully.

Provision of post-secondary education

25. Dr Fernando CHEUNG declared that he was teaching at HKPolyU. Dr CHEUNG remarked that Hong Kong had a highly selective higher education system. The Government had merely strived to achieve the target of a 60% post-secondary education participation rate, but without any action or plan to increase the number of publicly-funded undergraduate places as currently, only some 18% of secondary school leavers could be admitted to publicly-funded undergraduate programmes. Individual institutions had regarded the demand for higher education as a business opportunity, and had been offering self-financing programmes in a massive manner without due regard to their own readiness and the well-being of students. Dr CHEUNG enquired about the vision, if any, of the Administration in developing post-secondary education.

26. Dr Kenneth CHAN declared that he was an associate professor of the Department of Government and International Studies at HKBU but he had not participated in any self-financing post-secondary programmes. Dr CHAN shared Dr Fernando CHEUNG's concern, and considered that the over-enrolment incident at CCLU/LIFE had exposed the two-fold problem of the insufficiency of publicly-funded undergraduate places and the lack of regulatory oversight over the self-financing post-secondary education sector.

27. Noting members' views and concerns, US(Ed) advised that the Administration had not merely strived to attain a quantitative target in terms

Action

of the number of students who could have access to post-secondary education. In pursuing a policy to support the parallel development of the publicly-funded and self-financing post-secondary education sectors, the Administration aimed at broadening the choices and opportunities for further education, thereby providing quality, diversified and flexible pathways with multiple entry and exit points for school leavers.

Issues related to quality assurance and governance

28. Mr Abraham SHEK declared that he was a Council member and Court member of HKU. Mr SHEK referred to the over-enrolment incident at CCLU/LIFE, and enquired about the regulation of the operation of non-UGC-funded institutions and the monitoring of the quality of sub-degree programmes.

29. Deputy Secretary for Education (1) ("DS(Ed)1") said that each institution had established its own management and governance structure which was usually underpinned by committees overseeing academic, development and management policies and activities. At present, HKCAAVQ was responsible for the quality assurance of all non-UGC-funded institutions and the programmes offered by them. Programmes proposed to be offered by the institutions would be subject to accreditation by HKCAAVQ which would also take into account the institutions' capabilities to offer such programmes. The undergraduate and postgraduate programmes and the self-financing sub-degree programmes offered by UGC-funded institutions were subject to quality audits and review by QAC and JQRC respectively. DS(Ed)1 recapitulated that the Administration had also taken incremental steps to enhance the quality assurance mechanism.

30. Regarding the incident of CCLU/LIFE, DS(Ed)1 further advised that before submitting the proposed sub-degree programmes to JQRC for accreditation, Lingnan University had, in line with the prevailing procedures, conducted an internal assessment on the programmes and obtained the approval of the Senate on details of the programmes. Whether the relevant arrangements as approved by the Senate had been followed was another matter and could be subject to investigation by the Inquiry Panel.

31. Dr Helena WONG was concerned about the existing mechanism of quality assurance of self-financing post-secondary programmes. She considered that the co-existence of three different oversight bodies responsible for the quality assurance/accreditation of different post-secondary education providers was not conducive to quality assurance

Action

in a consistent, transparent and accountable manner. Noting UGC's recommendation in its Review Report to establish a single quality assurance body for the whole post-secondary system, Dr WONG asked when the single quality assurance body would be established and the role, if any, of the Administration in the quality assurance mechanism.

32. DS(Ed)1 advised that the Administration was studying the possibility of eventually setting up a single quality assurance body. In the interim, incremental steps had been implemented to enhance the quality assurance mechanism. The Tripartite Liaison Committee had been transformed to the Liaison Committee on Quality Assurance ("LCQA") by engaging QAC. LCQA had been promoting the sharing of existing practices of different institutions, and had issued written warnings to institutions in cases of non-compliance of the Common Descriptors for sub-degree programmes. One of the goals of LCQA was to enhance the transparency of the quality assurance mechanism and the consistency in practices among institutions. Separately, EDB was liaising with the Heads of Universities Committee to form a working group to study issues related to the conduct of external quality audits on sub-degree operations of UGC-funded institutions.

33. Dr Helena WONG noted that UGC-funded institutions were required to undertake that their sub-degree operations benefiting from the Sixth Matching Grants Scheme should be subject to periodic quality audits by HKCAAVQ. Dr WONG was gravely concerned about the conflict of interests arising from HKCAAVQ's role as a quality assurance body on the one hand, and its heavy reliance on the income derived from providing accreditation services for self-financing programmes on the other hand. In this regard, DS(Ed)1 responded that HKCAAVQ was an independent and statutory body operating on a self-financing basis. One of its responsibilities was to conduct accreditation on self-financing post-secondary programmes.

34. Dr Kenneth CHAN reiterated his concern about the indiscriminate admission of students by individual institutions following a market-driven approach, and the lack of regulatory oversight on post-secondary institutions.

35. US(Ed) said that the Administration had noted the views of deputations and members on the development of the self-financing post-secondary education sector. He stressed that the Administration would look into and address relevant issues in a responsible manner.

36. The Deputy Chairman requested the Administration to follow-up two cases. According to the Inquiry Panel's Report, LIFE had admitted 123 students who had not fulfilled the basic admission requirement to the

Action

Advanced Diploma programme. The Deputy Chairman was concerned about the remedial action to be taken and whether the qualification attained by these students would be recognized in future. Another case was brought up by the deputation "守護城大社工副學士兼讀課程關注組". According to the deputation, a part-time self-financing Associate Degree programme on Social Work offered by the Community College of City University ("CCCU") would be discontinued in 2013 due to the non-availability of venue for conducting the programme.

37. Regarding the Advanced Diploma programmes offered by LIFE, DS(Ed)1 said that the Education Bureau ("EDB") was concerned about the admission requirements and articulation arrangements of the programmes. EDB had written to Lingnan University in December 2012 requesting clarification, and was still awaiting Lingnan University's reply.

38. In this connection, Ms Cindy SIU Sau-yin of CCLU/LIFE advised that remedial programmes would be provided to the 123 students concerned to compensate for their non-fulfillment of admission requirements.

39. Regarding the CCCU's part-time self-financing programme, DS(Ed)1 said that after reviewing relevant documentation, EDB had already advised the institution in writing that the programme in question could be conducted at the proposed venue, namely Academic 2 of the City University of Hong Kong. It would be for the institution to decide whether the programme in question would be continued.

40. Noting the Administration's response, the Deputy Chairman maintained his request that the Administration should follow up these cases and report the outcome to the Panel.

41. At this juncture, the Deputy Chairman informed the meeting that Mr Abraham SHEK had suggested that a motion should be moved to request the Administration and individual post-secondary institutions to address the concerns raised at the meeting. Due to time constraint, the Deputy Chairman suggested that the Panel should continue discussion at the Panel's regular meeting to be held on the following Monday, 14 January 2013.

Action

II. Any other business

42. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:20 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 September 2013

Panel on Education
Special meeting on Friday, 11 January 2013, at 9:30 am
Self-financing post-secondary education
Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals
[First session]

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
1.	Pui Ching Academy [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(01)]	The institution considered that over-enrolment in the 2012-2013 academic year was a short-term problem. To safeguard against over-enrolment, quality assurance bodies should set certain benchmarks for assuring the quality of teaching and learning, such as the minimum space entitlement of each student. To facilitate the development of self-financing post-secondary institutions, the Government should provide additional financial support in the form of special start-up grants and/or start-up matching grants.
2.	YMCA College of Careers	The college was concerned that over-enrolment might be indicative that education had become a profiteering activity. According to the college, small to medium institutions might have difficulties in applying for membership of the Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education. All institutions, irrespective of whether they were members of the Federation, should be eligible to offer the New Yi Jin Diploma programme.
3.	Hong Kong Association of Careers Masters and Guidance Masters [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(03)]	The deputation cast doubt on the efficacy of the Electronic Advance Application System for Post-secondary Programmes (E-APP) platform. Since certain institutions required applicants to take extra admission tests and provide extra credentials, the E-APP platform could not serve as a one-stop platform for application, admission and allocation of offers. The deputation was also concerned that some institutions had not clearly disclosed the detailed admission requirements of individual programmes, and urged for greater transparency.
4.	Hong Kong Buddhist College [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(02)]	The college urged the Government and post-secondary institutions to critically review and improve their quality assurance mechanisms. The Government should improve the operating environment for self-financing post-secondary institutions. Self-financing programmes offered by University Grants Committee ("UGC")-funded institutions and other self-financing programmes accredited by the Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications should receive the same recognition. The college suggested that the Government should provide non-UGC-funded institutions with an one-off start-up grant and operating subsidies, and/or buy

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		places in these institutions for students. All institutions, irrespective of whether they were members of the Federation for Self-financing Tertiary Education or not, should be eligible to offer the Government recognized and subsidized New Yi Jin Diploma programme.
5.	Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union [LC Paper No. CB(4)306/12-13(02)]	Noting the over-enrolment by individual institutions, the deputation considered it necessary to step up the regulation on self-financing post-secondary institutions. The deputation was concerned that some institutions lacked resources to provide sufficient facilities and support to meet the needs of students. In the deputation's view, consideration should be given to providing start-up grants to self-financing post-secondary institutions and recurrent subvention in an amount of \$30,000 per student per annum.
6.	HKU SPACE Po Leung Kuk Community College [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(03) (Joint submission)]	The institution invited the University of Hong Kong School of Professional and Continuing Education to present their views as detailed in their joint submission.
7.	The University of Hong Kong School of Professional and Continuing Education [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(03) (Joint submission)]	In the deputation's view, the support provided by the Government through land grants and interest-free loans was crucial in enabling the institutions to build their campus and cater for the needs of students to lead a meaningful campus life. Apart from start-up loans, the Government should also consider providing start-up grants to institutions. To help increase the recognition of sub-degree qualifications, the deputation asked the Government to increase the number of government posts which accepted these qualifications in fulfillment of entry requirements.
8.	Hong Kong Association of the Heads of Secondary Schools [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(04)]	The deputation considered that the Government should take a more proactive role in promoting the development of publicly-funded and self-financing post-secondary education to keep pace with the reform of basic education. Consideration should be given to providing incentives to attract overseas universities to set up self-financing institutions in Hong Kong.
9.	Hong Kong Institute of Technology	The institution highlighted that the Review Report issued by UGC in December 2010 contained two important recommendations, namely setting up a single quality assurance body for the self-financing post-secondary education sector and the segregation of the operation of community colleges from UGC-funded institutions. These recommendations should be implemented as soon as possible. Amendments to the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320) should be made to remove the outdated requirements and facilitate the development of post-secondary education.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
10.	City University of Hong Kong	The institution said that the sub-degree programmes operated by its self-financing units were subject to the same quality assurance system of the other programmes operated by the institution. To safeguard against over-enrolment, the institution had adopted the practice of offering the places to successful applicants by phases.
11.	Hong Kong Baptist University [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(05)]	The institution considered it necessary to set benchmarks for the quality of 2-year and 4-year post-secondary programmes. In the institution's view, guidelines on both hardware and software standards should be set for self-financing post-secondary institutions to follow. To facilitate the development of the post-secondary education sector, the institution suggested that in addition to land grants and interest-free loans, the Government should consider providing other means of financial support, such as issuance of vouchers to students for pursuing programmes of their choice.
12.	Hong Kong Association of Squint and Double Vision Sufferers [LC Paper No. CB(4)367/12-13(01)]	The deputation expressed concern about the lack of support for students with disabilities and from needy families. The deputation pointed out that students with disabilities pursuing post-secondary education were not allowed to receive Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") but were required to apply for financial assistance from the Student Financial Assistance Agency ("SFAA"). Without CSSA, the repayment of the loans from SFAA would become great financial burden on students with disabilities.
13.	The Open University of Hong Kong	The institution pointed out that self-financing post-secondary institutions and the self-financing units of UGC-funded institutions did not operate on a level playing field. Programmes offered by self-financing post-secondary institutions were subject to quality assurance by external bodies but individual UGC-funded institutions had self-accrediting status. The profits generated by self-financing post-secondary institutions had to be used for the benefit of students while the self-financing units of UGC-funded institutions might pool the income into their centralized funding which could be used for other purposes. The institution urged the Government to strengthen the support for the development of self-financing post-secondary institutions, such as providing start-up grants and recurrent subsidies.
14.	Hong Kong Federation of Students [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(06)]	The deputation expressed its concern on the proliferation of sub-degree programmes. Noting the over-enrolment of some institutions, the deputation urged the Government to increase publicly-funded undergraduate and sub-degree places; and to strengthen the regulation on self-financing post-secondary programmes by setting up a single quality assurance body as soon as possible.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
15.	The Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union	The deputation was concerned that under the prevailing mechanism, the self-financing sub-degree programmes offered by the community colleges of UGC-funded institutions were only required to obtain approval from the Senate of the respective institution. As such, the community colleges might make use of the self-accreditation status of the UGC-funded institutions to offer a large number of programmes in order to maximize profits. The deputation was also concerned about the Government's plan to discontinue the UGC-funded sub-degree programmes. It considered that if the Government planned to promote the development of sub-degree programmes in Hong Kong, it should increase the number of publicly-funded sub-degree places.
16.	大專行動 – 立即雙普選部	The deputation pointed out that publicly-funded first-year-first-degree places had only been slightly increased from 14 500 in the 1994-1995 academic year to 15 000 in the 2012-2013 academic year. The Government had allowed the proliferation of self-financing sub-degree programmes and industrialization of higher education to take place in order to boost the participation rate in post-secondary education to the target of 60% of the relevant cohort. The deputation considered that the self-financing post-secondary education sector had not been given adequate financial support, nor was it effectively regulated.
17.	Lingnan University Students' Union	In the deputation's view, the findings of the Inquiry Panel's Report submitted by Lingnan University on the over-enrolment incident and the launch of Advanced Diploma programmes had revealed the lack of regulation over self-financing post-secondary programmes under the prevailing system. The double-cohort year had provided a good opportunity for self-financing post-secondary institutions to maximize their profits at the expense of the well-being of students. The deputation urged the Education Bureau to set up an oversight body for the self-financing post-secondary sector and see to it that Lingnan University would carry out the necessary remedial measures to mitigate the impact of the over-enrolment incident.
18.	Miss HO Kit-wang	She considered that the over-enrolment incidents of the Community College of Lingnan University ("CCLU") and Lingnan Institute of Further Education ("LIFE") were ridiculous. The institutions did not have sufficient classrooms, teaching staff, facilities and other support measures to cope with the large number of students enrolled. Ultimately, students were the victims of the industrialization of education.
19.	The Student Union of Hong Kong Shue Yan University	The deputation expressed concerns about the transparency of the finance of the self-financing post-secondary institutions and the quality assurance of self-financing post-secondary programmes. In its view, the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320) was obsolete and no longer capable of coping with the development of post-secondary education.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
20.	副學士苦主大聯盟	In the deputation's view, there was inadequate provision of publicly-funded undergraduate places. Students who had met the general entrance requirements could not get admitted to subsidized undergraduate programmes and had to pursue self-financing programmes which had resulted in a heavy financial burden on them. The deputation expressed concern about the market-driven manner in which self-financing post-secondary programmes had been launched and the lack of recognition for sub-degree qualifications.
21.	Mr Gil LEE	He informed the Panel of the difficulties encountered by students pursuing self-financing post-secondary programmes. He expressed concern about the inadequacy of publicly-funded undergraduate places, the lack of articulation pathways for sub-degree holders and the growing commercialization of post-secondary education.
22.	恒生管理學院本科部學生會	The deputation expressed concern about the heavy financial burden shouldered by students pursuing self-financing post-secondary programmes. Noting that the Administration had conducted consultation on the proposed amendments to the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320), the deputation was concerned that the Administration had not addressed the lack of transparency in the operation of self-financing post-secondary institutions and ineffective regulation of this sector.
23.	Mr Benny CHONG	He said that the Administration aimed to achieve its target of boosting the post-secondary education participation rate, but did not take steps to increase publicly-funded undergraduate places. The Administration's proposed amendments to the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320) would have the effect of relaxing the regulation over post-secondary institution, thereby resulting in even greater proliferation of self-financing programmes. He was also gravely concerned that self-financing post-secondary institutions would charge high tuition fees on students to cover the repayment of start-up loans to the Government.
24.	恒管事務關注組	The deputation was concerned that since self-financing post-secondary institutions had to repay the start-up loans, the financial burden of institutions would eventually be transferred to students through payment of high tuition fees. In the deputation's view, the Government should subsidize the development costs of infrastructure and campus of self-financing post-secondary institutions. The transparency of operation and finance of self-financing post-secondary institutions should be enhanced.

Panel on Education
Special meeting on Friday, 11 January 2013, at 9:30 am
Self-financing post-secondary education
Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals
[Second session]

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
25.	The Community College at Lingnan University/Lingnan Institute of Further Education [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(07)]	The institution advised that the Inquiry Panel of Lingnan University had released its report on the over-enrolment incidents of CCLU/LIFE yesterday. With reference to the findings and recommendations of the Inquiry Panel, the institution would improve the operation and control mechanism of the admission exercise for the 2013-2014 academic year as well as its quality assurance system.
26.	陳宗佑社區服務處	The deputation expressed its concern about the financial burden on students pursuing self-financing post-secondary programmes and the quality assurance of self-financing sub-degree programmes.
27.	Kaplan Business and Accountancy School [LC Paper No(s). CB(4)299/12-13(04) & CB(4)306/12-13(03)]	The school pointed out that the recent over-enrolment by individual institutions had projected a bad image of self-financing post-secondary programmes. As a result, students might be deterred from enrolling on these programmes and the post-secondary institutions concerned might also incur substantial financial losses due to insufficient enrolment. The school urged the Government to strengthen the monitoring of all self-financing post-secondary programme providers and provide a fair level playing field for them. Apart from providing land grants and interest-free loans for campus development, the Government should also provide start-up grants for newly-established institutions.
28.	Labour Party	The deputation was concerned about the difficulties encountered by students pursuing self-financing sub-degree programmes, including the heavy financial burden, lack of articulation pathways, as well as the lack of recognition on the part of employers for sub-degree qualification. The deputation urged the Administration to increase public expenditure in education and increase publicly-funded undergraduate places.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
29.	The Hong Kong Polytechnic University [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(05)]	The institution explained the control mechanism of the admission exercise and the quality assurance system of its self-financing post-secondary programmes.
30.	Dr CHANG Chung-nan	The Government should formulate clear policies to facilitate the planning and development of the self-financing post-secondary sector in Hong Kong. He objected to the use of land resources to attract overseas educational institutions to set up their operations in Hong Kong because these institutions would usually charge high tuition fees. In his view, the self-financing post-secondary institutions were over-regulated while the self-financing programmes offered by UGC-funded institutions were under-regulated. UGC-funded institutions could benefit from their self-accrediting status to offer self-financing sub-degree programmes, which placed other non-UGC-funded institutions in a disadvantaged position.
31.	Mr Marcus TSE	He noted that when discussing the quality of education, the emphasis was always put on the academic performance of students. However, employers also took into consideration the attitude and personality of applicants. In his view, it was worthwhile to reflect on the objective of education and critically review basic education before considering other issues such as the suggestion of increasing public expenditure in higher education.
32.	Hang Seng Management College [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(06)]	In the college's view, self-financing post-secondary institutions had an important role to play in Hong Kong's education system, unless the Government had plans to greatly expand publicly-funded university places. The Government should continue its support for the development of self-financing post-secondary institutions and provide all institutions, whether funded by UGC or self-financed, with a fair operating environment.
33.	Mr Conrad KARAGEORGE [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(08)]	He said that the most important aspect of university education was its quality rather than quantity. The Government should limit its support by providing grants and land to institutions for their establishment and then institutions should operate and sustain viability on their own.
34.	Tung Wah College [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(09)]	In the college's view, it was necessary to have a single quality assurance body for all post-secondary programmes offered by UGC-funded or self-financing institutions. Regarding the concern on the recent over-enrolment incidents by individual institutions, the college opined that if the institutions concerned had adequate facilities, teaching staff and support measures to cope with a large intake, they could increase the number of students admitted. Over-enrolment could be prevented if there was a unified admission system like the Joint University Programmes Admissions System.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
35.	Yew Chung Community College [LC Paper No. CB(4)279/12-13(10)]	The college pointed out that UGC-funded institutions enjoyed self-accreditation status in offering self-financing sub-degree programmes, which placed other non-UGC-funded institutions in a disadvantaged position. In the college's view, policies and regulations should be equally applied to all post-secondary institutions, irrespective of whether they were funded by UGC. The college expressed concern about the negative impact of the over-enrolment by some institutions on the self-financing post-secondary education sector. It considered that measures should be taken to prevent recurrence of the over-enrolment problem.
36.	The Hong Kong Institute of Education [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(07)]	The institution advised that it had decided to gradually phase out its sub-degree programmes. Out of 10 Associate Degree/Higher Diploma programmes, student recruitment had ceased for six programmes starting from the 2012-2013 academic year.
37.	Alliance for the Concern of Sub-degree Education [LC Paper No. CB(4)306/12-13(01)]	The deputation was concerned about the lack of effective regulation over the self-financing post-secondary sector, as demonstrated by the launch of Advanced Diploma programmes by LIFE before obtaining approval from the Joint Quality Review Committee. The deputation urged the Government to set up an independent statutory body on quality assurance without delay.
38.	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	The deputation was concerned that while some self-financing post-secondary institutions had over-enrolled students, some other institutions had recorded under-enrolment. To facilitate the healthy development of higher education in Hong Kong, the Government should improve the recognition of sub-degree qualification, consider issuing education vouchers or other form of subsidy to students pursuing self-financing post-secondary programmes, and provide assistance to sub-degree holders to further their study in the Mainland.
39.	Education Union of Knowledge and Practice	The deputation expressed concern about the over-enrolment by some institutions and the lack of recognition of sub-degree qualification. In the deputation's view, the Administration should strengthen the regulation of the self-financing post-secondary sector.
40.	Civic Party [LC Paper No. CB(4)306/12-13(04)]	To maintain the quality of programmes and safeguard the interest of students, the deputation considered that the Administration should formulate a policy on the regulation of self-financing post-secondary institutions and programmes. The Administration was urged to increase the number of publicly-funded undergraduate places.
41.	Miss Cecilia CHANG	Regarding the over-enrolment by some institutions, she considered that the crux of the matter was the attitude towards post-secondary education. In her view, neither the increase in publicly-funded

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		undergraduate places nor the stepping up of regulation over the self-financing post-secondary sector was the solution to the problem. The community should change its value judgement that university education was a prerequisite for employment. The Government should provide alternative options for further studies on vocational or creative subjects.
42.	SCAD Hong Kong [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(08)]	The institution was supportive of the establishment of a single oversight body for self-financing post-secondary education. Institutions governed by the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320) or the Non-local Higher and Professional Education (Regulation) Ordinance (Cap.493) should have equal opportunities to benefit from the subsidies and financing schemes provided by the government. Relevant regulations and ordinances should be aligned to enable all institutions to exercise flexibility in school management.
43.	Joint Quality Review Committee [LC Paper No. CB(4)299/12-13(09)]	The deputation was an independent corporate quality assurance body formed under the Heads of Universities Committee to oversee the quality assurance processes for the self-financed sub-degree programmes of UGC-funded institutions. Noting the UGC's recommendation for establishing a single quality assurance body, the deputation considered that in the long term, it might be possible to contemplate an integration of the different quality assurance approaches, and to consider the model of a single quality assurance body. Nevertheless, the current system comprising three quality assurance bodies with distinct responsibilities was an effective division of labour. The self-accreditation status of an institution was recognition of its professional standing and achievement.
44.	D-DONG [LC Paper No. CB(4)347/12-13(01)]	With a view to safeguarding against over-enrolment, the deputation urged the Administration to review the development of sub-degree programmes and set up a single quality assurance body.
45.	Mr CHEUNG Chi-wai	Regarding the students admitted by LIFE/CCLU, he was concerned whether the qualifications attained from those programmes that had not been approved by the Joint Quality Review Committee would be recognized. He urged the Government to set up an independent body on quality assurance without delay.
46.	Hong Kong College of Technology [LC Paper No. CB(4)313/12-13(01)]	Noting that some institutions with self-accrediting status had admitted students for programmes that had not been duly approved by their senate or academic board, the college cast doubt on the efficacy of the existing quality assurance system. It supported the setting up of a single quality assurance body. Meanwhile, the differences among existing quality assurance mechanisms should be minimized as far as possible. To facilitate the development of the self-financing post-secondary sector, amendments to the Post Secondary Colleges Ordinance (Cap. 320) should be made as soon as possible.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
47.	守護城大社工副學士兼讀課程關注組	The deputation noted with concern that earlier on, it was reported that the Associate of Social Science in Social Work programme offered by the Community College of City University ("CCCU") would be discontinued in 2013 because of non-availability of teaching centres. However, after repeated requests for clarification, CCCU subsequently confirmed that the programme concerned would be continued. The deputation pointed out that this incident had indicated the lack of regulation over the offer of self-financing post-secondary programmes by individual institutions. The deputation also expressed concern about insufficient venues for conducting part-time self-financing programmes by institutions.
48.	Hong Kong Federation of Social Work Students	The deputation was concerned that the arbitrary decision of an institution to launch or discontinue a self-financing programme would make it difficult for students to plan for their study. The Administration should put in place a clear policy and mechanism to regulate self-financing post-secondary programmes.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 September 2013